



**VISITATION REPORT**

**To the Department of Veterinary Sciences, University of Turin, Turin, Italy**

**On 11 – 15 October 2021**

**By the Visitation Team:**

**Begüm Yurdakök Dikmen**, Ankara, Turkey: Visitor in Basic Sciences

**Ton Willemse**, Utrecht, the Netherlands: Visitor in Clinical Sciences in Companion Animals

**Renaud Maillard**, Toulouse, France: Visitor in Clinical Sciences in Food-Producing Animals

**Robert Huey (Chairperson)**, Belfast, Northern Ireland, United Kingdom: Visitor in Food Safety and Quality

**Werner Swannet**, Ghent, Belgium: Visitor in Quality Assurance

**Borut Zemljič**, Ormos, Slovenia: Practitioner

**Kate Dakin**, Bristol, United Kingdom: Student

**Laura Helen Kramer**, Parma, Italy: Observer

**Hans Henrik Dietz**, Copenhagen, Denmark: ESEVT Coordinator

## **Contents of the Visitation Report**

Introduction

Area 1. Objectives, Organisation and QA Policy

Area 2. Finances

Area 3. Curriculum

Area 4. Facilities and equipment

Area 5. Animal resources and teaching material of animal origin

Area 6. Learning resources

Area 7. Student admission, progression and welfare

Area 8. Student assessment

Area 9. Academic and support staff

Area 10. Research programmes, continuing and postgraduate education

11. ESEVT Indicators

12. ESEVT Rubrics

Executive Summary

COVID-19 annex summary

Glossary

## **Introduction**

The Veterinary School, Kingdom of Savoy, was founded in 1769 and it was the first VetSchool in Italy and the fourth in Europe. The School was settled in Turin in 1859. In 1934 the School became one of the Faculties of the University of Turin (UniTo), and in 1999, the now Department of Veterinary Sciences (referred to as Veterinary Education Establishment (VEE) in this Report) was relocated in Grugliasco, 11 km from the centre of Turin, in a shared campus with the Department of Agriculture, Forestry and Food Sciences.

The VEE has:

- well maintained and updated facilities
- a good and stable financial situation
- good support from the Grugliasco municipality
- good relations with the Turin Chamber of Veterinarians, the national Federation of Veterinarians Chambers (FNOVI), and the National Veterinary Assistance and Welfare Agency (ENPAV)

The first EAEVE Visitation took place in 1999. The second EAEVE Visitation took place in 2010 resulting in Full Approval status.

The main developments since the last EAEVE Visitation are:

- new structure imposed by the new Italian, national university law with a semantic change of “Faculties” into “Departments” i.e. Department of Veterinary Sciences (DVS), Turin
- direct responsibility for teaching and research at departmental level
- introduction of tenure track leading to permanent Associate Professor positions
- the Italian National Agency for Evaluation of Universities and Research Institutes, ANVUR, has developed its own assessment criteria, methodologies and procedures to fulfil its tasks, in strict adherence to Standards and Guidelines for Quality Assurance in

the European Higher Education Area (ESG). Following this the VEE courses are currently adjusted to ANVUR; ISO 9001:2015; and EAEVE

- technical and administrative services are no longer under the direct control chain of Departments
- introduction of Portfolio of Competences to certify students' Day One Competences
- student assessment incorporated in the quality assurance system
- completely renewed diagnostic imaging and anaesthesia equipment
- new software for the VTH
- renovation and upgrading of many buildings including the open laboratory

The problems currently encountered by the VEE are:

- considerable effort and time were invested to align the VEE's organization to the provisions of the new University law
- reorganization of UniTO Central Administration implying new chains of command for a large proportion of the support staff
- very bureaucratic and slow procedures when it comes to spending money also for absolute necessities like replacement of e.g. laptops, analytic material for laboratory work etc.

The ESEVT SOP 2019 as amended in September 2021 is valid for this Visitation.

## **Area 1: Objectives, Organisation and QA Policy**

**Standard 1.1 The VEE must have as its main objective the provision, in agreement with the EU Directives and ESG recommendations, of adequate, ethical, research-based, evidence-based veterinary training that enables the new graduate to perform as a veterinarian capable of entering all commonly recognised branches of the veterinary profession and to be aware of the importance of lifelong learning.**

**The VEE must develop and follow its mission statement which must embrace all the ESEVT Standards.**

### **1.1.1. Findings**

The VEE clearly states the classic threefold mission which includes education, research and services to society.

The European Directive 2005/36/EC, the World Organisation for Animal Health (OIE) recommendations on the Day One Competences for graduating veterinarians and the 10 Areas of the ESEVT are the basis for the veterinary training programme delivered by the DVS (Department of Veterinary Science).

Knowledge, skills and competences are combined in this progressive training. No formal tracking is offered in order to avoid specialisation before attaining a sound comprehensive veterinary education.

In the Five-Year education, basic sciences and animal production are taught in the first 2 years whereas clinical sciences, food safety and public health are dealt with in the next 3 years.

During the Visitation it was stated several times that administrative issues were time-consuming for research staff. This was especially the case with the requisition of equipment and simple items, such as consumables required for laboratory work.

### **1.1.2. Comments**

The mission statement includes the promotion of advanced teaching, learning and research in the field of Veterinary Sciences, for the benefit of animal, human, and environmental life and health, encouraging mutual collaboration and plurality of thought according to criteria of equality, impartiality, continuity, participation, efficiency and in accordance with the provisions of the "Quality Policy" that involves the whole organization, orienting it to the definition of objectives that are intended to be achieved and the planning of the use of the resources necessary for their achievement.

The mission statement fulfils the requirement of Standard 1.1 and is supported by the strategic plan.

### **1.1.3. Suggestions for improvement**

- An internal evaluation of administrative procedures in relation to requisition of equipment and consumables might be beneficial to the University of Turin to ensure effective running of daily work procedures and laboratory work.

### **1.1.4. Decision**

The VEE is compliant with Standard 1.

**Standard 1.2 The VEE must be part of a university or a higher education institution providing training recognised as being of an equivalent level and formally recognised as such in the respective country.**

**The person responsible for the veterinary curriculum and the person(s) responsible for the professional, ethical, and academic affairs of the Veterinary Teaching Hospital (VTH) must hold a veterinary degree.**

**The decision-making process, organisation and management of the VEE must allow implementation of its strategic plan and of a cohesive study programme, in compliance with the ESEVT Standards.**

### **1.2.1. Findings**

The University of Turin is a public institution and depends on the Italian Ministry of Education University and Research (MIUR). The university Rector is the official representative with the Academic Senate and the Board of Governors as the two main governing bodies. The university comprises 25 departments of which the Department of Veterinary Science is one.

The main campus for veterinary students is located in Grugliasco (situated at 11 km from the rectorate) and is the Campus of Agronomy and Veterinary Medicine, home to the School of Agriculture & Veterinary Medicine (SAMEV), where education of the students is provided, by amongst others, the Department of Veterinary Science (DVS) and the Special Didactic Veterinary complex SDSV.

The Director heads the DVS for a period of three years and can be re-elected once. The Director is chair of the Department Council and the Department Executive Committee. He/she nominates two vice directors; one in charge of research the other of teaching and 22 delegates. A coordinator, also member of the teaching staff, heads the veterinary curriculum and is elected by the degree course council also for 3 years.

The DVS comprises a Special Didactic Veterinary Complex (SDSV). This didactic complex is

composed of a Veterinary Teaching Hospital, a Teaching Farm and a slaughterhouse. These are used for clinical training and professional training for veterinary students. The SDSV is also used for graduate clinical training, research and third mission activities.

The main external bodies with which the DVS collaborates are the regional Veterinary Chambers, the regional Veterinary Services of the National Health System and the Experimental Prophylactic Institute of Piemonte, Liguria and the Valley of Aosta.

The DVM Course Coordinator, the director of the Special Didactic Veterinary Complex and the director of the VTH all hold a veterinary degree.

### **1.2.2. Comments**

The VEE represents, for the veterinary field, the only academic institution of reference for the North-West part of Italy; providing degree in veterinary medicine as well as specialization, PhD and Master degree programmes. Turin University is involved in the European platform "EIT food" which facilitates the professionalising of teaching related to food safety in an international context.

### **1.2.3. Suggestions for improvement**

None.

### **1.2.4. Decision**

The VEE is compliant with Standard 1.2.

**Standard 1.3 The VEE must have a strategic plan, which includes a SWOT analysis of its current activities, a list of objectives, and an operating plan with a timeframe and indicators for its implementation.**

### **1.3.1. Findings**

As required by the university, the VEE has a 3-year strategic plan which includes a detailed SWOT analysis. Each objective is connected to the University's strategic plan in terms of strategic purpose, objective and university reference indicator. Department objectives are well described in terms of plans/planned actions, departmental resources, responsible person for monitoring/management along with indicators for descriptions. The last strategic plan was approved in June 2018 and it covers 2018-2021.

**Strengths** can be summarized in: Approval status by EAEVE in April 2011; Accreditation by ANVUR in 2016; Good infrastructure of the Grugliasco-campus; ISO 9001 certification of undergraduate programme, LLL courses, the VTH and the campus library; VTH is compliant with FVE's Code for Good Veterinary Practices; special funding by MIUR for top ranking in research; high number of DVM, EBVS & ABVS degrees amongst teachers; student involvement in all processes of planning, self-evaluation and reviewing of teaching activities.

**Weaknesses** comprise: High cost for support staff for hands-on training activities in small groups; suboptimal number of support staff; up-to-standard training requires frequent upgrading and renovating facilities, equipment and technologies; innovative teaching methods require training of teaching staff; considerable differences in research performance between subject areas and groups; limited interest in international competitive grants of academic staff.

**Opportunities** are: Strengthening of the involvement of students and staff in revising and

updating QA related processes for renewal of certifications; opportunity to refurbish and expand teaching facilities in light of the impending EAEVE Visitation; increase the interest on VEE activities and the societal role of the veterinary profession by a larger public through the “Department of Excellence” project that also will enhance internationalization in teaching and research by inviting professors and scientists.

**Threats** are: the high cost of veterinary training; high cost for maintenance of facilities and equipment, limited career development opportunities for excellent performing staff and the lack of rewarding mechanisms; dependency on the Central university for budget and administrative processes lacking the need for flexibility.

An operating plan with objectives, actions and indicators on strategic actions in five areas (teaching, research, third mission, internationalization & human resources) has been drawn up consistent with the universities strategic objectives.

### **1.3.2. Comments**

Strategic plans are expected to include strategic stakeholder analysis; where the demands of stakeholders are identified, prioritized and evaluated according to the needs. In the published strategic plan, stakeholder analysis and their contribution to the plan is not evident.

### **1.3.3. Suggestions for improvement**

None.

### **1.3.4. Decision**

The VEE is compliant with Standard 1.3.

**Standard 1.4 The VEE must have a policy and associated written procedures for the assurance of the quality and standards of its programmes and awards. It must also commit itself explicitly to the development of a culture which recognises the importance of quality, and quality assurance, within their VEE. To achieve this, the VEE must develop and implement a strategy for the continuous enhancement of quality. The development and implementation of the VEE’s strategy must include a role for students and other stakeholders, both internal and external, and the strategy must have a formal status and be publicly available.**

### **1.4.1. Findings**

“The Higher Education Quality Assurance system” was introduced by law (240/2010) and Legislative Decree (19/2012) in the whole of Italy. The entity in charge of executing the QA is called ANVUR, what stands for “National Agency for the Evaluation of Universities and Research Institutes”. ANVUR is a member of ENQA, which ensures that a positive assessment report is in full compliancy with the ESG standards.

From 2010 onwards the VEE has undergone several successful internal and external evaluation procedures. Standard ISO 9001, compliancy with the code for good veterinary practices by the FVE and the external evaluation by the National Agency for the Evaluation of Universities and Research Institutes (ANVUR) are three examples.

Since 2014 the VEE is regularly submitted to internal and external QA evaluations. The quality assurance policy has a formal status and can be found on the website.

The VEE continuously develops and implements its own quality assurance system based on the European directive, the National University law, the ESEVT SOP, the directives of the National System of Accreditation (AVA) and the ISO 9001:2015 procedures.

Information is collected on all QA processes and activities by means of student and lecturer questionnaires, customer satisfaction surveys, quantitative indicators on student progression and employment rates and monitoring of research performance using internationally agreed indicators.

All the data is used to assess outcomes and draft the monitoring reports of the strategic plan.

The PDCA-cycle is closed by cyclical reviews to set new objectives for enhancing quality.

In 2016, focus groups with external stakeholders were set up for each of the five pillars of the training (Veterinary Public Health, Companion Animals, Food-producing Animals, Equines, Food Safety and Industries), with representatives of the profession and alumni working in public or private organizations to review each subject with the ESEVT Day One Competences (D1Cs) as a guideline and, where necessary, provide them with new competence based learning outcomes which were subsequently described in the subject forms. Since then, the maintenance of the subject forms rests with the CMR (Monitoring & Review Committee).

Regular consultation with internship supervisors and stakeholders and the employers provide a good picture of the suitability of the training.

#### **1.4.2. Comments**

The learning outcomes are stated in the “Regolamento Didattico”/Teaching Regulation, art 2 ([https://www.veterinarymedicine.unito.it/do/documenti.pl/Show?\\_id=o26m](https://www.veterinarymedicine.unito.it/do/documenti.pl/Show?_id=o26m)). In addition, general learning outcomes are reported in the “SUA CdS” report, a public document presenting the educational offer in a particular year. The general learning outcomes refer to three categories of subjects: basic sciences, preclinical and food safety subjects and clinical subjects. After each category, the course units contributing to these learning outcomes are summed up with a link to each course sheet.

The VEE is among the 10 Departments of the University of Turin that have been awarded the five-year funding fund (2018-2022) of the Departments of Excellence of Italian universities; to strengthen and enhance the excellence of research, with investments in human capital, infrastructures and highly qualified educational activities.

It is commendable that the VEE is permeated with a far-reaching quality assurance system at every level and for each of its operations.

Browsing through the “SUA CdS” (<https://www.universitaly.it/index.php/scheda/sua/49913>) is not easy. There are a lot of courses where the course sheet link is not working although these can be found in the study guide via a different route.

#### **1.4.3. Suggestions for improvement**

- The integration between the general learning outcomes of the Veterinary course and the learning outcomes of the several units of study could be improved using a cross reference table.
- The SUA CdS should be reviewed and updated.

#### **1.4.4. Decision**

The VEE is compliant with Standard 1.4.

**Standard 1.5 The VEE must provide evidence that it interacts with its stakeholders and the wider society. Such public information must be clear, objective and readily accessible; the information must include up-to-date information about the study programme, views and employment destinations of past students as well as the profile of the current student population.**

**The VEE's website must mention the ESEVT VEE's status and its last Self Evaluation Report and Visitation Report must be easily available for the public.**

#### **1.5.1. Findings**

As it would be expected, the main way of providing information on the veterinary programme is the internet, with the VEE's website for general information and the Scheda Unica Annuale (SUA-CdS) for to the point detailed information, as the two major information channels. Further information can be found on the internet relating to the integration of graduates into the labour market and information on continuing education.

Regular consultation with stakeholders, in order to gather information for updating the veterinary curriculum and EPT training activities (with earning of credits) for veterinarians is organized. In order to keep learning outcomes aligned to the required professional profiles, on site meetings are organized both in plenary sessions and in working groups focused on specific themes (public health, companion animals, food producing animals, food safety and industries). In addition, twice a year official veterinarians and practitioners involved in the State Exam sessions are invited to give feedback regarding the general achievement of professional competences by new graduates by means of questionnaires. This information is included in the "SUA CdS" report.

Practitioners involved in EPT are offered training on organisation, scope and assessment of EPT activities that are rewarded by credits for continuing education.

Annually an AgroVet party is organised at the opening of the year which is open to the public in order to create awareness of activities taking place at the Campus.

#### **1.5.2. Comments**

A stakeholder committee gathers at least once a year but can be convened when the VEE is of the opinion that circumstances require it.

#### **1.5.3. Suggestions for improvement**

None.

#### **1.5.4. Decision**

The VEE is compliant with Standard 1.5.

**Standard 1.6 The VEE must monitor and periodically review its activities, both quantitative and qualitative, to ensure that they achieve the objectives set for them and respond to the needs of students and society. The VEE must make public how this analysis of information has been utilised in the further development of its activities and provide**



**evidence as to the involvement of both students and staff in the provision, analysis and implementation of such data.**

**Any action planned or taken as a result of this data analysis must be communicated to all those concerned.**

#### **1.6.1. Findings**

The VEE's QA committee is primarily responsible for drafting, and follow-up, the three year strategic plan. It is chaired by the VEE's Director. Academic staff, students and support staff are represented. The yearly monitoring report on the strategic plan is discussed and approved by the VEE Council after which it is transferred to the university who in turn formulates comments and suggestions and thereby completes the QA cycle.

At the end of the three-year strategic plan, a final assessment is conducted and a new SWOT-analysis is performed.

#### **1.6.2. Comments**

Indicators are clearly defined with "ex-ante" reference values and "target" expected values in the strategic plan; allowing monitoring of progress. Yearly target values for indicators are not included in the strategic plan, which restricts the control measures and precautions to be taken to reach the 3-year target.

#### **1.6.3. Suggestions for improvement**

None.

#### **1.6.4. Decision**

The VEE is compliant with Standard 1.6.

**Standard 1.7 The VEE must undergo external review through the ESEVT on a cyclical basis. Evidence must be provided of such external evaluation with the assurance that the progress made since the last ESEVT evaluation was linked to a continuous quality assurance process.**

#### **1.7.1. Findings**

The VEE was inspected in 2002 when it received 'approval' status. The next Visitation took place after the move to the Grugliasco campus in 2010, whereby the 'approved' status was extended. Most of the many recommendations and suggestions have since been followed and carefully undertaken.

#### **1.7.2. Comments**

Suggestions and recommendations to rectify minor weaknesses in the ESEVT report were reviewed carefully and efforts in commending improvement in accordance to the ANVUR Periodic Accreditation procedures and UNI-EN ISO 9001: 2015 action resulting in compliance with European standards in terms of education in the veterinary medical field.

#### **1.7.3. Suggestions for improvement**

None.

#### **1.7.4. Decision**

The VEE is compliant with Standard 1.7.

## **Area 2. Finances**

**Standard 2.1 Finances must be demonstrably adequate to sustain the requirements for the VEE to meet its mission and to achieve its objectives for education, research and services. The description must include both expenditures (separated into personnel costs, operating costs, maintenance costs and equipment) and revenues (separated into public funding, tuition fees, services, research grants and other sources).**

#### **2.1.1. Findings**

The VEE, as part of the University of Turino (UniTO), is responsible for its own budget with the exception of staff salaries, the functioning of services such as ICT and the campus library, the maintenance and refurbishment of premises, premises management, utilities, and the cleaning and security services.

The public funding is assigned annually based on a formula taking into account the number of students and staff as well as performance in research and teaching. A rise in funding during 2018 was due to the “Department of Excellence” additional funding by MIUR (Italian Ministry of Education, University and Research).

The University central administration also grants a ‘special contribution’ for the veterinary medicine course, about 565 euro/student/year, in recognition of the higher costs of veterinary training.

DVS and SDSV expenditure is primarily on salaries of hired veterinarians/instructors to help with practicals and scholarships, operating costs for the purchase of consumables, the keeping of animals, purchase of animal materials for practicals, disposal of waste, student transport, and occasional maintenance, such as the faculty slaughterhouse.

Research funding is through the UniTo and other public and private sources.

#### **2.1.2. Comments**

The governance of spending the UniTo funding requires all expenditure to be recorded/approved through the formal system. This is in line with both University policy and public procurement law. While still burdensome, the system has been improved by being put online so that the process can be completed electronically. The delay inherent in this governance system has been mitigated, to some extent, for the VTH who can order their requisites without the need for prior approval of individual orders, through a pre-approved supplier.

Within the research arena, projects may be delayed because of the time required to get financial approval for reagents and other consumables.

#### **2.1.3. Suggestions for improvement**

- While maintaining good governance, the VEE should investigate the extension of the VTH flexibility, or other arrangement, for approval of orders into the field of research.

#### **2.1.4. Decision**

The VEE is compliant with Standard 2.1.

**Standard 2.2 Clinical and field services must function as instructional resources. Instructional integrity of these resources must take priority over financial self-sufficiency of clinical services operations.**

**The VEE must have sufficient autonomy in order to use the resources to implement its strategic plan and to meet the ESEVT Standards.**

#### **2.2.1. Findings**

The Special Didactic Veterinary Complex (SDSV) is made up of the Veterinary Teaching Hospital (VTH), the farm, slaughterhouse and kennels and has a budget managed separately from the VEE with additional flexibilities on spending. However, since DVS is a major contributor to the budget they have positions on the financial decision making committees.

The SDVS, through UniTo regulations, enjoys more flexibility and agile spending procedures than DVS.

#### **2.2.2. Comments**

There is sufficient autonomy within the SDSV financial management.

#### **2.2.3. Suggestions for improvement**

None.

#### **2.2.4. Decision**

The VEE is compliant with Standard 2.2.

**Standard 2.3 Resources allocation must be regularly reviewed to ensure that available resources meet the requirements.**

#### **2.3.1. Findings**

A strategic plan is in place for the development of the VEE with various plans for construction and refurbishment. These planned investments are directly managed by UniTO.

During 2019, the VEE received extra public funds following the recognition of the VEE's "Excellence" status and the additional "special contribution" for veterinary medicine of up to 656 euro per student per year.

#### **2.3.2. Comments**

The VEE is currently adequately resourced partly due to the additional funding received from the UniTo.

#### **2.3.3. Suggestions for improvement**

None.

#### **2.3.4. Decision**

The VEE is compliant with Standard 2.3.

### **Area 3. Curriculum**

**Standard 3.1 The curriculum must be designed, resourced and managed to ensure all graduates have achieved the graduate attributes expected to be fully compliant with the EU Directive 2005/36/EC (as amended by directive 2013/55/EU) and its Annex V.4.1. The curriculum must include the subjects (input) and must allow the acquisition of the Day One Competences (output) listed in Annex 2. This concerns Basic Sciences, Clinical Sciences in companion animals (including equine and exotic pets), Clinical Sciences in food-producing animals (including Animal Production and Herd Health Management), Food Safety and Quality, and Professional Knowledge.**

#### **3.1.1. General findings**

##### **3.1.1.1. Findings**

Significant efforts have been made to modify the curriculum since the last ESEVT Visitation in 2010. In 2019 the mandatory professional practical training (PPT) was fully revised and updated. Other notable achievements include:

- 1) the introduction of a Portfolio of Competences (to document a student's attainment of Day One Competences);
- 2) the adoption of an assessment policy that incorporates quality assurance. The design and review of the curriculum is now under the responsibility of the Monitoring and Review Committee (CMR) which answers to the main curriculum decision making body the Degree Course Council.

The basic subjects and basic sciences are taught in the first two years with an increasing clinical emphasis from year 3 onwards. Previous student surveys have pointed out the overload of material in years 1 and 2. As a result, the course during the first two years was revised and changes implemented in 2015. The current aim of student training is to combine knowledge, skills and competences. Especially post-COVID period, a problem solving approach has been adopted as an important component of face-to-face lectures, where recorded lectures provide base for classical didactic teaching.

Each course is coordinated by a single, experienced teaching staff member. A key document is the Subject Form (Scheda di insegnamento) which details all relevant information on the course. A random sample of Subject Forms is reviewed by an external body "Commissione Didattica Paritetica" della SAMEV (Joint Teaching Committee of the Campus School) is denominated for a random course each year for formal accuracy and thoroughness. There is a long bureaucratic burden on possible changes and adaptations in ECTS distributions among subject categories, where UniTo, the National University Council/CUN and ANVUR approval is requested besides DVM Course Council, which prohibits a quick response.

There is a heavy reliance on didactic teaching, while the practical teaching content is relatively low.

Training involving the use of the clinical skills labs occur in year 5.

The number of hours of external practical training (EPT) is 350 (10 weeks). There is no minimum number of weeks for EPT in production animals.

The Day One Competences are covered by the lectures and clinical training opportunities confirmed in the curriculum.

Anonymous feedback on teachers and courses is provided by students through the UniTo online evaluation platform Edumeter, where the survey results are evaluated by DVM Monitoring and Review Committee (CMR). This system allows direct student opinions on course evaluation for further overlap, redundancy and omissions for the courses.

### **3.1.1.2. Comments**

Certain recommendations of the last ESEVT Visitation in 2010 have only been partially implemented, namely:

- 1. It would be good to see more evidence of multi-disciplinary, problem oriented teaching, particularly in the clinical years.*
- 2. Horizontally coordinated system-related teaching should be given stronger weight and significantly improved.*
- 3. The introduction of problem-orientated teaching and learning in case presentations in earlier semesters and their relation to the basic subjects could be increased, in order to make the students aware of the importance of the knowledge of preclinical subjects. In clinics, problem-oriented case analysis and discussion should be introduced.*

Certain recommendations of the last Visitation in 2010 have not been implemented, namely:

- 1. Awards for “teacher of the year”.*
- 2. Introduction of external examiners for formal examinations.*

Other areas that have not been addressed fully since the previous ESEVT Visitation include:

- 1. Lack of proper recognition of teaching excellence (existing University regulations only explicitly recognise research performance for promotion);*
- 2. The length of time to graduation (under UniTO regulations it is not possible to exclude failing students from the programme and studies may be interrupted for up to 8 years).*

In 2016 as a result of changes in the national system for admission of students to the programme, some students may not be enrolled until the end of semester 1, thus missing a large number of scheduled classes.

While integration of content is aspired to and encouraged with much progress reported, a lot of further work is required in this regard.

Rationalisation of the student workload is expected to be extended to other basic and clinical courses like the physiology-anatomy example.

A significant constraint on curricular change is the bureaucratic burden imposed by UniTo, the National University Council and ANVUR (Italian National Agency for the Evaluation of Universities and Research Institutes). The current veterinary programme was approved in 2015. Despite the legal constraints, it may be possible to reduce the time, content and required ECTS allocation to the legal minimum and thus free up some time for self-directed learning.

The number of places for the elective lectures are low for the number of students applying.

### **3.1.1.3. Suggestions for improvement**

- Evaluate whether the balance between didactic teaching and practical teaching, case-based learning, tutorials, seminars, clinical skills, etc. is optimal.
- The number of days of external practical training (EPT) should be increased and should include mandatory minimum periods in both production animals and horses.
- It should be considered to provide additional elective places.

#### **3.1.1.4. Decision**

The VEE is compliant with Standard 3.1.1.

### **3.1.2. Basic Sciences**

#### **3.1.2.1. Findings**

The first two curricular years are almost entirely devoted to basic sciences. Basic subjects form a total amount of 230 h (5.5%) and the Basic Sciences form 1839 h (44.1%), while the clinical sciences comprise 35.6% among the core curriculum. Most of the basic subjects are taught by VEE academics. All basic sciences subjects in the EU-list are taught with a heavy reliance on didactic teaching.

Lecture hours in the basic sciences are 1,357 h (73.8%), overall practical lectures are 461 (25.1%); while supervised self-learning is 41 h (2.2%). The practical teaching and supervised self-learning is very low relative to heavy didactic lecture hours.

Students take a Safety Training Course in their first year for safety in the laboratory workplaces on prevention and protection.

Training in laboratory animals for both undergraduate and graduate studies is not specifically mentioned in the curriculum.

#### **3.1.2.2. Comments**

The ESEVT suggestion regarding *“the introduction of problem-orientated teaching and learning in case presentations in earlier semesters and their relation to the basic subjects could be increased, in order to make the students aware of the importance of the knowledge of preclinical subjects”* has been partially implemented.

As time within the currently curriculum is at a premium, it may be timely to critically review the value and content of the basic subjects.

Much greater effort could be made to move to student centred learning and away from an over reliance on didactic teaching.

The information about laboratory animals that is provided under different subjects does not prepare the students fully for a career that involves laboratory animal research or as a breeder, supplier of laboratory animals which requires a satisfactory understanding of laboratory animal science and medicine (LASM).

#### **3.1.2.3. Suggestions for improvement**

- Increase elective courses integrating the basic sciences with clinical sciences.
- Put more emphasis on laboratory animal medicine in the curriculum.
- Increase the number and the variety of cadavers used in practical anatomical training.

#### **3.1.2.4. Decision**

The VEE is compliant with Standard 3.1.2.

### **3.1.3. Clinical Sciences in companion animals (including equine and exotic pets)**

#### **3.1.3.1. Findings**

All EU-listed subjects are covered. Students are gradually involved in companion animal clinical activities from the 3<sup>rd</sup> year. This involvement is increased during the 4<sup>th</sup> and 5<sup>th</sup> years. A clinical skills lab training is mandatory and used to introduce the students to clinical

management and animal handling before starting clinical rotations at the VTH.

Core clinical rotations are mandatory; 3<sup>rd</sup>, and 4<sup>th</sup> and 5<sup>th</sup> years students must participate in rotations at the Emergency, Intensive Care and Hospitalization services of the VTH. Intramural clinical rotations during the 5<sup>th</sup> year let the students to be involved in the clinical management of different disciplines in companion animals. During their rotations, students have to fill in a daily logbook to acquire approval of Day One Competences. Also, they must record the clinical procedures they proactively carried out, which are then signed off by the teaching staff on duty, and finally validated by a qualified member of the academic staff.

Exotic animals are adequately incorporated in the curriculum.

### **3.1.3.2. Comments**

The number of companion animals seen intramurally by students is adequate. Clinical hands-on training has been introduced in all areas. As part of the revised extramural practical teaching, attendance to off-campus companion animal clinics has become mandatory for all students, starting from fall 2020.

### **3.1.3.3. Suggestions for improvement**

None.

### **3.1.3.4 Decision**

The VEE is compliant with Standard 3.1.3.

## **3.1.4. Clinical Sciences in food-producing animals (including Animal Production and Herd Health Management)**

### **3.1.4.1. Findings**

Clinical Sciences in food-producing animals are part of Professional Practical Training (intramural part), taking place 3<sup>rd</sup>, 4<sup>th</sup> and 5<sup>th</sup> year.

The practical rotations related to Clinical Sciences in food-producing animals, performed at the VTH (intra-mural clinics) under academic staff supervision start in year 3: 6 shifts of 8h/each equally divided between small and large animals (consequently 24 h for large animals/student). In years 4 and 5, students take 32 shifts of 8h/each equally divided between small and large animals (consequently 126 h for large animals/student). Shifts are scheduled during day and night hours, including the weekends. 5<sup>th</sup> year students are involved in off-campus clinical rotations on farm animals (8 rotations of 8 hours each) under the tutorship of hired practitioners operating as adjunct teaching staff. For production animals (ruminants, pigs and rabbits), the clinical rotations include off-campus herd health visits (clinics), ambulatory service and daily short-term farm visits: 3 days/student (year 5).

The curriculum hours devoted to Animal Production (1) and Herd Health Management (2) are as follows: lectures: 47 (1) and 14 (2), supervised self-learning: 18 (1) and 18 (2), non-clinical animal work: 38 (1) and 27 (2).

A 2-week EPT devoted to production animals (pre-clinical) is scheduled year 3 or 4 (SER, table 3.5.1.).

During 3<sup>rd</sup>, 4<sup>th</sup> and 5<sup>th</sup> years, the training approach is mainly based on clinics and relies on the supervision of a lecturer, on the companionship of students from subsequent years, and on hired

practitioners. During the 5<sup>th</sup> year the pedagogical approach involves more actively the students to study clinical cases and to participate very actively in the clinical activities.

The subjects/disciplines related to Clinical Sciences in food-producing animals are adequately distributed throughout the last years and represent 37% of the total volume of education. Approximately 50% of the curriculum hours are devoted to ruminants, 30% to swine and the rest to poultry and rabbits. The modalities for the recruitment of animals for PPT are as follows: the clinical cases derive from activities/services at the VTH, as well as curricular off-campus traineeship periods by the students aside hired/collaborating practitioners.

Mandatory EPT dedicated to *clinical* production animals are short (see also 3.5 and Area 5) but 5<sup>th</sup> year students are involved in off-campus training on farm animals (8 shifts of 8 hours each) under the tutorship of hired practitioners operating on behalf of the VEE.

The ESVET Indicators are good to excellent except for individual ruminants and pig patients seen extramurally (see “Indicators”) that are less than the minimum (see also 3.5 and Area 5). Competences achieved by attending practical and clinical activities are validated according to the “Portfolio of Competencies” (individual electronic record of the scholarship for each student).

The VEE teaches aquaculture and bee medicine spread over several courses with little emphasis in terms of production animals.

#### **3.1.4.2. Comments**

The Animal Production and Herd Health Management curriculum is satisfactorily supported except for the Indicators (caseload) of ruminants and swine seen extramurally. The “Portfolio of Competencies” in production animals is commendable. The number of production animals (and companion animals) seen intramurally is commendable.

#### **3.1.4.3. Suggestions for improvement**

None.

#### **3.1.4.4. Decision**

The VEE is compliant with Standard 3.1.4.

### **3.1.5. Food Safety and Quality**

#### **3.1.5.1. Findings**

Food Safety and Quality, Veterinary Public Health and the One Health Concept are given over 400 hours within the curriculum, of which 176 consists of lectures. The stated aim of the training on inspection, control and certification of food products is to integrate knowledge of technology and hygiene of the supply chains relative to food of animal origin, hygiene and safety of primary production, principles of legislation of veterinary interest, in order to prepare the future veterinarian to work in the food supply chain. It also provides the necessary knowledge for the state examination in Veterinary Medicine and the post graduate education in the hygiene of the production, processing, marketing, storage and transport of food of animal origin and their products.

Food Industry and Food control, during third year, focuses on structural requirements, animal welfare and operational hygiene. Each student receives seven hours of practical training in a



group size of 7-10.

Inspection, Control and Certification follows during the fourth year, focusing on the practical teaching of animal welfare during transport, as well as ante and post mortem inspection. Each student receives 3 hours of practical training in post-mortem in groups of five.

Each student has 8 hours practical experience within the municipal slaughterhouse close to the DVM during which time they have good quality instruction in groups of 7-10 from the Official Veterinarians on the systems of ante-mortem and post-mortem inspection of bovines. The slaughterhouse premises provide an excellent learning environment for the students with plenty of space and acceptable noise levels. Each student has the opportunity to observe and palpate the organs and some students carry out incision.

The slaughter process was carried out on the bovines by an experienced operative who performed his duties in an exemplary manner. The Official Veterinarians providing the training were knowledgeable, experienced and related well with the students who maintained interest throughout.

In addition, the VEE has its own cattle/horse slaughterhouse which is well equipped. However, it is not currently operating due to there being no private operator available to use the facility in collaboration with the VEE.

Poultry slaughter may be observed through a visit to a commercial slaughter facility. This is currently not possible due to Food Business Operator concerns relating to COVID-19. Alternative possibilities for training involve videos and using the VEE's cattle slaughterhouse to process small numbers of poultry from the DVM farm.

Students were observed during a visit to a fish market where identification of fish, substitution of species and food safety hazards were outlined by the Official Veterinarian supported by a member of DVM staff. Other visits, not observed, which are experienced by all students include milk processing, meat processing, pig slaughter and processing and catering. During these visits students consolidate their understanding of food production along the supply chain, and the roles of Official Veterinarians and Food Business Operators in the Food Safety Management systems.

#### **3.1.5.2. Comments**

The time set aside for training in these subjects is sufficient.

Sufficient theoretical and practical training to attain Day One Competences is provided.

The practical training in fish hygiene and in bovine slaughter observed is to be commended particularly for the enthusiasm and knowledge of the Official Veterinarians and the academic staff. While students receive practical and technical skills through practicals in meat, poultry, rabbits, milk and fish, there is no practical training provided on honey.

The current position with no commercial contractor partner for the DVM slaughterhouse is regrettable as it results in a valuable asset being underused to the detriment of the student educational experience. It would be a significant improvement if the new contract should extend the service to include some aspect of meat processing.

### **3.1.5.3. Suggestions for improvement**

- The new contract with a commercial partner to run the DVM slaughterhouse should include an extension to include some aspect of meat processing. This may require the provision of an additional food technology laboratory, processing room.

### **3.1.5.4. Decision**

The VEE is compliant with Standard 3.1.5.

## **3.1.6. Professional Knowledge**

### **3.1.6.1. Findings**

Throughout Italy the veterinary curriculum is designated by governmental decrees (509/1999; 270/2004 and 240/2010). Whilst most requirements pertaining to professional knowledge are written within these decrees, the VEE is allowed to change the organisation of the intramural and extramural professional practical programme. However, all declarations from the unified national programme must be approved by several parties including the DVM course council, UniTO and the national university council. This is a bureaucratic procedure which can be a time-consuming burden for the university.

Students from the last three years of the veterinary programme are required to be involved in intramural practical training. This training is progressive which means that the degree of responsibility of each student increases with each academic year. Students in these years are required to undertake a certain number of shifts, with each shift being equal to 8 hours, these shifts are split equally between both small and large animals.

In the third year of the programme students are organised into six shifts which carry out during daytime. Activities during work imply moderate to advanced responsibility, according to level of knowledge of the candidate.

In the fourth and fifth year of the programme each student must undertake 32 shifts which include both day and night shifts, thus assuming responsibility in accordance with the level of knowledge of the student. Students attend companion animal shifts individually and large animal shifts in pairs. They are trained in the basic use of the VTH management system and are also required to set up clinical labs. A detailed list of activities and competencies is provided to students which can be accessed easily online, these must be carried out during the intramural part of PPT.

In the final year, students are also involved in extramural clinical rotations on production animals under the supervision of at least one of the four designated practitioners for production animals. Students undertake three such rotations amounting to 24 hours of practical work in this area. Once students have achieved 160 ECTS they are able to take part in intramural 'rounds'. These rounds are scheduled during March and October and amount to 240 hours with 6 hours to be carried out per day and 30 hours per week. Students are organised in groups of 5 - 6 and each week are assigned to a different VTH service. They have a choice of participating in: equine clinic, production animal clinic, companion animal clinic, nursing, medicine and surgery of exotic animals, companion animal surgery and reproduction, diagnostic imaging and ultrasound and clinical laboratory work.

## **FINAL REPORT AS ISSUED BY ECOVE ON 14 DECEMBER 2021**

Students are required to fill in their own electronic logbook each day, which must summarise each of the cases and the main clinical procedures they have encountered that day. Logbooks must be signed by the teaching staff on duty and are then validated by a member of the academic staff within the veterinary teaching hospital (VTH).

During 'rounds' students are also involved in the day-to-day activities within the VTH including: communication with clients, patient history taking, clinical examinations, collection of samples, developing diagnostic and treatment plans and documentation.

For production animal, herd health visits are held for students as well as the opportunity to participate in ambulatory services and short farm visits.

In intramural work students participate in both diagnostic and therapeutic procedures. Under supervision students can take part in the evaluation of recorded data, plan further investigations, participate in diagnostic procedures and decide upon corresponding therapy and prognosis of the patient and later attending any patient follow-up consultations. Students are expected to fill in clinical reports, write medical prescriptions, and be able to inform the owner of patient progress. During all these activities students are also trained to discuss and report the clinical case to colleagues.

Students are required to undertake student elective ECTS credits before graduation. The curriculum provides a limited number of these credits and only students who have achieved 190 ECTS points or more have the option to select from the list of elective practical courses which is provided at the beginning of the final year.

Electives are only prepared by the VEE academic staff with a maximum of five spaces available on each elective. External elective courses offered by different degree courses at UniTO or intramural or extramural elective practical training periods (APS) amount to a duration of 100 hours which equals 4 ECTS.

Extramural APS is performed by accredited farms or practitioners who are willing to involve students in their daily activities. Students must fill in their logbook which is checked by the DVM coordinator. Before certification of logbooks students must perform either an oral interview, oral report or oral presentation. Each student as well as the practitioner must fill in a questionnaire which is then presented to a member of academic staff.

Attendance at the clinical activities is mandatory, it is tracked and signed off by the course coordinator. In the case of 'rounds' and activities in the PPT programme, attendance is tracked by academic tutors by the taking of daily registers as well as signatures of non-academic tutors in charge. Students must achieve 80% attendance during 'rounds' and 100% for all activities included in the PPT programme. When students fail to be signed off for their attendance they are required to re-sit.

During intramural and extramural PPT students are able to fulfil the portfolio of competencies, which is compliant with the list of Day One Competences provided by the ESEVT. The performance criteria listed within this portfolio must be fulfilled before graduation. Fulfilment of performance criteria are certified by members of teaching staff during core practical work,

rounds and PPT periods as well as during examinations, including practical exams. In the case that a performance criterion is signed off by an external tutor it must then be validated by a member of academic staff.

### **3.1.6.2. Comments**

The process of accessing EPT can be long with the requirement of multiple bureaucratic party confirmations.

Half of practical rotations are dedicated to companion animals not including equine clinics, with 30 % designated to small animals and only 20 % to production animals.

### **3.1.6.3. Suggestions for improvement**

None.

### **3.1.6.4 Decision**

The VEE is compliant with Standard 3.1.6.

**Standard 3.2 Each study programme provided by the VEE must be competency-based and designed so that it meets the objectives set for it, including the intended learning outcomes. The qualification resulting from a programme must be clearly specified and communicated and must refer to the correct level of the national qualifications framework for higher education and, consequently, to the Framework for Qualifications of the European Higher Education Area.**

**The VEE must provide proof of a QA system that promotes and monitors the presence of an academic environment highly conducive to learning including self-learning. Details of the type, provision and updating of appropriate learning opportunities for the students must be clearly described, as well as the involvement of students.**

**The VEE must also describe how it encourages and prepares students for self-learning and lifelong learning.**

### **3.2.1. Findings**

The study programme in place is consistent with the enunciations of EU Directive 2005/36/EC (as amended by Directive 2013/55/EU) and embraces all subjects listed in Annex V.4. from the SER to meet expectations on the Day One veterinarian. The curriculum design is consistent with current national Italian standards. It is organized in 5 years, subdivided in 10 semesters, for a total of 300 ECTS (on average, 60 ECTS/year).

In order to provide competency training, the VEE offers a great choice and proportion of practical training (clinical rotations), promoted by the reorganization of the Professional Practical Training (PPT) to reduce group size and favour hands-on student-centred training in a variety of species and contexts. Following the recommendations of the last EAEVE visit a significant number of intramural farm animal patients are available for training. Competences achieved by attending practical and clinical activities are validated according to the “Portfolio of Competencies”. The fulfilment of “Performance Criteria” is certified by entitled members of the teaching staff on occasion of core practicals, “Rounds”, PPT periods as well as during those examinations whose format includes a practical part. In the case of EPT activities, individual “Performance Criteria” countersigned by external tutors must be validated afterwards by a member of the academic staff.

Subject Forms are intended as a transparent pact signed with students, the other teachers and stakeholders. A thorough annual check is performed by the Monitoring and Review Committee (CMR). A cross-matrix among different subjects and a syllabus of the practical activities along the entire curriculum are also available to the DVM Course Coordinator and the CMR as working tools to evaluate the completeness of the programme and facilitate the identification of inconsistencies. The cross matrix has now become available at: [https://www.clmveterinaria.unito.it/do/documenti.pl/Show?\\_id=c23q](https://www.clmveterinaria.unito.it/do/documenti.pl/Show?_id=c23q) (in Italian); [https://www.veterinarymedicine.unito.it/do/documenti.pl/Show?\\_id=q7nl](https://www.veterinarymedicine.unito.it/do/documenti.pl/Show?_id=q7nl) (in English).

The environment of the VEE is conducive to learning thanks to the number and quality of teachers, the programme organization, the available learning resources and spaces, the number and variety of patients, the hands-on involvement of students in practical and clinical training, and the assessment methods.

Innovative training methods are introduced and encouraged. E-learning tools have expanded. A lot of time is allocated to group work, and self-learning. The COVID-19 emergency apart, self-learning is particularly encouraged in two well-defined moments, namely when students attend clinical rotations (from the 3<sup>rd</sup> to the 5<sup>th</sup> year) and are assigned responsibility on a specific case/patient, and when they are engaged in preparing the graduation thesis.

Self-learning is further promoted by attendance at the clinical skills labs.

Additionally, the provision of new functional spaces for individual study and group work and the reset of outdoor spaces for the socialization and the necessary rest and relaxation offer better conditions to learn.

The VEE also offers continuing educational courses.

By the CMR annually revised Subject Forms (course sheets) are the basic building blocks of the programme. They contain all information regarding course content, teaching methods, final competences and examination methods of the units of study.

The October 2019 introduced Portfolio helps the follow-up of D1C's acquirement by the students.

A combination of elements are responsible for an academic environment conducive to learning such as the proficiency of teachers, the learning resources, hands on clinical practice, patient load etc.

Self-learning competences are taught during clinical rotations, the clinical skills labs and the elaboration of the graduation thesis.

Students have free access to Continuous Professional Development (CPD) events as a compulsory part of their PPT.

### **3.2.2. Comments**

Teaching and training at the VEE is competency-based, fitting into the European and Italian framework, and has a learning environment conducive to self-learning and life-long development.

The COVID-19 crisis has played a huge role in the accelerated development of self-learning packages.

The learning outcomes of the units of study and the relation with the general learning outcomes of the programme could be more explicit.

### **3.2.3. Suggestions for improvement**

None.

#### **3.2.4. Decision**

The VEE is compliant with Standard 3.2.

#### **Standard 3.3 Programme learning outcomes must:**

- **ensure the effective alignment of all content, teaching, learning and assessment activities of the degree programme to form a cohesive framework**
- **include a description of Day One Competences**
- **form the basis for explicit statements of the objectives and learning outcomes of individual units of study**
- **be communicated to staff and students**
- **be regularly reviewed, managed and updated to ensure they remain relevant, adequate and are effectively achieved.**

#### **3.3.1. Findings**

Learning outcomes were established for each teaching unit and are published in the online repository which is accessible to all students and stakeholders (<https://www.clmveterinaria.unito.it/do/corsi.pl/BrowseYears?>). The DVM Monitoring and Review Commission (CMR) is in charge of monitoring the subject forms, with special commitment to checking the teaching/assessing methods with the declared learning outcomes. Accordingly, each subject Coordinator is responsible for ensuring consistency between learning outcomes and the assessment.

Achievement of learning outcomes is certified in different and complementary ways: i) a positive grade in the final exam of any subject or in an interim test (where applicable), a signature (by a lecturer or a tutor) on any box of the “Portfolio of Competencies” and finally, the grade awarded following discussion of the Graduation thesis.

Intended EPT learning outcomes are defined and regularly revised by the CMR and approved by the DVM Council.

#### **3.3.2. Comments**

Learning outcomes are clearly defined in the programme and guarantee the balance of the teaching content. They are communicated to the students and staff and they are regularly reviewed. Integration of the Programme Learning Outcomes with the learning outcomes of the units of study could be more integrated.

#### **3.3.3. Suggestions for improvement**

None.

#### **3.3.4. Decision**

The VEE is compliant with Standard 3.3.

**Standard 3.4 The VEE must have a formally constituted committee structure (which includes effective student representation), with clear and empowered reporting lines, to oversee and manage the curriculum and its delivery. The committee(s) must:**

- **determine the pedagogical basis, design, delivery methods and assessment methods of the curriculum**
- **oversee QA of the curriculum, particularly gathering, evaluating, making change and responding to feedback from stakeholders, peer reviewers and external assessors, and data from examination/assessment outcomes**

- **perform on going and periodic review of the curriculum at least every seven years by involving staff, students and stakeholders; these reviews must lead to continuous improvement. Any action taken or planned as a result of such a review must be communicated to all those concerned**
- **identify and meet training needs for all types of staff, maintaining and enhancing their competence for the ongoing curriculum development.**

#### **3.4.1. Findings**

According to the SER, the VEE has a monitoring and review committee (CMR) where all interested parties have their representatives (Coordinator and vice-coordinator; delegates for QA, PPT & OTP; teaching staff and students), CMR is in charge of monitoring and revising the curriculum. To do so CMR is in charge of:

- Collecting and analysing feedback from students, teaching staff and stakeholders on the quality and the progress of every course unit.
- Proposing changes or improvement to the structure or organisation of the programme or parts of it.
- The composition and final editing of the Scheda Unica Annuale (SUA-CdS).
- Preparing the annual quality indicators for ANVUR (student flow, internationalisation and integration of graduates into the labour market) in the “Scheda di Monitoraggio Annuale”.
- Carryng out the periodical review of the DVM programme (“Rapporto di Riesame ciclico”).
- Taking care of communication and coordination of education-related policy options and related decisions with other academic bodies and committees.

At the end of the process all CMR documents are send to the DVM council for discussion and approval. Finally approved changes are published on the website or adapted in the respective course sheets.

Representatives of the veterinary profession are officially asked in advance about proposals of major changes in the curriculum. Feedback about major organizational changes is also given to the professional stakeholders.

#### **3.4.2. Comments**

The CMR is a committee with many responsibilities. In addition, each of its responsibilities is extensively documented with questionnaires, analyses and proposals, in which QA is always an important part. Despite the paperwork that this way of working entails, it is commendable how each adjustment is documented.

#### **3.4.3. Suggestions for improvement**

None.

#### **3.4.4. Decision**

The VEE is compliant with Standard 3.4.

**Standard 3.5 External Practical Training (EPT) is compulsory training activities organised outside the VEE, the student being under the direct supervision of a non-academic person (e.g. a practitioner). EPT cannot replace the core intramural training nor the extramural training under the close supervision of academic staff (e.g. ambulatory clinics, herd health management, practical training in FSQ and VPH).**

**Since the veterinary degree is a professional qualification with Day One Competences, EPT must complement and strengthen the academic education inter alia by enhancing student’s professional knowledge.**

### **3.5.1. Findings**

EPT starts in third year of the programme and is divided into five teaching modules:

- Animal health and preventive veterinary medicine (50 hours)
- Inspection and hygiene of food of animal origin (125 hours)
- Animal husbandry, animal welfare, pharmacosurveillance and pharmacovigilance (75 hours),
- Post-mortem diagnostics (25 hours),
- Companion animal clinics (75 hours)

The first three items of expertise noted above are carried out in local units of the national health system (ASSL) by official veterinarians. Post-mortem diagnostics are carried out at the zooprofilactic institute and in the last item students are under the surveillance of private non-academic companion animal clinics. The intended EPT learning outcomes are defined and regularly revised by CMR and then approved by the DVM council. External private partners must be approved and put on the official UniTO list. Students must pass the necessary preparatory exams in order to start their EPT studies. At the end of any EPT period both the student and non-academic tutor must fill in an evaluation form. During EPT students must fill in a logbook with the cases they have seen and practical skills carried out which must then be approved by their academic tutor.

According to the programme EPT must be undertaken in a range of veterinary expert areas. Meetings between stakeholders and leaders of the programme take place to discuss intended outcomes and evaluation strategies to ensure coherency between the EPT course and academic training.

It is necessary that during the EPT studies students are exposed to “real life” challenges and are made aware of the official databases of the national veterinary health system. They must acquire experience of basic medical and surgical treatments in companion animals and must practice communication with owners to further develop skills in a variety of expert areas of the veterinary profession.

### **3.5.2. Comments**

Students are exposed to a sufficient number of 'real life' clinical practice scenarios with production animals outside of the academic surroundings.

The team recognises that the opportunity for students to be more involved in clinical equine cases is more difficult due to the owners' perception of value of their equine. However, in small animal practice and more so in production animal practice, there are more opportunities for students to be involved with clinical procedures without the huge concern of owners as long as animal welfare rules are followed.

The VEE is able to provide hands-on practice for the “treatment” of small animals and large animals (mainly food producing); while for equine practice, the “treatment” applications by the students are restricted due to animal owners preferences.

### **3.5.3. Suggestions for improvement**

- The number of equine treatment for students' practices are expected to be increased by convincing the owners that standards of animal welfare are always secured.



#### **3.5.4. Decision**

The VEE is compliant with Standard 3.5.

**Standard 3.6 The EPT providers must have an agreement with the VEE and the student (in order to state their respective rights and duties, including insurance matters), provide a standardised evaluation of the performance of the student during their EPT and be allowed to provide feedback to the VEE on the EPT programme.**

**There must be a member of the academic staff responsible for the overall supervision of the EPT, including liaison with EPT providers.**

#### **3.6.1. Findings**

Every student intended for EPT programmes is fully insured by the VEE. It is assured that students have the necessary knowledge and skills to attend EPT in a non-academic environment. Staff have access to a database of external practices that are willing to take students for EPT and students can request information of appropriate EPT placements from this database, students do not have access to this database for privacy reasons.

The administrative management of EPT is under the responsibility of Orientation, Tutorship and Placement service (OTP) who are located on the veterinary campus. Students can only attend an EPT placement once the EPT provider has signed an agreement with UniTO. Students must agree with academic and non-academic tutors on specific training objectives that they will be required to meet during their EPT.

EPT providers are regularly invited to participate in clarification/updating of the kind of training students are expected to achieve and how to evaluate and harmonise the student performance.

#### **3.6.2. Comments**

Students stated that the process of filling out the necessary paperwork for off-site EPT takes a lot of time, however it is not difficult. In the event of any complications or difficulties they were able to receive the necessary support from staff to complete the forms. The students stated that they were easily able to find placements on their own and were also able to request help from staff to find placements.

The criteria to select EPT sites is described and secured by the agreement between the university-EPT-provider-student. A feedback mechanism where the students evaluate EPT providers, is present.

#### **3.6.3. Suggestions for improvement**

None.

#### **3.6.4. Decision**

The VEE is compliant with Standard 3.6.

**Standard 3.7 Students must take responsibility for their own learning during EPT. This includes preparing properly before each placement, keeping a proper record of their experience during EPT by using a logbook provided by the VEE and evaluating the EPT. Students must be allowed to complain officially and/or anonymously about issues**

**occurring during EPT. The VEE must have a system of QA to monitor the implementation, progress and then feedback within the EPT activities.**

### **3.7.1. Findings**

In order for students to attend external EPT placements, they must have the necessary theoretical background which is assessed through regular preparatory exams. During student training non-academic tutors are responsible for the progress of their students. To fulfil all the necessary tasks in the EPT programme, students must keep a logbook which must include descriptions of daily activities they carried out as well as a record of their attendance at various EPT placements. The logbook is contra signed by a non-academic tutor.

At the end of each EPT programme students must fill in a survey about the EPT provider where the results of which are periodically sent to the EPT provider as well as any external tutors and stakeholders. All results from the student surveys are collected by the OTP service on campus and analysed by EPT delegates in CMR where they are annually discussed.

Student complaints are conveyed to the DVM coordinator by student representative's in CMR or they are anonymously reported where they are discussed in staff-student meetings at the end of each semester and the results of the discussion are drafted by the didactic manager. In the case of criticism or complaints corrective actions are implemented. However, staff stated that they have never received a complaint from a student about EPT providers and so an example of an exact procedure and process could not be stated.

### **3.7.2. Comments**

An important component of EPT is the leadership and guidance provided by supervisors. Students can lose motivation by either too little or too much supervision, therefore training of the academic supervisors regularly of work content, amount of supervision and appraisals during EPT is essential.

### **3.7.3. Suggestions for improvement**

None.

### **3.7.4. Decision**

The VEE is compliant with Standard 3.7.

## **Area 4. Facilities and equipment**

**Standard 4.1 All aspects of the physical facilities must provide an environment conducive to learning, including internet access. The veterinary VEE must have a clear strategy and programme for maintaining and upgrading its buildings and equipment. Facilities must comply with all relevant legislation including health, safety, biosecurity, accessibility to people with reduced mobility, and EU animal welfare and care standards.**

### **4.1.1. Findings**

The VEE is located in the Agriculture and Veterinary Medicine Campus in Grugliasco at 12 km from metropolitan Turin, and it is well connected to the main town by public transportation. The VEE area comprises 120,000 m<sup>2</sup> of land and 50,611 m<sup>2</sup> of built-up area. Main facilities include the main building (shared with Agriculture Department), the Veterinary Teaching

Hospital, the Farm, the Didactic Center, the Student Center, the Library, the Kennel (runned by the municipality), the Cafeteria and additional buildings for housing staff and research labs. All facilities are covered by Wi-Fi connection (Eduroam is available in all buildings and green areas) and are accessible to people with reduced mobility. Animal welfare regulations are implemented.

UniTO Building management, logistics and sustainability and the UniTO ICT, website and e-learning Directorates, respectively are in charge of maintenance and upgrading of the campus. A three-year programme for facilities maintenance, renovation, innovation and acquisition is available and annually reviewed.

#### **4.1.2. Comments**

Facilities guarantee an adequate environment for students and staff. Most premises are ventilated by an air-refreshment system.

Public transportation schedules are not optimal for students and therefore the campus parking is overcrowded. It is commendable that students can achieve extensive practical training in the community shelter.

#### **4.1.3. Suggestions for improvement**

- Under the current climate conditions it is suggested to provide air conditioning in all relevant premises including the chemical consumables storage areas.
- It is suggested that the current mandatory hours (1 day) of training in the community shelter be extended.

#### **4.1.4. Decision**

The VEE is compliant with Standard 4.1.

**Standard 4.2 Lecture theatres, teaching laboratories, tutorial rooms, clinical facilities and other teaching spaces must be adequate in number, size and equipped for the instructional purposes and must be well maintained. The facilities must be adapted for the number of students enrolled. Students must have ready access to adequate and sufficient study, self-learning, recreation, locker, sanitary and food service facilities.**

**Offices, teaching preparation and research laboratories must be sufficient for the needs of the academic and support staff.**

#### **4.2.1. Findings**

The VEE has plenty teaching rooms including an aula magna with 295 m<sup>2</sup>, two aulas of approximately 216 m<sup>2</sup> and five additional rooms, all equipped with computerized projection systems and Wi-Fi connection. There are several rooms for “work in groups” and 3 seminar rooms.

In addition, there are 2 skill labs with a total of 14 seats, 2 necropsy rooms and different laboratories: biology, chemistry, computer lab, anatomy dissection room, osteology room, feed analysis lab and teaching farm. The VTH provides facilities for clinical activities including consultations, diagnostic services, housing of hospitalized animals, emergency units and isolation units. A slaughterhouse and kennel are also available for teaching.

There are premises for self-learning and study including the library and Student centre, locker rooms, catering facilities (canteen, cafeteria and vending), and accommodation for on-call students and staff at the VTH and the teaching farm.

Staff offices and research laboratories along the VEE are adequate in number and conditions

for teaching and research.

#### **4.2.2. Comments**

The number and equipment of facilities for theoretical and practical teaching are adequate. Self-learning facilities, recreation, locker, sanitary and food services for students are suitable.

#### **4.2.3. Suggestions for improvement**

None.

#### **4.2.4. Decision**

The VEE is compliant with Standard 4.2.

**Standard 4.3 The livestock facilities, animal housing, core clinical teaching facilities and equipment used by the VEE for teaching purposes must:**

- **be sufficient in capacity and adapted for the number of students enrolled in order to allow safe hands-on training for all students**
- **be of a high standard, well maintained and fit for the purpose**
- **promote best husbandry, welfare and management practices**
- **ensure relevant biosecurity and bio-containment**
- **be designed to enhance learning.**

#### **4.3.1. Findings**

Facilities for animal housing (healthy and hospitalized), livestock and clinical activities are in agreement with the requirements for all species including companion animals. Clinical activities are concentrated at the VTH, involving the Companion Animal-VTH, Large Animal-VTH; non-Conventional Animals and Wildlife Unit (exotics) and Diagnostic Services (including laboratories and imaging).

The VTH provides facilities for consultation, diagnostic purposes and hospitalization of companion animals, equines, production animals, and exotics.

A CE-authorized slaughterhouse is also available and equipped with a complete slaughtering line for bovines, horses, sheep and goats.

#### **4.3.2. Comments**

The physical facilities of the VEE provide an environment conducive for learning. Biosecurity and biosafety procedures are well implemented in all premises. Training in exotics medicine is provided by a general practitioner.

Establishing the state-of-the art non-Conventional Animals and Wildlife Unit (exotics) is commendable.

#### **4.3.3. Suggestions for improvement**

None.

#### **4.3.4. Decision**

The VEE is compliant with Standard 4.3.

**Standard 4.4 Core clinical teaching facilities must be provided in a veterinary teaching hospital (VTH) with 24/7 emergency services at least for companion animals and equines. Within the VTH, the VEE must unequivocally demonstrate that standard of education and clinical research are compliant with all ESEVT Standards, e.g. research-based and**

evidence-based clinical training supervised by academic staff trained to teach and to assess, availability for staff and students of facilities and patients for performing clinical research and relevant QA procedures.

For ruminants, on-call service must be available if emergency services do not exist for those species in a VTH.

The VEE must ensure state-of-the-art standards of teaching clinics which remain comparable with or exceeding the best available in the private sector.

The VTH and any hospitals, practices and facilities (including EPT) which are involved with the curriculum must meet the relevant national Practice Standards.

#### **4.4.1. Findings**

The VTH has a 24/7 emergency service for companion animals and equines. For ruminants, an on-call service is available for referred patients.

The VEE facilities and staff create the conditions for adequate evidence-based clinical training.

#### **4.4.2. Comments**

The VEE meets the requirements.

#### **4.4.3. Suggestions for improvement**

None.

#### **4.4.4. Decision**

The VEE is compliant with Standard 4.4.

**Standard 4.5 The VEE must ensure that students have access to a broad range of diagnostic and therapeutic facilities, including but not limited to: diagnostic imaging, anaesthesia, clinical pathology, intensive/critical care, surgeries and treatment facilities, ambulatory services, pharmacy and necropsy facilities.**

#### **4.5.1. Findings**

Students have access to all, modern and new or updated diagnostic and therapeutic facilities and a variety of patients of different species intramurally and extramurally starting from the 3<sup>rd</sup> year.

#### **4.5.2. Comments**

None.

#### **4.5.3. Suggestions for improvement**

None.

#### **4.5.4. Decision**

The VEE is compliant with Standard 4.5.

**Standard 4.6 Appropriate isolation facilities must be provided to meet the need for the isolation and containment of animals with communicable diseases. Such isolation facilities must be properly constructed, ventilated, maintained and operated to provide for animal care and for prevention of spread of infectious agents. They must be adapted to all animal species commonly handled in the VTH.**

#### **4.6.1. Findings**

The VEE maintains two isolation units, for companion animals and equine/farm animals respectively. A third isolation unit for non-conventional animals and wildlife is currently under construction. The first isolation unit is located at the VTH and can be used for both dogs and cats.

Isolation units are adequately equipped and operate under relevant and sufficient biosecurity guidelines and protocols.

#### **4.6.2. Comments**

The isolation units are adequate and for the large animals they are commendable.

#### **4.6.3. Suggestions for improvement**

None.

#### **4.6.4. Decision**

The VEE is compliant with Standard 4.6.

**Standard 4.7 The VEE must have an ambulatory clinic for production animals or equivalent facilities so that students can practise field veterinary medicine and Herd Health Management under academic supervision.**

#### **4.7.1. Findings**

Practical training in field veterinary medicine and herd health management is provided during visits to the Teaching Farm and a single off-campus poultry farm (128 hours/student). In addition, there are daily visits to off-campus cattle, donkey, swine and rabbit farms and horse stables (35 hours overall; 4 – 5 students/shift). Furthermore, students participate in the daily activities of hired and pedagogically trained farm animal practitioners off campus (24 hours overall; 2-3 students/shift).

For ambulatory practical training the VEE is using 2 vehicles. The vehicles are equipped with ultrasound equipment and a limited number of medicines and instruments because the students have free access to all types of relevant medicines and instruments belonging to the onsite veterinarians and/or farmers.

The animal owners are clients of a private practitioner. All ambulatory clinic visitations are carried out together with the local practitioner and, whenever necessary, also under the surveillance of a public veterinarian. If treatment is required, such as surgery, the practitioner will perform it with the participation of the students and under supervision and support from VEE staff.

Moreover, the VEE's ambulatory clinic operate as a service on demand 365 days/year. In all cases students are present.

#### **4.7.2. Comments**

The VEE does not “own” its own clients but collaborates closely with local practitioners. The VEE is compliant with Standard 4.7 because the ambulatory service provides a diagnostic service in collaboration with private practitioners and under the supervision of VEE staff. The 2 vehicles used for the ambulatory clinic are sufficiently equipped given the fact that all types of treatment is done in collaboration with the animal owners' private practitioner using her

equipment.

#### **4.7.3. Suggestions for improvement**

None.

#### **4.7.4. Decision**

The VEE is compliant with Standard 4.7.

**Standard 4.8 The transport of students, live animals, cadavers, materials from animal origin and other teaching materials must be done in agreement with national and EU standards, to ensure the safety of students and staff and to prevent the spread of infectious agents.**

#### **4.8.1. Findings**

For student transportation there are four minibuses and for other purposes there are one car for biological samples, a leak proof vehicle for risk materials, two vehicles for transportation of large and small live animals, a trailer for large animal transportation and a four-wheel-drive vehicle for field capture of injured wildlife animals.

#### **4.8.2. Comments**

The vehicles available ensure safe transportation of students, samples and animals.

#### **4.8.3. Suggestions for improvement**

None.

#### **4.8.4. Decision**

The VEE is compliant with Standard 4.8.

**Standard 4.9 Operational policies and procedures (including e.g. biosecurity, good laboratory practice and good clinical practice) must be taught and posted for students, staff and visitors and a Biosafety manual must be available. The VEE must demonstrate a clear commitment for the delivery of biosafety and biosecurity, e.g. by a specific committee structure. The VEE must have a system of QA to monitor and assure clinical, laboratory and farm services, including a regular monitoring of the feedback from students, staff and clients.**

#### **4.9.1. Findings**

Biosafety and biosecurity issues are addressed by the VEE Biosecurity Committee, composed of an expert on behalf of UniTO Service for Prevention and Protection and by members of the academic and support staff of the different services.

The VEE has set protocols aimed to ensure that all activities and services are run smoothly and safely, including quality control of processes as animal admission to clinics, diagnosis and treatment, the management of emergencies, hospitalization and intensive care, and pharmacy.

Written rules govern the access to work premises, the clothing management, cleaning and sanitizing of the different areas, and the maintenance of facilities and equipment.

The Biosecurity Committee updates the biosafety manual and it is in charge of its

implementation, such as promoting and organizing the mandatory training on biosecurity for the students and staff.

Operational policies and procedures are collected in the "Risk assessment, prevention and Biosafety manual" available on the website

([https://www.veterinaria.unito.it/do/documenti.pl/Show?\\_id=5ki4](https://www.veterinaria.unito.it/do/documenti.pl/Show?_id=5ki4)).

Processes involved in the Quality and Good Veterinary Practice (GVP) Management System at the SDSV are subject to periodical internal audits and customer satisfaction questionnaires.

#### **4.9.2. Comments**

Biosecurity/biosafety procedures are adequate and well implemented. Controlled drugs are stored according to good Good Clinical Practice (GCP) and other EU regulations.

Biosecurity procedures for access of lorries to the restricted farm area are commendable.

#### **4.9.3. Suggestions for improvement**

None.

#### **4.9.4. Decision**

The VEE is compliant with Standard 4.9.

### **Area 5. Animal resources and teaching material of animal origin**

**Standard 5.1 The number and variety of healthy and diseased animals, cadavers, and material of animal origin must be adequate for providing the practical and safe hands-on training (in the areas of Basic Sciences, Clinical Sciences, Pathology, Animal Production, Food Safety and Quality) and adapted to the number of students enrolled.**

**Evidence must be provided that these data are regularly recorded and that procedures are in place for correcting any deficiencies.**

#### **5.1.1. Findings**

To be compliant with Day One Competences in line with EU Directives (2005/36 and 2016/35), with internal QA policy and the 3-year strategic plan, the use of animals and material of animal origin is essential for the practical training in different core subjects, from Anatomy to Pathological Anatomy, Food Hygiene and all clinical subjects.

The VEE's global strategy relies on:

- i) periodic monitoring of ESEVT Indicators
- ii) interaction with the VTH and the Teaching Farm management for provisions related to clinical training;
- iii) optimization of recruitment and use of cadavers
- iv) agreement with external parties, including public health agencies, a public kennel and veterinary practitioners;
- v) purchase of material of animal origin.

On request of the Didactic Committee, needs are annually identified.

SER Tables 5.1.1 to 5.1.8 give the number of animals or materials of animal origin used during the courses (including clinics, necropsy, animal production and herd health management, plus visits to slaughter houses).

For basic sciences and pre-clinical learning, materials of animal origin and healthy animals are used to teach the structure, behaviour, physiological and welfare needs of animals and the basis



of clinical examination.

For anatomy, cadavers of companion animals are supplied by internal and external sources, namely from the VTH and private clinics after obtaining informed consent by the owners. Ruminants consist in medium-sized wild ruminants, and cadavers are obtained by agreement with public wildlife agencies. Other teaching material of animal origin includes organs (e.g. heads, plucks, limbs, genitals and isolated organs of horses, bovines and pigs) provided by the internal and some external nearby slaughterhouses. Cadavers are mainly represented by companion animals (mean 50.7/year) and small ruminants (mean 5.7/year). Isolated organs mainly come from cattle (mean 51.7/year), pigs (mean 27/year) and horses (mean 44/year).

For pathology (necropsy), the majority of cadavers of domestic animals for training are those submitted to the departmental post-mortem service for diagnostic purposes, including animals from the VTH, the teaching farm, private clinics, practitioners, public and private kennels, charities and individual owners, and wildlife cadavers obtained by agreement with the competent regional authority through a range of local agencies. All species are represented for necropsy, including exotic pets and aquatic animals. For the main species, (i.e. cattle, small ruminant, pigs, horses, and companion animals) the number of cadavers increased sharply between 2017 and 2019 for example from 49 to 103 (cattle), 10 to 105 (pigs) and 144 to 271 (companion animals).

The material used for training in anatomy and pathology originating from external sources is transported to the VEE by a vehicle authorized for transportation of animal by-products as prescribed by the Regulation (EC) No 1069/2009. Finally, the material (cadavers, fresh and fixed organs/tissues and fixed tissues) is collected and disposed of by incineration at a specialized company.

For preclinical training, live ruminants (mean 125), pigs (mean 173.3), horses (mean 5.3), companion animals (mean 20) and poultry+rabbits (mean 1,283.3) are used each year.

For clinical training, the acquisition of technical know-how is carried out in various successive phases during which the students who have acquired the theoretical knowledge (material, conditions of realization etc.), (i) observe and practice the technical skills performed in the two new clinical skill labs (ii) observe the technical skills within the hospital structure by competent staff, (iii) are trained in their implementation on animals for teaching, (iv) help to perform the actions and finally, (v) perform the actions under the supervision of a competent staff (inside and outside the VEE during PPT and EPT).

The number of animals used for clinical training is constantly increasing for all species (SER tables 5.1.3 and 5.14), and all species of veterinary interest are sufficiently represented.

Procedures to ensure the welfare of animals used in educational (and research) activities at the VEE are consistent with Italian pending legislation, D.Lvo n° 26/2014a, and further regulations adopted by UniTOb. The VEE has independently set an internal Ethics and Animal Welfare Committee. The existing procedure to decide, verify and review the number of animals, material of animal origin and the clinical services for students' training is based on the regular monitoring of ESEVT indicators, and data is usually evaluated once every two years.

Mandatory practical training for clinics in food producing animals (excluding horses) consists in 3 PPT rotations in year 3, 8 PPT rotations on year 4 and 8 rotations on year 5 (1 rotation = 8 hours), for a total of 19 rotations. The 8 rotations in year 5 consists in 5 rotations at the hospital of the VEE and 3 EPT rotations, one for cattle, one for pig and one for rabbit. Students may choose to add 2x100h EPT in practices dealing with food producing animals (*optional*) see 5.2.1.

### **5.1.2. Comments**

For basic sciences and for pre-clinical training, the number and variety of healthy and diseased animals, cadavers, and material of animal origin is considered adequate to provide the practical and safe hands on training and appropriate for the number of students enrolled.

For clinical training, there is a constant ambition to maintain and, better, increase a sufficient caseload both in companion animals, exotics, equines, and in food producing animals, with respect to intramural cases.

As described, all procedures to obtain, prepare, store and destroy the cadavers and material of animal origin are considered satisfactory. Records of all necropsy reports are available in electronic format in a dedicated server. A separate electronic system for recording of treatments and vaccinations is in use at the teaching farm. According to national regulations, all animals housed in the teaching farm are registered in the official loading/unloading electronic register. Overall, procedures are in place for correcting any deficiencies and to improve practices.

The Indicators are all positive and for I12 and I13 figures have increased during the last Academic Year as a result of the implementation of the activities at the municipal canine and feline shelter and the off-campus clinical rotation on farm animals under the tutorship of hired practitioners since autumn 2020. See the added Indicators 2020/2021 table. These changes have been implemented under difficult conditions due to the serious COVID-19 situation and the postponement of the Full Visitation.

Establishing an internal Ethics and Animal Welfare Committee is commendable.

### **5.1.3. Suggestions for improvement**

- The conventional approach to anatomy based on dissection could be supplied with the introduction of a variety of complementary dynamic imaging teaching modalities (e.g. ultrasonography, radiography).
- An optional EPT (2x100h) could be partially or totally devoted to food producing animals.

### **5.1.4. Decision**

The VEE is compliant with Standard 5.1.

**Standard 5.2 In addition to the training provided in the VEE, experience can include practical training at external sites, provided this training is organised under direct academic supervision and following the same standards as those applied in the VEE.**

### **5.2.1. Findings**

Familiarisation with the diagnostic and therapeutic approach can be achieved in both the consultation sector (in situ-VTH- and ambulatory clinics-EPT) and the hospital sector-VTH. All students are involved in mandatory off-campus training (overall 14 ECTS), starting from the third year of the curriculum. EPT is done at local healthcare units (ASSL) of the National Health System, at the Diagnostic Laboratories of the Istituto Zooprofilattico Sperimentale (IZS), and, starting from fall 2020, at private veterinary clinics or veterinary hospitals.

Candidate hospitals/clinics for EPT periods are included in an official list following their spontaneous declaration of availability and the fulfilment of a bureaucratic procedure with

UniTO, leading to inclusion in the list of EPT providers. The list is permanently open to the staff: students do not have access to the list but they can ask the staff. Extra curriculum EPT is not allowed. However, optional curricular EPT is allowed, during the whole year (year 4 and 5), in form of extramural elective practical training (acronym APS). Each period has a duration of 100 hours (4 ECTS). Traineeship abroad (mostly in the frame of Erasmus programmes) is accepted and encouraged by the VEE.

Students are under the direct supervision of a local tutor formally trained on the skills to be developed. EPT is supervised by academic staff and assessed with the support of a logbook describing the daily activities and certifying the student's attendance.

### **5.2.2. Comments**

Mandatory clinical EPT, especially on large animals, is of short duration compared to the whole curriculum. For the period 2017-2019, EPT mainly focused on pre-clinical subjects, on food hygiene and pharmacosurveillance and on preventive medicine.

EPT increases the practice in the main domestic species and allows a better fulfilment of Day-One skills for clinical disciplines, at least for year 4 and 5 students (see 5.1.1 to 5.1.3). The VEE has set them up since fall 2020.

### **5.2.3. Suggestions for improvement**

None.

### **5.2.4. Decision**

The VEE is compliant with Standard 5.2.

**Standard 5.3 The VTH must provide nursing care skills and instruction in nursing procedures. Under all situations students must be active participants in the clinical workup of patients, including problem-oriented diagnostic approach together with diagnostic decision-making.**

### **5.3.1. Findings**

Skills in small animal's hygiene and nursing are acquired by undergraduate students during their rotations at the VTH, during consultations and hospitalization of intramural patients. Students are involved during hospitalization as well as during the visit of patients in front of the owners.

In companion animal medicine, year 3 and 4 students perform the daily physical examination and provide nursing care on hospitalized animals. Final year students during clinical rotations ("Rounds") are involved in hands-on history taking, physical examination, blood and urine sampling and diagnostic imaging. They also interpret diagnostic tests, suggest treatment procedures and assist the clinician in the emergency visits.

In equine medicine, students assist the clinicians during first aid management of emergency, perform the physical examination of hospitalized patients and provide nursing care. During "Rounds" in their final year, students perform history taking, physical examination and biological samples collection. They interpret diagnostic tests, suggest treatment procedures and assist the clinician.

In food producing animal medicine, clinical training starts with practicals during which year 3 and 4 students perform the physical examination. On the animals raised in the teaching farm student assist the clinician during the most common clinical procedures. For the year 5 students “Rounds” are mainly carried out in form of ambulatory clinic.

In line with the learning objectives of the core clinical courses, “Rounds” and PPT periods, students are progressively stimulated to improve their autonomy, including the critical understanding of the case management. Students become deeply involved in the daily discussion of the caseload particularly during the 5<sup>th</sup> year.

### **5.3.2. Comments**

The active participation of students in the clinical workgroups is facilitated by the adequate group size for the different types of clinical training (both intramurally and extramurally). Younger students can be mentored by more advanced students. The teaching farm is a valuable tool.

### **5.3.3. Suggestions for improvement**

None.

### **5.3.4. Decision**

The VEE is compliant with Standard 5.3.

**Standard 5.4 Medical records must be comprehensive and maintained in an effective retrieval system (preferably an electronic patient record system) to efficiently support the teaching, research, and service programmes of the VEE.**

### **5.4.1. Findings**

The electronic patient record system has been designed for the VTH as well as for undergraduate and postgraduate clinical teaching. To improve on both aspects, a new cloud-based veterinary practice management software (<https://www.provet.cloud/>) was purchased in 2018 and has been fully operative since February 2020. The Provet Cloud base model has been upgraded to support queries by clinical disciplines, consultations vs hospitalizations and first-opinion vs referral cases. Feedback on work by the individual student has been streamlined. All data on admitted patients at VTH (including companion animals, equines, food producing animals and non-conventional animals) are conveyed in a single centralized data-warehouse, allowing a complete retrieval of any patient, case management and administrative information. Students and staff freely access the patient record system through their University's Unified Credentials System (SCU). Students are adequately trained to Provet Cloud.

Until migration of the VTH patient data on Provet Cloud, the available electronic record system was Virtual Machine HyperV (Windows server 2012-R2), run as an Intranet service.

A dedicated “home-made” record system “CANC 5.0” (based on Microsoft Access) for clinical data has been implemented in the non-conventional animal section. Finally, a separate electronic system for recording of treatments and vaccinations is in use at the Teaching Farm.

### **5.4.2. Comments**

The implementation of a single integrated system for patient records for all species guarantees an efficient support to the teaching, research, and service programmes of the VEE is not in place. However, experience with fully integrated systems varies between VEEs.

### **5.4.3. Suggestions for improvement**

None.

### **5.4.4. Decision**

The VEE is compliant with Standard 5.4.

## **Area 6. Learning resources**

**Standard 6.1 State-of-the-art learning resources must be adequate and available to support veterinary education, research, services and continuing education. When the study programme is provided in several tracks/languages, the learning resources must be available in all used languages. Timely access to learning resources, whether through print, electronic media or other means, must be available to students and staff and, when appropriate, to stakeholders. State-of-the-art procedures for bibliographical search and for access to databases and learning resources must be taught to undergraduate students.**

### **6.1.1. Findings**

After the Visitation in 2010, staff of the VEE recognised that materials from the central and subsidiary libraries were necessary for teaching purposes as well as state-of-the-art interactive learning resources. Therefore, two clinical skill labs were established, and two important processes have been essential to this:

- Formation of a strengthened educational programme for staff which was finished in 2017;
- Reorganisation of intramural PPT to include mandatory self-learning at newly formed clinical skill labs.

At the beginning of every academic year a welcome session is organised with the presence of the president of each course, didactic manager, coordinator of the campus library and IT coordinator. At this session students are informed about a number of items including: how to activate and manage the institutional e-learning account, how to access the virtual campus, how to use the library services and the benefits of the library.

Library staff are very willing to help students at any time on all of the available services including: how to use search machines and the retrieval system, the availability of a variety of databases and catalogues, the available licenced software for literature research and how to manage bibliographic data through citation. Students increasingly use tutorials and free study resources.

PhD students are offered courses to encourage and facilitate the use of advanced online resources. During the COVID-19 crisis IT staff offered refresher courses on how to use the Moodle platform, video conferencing and how to organise remote exams.

The library committee is responsible for the full management of the campus library as well as making all of the strategic decisions on e-learning and new technologies. They also establish and develop the library policy which includes budget planning and update and renew book collections and subscriptions periodically to control the quality of library services. The library committee is appointed for three years and is composed of three VEE academic staff members, three academic staff members from the Agricultural department, two student representatives

and two members of technical staff.

In 2015 the library committee began upgrading the quality management system to ISO 9001-2015 and in 2018 acquired the title of the first ISO certified library in UniTO. This certificate prioritised revision and expansion of the quality management system with regards to processes related to the provision of library services and definition of new key performance indicators. This was only possible with extensive involvement and training of staff in quality management systems, this resulted in the improvement of user satisfaction of students which is monitored through surveys completed by both students and VEE staff.

The library committee has a degree of freedom when it comes to procedures around acquiring new books, they regularly carry out surveys and enquire about satisfaction with the library services which is published on the library website.

### **6.1.2. Comments**

The quality of the online veterinary education materials are assessed regularly through individual learner and teacher perspectives in terms of professional, pedagogical, usability, accessibility and production quality.

The COVID-19 emergency resulted in a rapid and widespread adaptation to new e-learning teaching tools. This has resulted in a qualitative and quantitative increase of such resources and methods.

It is commendable that the library staff are both very helpful to the students and very enthusiastic about their work.

### **6.1.3. Suggestions for improvement**

None.

### **6.1.4. Decision**

The VEE is compliant with Standard 6.1.

**Standard 6.2 Staff and students must have full access on site to an academic library administered by a qualified librarian, an Information Technology (IT) unit managed by an IT expert, an e-learning platform, and all the relevant human and physical resources necessary for the development of instructional materials by the staff and their use by the students.**

**The relevant electronic information, database and other intranet resources must be easily available for students and staff both in the VEE's core facilities via wireless connection (Wi-Fi) and from outside the VEE through a hosted secured connection, e.g. Virtual Private Network (VPN).**

### **6.2.1. Findings**

The VEE Library is part of the library system of the University of Turin, which is included in the national library service. It is open to students, university staff and also the general public. Across the Campus including in the library there is free Wi-Fi and W-Lan for mobile devices, which both students and staff have access to using their SCU credentials.

### **6.2.2. Comments**

Student satisfaction for internet resources, e-learning and IT support is assessed regularly.

### **6.2.3. Suggestions for improvement**

None.

### **6.2.4. Decision**

The VEE is compliant with Standard 6.2.

**Standard 6.3 The VEE must provide students with unimpeded access to learning resources, internet and internal study resources, and equipment for the development of procedural skills (e.g. models). The use of these resources must be aligned with the pedagogical environment and learning outcomes within the programme and have mechanisms in place to evaluate the teaching value of changes in learning resources.**

### **6.3.1. Findings**

The library has access to over 15,000 journals and 1,500 books. At the time of the COVID-19 crisis the number of subscriptions to online journals increased significantly.

Students can access the library's electronic resources from outside the UniTO network by using any browser and electronic device with their SCU credentials. All teaching staff are requested to upload teaching material at the beginning of their lecture period, so that students can download teaching material from UniTO platform ahead of lectures.

The E-Moodle platform is used for teaching material and was used throughout the COVID-19 crisis by teaching staff to allow for distance teaching, this continues to be used.

### **6.3.2. Comments**

The range of online learning resources (from material to tools) allows students to construct the learning environment that is most suited to their individual requirements and preferences.

Regular assessments on the preferences of e-learning activities (frequency evaluation of the usage of e-classroom for learning, reading electronic books, searching articles in databases, using other (foreign) universities' electronic educational material, social networks etc.) and ICT activities (frequency evaluation of the usage of audiobooks, zoom, recording lectures, assisting hardware) of the students would enable lecturers to improve the environment of self-learning.

### **6.3.3. Suggestions for improvement**

None.

### **6.3.4. Decision**

The VEE is compliant with Standard 6.3.

## **Area 7. Student admission, progression and welfare**

**Standard 7.1 The VEE must consistently apply pre-defined and published regulations covering all phases of the student "life cycle", e.g. student admission, progression and**

**certification.**

**In relation to enrolment, the VEE must provide accurate and complete information regarding all aspects of the educational programme in all advertisings for prospective national and international students.**

**Formal cooperations with other VEEs must also be clearly advertised.**

### **7.1.1. Findings**

All relevant information can be found on the website of the DVM course and comprises enrolment criteria, course programme, progression criteria, international mobility and partner countries, information on the graduation exam and the state exam.

In July, the annually updated educational programme (Manifesto Guida dello Studente), after approval by DVM & VEE council, is also published on the DVM website.

Prospective students can find on the website an annually updated document, Scheda SUA-CdS ([https://www.clmveterinaria.unito.it/do/documenti.pl/Show?\\_id=k6zh](https://www.clmveterinaria.unito.it/do/documenti.pl/Show?_id=k6zh)), prepared by the Monitoring & Review Committee (CMR) with detailed information on didactic objectives, structure of the DVM course, campus equipment and facilities and QA issues.

Additional information is provided by the university (orientation towards secondary school students, timetables for orientation and enrolment, selection criteria), which also organizes an ‘orientation Fair’ where an information desk service providing first-hand information on the veterinary programme is present.

Finally each department organises a two hour orientation session for prospective students.

Once enrolled, the Campus School provides a permanent orientation, tutoring and placement service (OTP).

An orientation video on the DVM course is available on the Campus School website.

### **7.1.2. Comments**

In addition to the findings, the Team was informed during the Visitation that orientation/information events are organized for high school students before they apply for the veterinary course. High schools are also able to request an orientation/information meeting to be organized specifically for their school. During these events students are told about the study and about career opportunities after graduation. During these events, the VEE tries to be as truthful as possible about study load and need for great personal commitment so that the student have a realistic idea of what it’s like to study veterinary medicine (range of animal species covered, mandatory participation in all aspects of training related to the duties of veterinarians such as slaughterhouse visits and slaughterhouse certification) and how it is “to be a vet”.

The university also runs two open days per year for students to visit and they provide similar information to the orientation event as well as giving tours around the campus and its facilities. The shift, in 2016, to a national procedure for the admission test for new students has prolonged the completion time of student’s enrolment procedures. As a result of it – and regardless of the VEE’s level of proactivity – some students may be enrolled at the end of their first curricular semester. Late admissions may result in partial (if any) attendance to scheduled practical works.

Learning difficulties during first semester or year could be reduced by further learning-oriented events. The organisation of more academic coaching sessions could improve first year students’



self-management, time management and organization and study skills. In that respect the elaboration of a centralised study coaching / study support service could be of help.

The cooperation between the university, the Campus School and the VEE in terms of orientation and guidance is commendable.

#### **7.1.3. Suggestions for improvement**

- It is suggested that the VEE initiate a dialogue with the government to enhance a faster completion of the admission procedure.

#### **7.1.4. Decision**

The VEE is compliant with Standard 7.1.

**Standard 7.2 The number of students admitted must be consistent with the resources available at the VEE for staff, buildings, equipment, healthy and diseased animals, and materials of animal origin.**

#### **7.2.1. Findings**

After consultation of the VEEs, the Ministry determines the amount of students admitted every year by numerus clausus. The didactic committee of the VEE makes a proposal, taking into consideration the available resources, which is then approved by the VEE Council before being submitted to the university and the Ministry. The last 10 years the number of admitted students has been decreased by 15%.

On an average of 750 applicants per year only 100 are admitted in the DVM programme at the VEE.

#### **7.2.2. Comments**

The VEE is satisfied with the number of students allocated to them.

#### **7.2.3. Suggestions for improvement**

None.

#### **7.2.4. Decision**

The VEE is compliant with Standard 7.2.

**Standard 7.3 The selection and progression criteria must be clearly defined, consistent, and defensible, be free of discrimination or bias, and take into account the fact that students are admitted with a view to their entry to the veterinary profession in due course. The VEE must regularly review and reflect on the selection processes to ensure they are appropriate for students to complete the programme successfully. If the selection processes are decided by another authority, the latter must regularly receive feedback from the VEE.**

**Adequate training (including periodic refresher training) must be provided for those involved in the selection process to ensure applicants are evaluated fairly and consistently.**

#### **7.3.1. Findings**

Since 1999 the number of students admitted annually to the veterinary medicine course in Italy is subject to numerus clausus. Students are admitted based on their national test score ranking.

## **FINAL REPORT AS ISSUED BY ECOVE ON 14 DECEMBER 2021**

Entrance exam is prepared by the ministry with the help of Cambridge Assessment and a panel of experts appointed by ministerial decree.

For the whole of Italy the exam of the Ministry is organized at the beginning of September for all the candidates. The only requirement for attending the entrance exam is holding a high school diploma or equivalent for foreign EU or non-EU students. Requirements for passing are stated on the website of the VEE. The VEE where the student took the entrance exam is considered as their first choice.

Recently the Board of Directors of Veterinary Departments in Italy added a 'motivation questionnaire' to the national entrance exam.

The selection process is exclusively managed by the Ministry. The VEE annually designates an internal selection Committee on proposal of the VEE to look after the correct application of procedures.

Students can appeal against decisions of the Ministry to the Regional Administrative Court.

Admission criteria and procedures are published every year on the websites of the Ministry, the University and the DVM Course website.

The proposal of the yearly number of admissible students is prepared by the DVS Didactic Committee which takes into account the available resources. Thereafter it is approved by the DVS Council and is submitted to the Ministry.

The main data taken into consideration of elaborating the number of admissible students are: the needs of teaching equipment and consumables by the teachers; the needs for repeated practical activities; the available FTE's and finally the impact on the ESEVT Indicators determined by the number of students.

It is expected that no significant changes will take place in the amount of yearly admitted students.

Disabled students can rely on special admission measures such as extra time, non-scientific calculators, video magnifiers, tutor assistance.

### **7.3.2. Comments**

The selection and progression criteria are clearly defined and stated on the relevant websites. Feedback and suggestions on the selection process are discussed within the Board of Directors of Veterinary Departments and are then transferred to the Ministry.

Admission of students from lower income backgrounds is possible, there are 5 levels of social rate dependent on the income of themselves or their parents to pay a reduced fee. In the lowest social level they can receive their education for free. Based upon their social level, they can also receive reduced or free rent in the student accommodation which is 1 km away. Meals at the campus canteen can be purchased at a reduced fee and they can apply for grants to help pay for the necessary equipment as well as living costs.

### **7.3.3. Suggestions for improvement**

None.

### **7.3.4. Decision**

The VEE is compliant with Standard 7.3.

**Standard 7.4 There must be clear policies and procedures on how applicants with disabilities or illnesses are considered and, if appropriate, accommodated in the programme, taking into account the requirement that all students must be capable of meeting the ESEVT Day One Competences by the time they graduate.**

#### **7.4.1. Findings**

Both at university and department level there are Dedicated Delegates for students with disabilities. They collect information about the disability and offer advice about possible compensation strategies that could be used. On request of the students they can also mediate with the teaching staff.

Procedures for disabled students are published on the website and can include:

- guidance either by students or by National Civic Service Volunteers
- didactic tutorship by students
- support for Deaf and Hard of Hearing Students, by Italian Sign Language Interpreters and Communication Mediators
- personalised support
- special support measures during exams
- support on partaking in international mobility

EDISU, the Regional Body for the Right to Education, guarantees the access to services such as the University canteens, scholarships, accommodation and special contributions.

Reduction in tuition fees is provided for students upward from a certain level of disability. Reduced tuition fees for students is not reflected in the finances for the VEE.

All facilities are accessible for students with physical disabilities.

From 2019, specific education programmes on inclusive teaching is provided to academic staff.

#### **7.4.2. Comments**

During the Visitation it was confirmed that students with conditions such as dyslexia or dyscalculia can make use of special university-level services that can determine any educational facilities.

It is commendable that the VEE offers very good possibilities for disabled students.

#### **7.4.3. Suggestions for improvement**

None.

#### **7.4.4. Decision**

The VEE is compliant with Standard 7.4.

**Standard 7.5 The basis for decisions on progression (including academic progression and professional fitness to practise) must be explicit and readily available to the students. The VEE must provide evidence that it has mechanisms in place to identify and provide remediation and appropriate support (including termination) for students who are not performing adequately.**

**The VEE must have mechanisms in place to monitor attrition and progression and be able to respond and amend admission selection criteria (if permitted by national or university law) and student support if required.**

### **7.5.1. Findings**

The Didactic Regulation of the DVM course and the Student Guide stipulate the general progression criteria. These state amongst others:

- an 80% attendance of all practical training offered in order to be admitted to the exams
- a pass in propaedeutic exam prior to be admitted to PPT among other starting competences prior to enrol in follow-up courses
- achieving 160 ECTS prior to being allowed participation in clinical rounds
- graduation only after achieving all D1C's, completion of the PPT programme and completing the graduation thesis

There is no limitation in the number of enrolment for examination for low performing students.

A new exam policy was implemented in '18-'19 in order to harmonize exam procedures and system and in terms of QA. It comprises guidelines for teachers and students. New evaluation criteria for the graduation thesis followed. Training events on assessment in different formats are offered.

Part of the self-assessment process of the DVM is the monitoring of student progression and performance. Every year a monitoring reports is drafted and submitted to the university quality committee. The Degree Course can be called upon in cases of critical issues where they can investigate possible causes and propose corrective actions.

Each student has a personal tutor among the academic staff. Students can also rely on the Didactic Manager for information regarding organisation of teaching activities and eventually for referring to different contact persons (e.g. coordinator, teacher).

An electronic learning platform (UniToSkillCase) is available for the development of soft skills and a didactic platform (Orient@Mente) for self-directed learning is available for basic sciences and offers online tutorial lessons and exercises.

Students are represented in the CMR and therefor actively involved in the decision making process of the progression criteria. Progression criteria are published on the DVM Course website.

Dropout rates are less than 1% and are mainly caused by students' personal reasons.

Student services are subject of a PDCA-cycle that involves planning and implementation, monitoring and revision & self-evaluation in which the VEE Council, the VEE Didactic Committee, the Monitoring and Review Committee, the Campus School, the DVM Council and finally the university and the Ministry play their dedicated role.

A little under 40% of the students graduate in 5 years. Another quarter graduates in 5 + 1 years.

### **7.5.2. Comments**

Study progress decisions are clearly communicated to the students. A Didactic Manager is available to students. A tutor system can be set up at the request of the student.

Despite the numerus clausus with entrance exam, just under 35% of the student population still

needs 7 or more years to pass. The percentage of students graduating within the allotted time is low (around 30%). The VEE is aware of this problem and sees the cause both within a broad national context as in a narrower local one.

An intrinsic weakness of the national admission test is the limited possibility to select students on the basis of their real motivation/attitudes.

Actions planned to increase the number of students graduating in the allotted time are the following:

The VEE identifies the Board of Directors as the representing Committee for discussing improvement of admission test procedures and harmonization of veterinary medicine curricula. The VEE is actively engaged in the national discussion concerning the two items.

In the local context, as a result of the self-evaluation process, the DVM Course has identified students' workload as one of the main reasons causing delay in graduation. As a result, starting from 2017, the time allotted to students' individual learning has been increased of 2h/ECTS for profession oriented subjects. Any positive impact on students' career will be seen starting from 2022.

The reorganization of some integrated courses of the first two years has also aimed to rationalize students' workload. Some ECTS (e.g., Veterinary Physiology) have been distributed among three different didactic modules thus rationalizing study workload and fostering integration between subjects having high affinity. The CMR is currently working to prepare a questionnaire for off-course students to collect and analyse data on the perceived causes of delay and possible suggestions for strategic recovery actions. Finally, the VEE is aware that the upcoming substantial revision of the whole veterinary programme will definitively improve the percentage of students graduating in the allotted time.

Sometimes students use the system of unlimited resits to their advantage. Some students re-sit an examination in order to try to achieve higher scores to qualify for a PhD position.

### **7.5.3. Suggestions for improvement**

None.

### **7.5.4. Decision**

The VEE is compliant with Standard 7.5.

## **Standard 7.6 Mechanisms for the exclusion of students from the programme for any reason must be explicit.**

**The VEE's policies for managing appeals against decisions, including admissions, academic and progression decisions and exclusion, must be transparent and publicly available.**

### **7.6.1. Findings**

Once enrolled, students cannot be excluded from the programme. Acquired ECTS remain valid for 8 years.

Procedures for appeal are in place and are stated in the Exam Policy Document.

### **7.6.2. Comments**

It is almost impossible for non-active students not to finish their studies as exclusion is not possible.

Students cannot be excluded from the course, they have an unlimited amount of opportunities to re-sit exams or a year and can take as long as they would like to complete the course.

Students have the option of interrupting their studies for a number of years in order to continue them afterwards. This is very reassuring in situations where students are obligated to interrupt their studies for an unspecified period of time for an unexpected reason. Later on, they can resume the study, keeping all credits acquired (up to a maximum of 8 years later).

### **7.6.3. Suggestions for improvement**

None.

### **7.6.4. Decision**

The VEE is compliant with Standard 7.6.

**Standard 7.7 Provisions must be made by the VEE to support the physical, emotional and welfare needs of students. This includes, but is not limited to, learning support and counselling services, career advice, and fair and transparent mechanisms for dealing with student illness, impairment and disability during the programme. This shall include provision of reasonable adjustments for disabled students, consistent with all relevant equality and/or human rights legislation.**

**There must be effective mechanisms for resolution of student grievances (e.g. interpersonal conflict or harassment).**

### **7.7.1. Findings**

The university provides online support for student services that comprises orientation services and events and service for administrative procedures. Furthermore the university offers services promoting equal opportunities, wellbeing in the workplace and non-discrimination, a university counselling service manned by trained psychologists and a counselling service for women-victims.

Also at Campus level, several services for students are available. These include the Student Administration Office, the Didactic Manager, the Campus Library and the on-demand counselling for disabled students provided by dedicated VEE staff.

Students benefit from an accidents and third party liability insurance.

A 16h course on personal health and safety is provided for first year students and a 3h radioprotection course is given in the beginning of the fourth year.

Throughout the campus study-places, Wi-Fi, computer access, a canteen and a cafeteria are available for students.

Indoor and outdoor sports facilities are available for (exchange) students, teachers and employees.

Student accommodation is provided in the centre of Grugliasco.

An annual Campus Party is organized with demonstrations, seminars, street food, music and sport events open to students, campus staff and the public.

Apart from the Erasmus Exchange programme, students of the VEE have recently founded an IVSA-affiliated association.

Student grievances are initially handled by the Didactic Manager which can then, if needed, be

referred to other services.

#### **7.7.2. Comments**

There are counselling services (psychological support) available at the main university campus but not on the veterinary campus. Veterinary students can book an appointment online and the counsellor can come to the veterinary site or they can meet them at the main campus. This service is not widely used, students state they are very comfortable discussing any problems with tutors or other members of staff and staff state that if they have a serious concern they will refer the student to the counsellor.

There is no student specific health service since all students benefit from national health service.

#### **7.7.3. Suggestions for improvement**

None.

#### **7.7.4. Decision**

The VEE is compliant with Standard 7.7.

**Standard 7.8 Mechanisms must be in place by which students can convey their needs and wants to the VEE. The VEE must provide students with a mechanism, anonymously if they wish, to offer suggestions, comments and complaints regarding compliance of the VEE with national and international legislation and the ESEVT Standards.**

#### **7.8.1. Findings**

There are four ways in which students can convey their needs and wants to the VEE. Students have representatives in the CMR & the Committee for Student Affairs. Students discuss the strengths and weaknesses of the past didactic period during the tutorial sessions organised by the Didactic Manager who compiles a report which on completion is sent to the CMR. Students give feedback on courses at the end of every semester.

Finally, students can also, anonymously if they wish, file complaints via an online form.

#### **7.8.2. Comments**

It was specifically emphasized, by the students as well as by the staff, that the relationship of staff and students is very strongly driven by mutual respect whereby communication between all parties runs very smoothly and the staff is always very accessible to students.

#### **7.8.3. Suggestions for improvement**

None.

#### **7.8.4. Decision**

The VEE is compliant with Standard 7.8.

### **Area 8. Student assessment**

**Standard 8.1 The VEE must ensure that there is a clearly identified structure within the VEE showing lines of responsibility for the assessment strategy to ensure coherence of the overall assessment regime and to allow the demonstration of progressive development across the programme towards entry-level competence.**

### **8.1.1. Findings**

Assessment strategy falls under the remit of the Monitoring and Review Committee (CMR) which incorporates the Examination Board. CMR evaluates the conformity of assessment formats with the specified learning outcomes on a regular basis. This Board is made up of the President, the quality assurance referent, four teachers and two student representatives. The current exam policy was adopted by the VEE Council in 2019. This was a major step forward in efforts to standardise and harmonise assessment procedures across the VEE.

Efforts have been made to implement ‘mixed format’ assessments (applying theoretical knowledge to problems). Adoption of this mixed format has been lowest in year 1. Orals account for 27.3-43.7% of assessment; while during COVID-19 period, different formats (in-person and/or distance learning) were made available.

Certain recommendations of the last Visitation in 2010 have only been partially implemented, namely:

1. The Teaching Affairs Manager and the Teaching Affairs Committee should strive for better coordination of teachers in integrated courses and well structured exams.
2. Any measures which the Faculty could take to ensure that students must pass their examinations in logical order and which would limit the number of times students could fail any examination would be welcome in ensuring that motivated and industrious students complete their studies in reasonable time.

Training events on novel assessment concepts and methods were offered to academic staff. Student opinions on assessment methods were obtained through surveys. In case the satisfaction percentage falls below the cut-off level 33.3%, respected lecturer is encouraged to improve their method with the opinions from CMR.

### **8.1.2. Comments**

Objectification of measurement procedures of oral examinations are provided to the lecturers, during their “teachers training” activity. Different departments, provide different opportunities for “tailor-made” flexibility for every student to retrieve a potential for testing higher cognitive skills, while, standards for all oral exams as in form of structured oral exams are preferred compared to the traditional exams for uniform, fair, less stressful, and less biased evaluation.

### **8.1.3. Suggestions for improvement**

- The VEE should consider to increase the usage of problem oriented exams and at the same time evaluate the extent, objectiveness and value of orals.

### **8.1.4. Decision**

The VEE is compliant with Standard 8.1.

**Standard 8.2 The assessment tasks and grading criteria for each unit of study in the programme must be published, applied consistently, clearly identified and available to students in a timely manner well in advance of the assessment. Requirements to pass must be explicit.**

**The VEE must properly document the results of assessment and provide the students with timely feedback on their assessments.**

**Mechanisms for students to appeal against assessment outcomes must be explicit.**



### **8.2.1. Findings**

Assessment procedures is set within the articles of the Didactic Regulation of UniTO, which is revised by the CMR yearly to be further approved by the DVM Council. The published versions are available publicly including the calendar, policy, grading criteria and graduation exams. There are a possible 8 exam sessions per year.

Less than half of students graduate in 5 years (Table 7.2.4). Students have the right to re-sit exams, this is an open-ended arrangement. Each year there are 5 opportunities to re-sit one exam, if they fail they are able to re-attend the teaching and ask for comments about why they failed, if they have not passed by the end of the year they are required to re-sit the year. The information for this is provided to the students online and in practicals.

Written exams can be converted to an oral exam but this is only an option for students with learning disabilities (they must have a certificate of disability from the national health service). In order to practice, graduates must pass a State exam (4 x 30 minute orals) conducted by external examiners selected by the Turin Veterinary Chamber.

Assessment outcomes data has been collected since 2019.

The Examination Board for each subject has at least two members of staff.

The Examination Board assesses appeals in the first instance. If students wish to take the matter further, they can fill in an anonymous form, send a complaint to the Coordinator of the DVM Course, ask for clarification at an end of semester tutorial or report the matter to the CMR through a student representative.

### **8.2.2. Comments**

There are differences in the oral examination assessment; where efforts for objective evaluation is attained by defining key assessment criteria in some department or a jury type (examination with at least two professors) in another department.

### **8.2.3. Suggestions for improvement**

None.

### **8.2.4. Decision**

The VEE is compliant with Standard 8.2.

**Standard 8.3 The VEE must have a process in place to review assessment outcomes, to change assessment strategies and to ensure the accuracy of the procedures when required. Programme learning outcomes covering the full range of professional knowledge, skills, competences and attributes must form the basis for assessment design and underpin decisions on progression.**

### **8.3.1. Findings**

Periodic revision of the assessment strategy falls within the remit of CMR.

A minimum of two different formats of assessment is required under the current exam policy. Consistency between the programme learning outcomes and the assessment are of primer responsibility of the subject coordinator.

Increasing use of practical exams is made as students progress through the course.

There is a heavy reliance on orals.

### **8.3.2. Comments**

Oral exams are carried out with at least 2 members of staff and are public to the students, this means that the students have the opportunity to compare their examination and complain if they think it was unfair. However, there is still a certain amount of subjectivity to the assessments based around the professors' opinions. In their final year they are tested by being given cases with some diagnostics and are expected to work out the diagnosis and treatment of this animal. The programme learning outcomes and exam criteria are matched for some courses. The importance of this match is also provided for teachers training course.

### **8.3.3. Suggestions for improvement**

- The VEE might consider to move to a wider range of examination formats e.g. Objective Structured Clinical Examination (OSCE) and Direct Observation of Procedural Skills (DOPs).

### **8.3.4. Decision**

The VEE is compliant with Standard 8.3.

**Standard 8.4 Assessment strategies must allow the VEE to certify student achievement of learning objectives at the level of the programme and individual units of study.**

**The VEE must ensure that the programmes are delivered in a way that encourages students to take an active role in creating the learning process, and that the assessment of students reflects this approach.**

### **8.4.1. Findings**

The use of integrated, comprehensive, over-arching exams is limited. Each subject has its own exam.

The following methods are used to encourage student active learning:

- 1) tutorials on selected topics,
- 2) feedback is provided upon request,
- 3) student involvement in curriculum management,
- 4) using teaching methods that stimulate student centred learning e.g. interactive software (Socrative, Mentimeter), role playing, portfolio of day one competences.

### **8.4.2. Comments**

More intensive use of integrated teaching and assessment would reduce over-examination and exams that focus on factual recall and excessive detail, while also inculcating a silo mentality in students that is not suitable for dealing with multi-faceted problems in the real world.

There are no details provided of the extent of the adoption of teaching methods used to promote student centred learning.

### **8.4.3. Suggestions for improvement**

None.

### **8.4.4. Decision**

The VEE is compliant with Standard 8.4.

**Standard 8.5 Methods of formative and summative assessment must be valid and reliable and comprise a variety of approaches. Direct assessment of clinical skills and Day One Competences (some of which may be on simulated patients), must form a significant**

**component of the overall process of assessment. It must also include the quality control of the student logbooks in order to ensure that all clinical procedures, practical and hands-on training planned in the study programme have been fully completed by each individual student.**

#### **8.5.1. Findings**

Formative assessment methods are used in about half of the subjects.

Use of mixed format exams have been adopted in 80% of summative exams.

There are on-going discussions to encourage adoption of the European Coordinating Committee on Veterinary Training (ECCVT) Day One Competences as central to the Italian State Exam.

#### **8.5.2. Comments**

The use of oral exams is high (36%). The extent of their use and value in assessment needs critical evaluation.

#### **8.5.3. Suggestions for improvement**

- It could be considered to assess the acquisition of D1Cs 1.1 to 1.14 e.g. using OSCEs, presentations, evidence-based literature reviews, reflective portfolios, knowledge exams on certain topics (legislation, ethical problems, etc.) more extensively.

#### **8.5.4. Decision**

The VEE is compliant with Standard 8.5.

### **Area 9. Academic and support staff**

**Standard 9.1 The VEE must ensure that all staff are appropriately qualified and prepared for their roles, in agreement with national and EU regulations and must apply fair and transparent processes for the recruitment and development of staff.**

**A formal training (including good teaching and evaluation practices, learning and e-learning resources, biosecurity and QA procedures) must be in place for all staff involved with teaching.**

**Most academic staff (calculated as FTE) involved in veterinary training must be veterinarians. It is expected that more than 2/3 of the instruction that the students receive, as determined by student teaching hours, is delivered by qualified veterinarians.**

#### **9.1.1. Findings**

Staff recruitment (teaching and support staff) is governed by Italian national regulations and all staff recruited are selected according to strict national rules and the rules set by the VEE itself. Fair and transparent processes for the recruitment and development of the Academic staff are set up. The VEE has a limited power on recruitment of Support staff.

Recruitment and promotion of Academic staff depend on available public funding. According to UniTO regulations, the VEE is requested to define its policy for the recruitment and promotion of academic staff in the Three-year Strategic Plan. The VEE's transparency as to recruitment and progression processes relies also on the existence of a Staff Committee and on the participation of both academic and support staff representatives in the VEE Council. The various selection and enrolment procedures for Academic staff are particularly long and complex (referring SER pages 107-109). An effort is made to avoid "endogamy".

Since 2017 the VEE has implemented a formal training programme for Academic staff. Courses are offered to all teachers (part of them are dedicated to newly enrolled staff), and they are especially but not exclusively recommended to beginners (and appropriately to lecturers who have received a negative assessment by students). The attendance is non-compulsory, but the vast majority of teachers participate. The list of training courses is long, and they are managed by both UniTo and the VEE.

Support staff also benefits from a strong training programme.

The large majority of the academic staff involved in veterinary training are veterinarians: approximately 85% are qualified veterinarians (for >2/3 expected).

### **9.1.2. Comments**

The recruitment and development of staff applies fair and transparent processes. The pedagogical and technical training programme, organised at local level to provide teaching theory and new teaching technologies to all teachers, represents an added value. The fact that each new lecturer follows a dedicated pedagogical and technical programme is commendable.

### **9.1.3. Suggestions for improvement**

None.

### **9.1.4. Decision**

The VEE is compliant with Standard 9.1.

**Standard 9.2 The total number, qualifications and skills of all staff involved with the programme, including teaching staff, ‘adjunct’ staff, technical, administrative and support staff, must be sufficient and appropriate to deliver the educational programme and fulfil the VEE’s mission.**

**A procedure must be in place to assess if the staff involved with teaching display competence and effective teaching skills in all relevant aspects of the curriculum that they teach, regardless of whether they are full or part time, residents, interns or other postgraduate students, adjuncts or off-campus contracted teachers.**

### **9.2.1. Findings**

Tables summarize the number and composition of the academic staff (two tables entitled 9.2.2), support staff (9.2.3.), as well as the research staff of the VEE (9.2.4.). The ESEVT Indicator, I2 (n. of FTE vets involved in veterinary training/n. of students graduating annually) is close to the median values (section Indicators of the SER, page 128), as are the Indicators I1 and I3. Permanent teaching staff covers all areas of the veterinary curriculum, from Basic Sciences to Professional Knowledge. In recent years, an effort has been made to recruit new Academic staff to compensate weaknesses related to specific competences (i.e. equine surgery).

At national level, there is no procedure to assess the competence of the staff, but ANVUR has issued a positive certificate to the DVM Course after in-depth evaluation of teaching procedures and effectiveness. A local procedure takes into account students feedback and PPT activities, which are reported, analysed and published online (VEE’s website) twice a year.

### **9.2.2. Comments**

The total number, qualifications and skills of the staff involved in the curriculum are sufficient and appropriate to deliver the educational programme. Recruitment for some specific disciplines is difficult (swine, dermatology).

### **9.2.3. Suggestions for improvement**

None.

### **9.2.4. Decision**

The VEE is compliant with Standard 9.2.

**Standard 9.3 Staff must be given opportunities to develop and extend their teaching and assessment knowledge and must be encouraged to improve their skills. Opportunities for didactic and pedagogic training and specialisation must be available. The VEE must clearly define any systems of reward for teaching excellence in operation.**

**Academic positions must offer the security and benefits necessary to maintain stability, continuity, and competence of the academic staff. They must have a balanced workload of teaching, research and service depending on their role. They must have reasonable opportunities and resources for participation in scholarly activities.**

#### **9.3.1. Findings**

Multiple opportunities are provided to the staff to develop and extend their teaching and assessment knowledge; didactic and pedagogic training courses are available for teaching staff as already described (see 9.1.). The number of staff holding a specialist recognition has increased since the last EAEVE evaluation (from 16 to 20).

Nevertheless, no reward system for teaching excellence has been defined but the National Scientific Qualification is necessary to have access to permanent positions of associate and full professor in Italian Universities. Low research productivity penalises the VEE in terms of funding for recruitment and promotion of staff. The evaluation of scientific production is required for access to all temporary or permanent positions, new recruited teachers are strongly interested to continue their research activity.

Stability and continuity of academic staff is implicit in the civil servant status. If a great pressure is placed on academics engaged to cover the workload of service and organization roles, full time professors are required to dedicate no less than 350 h/year to teaching, including mentoring, tutoring and learning assessment.

#### **9.3.2. Comments**

The workload of research, and the balance between research and other mandatory activities of the Academic staff are neither mentioned nor evocated.

#### **9.3.3. Suggestions for improvement**

- Excellence in both teaching and research should be rewarded.

#### **9.3.4. Decision**

The VEE is compliant with standard 9.3.

**Standard 9.4 The VEE must provide evidence that it utilises a well-defined, comprehensive and publicised programme for the professional growth and development of academic and support staff, including formal appraisal and informal mentoring procedures.**

**Staff must have the opportunity to contribute to the VEE's direction and decision-making**

processes.

**Promotion criteria for academic and support staff must be clear and explicit. Promotions for teaching staff must recognise excellence in, and (if permitted by the national or university law) place equal emphasis on all aspects of teaching (including clinical teaching), research, service and other scholarly activities.**

#### **9.4.1. Findings**

The modalities for professional training of staff are described above (9.1). The training programme is officially presented before the VEE Council. Other training opportunities exist in the campus. National legislation promotes lifelong learning, as a result a programme for the professional update and development of support staff is planned by UniTo on a three-year basis. Staff has the opportunity to participate in decision-making processes and to contribute to the VEE's direction through direct participation in the various decisional bodies (e.g. committees and working groups, staff committee) including VEE Council and Degree Course Council.

The existing University Law does not favour an explicit definition of promotion criteria other than ability in research, therefore progression of academic staff depends on: i) the budget UniTO allocates every year for staff strategies, and ii) the candidate's possession of the National Scientific Qualification (NSQ) for the role to be covered.

Progression criteria for support staff are explicit for both "horizontal" and "vertical" progression.

#### **9.4.2. Comments**

Promotion criteria for academic staff are primarily based on research activities.

#### **9.4.3. Suggestions for improvement**

- It is suggested to place equal emphasis on teaching, research and clinical activities in the promotion criteria.
- Pathways for promotion of support staff should be considered

#### **9.4.4. Decision**

The VEE is compliant with standard 9.4.

**Standard 9.5 A system for assessment of teaching staff must be in operation and must include student participation. Results must be available to those undertaking external reviews and commented upon in reports.**

#### **9.5.1. Findings**

The VEE has put in place a system for assessment of teaching staff, and such a system of assessment/evaluation includes student participation. For students, the evaluation is mandatory and anonymous. Students are also expected to evaluate all practical training activities (both intra and extra-mural). Teaching evaluation done by the students is a fully-integrated tool for continuous improvement of the school, and it is included in a comprehensive assessment process (e.g. the results of students' questionnaires and the report of the Didactic Manager are discussed by the Self Evaluation Committee at the end of each semester, and the analysis of students' feedback by the Self Evaluation Committee and the related reactions/compensations are presented and discussed within the Degree Course Council).

### **9.5.2. Comments**

Teaching evaluation done by the students is a fully integrated tool for continuous improvement of the school. It is not specified if evaluation results can be made available to undertake external reviews.

### **9.5.3. Suggestions for improvement**

None.

### **9.5.4. Decision**

The VEE is compliant with standard 9.5.

## **Area 10. Research programmes, continuing and postgraduate education**

**Standard 10.1 The VEE must demonstrate significant and broad research activities of staff that integrate with and strengthen the veterinary degree programme through research-based teaching.**

### **10.1.1. Findings**

The subjects in charge of the planning and monitoring phases of the research activities of the VEE are mostly composed of the members of the Department Research Committee (CRD). The Vice Director for Research has access to the databases of the research products and proposes to the CRD an annual analysis on the progress of the departmental research activity. Within the CRD, some subgroups are identified, which have the task of analytically evaluating the state of research, both in terms of scientific production and ability to participate in calls for funding. A meeting is planned at the beginning of the year at which the indicators and instruments of periodic evaluation are updated.

The quality of the VEE's research is monitored through the scientific production of teachers and fixed-term staff (fellows, research fellows and PhD students). The evaluation is both qualitative and quantitative including the number of competitive calls submitted; the number of teachers and fixed-term staff involved in mobility activities (incoming/outgoing); the number of research products carried out in collaboration with authors from foreign institutions. The annual monitoring actions refer to the research activity carried out in the calendar year just ended and in the previous 5 years and contribute to determining the scientific productivity of individual teachers and the Department. They are also functional to the allocation of research funds. The self-assessment process is in charge of the CRD, through consultation of the total scientific production on the database. Access to the site by the Director and the deputy director of research allows you to extract the data of interest, filtered according to the type of product (e.g.: journal articles, patents, etc.), and the main bibliometric indexes (the impact factor, the CiteScore etc.) used to evaluate the quality of scientific production (ranking *list*). The data, presented through a descriptive statistical analysis, are discussed in CRD and presented in the VEE. The percentage of works in which authors belonging to foreign research institutions are included is also evaluated. The activity of the PhD students is evaluated by the teaching staff of the doctorate through the data provided by each student during the annual reports, with particular reference to dissemination activities (publications, participation in conferences) and internationalization paths (period abroad).

753 scientific papers were published between 2015 and 2019. According to Scopus and Web of Science affiliation results, there is an incremental increase in the number of publications and

citations over the years. There are two academic spin-off companies that have filed national and international patents, some of which are commercially exploited.

The SWOT analysis carried out as part of the Strategic Plan (2018-2021) for the VEE identified the following weaknesses:

- 1) a low number of support staff;
- 2) large differences between subject areas in terms of research output;
- 3) limited participation in and success by staff in winning international research grants.

The majority of research-informed teaching has been undertaken on academics' individual initiative and not systematically established. There is no information on the web page for research integration in education to aspire research based teaching; which is important to develop its reputation around strong links to industry and the professions along with students. The VEE's research capacity, priority research areas and collaborations/protocols on research along with specific stakeholder protocols for research are not explicit and easily accessible through VEE' web, but available only from university web.

There is a close connection with the VEE and *L'Istituto Zooprofilattico Sperimentale del Piemonte* offering EPT opportunities for students and research collaborations with the academicians.

#### **10.1.2. Comments**

Key performance indicators are not used for actual student involvement in research as opposed to being passive recipients of research led teaching.

A share of partially inactive teachers remains (15% in 2017) indicated in the strategic plan; in which new measures are required to complete the PDCA cycle.

#### **10.1.3. Suggestions for improvement**

- Continued effort should be made to attract funding from e.g. commercial companies, and philanthropy to support student research projects.
- It is suggested that the VEE support sharing research facilities.

#### **10.1.4. Decision**

The VEE is compliant with Standard 10.1.

**Standard 10.2 All students must be trained in scientific method and research techniques relevant to evidence-based veterinary medicine and must have opportunities to participate in research programmes.**

#### **10.2.1. Findings**

Participation in research programmes is almost entirely confined to literature research. Attendance at congresses and accredited education courses has recently been made mandatory as part of the restyled PPT.

On a voluntary basis, students attend seminars, events and conferences organized by the VEE, while no lecture/seminar is provided for research methodology and research ethics on an undergraduate level.

The quality of the scientific research, carried out by the various sectors, has allowed the VEE to be counted among the ten Departments of excellence of the University of Turin by the Ministry of Education, University and Research which for this reason has allocated a special



five-year loan (2018-2022). The funded project has as its objective the rational use of veterinary drugs, a highly topical topic aimed both at controlling the spread of antibiotic resistance, and at safeguarding and promoting animal health and welfare and human health. Due to the development of these synergies, the research priorities of the VEE are increasingly oriented towards the application of the One-Health approach on transversal issues. Within this project graduate students are funded and also allow strengthening local collaborations between universities and businesses and starting new ones; in which future placements for students would be available.

#### **10.2.2. Comments**

There are no figures provided for the breakdown of the research carried out for the graduation thesis between experimental work and reviews.

It is commendable that the VEE provides opportunities for students to carry out short, focused lab or field-based research projects

#### **10.2.3. Suggestions for improvement**

- The size of student participation in voluntary (and recently mandatory) attendance at research seminars, journal clubs, etc. should be measured.

#### **10.2.4. Decision**

The VEE is compliant with Standard 10.2.

**Standard 10.3 The VEE must provide advanced postgraduate degree programmes, e.g. PhD, internships, residencies and continuing education programmes that complement and strengthen the veterinary degree programme and are relevant to the needs of the profession and society.**

#### **10.3.1. Findings**

Postgraduate programmes at the VEE include: PhD in veterinary sciences, residency programmes (ECAR, ECVCN, ECVN, ECVPH, ECVPT, ECVS, ECPC, ACVSMR) and Specialisation Schools (Animal Production, Food Inspection, Companion Animals).

The VEE is an accredited provider of continuing education programmes, organised by a Continuing Education Committee, in which between 2017-2019, 9 continuing education programmes were organized.

#### **10.3.2. Comments**

The Team noted that combined PhD and residency programmes have been carried out. Despite the lack of national recognition there are 8 residency programmes in place. This large number of residency programmes (despite a lack of national recognition for such specialisms) is commendable.

#### **10.3.3. Suggestions for improvement**

None.

#### **10.3.4. Decision**

The VEE is compliant with Standard 10.3.

**Standard 10.4 The VEE must have a system of QA to evaluate how research activities**

**provide opportunities for student training and staff promotion, and how research approaches, methods and results are integrated into the veterinary teaching programmes.**

**10.4.1. Findings**

The research activities of the VEE are evaluated every 5 years by ANVUR. The most recent exercise led to the award of “Department of Excellence” with government grant of more than 9 million euros, resulting in the hiring of 2 researchers, 2 associate professors, 2 research technicians with the allocation of 10 PhDs for 3 years and 10 postdocs for 2 years.

Students are exposed to research through journal clubs and six-monthly scientific meetings.

Quality assurance procedures are in place for PhDs and continuing professional development (CPD).

**10.4.2. Comments**

Attendance by students at research-led events is voluntary.

Research strategy (set within priority research areas, supportive tools etc.) and the goals around this strategy could be activated by the feedback mechanisms allowing further efficient monitoring in all divisions of the VEE.

**10.4.3. Suggestions for improvement**

- The VEE should consider to introduce that cooperation protocols for research secure and integrate students in national and international competitive research environments.

**10.4.4. Decision**

The VEE is compliant with Standard 10.4.

## 11. ESEVT Indicators

<b>Y-1</b>	1 Oct 2020 - 30 September 2021		
<b>Y-2</b>	1 Jan 2019 - 31 Dec 2019		
<b>Y-3</b>	1 Jan 2018 - 31 Dec 2018		
	1 Jan - 30 Sept 2020 excluded due to the Coronavirus situation		

<b>Calculated Indicators from raw data</b>		<b>Establishment values</b>	<b>Median values<sup>1</sup></b>	<b>Minimal values<sup>2</sup></b>	<b>Balance<sup>3</sup></b>
<b>I1</b>	n° of FTE academic staff involved in veterinary training / n° of undergraduate students	0,14	0,16	0,13	0,01
<b>I2</b>	n° of FTE veterinarians involved in veterinary training / n° of students graduating annually	0,82	0,87	0,59	0,23
<b>I3</b>	n° of FTE support staff involved in veterinary training / n° of students graduating annually	0,84	0,94	0,57	0,27
<b>I4</b>	n° of hours of practical (non-clinical) training	813,67	905,67	595,00	218,67
<b>I5</b>	n° of hours of clinical training	798,33	932,92	670,00	128,33
<b>I6</b>	n° of hours of FSQ & VPH training	470,00	287,00	174,40	295,60
<b>I7</b>	n° of hours of extra-mural practical training in FSQ & VPH	166,67	68,00	28,80	137,87
<b>I8</b>	n° of companion animal patients seen intra-murally / n° of students graduating annually	54,47	70,48	42,01	12,46
<b>I9</b>	n° of ruminant and pig patients seen intra-murally / n° of students graduating annually	1,48	2,69	0,46	1,01
<b>I10</b>	n° of equine patients seen intra-murally / n° of students graduating annually	2,74	5,05	1,30	1,44
<b>I11</b>	n° of rabbit, rodent, bird and exotic seen intra-murally / n° of students graduating annually	23,13	3,35	1,55	21,58
<b>I12</b>	n° of companion animal patients seen extra-murally / n° of students graduating annually	1,71	6,80	0,22	1,48
<b>I13</b>	n° of individual ruminants and pig patients seen extra-murally / n° of students graduating annually	9,34	15,95	6,29	3,05
<b>I14</b>	n° of equine patients seen extra-murally / n° of students graduating annually	1,45	2,11	0,60	0,85
<b>I15</b>	n° of visits to ruminant and pig herds / n° of students graduating annually	1,55	1,33	0,55	1,00
<b>I16</b>	n° of visits of poultry and farmed rabbit units / n° of students graduating annually	0,19	0,12	0,04	0,14
<b>I17</b>	n° of companion animal necropsies / n° of students graduating annually	2,22	2,07	1,40	0,82
<b>I18</b>	n° of ruminant and pig necropsies / n° of students graduating annually	1,94	2,32	0,97	0,97
<b>I19</b>	n° of equine necropsies / n° of students graduating annually	0,17	0,30	0,09	0,08
<b>I20</b>	n° of rabbit, rodent, bird and exotic pet necropsies / n° of students graduating annually	3,64	2,05	0,69	2,95
<b>I21*</b>	n° of FTE specialised veterinarians involved in veterinary training / n° of students graduating annually	0,27	0,20	0,06	0,20
<b>I22*</b>	n° of PhD graduating annually / n° of students graduating annually	0,09	0,15	0,09	0,00

Due to the problems encountered during the COVID-19 lockdown and the prolonged postponement of the Full Visitation to the Turin VEE, the VEE has added the latest figures from the academic year 2020/2021 (which is not by definition the Y-1 figures as stated in the SOP, but more like a real time image updated to a few months before the Visitation). These figures cover a whole year, but an academic year not a fiscal year.

The updated Indicators' spreadsheet was not ready at the end of the Visitation but was sent to the Chairperson and the Coordinator of the Visitation during the process of Factual Correction of Draft C Visitation Report.

**12. ESEVT Rubrics** (summary of the decision on the compliance of the VEE for each ESEVT Standard, i.e. (total or substantial) compliance (C), partial compliance (PC) (Minor Deficiency) or non-compliance (NC) (Major Deficiency))

<b>Area 1: Objectives, Organisation and QA Policy</b>	<b>C</b>	<b>PC</b>	<b>NC</b>
<b>Standard 1.1</b> The VEE must have as its main objective the provision, in agreement with the EU Directives and ESG recommendations, of adequate, ethical, research-based, evidence-based veterinary training that enables the new graduate to perform as a veterinarian capable of entering all commonly recognised branches of the veterinary profession and to be aware of the importance of lifelong learning. The VEE must develop and follow its mission statement which must embrace all the ESEVT Standards.	x		
<b>Standard 1.2</b> The VEE must be part of a university or a higher education institution providing training recognised as being of an equivalent level and formally recognised as such in the respective country. The person responsible for the veterinary curriculum and the person(s) responsible for the professional, ethical, and academic affairs of the Veterinary Teaching Hospital (VTH) must hold a veterinary degree. The decision-making process, organisation and management of the VEE must allow implementation of its strategic plan and of a cohesive study programme, in compliance with the ESEVT Standards.	x		
<b>Standard 1.3</b> The VEE must have a strategic plan, which includes a SWOT analysis of its current activities, a list of objectives, and an operating plan with a timeframe and indicators for its implementation.	x		
<b>Standard 1.4</b> The VEE must have a policy and associated written procedures for the assurance of the quality and standards of its programmes and awards. It must also commit itself explicitly to the development of a culture which recognises the importance of quality, and quality assurance, within their VEE. To achieve this, the VEE must develop and implement a strategy for the continuous enhancement of quality. The development and implementation of the VEE's strategy must include a role for students and other stakeholders, both internal and external, and the strategy must have a formal status and be publicly available.	x		
<b>Standard 1.5</b> The VEE must provide evidence that it interacts with its stakeholders and the wider society. Such public information must be clear, objective and readily accessible; the information must include up-to-date information about the study programme, views and employment destinations of past students as well as the profile of the current student population. The VEE's website must mention the ESEVT VEE's status and its last Self Evaluation Report and Visitation Report must be easily available for the public.	x		
<b>Standard 1.6</b> The VEE must monitor and periodically review its activities, both quantitative and qualitative, to ensure that they achieve the objectives set for them and respond to the needs of students and society. The VEE must make public how this analysis of information has been utilised in the further development of its activities and provide evidence as to the involvement of both students and staff in the provision, analysis and implementation of such data. Any action planned or taken as a result of this data analysis must be communicated to all those concerned.	x		
<b>Standard 1.7</b> The VEE must undergo external review through the ESEVT on a cyclical basis. Evidence must be provided of such external evaluation with the assurance that the progress made since the last ESEVT evaluation was linked to a continuous quality assurance process.	x		
<b>Area 2: Finances</b>			
<b>Standard 2.1</b> Finances must be demonstrably adequate to sustain the requirements for the VEE to meet its mission and to achieve its objectives for education, research and services. The description must include both expenditures (separated into personnel costs, operating costs, maintenance costs and equipment) and revenues (separated into public funding, tuition fees, services, research grants and other sources).	x		
<b>Standard 2.2</b> Clinical and field services must function as instructional resources. Instructional integrity of these resources must take priority over financial self-sufficiency of clinical services operations. The VEE must have sufficient autonomy in order to use the resources to implement its strategic plan and to meet the ESEVT Standards.	x		
<b>Standard 2.3</b> Resources allocation must be regularly reviewed to ensure that available resources meet the requirements.	x		
<b>Area 3: Curriculum</b>			
<b>Standard 3.1</b> The curriculum must be designed, resourced and managed to ensure all graduates have achieved the graduate attributes expected to be fully compliant with the EU Directive 2005/36/EC (as amended by directive 2013/55/EU) and its Annex V.4.1. The curriculum must include the subjects (input) and must allow the acquisition of the Day One Competences (output) listed in Annex 2. This concerns Basic Sciences, Clinical Sciences in companion animals (including equine and exotic pets), Clinical Sciences in food-producing animals (including Animal Production and Herd Health Management), Food Safety and Quality, and Professional Knowledge.	x		
<b>3.1.1. General findings</b>	x		
<b>3.1.2. Basic sciences</b>	x		
<b>3.1.3. Clinical Sciences in companion animals (including equine and exotic pets)</b>	x		
<b>3.1.4. Clinical Sciences in food-producing animals (including Animal Production and Herd Health Management)</b>	x		
<b>3.1.5. Food Safety and Quality</b>	x		
<b>3.1.6. Professional Knowledge</b>	x		

## FINAL REPORT AS ISSUED BY ECOVE ON 14 DECEMBER 2021

<p><b>Standard 3.2</b> Each study programme provided by the VEE must be competency-based and designed so that it meets the objectives set for it, including the intended learning outcomes. The qualification resulting from a programme must be clearly specified and communicated and must refer to the correct level of the national qualifications framework for higher education and, consequently, to the Framework for Qualifications of the European Higher Education Area.</p> <p>The VEE must provide proof of a QA system that promotes and monitors the presence of an academic environment highly conducive to learning including self-learning. Details of the type, provision and updating of appropriate learning opportunities for the students must be clearly described, as well as the involvement of students.</p> <p>The VEE must also describe how it encourages and prepares students for self-learning and lifelong learning.</p>	X		
<p><b>Standard 3.3</b> Programme learning outcomes must:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• ensure the effective alignment of all content, teaching, learning and assessment activities of the degree programme to form a cohesive framework</li> <li>• include a description of Day One Competences</li> <li>• form the basis for explicit statements of the objectives and learning outcomes of individual units of study</li> <li>• be communicated to staff and students</li> <li>• be regularly reviewed, managed and updated to ensure they remain relevant, adequate and are effectively achieved.</li> </ul>	X		
<p><b>Standard 3.4</b> The VEE must have a formally constituted committee structure (which includes effective student representation), with clear and empowered reporting lines, to oversee and manage the curriculum and its delivery. The committee(s) must:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• determine the pedagogical basis, design, delivery methods and assessment methods of the curriculum</li> <li>• oversee QA of the curriculum, particularly gathering, evaluating, making change and responding to feedback from stakeholders, peer reviewers and external assessors, and data from examination/assessment outcomes</li> <li>• perform ongoing and periodic review of the curriculum at least every seven years by involving staff, students and stakeholders; these reviews must lead to continuous improvement. Any action taken or planned as a result of such a review must be communicated to all those concerned</li> <li>• identify and meet training needs for all types of staff, maintaining and enhancing their competence for the ongoing curriculum development.</li> </ul>	X		
<p><b>Standard 3.5</b> External Practical Training (EPT) is compulsory training activities organised outside the VEE, the student being under the direct supervision of a non-academic person (e.g. a practitioner). EPT cannot replace the core intramural training nor the extramural training under the close supervision of academic staff (e.g. ambulatory clinics, herd health management, practical training in FSQ and VPH).</p> <p>Since the veterinary degree is a professional qualification with Day One Competences, EPT must complement and strengthen the academic education inter alia by enhancing student's professional knowledge.</p>	X		
<p><b>Standard 3.6</b> The EPT providers must have an agreement with the VEE and the student (in order to state their respective rights and duties, including insurance matters), provide a standardised evaluation of the performance of the student during their EPT and be allowed to provide feedback to the VEE on the EPT programme.</p> <p>There must be a member of the academic staff responsible for the overall supervision of the EPT, including liaison with EPT providers.</p>	X		
<p><b>Standard 3.7</b> Students must take responsibility for their own learning during EPT. This includes preparing properly before each placement, keeping a proper record of their experience during EPT by using a logbook provided by the VEE and evaluating the EPT. Students must be allowed to complain officially and/or anonymously about issues occurring during EPT. The VEE must have a system of QA to monitor the implementation, progress and then feedback within the EPT activities.</p>	X		
<b>Area 4: Facilities and equipment</b>			
<p><b>Standard 4.1</b> All aspects of the physical facilities must provide an environment conducive to learning, including internet access. The veterinary VEE must have a clear strategy and programme for maintaining and upgrading its buildings and equipment. Facilities must comply with all relevant legislation including health, safety, biosecurity, accessibility to people with reduced mobility, and EU animal welfare and care standards.</p>	X		
<p><b>Standard 4.2</b> Lecture theatres, teaching laboratories, tutorial rooms, clinical facilities and other teaching spaces must be adequate in number, size and equipped for the instructional purposes and must be well maintained. The facilities must be adapted for the number of students enrolled. Students must have ready access to adequate and sufficient study, self-learning, recreation, locker, sanitary and food service facilities. Offices, teaching preparation and research laboratories must be sufficient for the needs of the academic and support staff.</p>	X		
<p><b>Standard 4.3</b> The livestock facilities, animal housing, core clinical teaching facilities and equipment used by the VEE for teaching purposes must:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• be sufficient in capacity and adapted for the number of students enrolled in order to allow safe hands-on training for all students</li> <li>• be of a high standard, well maintained and fit for the purpose</li> <li>• promote best husbandry, welfare and management practices</li> <li>• ensure relevant biosecurity and bio-containment</li> <li>• be designed to enhance learning.</li> </ul>	X		
<p><b>Standard 4.4</b> Core clinical teaching facilities must be provided in a veterinary teaching hospital (VTH) with 24/7 emergency services at least for companion animals and equines. Within the VTH, the VEE must unequivocally demonstrate that standard of education and clinical research are compliant with all ESEVT Standards, e.g. research-based and evidence-based clinical training supervised by academic staff trained to teach and to assess, availability for staff and students of facilities and patients for performing clinical research and relevant QA procedures.</p> <p>For ruminants, on-call service must be available if emergency services do not exist for those species in a VTH.</p>	X		

## FINAL REPORT AS ISSUED BY ECOVE ON 14 DECEMBER 2021

The VEE must ensure state-of-the-art standards of teaching clinics which remain comparable with or exceeding the best available in the private sector. The VTH and any hospitals, practices and facilities (including EPT) which are involved with the curriculum must meet the relevant national Practice Standards.			
Standard 4.5 The VEE must ensure that students have access to a broad range of diagnostic and therapeutic facilities, including but not limited to: diagnostic imaging, anaesthesia, clinical pathology, intensive/critical care, surgeries and treatment facilities, ambulatory services, pharmacy and necropsy facilities.	X		
Standard 4.6 Appropriate isolation facilities must be provided to meet the need for the isolation and containment of animals with communicable diseases. Such isolation facilities must be properly constructed, ventilated, maintained and operated to provide for animal care and for prevention of spread of infectious agents. They must be adapted to all animal species commonly handled in the VTH.	X		
Standard 4.7 The VEE must have an ambulatory clinic for production animals or equivalent facilities so that students can practise field veterinary medicine and Herd Health Management under academic supervision.	X		
Standard 4.8 The transport of students, live animals, cadavers, materials from animal origin and other teaching materials must be done in agreement with national and EU standards, to ensure the safety of students and staff and to prevent the spread of infectious agents.	X		
Standard 4.9 Operational policies and procedures (including e.g. biosecurity, good laboratory practice and good clinical practice) must be taught and posted for students, staff and visitors and a Biosafety manual must be available. The VEE must demonstrate a clear commitment for the delivery of biosafety and biosecurity, e.g. by a specific committee structure. The VEE must have a system of QA to monitor and assure clinical, laboratory and farm services, including a regular monitoring of the feedback from students, staff and clients.	X		
<b>Area 5: Animal resources and teaching material of animal origin</b>			
Standard 5.1 The number and variety of healthy and diseased animals, cadavers, and material of animal origin must be adequate for providing the practical and safe hands-on training (in the areas of Basic Sciences, Clinical Sciences, Pathology, Animal Production, Food Safety and Quality) and adapted to the number of students enrolled. Evidence must be provided that these data are regularly recorded and that procedures are in place for correcting any deficiencies.	X		
Standard 5.2 In addition to the training provided in the VEE, experience can include practical training at external sites, provided this training is organised under direct academic supervision and following the same standards as those applied in the VEE.	X		
Standard 5.3 The VTH must provide nursing care skills and instruction in nursing procedures. Under all situations students must be active participants in the clinical workup of patients, including problem-oriented diagnostic approach together with diagnostic decision-making.	X		
Standard 5.4 Medical records must be comprehensive and maintained in an effective retrieval system (preferably an electronic patient record system) to efficiently support the teaching, research, and service programmes of the VEE.	X		
<b>Area 6: Learning resources</b>			
Standard 6.1 State-of-the-art learning resources must be adequate and available to support veterinary education, research, services and continuing education. When the study programme is provided in several tracks/languages, the learning resources must be available in all used languages. Timely access to learning resources, whether through print, electronic media or other means, must be available to students and staff and, when appropriate, to stakeholders. State-of-the-art procedures for bibliographical search and for access to databases and learning resources must be taught to undergraduate students.	X		
Standard 6.2 Staff and students must have full access on site to an academic library administered by a qualified librarian, an Information Technology (IT) unit managed by an IT expert, an e-learning platform, and all the relevant human and physical resources necessary for the development of instructional materials by the staff and their use by the students. The relevant electronic information, database and other intranet resources must be easily available for students and staff both in the VEE's core facilities via wireless connection (Wi-Fi) and from outside the VEE through a hosted secured connection, e.g. Virtual Private Network (VPN).	X		
Standard 6.3 The VEE must provide students with unimpeded access to learning resources, internet and internal study resources, and equipment for the development of procedural skills (e.g. models). The use of these resources must be aligned with the pedagogical environment and learning outcomes within the programme and have mechanisms in place to evaluate the teaching value of changes in learning resources.	X		
<b>Area 7: Student admission, progression and welfare</b>			
Standard 7.1 The VEE must consistently apply pre-defined and published regulations covering all phases of the student "life cycle", e.g. student admission, progression and certification. In relation to enrolment, the VEE must provide accurate and complete information regarding all aspects of the educational programme in all advertisements for prospective national and international students. Formal cooperations with other VEEs must also be clearly advertised.	X		
Standard 7.2 The number of students admitted must be consistent with the resources available at the VEE for staff, buildings, equipment, healthy and diseased animals, and materials of animal origin.	X		
Standard 7.3 The selection and progression criteria must be clearly defined, consistent, and defensible, be free of discrimination or bias, and take into account the fact that students are admitted with a view to their entry to the veterinary profession in due course. The VEE must regularly review and reflect on the selection processes to ensure they are appropriate for students to complete the programme successfully. If the selection processes are decided by another authority, the latter must regularly receive feedback from the VEE. Adequate training (including periodic refresher training) must be provided for those involved in the selection process to ensure applicants are evaluated fairly and consistently.	X		
Standard 7.4 There must be clear policies and procedures on how applicants with disabilities or illnesses are considered and, if appropriate, accommodated in the programme, taking into account the requirement that all students must be capable of meeting the ESEVT Day One Competences by the time they graduate.	X		

## FINAL REPORT AS ISSUED BY ECOVE ON 14 DECEMBER 2021

<p><b>Standard 7.5</b> The basis for decisions on progression (including academic progression and professional fitness to practise) must be explicit and readily available to the students. The VEE must provide evidence that it has mechanisms in place to identify and provide remediation and appropriate support (including termination) for students who are not performing adequately. The VEE must have mechanisms in place to monitor attrition and progression and be able to respond and amend admission selection criteria (if permitted by national or university law) and student support if required.</p>	x		
<p><b>Standard 7.6</b> Mechanisms for the exclusion of students from the programme for any reason must be explicit. The VEE's policies for managing appeals against decisions, including admissions, academic and progression decisions and exclusion, must be transparent and publicly available.</p>	x		
<p><b>Standard 7.7</b> Provisions must be made by the VEE to support the physical, emotional and welfare needs of students. This includes, but is not limited to, learning support and counselling services, career advice, and fair and transparent mechanisms for dealing with student illness, impairment and disability during the programme. This shall include provision of reasonable adjustments for disabled students, consistent with all relevant equality and/or human rights legislation. There must be effective mechanisms for resolution of student grievances (e.g. interpersonal conflict or harassment).</p>	x		
<p><b>Standard 7.8</b> Mechanisms must be in place by which students can convey their needs and wants to the VEE. The VEE must provide students with a mechanism, anonymously if they wish, to offer suggestions, comments and complaints regarding compliance of the VEE with national and international legislation and the ESEVT Standards.</p>	x		
<b>Area 8: Student assessment</b>			
<p><b>Standard 8.1</b> The VEE must ensure that there is a clearly identified structure within the VEE showing lines of responsibility for the assessment strategy to ensure coherence of the overall assessment regime and to allow the demonstration of progressive development across the programme towards entry-level competence.</p>	x		
<p><b>Standard 8.2</b> The assessment tasks and grading criteria for each unit of study in the programme must be published, applied consistently, clearly identified and available to students in a timely manner well in advance of the assessment. Requirements to pass must be explicit. The VEE must properly document the results of assessment and provide the students with timely feedback on their assessments. Mechanisms for students to appeal against assessment outcomes must be explicit.</p>	x		
<p><b>Standard 8.3</b> The VEE must have a process in place to review assessment outcomes, to change assessment strategies and to ensure the accuracy of the procedures when required. Programme learning outcomes covering the full range of professional knowledge, skills, competences and attributes must form the basis for assessment design and underpin decisions on progression.</p>	x		
<p><b>Standard 8.4</b> Assessment strategies must allow the VEE to certify student achievement of learning objectives at the level of the programme and individual units of study. The VEE must ensure that the programmes are delivered in a way that encourages students to take an active role in creating the learning process, and that the assessment of students reflects this approach.</p>	x		
<p><b>Standard 8.5</b> Methods of formative and summative assessment must be valid and reliable and comprise a variety of approaches. Direct assessment of clinical skills and Day One Competences (some of which may be on simulated patients), must form a significant component of the overall process of assessment. It must also include the quality control of the student logbooks in order to ensure that all clinical procedures, practical and hands-on training planned in the study programme have been fully completed by each individual student.</p>	x		
<b>Area 9: Academic and support staff</b>			
<p><b>Standard 9.1</b> The VEE must ensure that all staff are appropriately qualified and prepared for their roles, in agreement with national and EU regulations and must apply fair and transparent processes for the recruitment and development of staff. A formal training (including good teaching and evaluation practices, learning and e-learning resources, biosecurity and QA procedures) must be in place for all staff involved with teaching. Most academic staff (calculated as FTE) involved in veterinary training must be veterinarians. It is expected that more than 2/3 of the instruction that the students receive, as determined by student teaching hours, is delivered by qualified veterinarians.</p>	x		
<p><b>Standard 9.2</b> The total number, qualifications and skills of all staff involved with the programme, including teaching staff, 'adjunct' staff, technical, administrative and support staff, must be sufficient and appropriate to deliver the educational programme and fulfil the VEE's mission. A procedure must be in place to assess if they display competence and effective teaching skills in all relevant aspects of the curriculum that they teach, regardless of whether they are full or part time, residents, interns or other postgraduate students, adjuncts or off-campus contracted teachers.</p>	x		
<p><b>Standard 9.3</b> Staff must be given opportunities to develop and extend their teaching and assessment knowledge and must be encouraged to improve their skills. Opportunities for didactic and pedagogic training and specialisation must be available. The VEE must clearly define systems of reward for teaching excellence in operation. Academic positions must offer the security and benefits necessary to maintain stability, continuity, and competence of the academic staff. Academic staff must have a balanced workload of teaching, research and service depending on their role. They must have reasonable opportunities and resources for participation in scholarly activities.</p>	x		
<p><b>Standard 9.4</b> The VEE must provide evidence that it utilises a well-defined, comprehensive and publicised programme for the professional growth and development of academic and support staff, including formal appraisal and informal mentoring procedures. Staff must have the opportunity to contribute to the VEE's direction and decision-making processes. Promotion criteria for academic and support staff must be clear and explicit. Promotions for teaching staff must recognise excellence in, and (if permitted by the national or university law) place equal emphasis on all aspects of teaching (including clinical teaching), research, service and other scholarly activities.</p>	x		
<p><b>Standard 9.5</b> A system for assessment of teaching staff must be in operation and must include student participation. Results must be available to those undertaking external reviews and commented upon in reports.</p>	x		

**FINAL REPORT AS ISSUED BY ECOVE ON 14 DECEMBER 2021**

Area 10: Research programmes, continuing and postgraduate education			
<b>Standard 10.1</b> The VEE must demonstrate significant and broad research activities of staff that integrate with and strengthen the veterinary degree programme through research-based teaching.	x		
<b>Standard 10.2</b> All students must be trained in scientific method and research techniques relevant to evidence-based veterinary medicine and must have opportunities to participate in research programmes.	x		
<b>Standard 10.3</b> The VEE must provide advanced postgraduate degree programmes, e.g. PhD, internships, residencies and continuing education programmes that complement and strengthen the veterinary degree programme and are relevant to the needs of the profession and society.	x		
<b>Standard 10.4</b> The VEE must have a system of QA to evaluate how research activities provide opportunities for student training and staff promotion, and how research approaches, methods and results are integrated into the veterinary teaching programmes.	x		
<i>C: (total or substantial) compliance; PC: partial compliance (Minor Deficiency); NC: non-compliance (Major Deficiency)</i>			



## **Executive Summary**

### **Brief history of the VEE and its previous EAEVE Visitations**

The Veterinary School, Kingdom of Savoy, was founded in 1769 and it was the first VetSchool in Italy and the fourth in Europe. The School was settled in Turin in 1859. In 1934 the School became one of the Faculties of the University of Turin, and in 1999, the now Department of Veterinary Sciences (referred to as ‘VEE’ in this Report) was relocated in Grugliasco, 11 km from the centre of Turin, in a shared campus with the Department of Agriculture, Forestry and Food Sciences.

The current ESEVT Visitation was performed in agreement with the SOP (2019) as amended in September 2021.

### **Brief comment on the SER**

The SER was well written and followed the SOP.

The Team had a number of pre site visit questions which were answered in great detail and thereby adding to a thorough understanding of the VEE’s curriculum, the strengths and the weaknesses of the VEE and other important details.

Illustrations and tables were sufficient and relevant to understand the VEE’s concept of teaching veterinary medicine integrated with research in a large university setting. Much material was also brought to the Team’s knowledge during the Visitation.

### **Brief comment on the Visitation**

The Visitation was performed in a very friendly and informative atmosphere with great focus on students and didactics, and the Team met open doors in all areas visited with a strong emphasis on demonstrating exactly what the Team wished to see.

The interviews on Thursday revealed academic and technical staff and students very eager to supply the Team with additional information and also more critical remarks relevant to the different groups.

### **Areas worthy of praise (i.e. Commendations), e.g.:**

- A far-reaching quality assurance system at every level and for each of its operations;
- The “Portfolio of Competencies” in production animals;
- The number of production animals (and companion animals) seen intramurally;
- Despite the paperwork that this way of working entails, it is commendable how each adjustment is documented.
- The fact that students can achieve extensive practical training in the community shelter;
- The state-of-the art non-Conventional Animals and Wildlife Unit (exotics);
- The isolation units are adequate and for the large animals they are commendable.
- Biosecurity procedures for access of lorries to the restricted farm area;
- The internal Ethics and Animal Welfare Committee;
- The fact that the library staff are both very helpful to the students and very enthusiastic about their work;
- The cooperation between the university, the Campus School and the VEE in terms of orientation and guidance;
- The fact that the VEE offers very good possibilities for disabled students;
- The fact that each new lecturer follows a dedicated pedagogical and technical programme;

## **FINAL REPORT AS ISSUED BY ECOVE ON 14 DECEMBER 2021**

- The fact that the VEE provides opportunities for students to carry out short, focused lab or field-based research projects.
- The large number of residency programmes (despite a lack of national recognition for such specialisms).

### **Areas of concern (i.e. Minor Deficiencies):**

None.

### **Suggestions for improvement, e.g.:**

- A review and update of SUA CdS;
- Re-evaluation of the balance between the didactic and the other forms of teaching;
- More emphasis on laboratory animal medicine in the curriculum;
- Air conditioning in all relevant premises;
- Increased dialogue with the MIUR regarding the admission procedures;
- Increase in the number of problem-oriented exams and re-evaluation of the objectiveness and value of oral exams;
- Rewarding teaching and research excellence;
- Continued efforts to attract funding to support student research projects.

Additional suggestions for improvement are described in the Visitation Report.

### **Items of non-compliance with the ESEVT Standards:**

None.

## **COVID-19 Annex summary**

Following upon the emergence of the COVID-19 virus in Wuhan City China in December 2019, Italy reported its first cases in February 2020 and by March, had the second highest number of confirmed cases after China. A government decree of 11 March 2020 extended local prohibitions to movement outside the home introduced in some northern provinces, nationwide. This included closing schools and universities.

From the 4<sup>th</sup> May 2020, Italy entered phase 2 of the control programme including vaccination, mask wearing, social distancing and restrictions on gathering. Although no date was given for the resumption of the majority of face-to-face school and university activities, the Minister for University Education invited national establishments to re-organise activities for the academic year 2020-21 taking into consideration the public health needs.

In November 2020 the situation deteriorated again with twice the number of new cases recorded in November than during October. Numbers continued to increase into January and it was not until May 2021 that the vaccination programme and other control measures allowed the re-opening of the main activities and services.

As is the case in other European countries, Italy enforced COVID-19 controls through a comprehensive programme of national legal and regulatory measures.

## **COVID-19 – Management by the University of Turin (UniTo)**

The University reacted quickly to the emergency, monitoring the situation and communicating effectively with the university community by a range of channels, and creating a psychological listening space, managed by the Department of Psychology.

In line with the invitation from the Minister to re-organise activities for the 2020-21 academic year, during June the University invited Departments and degree courses to reflect on the didactic model and organisation while considering scenarios proposed by the University, Ministerial suggestions and students' opinions. This global approach was enacted to encourage the adoption of an integrated teaching solution planned within a quality framework including face-to-face lessons, live streaming lessons and activities in small groups.

A dedicated working group was created to manage ICT adaption of classrooms within Departments, and ad hoc funding was made available to enhance remote library facilities. By July 2020 an online course was available to improve teacher skills in e-teaching and additional online services for students. Preventive measures to allow regular student access to the campus from September 2020 were prepared.

Special measures to manage the 2020-21 admission test to the Veterinary Medicine degree course were adopted by Rectoral Decree, allowing social distancing.

However, the worsening situation over the following months led to the suspension of all face-to-face activities on the 4<sup>th</sup> November. This was gradually relaxed to allow some practical activity with a return to face to face from March 2021, particularly for experimental activities e.g. laboratory and in-field training.

#### **COVID-19 – Emergency Management by the Turin VEE**

The VTH was classified as an essential business and remained open for emergencies.

A training course was provided in March 2020 to provide teachers with skills in distance learning and a COVID-19 emergency response plan implemented. Objectives were set to ensure completion of exams and graduation of students and to support of students and staff. All theoretical courses are now offered online via the Moodle platform and teachers also allocate some time every week with students attending their courses.

During spring 2021 a hybrid teaching approach has been implemented. Hands-on activities, practicals and EPT at local veterinary practices and National Health Systems are now back to face to face.

## **Glossary**

ANVUR: Italian National Agency for the Evaluation of Universities and Research Institutes  
APS: Elective Practical Training  
CMR: The DVM Monitoring and Review Commission  
CRD: Department Research Committee  
D1C: Day One Competences  
DOPs: Direct Observation of Procedural Skills  
DVS: Department of Veterinary Sciences (= the VEE)  
EPT: Extramural Practical Training  
LA: Large Animals  
MIUR: Italian Ministry of Education, University and Research  
NSQ: National Scientific Qualification  
OSCE: Objective structured clinical examination  
OTP: Orientation, Tutorship and Placement service  
PPT: Professional Practical Training  
SA: Small Animals  
SAMEV: School of Agriculture & Veterinary Medicine  
SCU: University's Unified Credentials System  
SDSV: Special Didactic Veterinary Complex  
SUA-CdS: Scheda Unica Annuale (SUA-CdS) (objectives, curriculum, learning environment, learning outcomes, self-evaluation outcomes, profile of the current student population and the employment destinations of the past students)  
VEE: Veterinary Educational Establishment  
VTH: Veterinary Teaching Hospital

## **Decision of ECOVE**

The Committee concluded that no Major Deficiencies had been identified.

The Veterinary Education Establishment (VEE) of the University of Turin is therefore classified as holding the status of: **ACCREDITATION**.