



**VISITATION REPORT**

**To VetAgro Sup, Lyon, France**

**On 07 – 11 June 2021**

**By the Visitation Team**

**Marinka Drobnič-Košorok**, Ljubljana, Slovenia: Visitor in Basic Sciences

**Manuel Gascón Perez**, Zaragoza, Spain: Visitor in Clinical Sciences in Companion Animals

**Gerrit Hooijer**, Utrecht, The Netherlands: Visitor in Clinical Sciences in Food-Producing Animals

**Georges Daube**, Liège, Belgium: Visitor in Food Safety and Quality

**Massimo Castagnaro (Chairperson)**, Padua, Italy: Visitor in Quality Assurance

**Pavol Valášek**, Bratislava, Slovakia: Practitioner

**Diana Teixeira**, Vila Real, Portugal: Student

**Philip Duffus**, Bristol, United Kingdom: ESEVT Coordinator

## **Contents of the Visitation Report**

Introduction

1. Objectives, Organisation and QA Policy
2. Finances
3. Curriculum
4. Facilities and equipment
5. Animal resources and teaching material of animal origin
6. Learning resources
7. Student admission, progression and welfare
8. Student assessment
9. Academic and support staff
10. Research programmes, continuing and postgraduate education
11. ESEVT Indicators
12. ESEVT Rubrics

Executive Summary

Glossary

## **Introduction**

### **Brief history of the Establishment and of its previous ESEVT Visitations (if any)**

It will be difficult to give a “brief history” of the National Veterinary School of Lyon (referred to as Establishment in this report), as after being founded in 1791 (as the first veterinary school in the world) there have been about 260 years of history to consider!

In 2010, the National Veterinary School of Lyon merged with the National School of Veterinary Services (ENSV) and the National School for Agricultural Engineering of Clermont-Ferrand (ENITAC) to create VetAgro Sup.

VetAgro Sup is unusual among the Veterinary Teaching Establishments in that this merger has linked the education of veterinarians, agronomists, and veterinary public health officers. As a result, the Establishment offers three curricula (veterinary medicine, agricultural science, and veterinary public health). VetAgro Sup is also linked with the University of Lyon, which provides both preclinical and clinical human medical courses. These integrated courses and close links with medical Establishments puts VetAgro Sup in an excellent position to promote the concept of “One Global Health”.

In 2015, the Establishment was evaluated by the ESEVT and ECOVE granted an “Approval” status, valid until 2025. However, in 2018 and led by the Dean, the Establishment decided to be proactive and to apply for full accreditation under the ESEVT SOP as established in Zagreb in 2019.

VetAgro Sup is also a member of Agreenium, an interesting concept which was established by the French Ministry of Agriculture to bring together several Establishments of higher education in agriculture and four research institutes, with the goal of disseminating knowledge and producing a shift in training to meet global challenges of the future.

### **Main features of the Establishment**

There are two campuses as described later in this report. There have been major changes in the leadership, organisation and governance of the VEE as discussed below. Another unusual feature (in comparison to other mainland European VEEs) is that VetAgro Sup is currently fully accredited by AVMA with a comprehensive site visit still to be scheduled.

### **Main developments since the last Visitation (or, if there has not been a previous one, in the period since the veterinary degree programme began)**

Since the last ESEVT Visitation in 2015 there have been several changes which are highlighted in the Self-Evaluation Report (SER), for example:

- The curriculum was modified at the national level in 2017 and is now competency-based.
- The number of students admitted to the veterinary curriculum has increased from 140/year to 160/year in 2018.
- The number of academic and support staff has also increased (+9.6 FTE between 2015 and 2019).
- Most lecture theatres have been renovated and six new classrooms created.
- A skill lab (VetSkill) and a learning lab (Le Lab) have been created.
- A new Equine Emergency and Critical Care Unit has been established.

There were a number of potential deficiencies identified by the 2015 ESEVT Visitation which have been addressed:

- The Visitation Team identified a lack of autonomy in using both income and financial resources which to some extent has been improved but the VEE still feels it lacks sufficient monetary control on its activities.
- The Visitation Team also identified an insufficient number of pigs and poultry for both pre-clinical and clinical teaching. This has been rectified by a series of in-depth contracts with private veterinarians, as well as an increase in patients seen in both extramural and intramural teaching.
- The Visitation Team also identified a lack of sufficient training in ophthalmology, which has now resulted in a dedicated room and a contract with an ophthalmology specialist. Similarly, the ESEVT Team identified a lack of basic aquaculture/fish disease teaching which has caused a specific course to be developed for Y3 students.

### **Version and date of the ESEVT SOP which is valid for the Visitation**

The ESEVT SOP as established in Zagreb in 2019 is the basis for this Visitation.

## **Standard 1: Objectives, Organisation and QA Policy**

**1.1 The Establishment must have as its main objective the provision, in agreement with the EU Directives and ESG recommendations, of adequate, ethical, research-based, evidence-based veterinary training that enables the new graduate to perform as a veterinarian capable of entering all commonly recognised branches of the veterinary profession and to be aware of the importance of lifelong learning.**

**The Establishment must develop and follow its mission statement which must embrace all the ESEVT standards.**

### **1.1.1. Findings**

Under the conditions laid down in Article L. 812-1 of the Rural Code of French legislation, VetAgro Sup issues the national diplomas of veterinary education provided for in Article R. 812-55 of the Rural Code, as well as the national titles and diplomas for which it has been authorised by the Ministry of Higher Education and Research (MESRI), alone or in partnership with other institutions of higher education.

The main objective of the Establishment is to provide undergraduates with European top-level education on animal health and welfare, biomedical research, and veterinary public health that helps them to advance in their future careers and serves the needs of society. Education is carried out with particular regard to human health and protection of environment.

The different features of the Mission of VetAgro Sup are well written in the Table 1.1.1. of the SER.

### **1.1.2. Comments**

The Establishment provides a veterinary education that embraces all ESEVT Standards and are in agreement with the EU Directives and ESG recommendations.

### **1.1.3. Suggestions for improvement**

None.

### **1.1.4. Decision**

The Establishment is compliant with Substandard 1.1.

**1.2 The Establishment must be part of a university or a higher education institution providing training recognised as being of an equivalent level and formally recognised as such in the respective country.**

**The person responsible for the veterinary curriculum and the person(s) responsible for the professional, ethical, and academic affairs of the Veterinary Teaching Hospital (VTH) must hold a veterinary degree.**

**The decision-making process of the Establishment must allow implementation of its strategic plan and of a cohesive study programme, in compliance with the ESEVT standards.**

### **1.2.1. Findings**

VetAgro Sup is a public establishment for teaching and research with the same status as a university, and it is under the supervision of both the Ministry of Agriculture and Food (MAA) and the Ministry of Higher Education and Research (MESRI).

Appointed by the MAA in July 2016, the Dean (Dr. Emmanuelle Souberyan, DVM, ISPV) is a qualified veterinarian that established a governance system based on three Vice-Deans: one oversees the veterinary campus (the Establishment – Prof. Jeanne-Marie Bonnet-Garin, DVM, PhD), one in charge of National School of Veterinary Services (ENSV – Dr. Nathalie Guerson, DVM, ISPV), and the third for the agronomic campus.

The present Dean will soon leave the VetAgro Sup to become Chief Veterinary Officer for France. In the transition phase, during the on-going procedures for the recruitment of the new dean, Prof. Jeanne-Marie Bonnet-Garin will function as a Dean.

In a cascading manner, the Establishment has then identified an Education Director (Prof. Luc

Mounier, qualified veterinarian), a Director of the VTH (Pr. Luc Chabanne, qualified veterinarian), a Scientific Director (Dr Estelle Loukiadis, DVM, ISPV, PhD), a director for International Relations (Pr. Gilles Brunschwig, PhD) and a quality, health and safety/accreditation officer (Dr. Vanessa Neto, PhD).

Education activities are organized and performed within three departments: i. Basic Sciences, ii. Clinical Department for Companion, Sport, and Leisure Animals, and iii. Livestock and Veterinary Public Health.

The decision-making process, from the general orientation and strategy topics to the management of relevant specific issues, relies on a very clearly articulated and complex organization of councils and committees where external stakeholders, faculties and students are well represented and contribute to the implementation of the strategic plan within the study programme.

The COVID-19 crisis committee, led by the Dean and composed of a representative panel of the key functions of the Establishment, has met as often as necessary. It also included specialists in infectious pathology and epidemiology.

The Establishment's bodies (CE, CEVE, CHSCT, CA) have been regularly held in a distancing webinar to discuss the COVID-19 crisis management.

#### **1.2.2. Comments**

- The Establishment is a higher education institution in which Dean, Vice-Dean, Educational Director (person responsible for the veterinary curriculum) and the Director of the VTH hold a veterinary degree.
- The implementation of the strategic plan and of the veterinary study programme is ensured by an adequate decision-making process and a articulated organization.

#### **1.2.3. Suggestions for improvement**

None.

#### **1.2.4. Decision**

The Establishment is compliant with Substandard 1.2.

### **1.3 The Establishment must have a strategic plan, which includes a SWOT analysis of its current activities, a list of objectives, and an operating plan with a timeframe and indicators for its implementation.**

#### **1.3.1. Findings**

The Establishment's five-year strategic plan (2016-2020) has been built on the base of goals set by the French Ministry of Agriculture and Food (MAA) and it is articulated into clearly identified, objectives aiming together to train veterinarians with an integrated vision (veterinary, agronomic, environmental, and societal) of the health. A complete SWOT analysis performed in 2018 by the Establishment, confirmed its general strategic pathway and it has led to the new 2021-2025 new strategic plan, which has been voted by the Board of Directors in December 2020. The new project is currently being broken down into actions and sub-actions, under the responsibility of pilots and project groups with the involvement of faculties, support staff and students. Some projects have been slowed down by the sanitary crisis (Compet'Vet development, finalisation of Improve-IT platform (this latter project had been finalised by the time of the Visitation)). Specific timeframes

and key indicators are identified in Appendix 14 of the SER. Many further indicators for the monitoring of the objectives used by the Establishment are present in the COP, the “*Contrat d’Objectifs et de Performance*” between the VetAgro Sup and MAA (Ministry of Agriculture and Food). The Establishment is also planning a new project (Vet Campus) that, using a major public investment, will allow a significant extension of the buildings available for the teaching activities.

### **1.3.2. Comments**

- The Establishment has a modern, ambitious, clear and well-constructed strategic plan based on a SWOT analyses.
- Objectives, indicators and timeframe are also included.

### **1.3.3. Suggestions for improvement**

None.

### **1.3.4. Decision**

The Establishment is compliant with Substandard 1.3.

**1.4 The Establishment must have a policy and associated written procedures for the assurance of the quality and standards of its programmes and awards. It must also commit itself explicitly to the development of a culture which recognises the importance of quality, and quality assurance, within their Establishment. To achieve this, the Establishment must develop and implement a strategy for the continuous enhancement of quality. The development and implementation of the Establishment’s strategy must include a role for students and other stakeholders, both internal and external, and the strategy must have a formal status and be publicly available.**

### **1.4.1. Findings**

VetAgro Sup's approach to quality is based on the PDCA cycle and it is compliant with ESG Standards; its Quality Management System (QMS) consists of a i. quality policy published on the website, ii. a quality manual, integrating all operations of VetAgro Sup (including teaching and research), iii. a process map, and iv. hundreds of documents dedicated to quality assurance.

Once a year, a management review assesses the effectiveness of each process and monitors progress towards the established objectives. Non-conformities, malfunction and complaints are recorded and addressed to the relevant unit and help to identify areas for improvements and corrective actions.

QA policy, written procedures and the strategy for continuous enhancement of quality are under the responsibility of a quality manager and include teaching, research, support and management activities.

Every year the effectiveness of each process and the progress towards the established objectives is assessed by a management review with the participation of student representatives. Monitoring of the objectives is also granted by programmed internal audits.

The Quality Management System is published on the Establishment website.

### **1.4.2. Comments**

- The Establishment has in place a Quality Management System (QMS) which includes QA policy and associated written procedures.

## **FINAL REPORT AS ISSUED BY ECOVE ON 29 SEPTEMBER 2021**

- The development and implementation of the QA system are achieved with the contribution of student's representatives.
- QMS is publicly available on the Establishment's ebsite.

### **1.4.3. Suggestions for improvement**

None.

### **1.4.4. Decision**

The Establishment is compliant with Substandard 1.4.

**1.5 The Establishment must provide evidence that it interacts with its stakeholders and the wider society. Such public information must be clear, objective and readily accessible; the information must include up-to-date information about the study programme, views and employment destinations of past students as well as the profile of the current student population.**

**The Establishment's website must mention the ESEVT Establishment's status and its last Self Evaluation Report and Visitation Report must be easily available for the public.**

### **1.5.1. Findings**

VetAgro Sup has developed different networks and several partnerships in order to interact with external stakeholders, from the private to the public sectors and including alumni. Information regarding study programme and employment destination are communicated through digital social networks, newsletters and a yearly report. On the VetAgro Sup website the Establishment's ESEVT status and the last SER and Visitation Report are publicly available.

### **1.5.2. Comments**

- The Establishment has solid and diffuse interactions with its stakeholders.
- The last Visitation's SER and Visitation Report are easily available on the Establishment's website.

### **1.5.3. Suggestions for improvement**

None.

### **1.5.4. Decision**

The Establishment is compliant with Substandard 1.5

**1.6 The Establishment must monitor and periodically review its activities, both quantitative and qualitative, to ensure that they achieve the objectives set for them and respond to the needs of students and society. The Establishment must make public how this analysis of information has been utilised in the further development of its activities and provide evidence as to the involvement of both students and staff in the provision, analysis and implementation of such data.**

**Any action planned or taken as a result of this data analysis must be communicated to all those concerned.**

**1.6.1. Findings**

Performances of the VetAgro Sup are monitored monthly by analysing financial and human resources indicators. A project manager evaluates the progression of specific goals included in the strategic plan several times a year. A yearly report containing the analysis of the rate of achievements is presented during the Board of Directors' meeting and available on the intranet. The reports of the Management Board are sent to all Establishment's employees by e-mail.

The VetAgro Sup teaching and research strategy is evaluated by the National High Council for the Evaluation of Research and Higher Education (HCERES).

The Establishment uses several approaches to listen and respond to the needs of the students (national survey by MAA, self-evaluation survey of students and young graduates, student evaluations for each semester, etc.). A report, published on the VetAgro Sup intranet, synthesises all information coming from all these approaches and identifies new objectives for the following period.

**1.6.2. Comments**

- The Establishment is monitoring and reviewing the established objectives and communicating them to all those concerned, including all the relevant information regarding the development of new activities.
- Students and internal and external stakeholders are involved in the provision, analysis and implementation of data coming for establishment monitor system.

**1.6.3. Suggestions for improvement**

None.

**1.6.4. Decision**

The Establishment is compliant with Substandard 1.6.

**1.7 The Establishment must undergo external review through the ESEVT on a cyclical basis. Evidence must be provided of such external evaluation with the assurance that the progress made since the last ESEVT evaluation was linked to a continuous quality assurance process.**

**1.7.1. Findings**

Although no Major Deficiencies were found during the last ESEVT Stage 1 Visitation (21-25 September 2015), the Visitation Team had identified several potential shortcomings that have been analysed and corrected by the Establishment.

The different laboratories and technological facilities of VetAgro Sup are periodically evaluated by various external organisations.

**1.7.2. Comments**

None.

**1.7.3. Suggestions for improvement**

None.

#### **1.7.4. Decision**

The Establishment is compliant with Substandard 1.7.

### **Standard 2. Finances**

**2.1 Finances must be demonstrably adequate to sustain the requirements for the Establishment to meet its mission and to achieve its objectives for education, research and services. The description must include both expenditures (separated into personnel costs, operating costs, maintenance costs and equipment) and revenues (separated into public funding, tuition fees, services, research grants and other sources).**

#### **2.1.1. Findings**

The average income of nearly 33 million Euros is largely obtained from the state through the payment of the salary of a large part of the staff and through other subsidies. Nonetheless, clinical, analytical and consultancy services generate more than 7 million Euros annually, research - 1.2 million and continuing education - 1.8 million. All this latter income can be used freely by the Establishment to cover its expenses. These are mainly personnel costs (nearly 16 million Euros paid by the MAA and nearly 6 million by the Establishment) but the Establishment can utilise more than 3 million per year for investments.

The budget dedicated to local contracts increased between 2018 and 2019 by 647 k€. Seventy per cent of the increase (462 k€) is linked to the VTH. Recruitments took place following the recommendations of the organizational and financial audit (Cabinet Deloitte), such as a director, animal health technicians, a pharmacist. Some recruitments also occurred for the Skill Lab, the creation of the Animal Welfare Chair, and a quality engineer.

The continuing education revenue increased by 48,4% between 2018 and 2019 by the development of new training courses, such as more than 245,000 € for the Certificate of Advanced Studies (CEAV) of Internal Medicine for Companion Animals.

A major investment plan is planned for 2020-2021. The Establishment is self-financing with 3 M€ investments, and 4.5 M€ investments financed by the State (Ministry of Agriculture or other funding). A further 8.8 M€ is postponed to 2022, as the projects are at the study stage. Beyond those projects, half of them will be financed by the State (CPER, *Contrat de Plan Etat Région*), the other half self-financed.

By the end of 2020, the Establishment's cash flow reached 18 M€.

#### **2.1.2. Comments**

- The income largely covers the basic expenses and also allows for an ambitious investment plan.

**2.1.3. Suggestions for improvement**

- Cost accounting for the entire Establishment, such as that implemented within the VTH, would better identify the sources of profit or loss and thus better identify points of attention in the area of finance.

**2.1.4. Decision**

The Establishment is compliant with Substandard 2.1.

**2.2 Clinical and field services must function as instructional resources. Instructional integrity of these resources must take priority over financial self-sufficiency of clinical services operations.**

**The Establishment must have sufficient autonomy in order to use the resources to implement its strategic plan and to meet the ESEVT Standards.**

**2.2.1. Findings**

The VTH can use the income it generates, in particular to recruit additional staff, but most of the staff do not depend on clinical re-entry. The management of the clinical services is carried out in collaboration with that of the rest of the Establishment and any large investments are discussed at this level. A computerized management tool has been set up for analytical management of the VTH.

**2.2.2. Comments**

- The VTH is being modernized, in particular for its medical imaging equipment and a number of premises. A recent audit identified a set of actions for improvement to be carried out at the organizational, financial and communication activities and actions level.
- The Establishment has the autonomy necessary for its proper functioning.

**2.2.3. Suggestions for improvement**

- The computerization of activities and the harmonization of work practices within the various VTH clinics should be finalized.

**2.2.4. Decision**

The Establishment is compliant with Substandard 2.2.

**2.3 Resources allocation must be regularly reviewed to ensure that available resources meet the requirements.**

**2.3.1. Findings**

All parties affected by the budget are interviewed once a year about their operational, staffing and investment needs. Arbitrations are carried out by the Dean, the senior deputies, the secretary general and the directors. It is checked by the regional budget controller and then approved by the Board of Directors. The MAA, which funds most of the revenue, is informed of the budget allocation for technical verification. The budget can be amended once a year in November by following the same procedure.

### **2.3.2. Comments**

- The establishment of the budget and its monitoring are transparent and well organized and involve all the parties concerned.

### **2.3.3. Suggestions for improvement**

None.

### **2.3.4. Decision**

The Establishment is compliant with Substandard 2.3.

## **Standard 3. Curriculum**

**3.1 The curriculum must be designed, resourced and managed to ensure all graduates have achieved the graduate attributes expected to be fully compliant with the EU Directive 2005/36/EC (as amended by directive 2013/55/EU) and its Annex V.4.1. The curriculum must include the subjects (input) and must allow the acquisition of the Day One Competences (output) listed in Annex 2. This concerns Basic Sciences, Clinical Sciences in companion animals (including equine and exotic pets), Clinical Sciences in food-producing animals (including Animal Production and Herd Health Management), Food Safety and Quality, and Professional Knowledge.**

### **3.1.1 General findings**

Study of veterinary medicine in France is standardised on the national level. All four establishments responsible for veterinary medicine teaching (Lyon, Nantes, Alfort and Toulouse) participated in designing the admittance conditions, undergraduate curriculum, and complementary studies.

The undergraduate veterinary curriculum takes place over five years (Y1-Y5). To obtain all the necessary knowledge and skills based on Day One Competences all students must pass four years of an identical core curriculum of full-time theoretical and practical study under the supervision of VetAgro Sup, a public establishment for teaching and research with the same status as a university. After Y4 they are awarded the **Diploma of Fundamental Veterinary Studies (DEFV)**. In this period at least two weeks of international period are compulsory. It can be taken as EPT on the basis of an individual contract with different providers of veterinary services.

In the last year (Y5) students can choose one or two specific fields of in-depth study (clinical work, veterinary public health, research, business management or a combination of these fields) and prepare their final thesis. After successfully defending their thesis, students are awarded the **State Diploma of Veterinary Doctor**.

All courses are listed in Appendix 2; teaching hours, type of training (lectures, seminars, supervised self-learning, laboratory and desk-based work, non-clinical animal work and clinical animal work) as well as the allocated ECTS are evident for each teaching unit.

Complementary studies after the fifth year can be chosen by students who wish to complete an internship (one year) and pursue veterinary specialisation. Students are selected for an internship

on the basis of the results of a national competition, based on selective examination. The degree of European Specialist can be reached through completing the residency or by following a three-year programme for the Diploma of Specialised Veterinary Studies (DESV). The Establishment is accredited for 14 European specialities and hosting approximately 22 residents per year.

The knowledge and skills to be acquired are outlined by the “**competency framework of the national veterinary diploma**”, based on Day One Competences as defined in the SOP and is compliant with EU Directives 205/36/EU in 2013/55/EU. These competences must be evaluated in all students at the end of the fourth year.

This competency framework became effective in 2018. It was developed by intensive collaboration of all four French veterinary establishments, their stakeholders, the ministry, and representatives of the profession and was coordinated by a steering committee (Education director and academics from each of four establishments, representing different disciplines). The progress in building the competency framework and the final results were discussed with teachers during Teachers’ Assemblies or pedagogic seminars and students through the meetings of Council of teaching and student life (CEVE). The results were shared with the representatives of the veterinary profession including practitioners from all fields. The feedback from all these stakeholders was incorporated in a final version of the reference framework, which was finally accepted at the national level. Now the focus of the steering committee is turned to the proper implementation of this framework in each establishment.

The competency framework is broken down into four macro-competences that are veterinary-specific (advise and prevent, establish a diagnosis, care-treat and act for veterinary public health) and four interdisciplinary ones (work in a company, communicate, act as a scientist, act responsibly).

Each macro competence is broken down into several skills and further to abilities. For each ability a level of performance is specified (“*has seen*”, “*has done*”, “*knows how to do*”). Each situation must be seen in the clinical rotation, off campus studies and EPT’s in real or simulated situations. The use of the competency matrix will come in full operation in 2022, when after a period of pilot operation in 2021 it will be used for the evaluation of the competences obtained by each student.

The competence framework was implemented into the national legislation in the field of veterinary studies; however, the Establishment is autonomous in the means of achieving the objectives (i.e. determination of necessary teaching units, their objectives, teaching hours and their place in the curriculum).

In response to the updated national framework the Establishment decided to make changes to the curriculum on the basis of feedback information obtained from 2012 and 2013 generations of the alumni, identifying weak and strong points of veterinary training in the Establishment. Teachers as well as students were deeply involved in discussions regarding the changes of the curriculum. Five working groups composed of students and teachers were formed (group for new teaching units, pedagogical progression, personalisation of training paths, EPTs and their evaluation, evaluation of the curriculum). The updated curriculum was first implemented for incoming students in 2017. Until now the implementation has reached the fourth year in 2020.

The Establishment formally implemented the national competency framework into the new curriculum in 2018.

## **FINAL REPORT AS ISSUED BY ECOVE ON 29 SEPTEMBER 2021**

Extensive effort was put into identifying omissions, lack of consistency, and redundancies during these reflections and discussions related to the new curriculum. As a result of all these activities new teaching units were created (such as exotic animals, critical analyses of scientific literature, etc.), with a specific focus on different aspects of professional competence (e.g. communication, management, legislation, deontological code, professional ethics, etc.)

Some teaching units were modified (e.g. animal welfare, parasitology, pig and poultry production, etc.) or displaced in the curriculum (e.g. clinical examination).

Competency matrix was prepared for each teaching unit. The competency matrix of each teaching unit is compiled in a single document which makes it possible to determine the teaching units that are involved in the development of each ability and also if certain abilities are not taught by any other teaching unit.

Computer based visual aid will allow each student to follow his/her acquisition of the required competences upon completion of the different teaching units. It is supposed to be implemented as a one-year pilot project in October 2021. From 2022 should be accepted also as a regular assessment tool for clinical rotation.

Beside major changes in the curriculum, regular updates are carried out to adapt instruction to new knowledge and new practices. New learning/teaching methods should be introduced. The changes are evaluated by students, teachers, and representatives of the veterinary profession. To further adapt training to the real needs of the profession, it was decided in 2019 to set up a Professional Development Council with representatives of the veterinary profession, students, the management of the Establishment, and department heads. The aim of this council is to analyse the training and make recommendations for its further development.

### **3.1.1.2. Comments**

- Development of the Competency matrix and the implementation of its digital form for assessment of the acquired competences will contribute a lot to the objective and comprehensive assessment of student achievements. By using this tool, the quality control of the assessment of the achieved competences will be substantially improved.

### **3.1.1.3. Suggestions for improvement**

None.

### **3.1.1.4. Decision**

The Establishment is compliant with Substandard 3.1.1.

## **3.1.2. Basic Sciences**

Students to be admitted to the first year of the undergraduate study programme on one of the four establishments of veterinary training in France have to complete an initial two-to-three-year preparatory period to obtain basic knowledge in life sciences (Physics, Chemistry, Mathematics, Animal and Plant Biology as well as French and English). This knowledge can be achieved by several different ways finishing with competitive examinations. Successful competition of the exams is necessary/obligatory to apply for the study of the veterinary medicine on any of the four veterinary faculties in France. Preparatory training as well as competitive exams are organised on national level and are not directly within the purview of the Establishment. These different

pathways and the associated exams are managed by a national organisation (*Service des Concours Agronomiques et Vétérinaires*; SCAV).

### **3.1.2.1. Findings**

The basic competences can be further upgraded by the courses in the first three years of the veterinary training, to get the knowledge of the structure, functions, behaviour, and physiological needs of animals. All courses required by the ESEVT SOP are included in the curriculum.

All specific veterinary subject in basic sciences as required by the SOP, are listed in Appendix 2 and are a basis for “personalised study” which was introduced with the new curriculum.

The knowledge and skills to be acquired as well as the methods of assessment are outlined in competency matrix developed for each teaching unit and compiled in the “**competency framework of the national veterinary diploma**”, based on Day One Competences as defined in SOP and is compliant with EU Directives 2005/36/EU and 2013/55/EU.

### **3.1.2.2. Comments**

None.

### **3.1.2.3. Suggestions for improvement**

None.

### **3.1.2.4. Decision**

The Establishment is compliant with Substandard 3.1.2.

## **3.1.3. Clinical Sciences in companion animals (including equine and exotic pets)**

### **3.1.3.1. Findings**

In Clinical Sciences in companion animals (including equine and exotic pets) the curriculum is compliant with the EU Directive 2005/36/EC (as amended by directive 2013/55/EU), including the subjects (input) and allows the acquisition of the Day One Competences.

The number of hours taken by each student is 1,050 in the first four years, and 1,607 in year 5.

- In year 2, students take 15 hours in non-clinical animal work.
- In year 3, students take 18 hours in non-clinical animal work, and 252 hours in clinical animal work.
- In year 4, students take 140 hours in non-clinical animal work, and 910 hours in clinical animal work.
- In year 5, students take 1,050 hours in clinical animal work, although including lectures, seminars and reflection exercises.
- Each student has to choose one single species clinical track, the hours depending on the chosen track. In the case of small animal/exotic/equine the number of hours would be: 1015 in small animal track, 525 in exotic, 600 in equine. In the mixed clinical track 490 small animal and 300 equine.

Another important aspect is the number of hours taken for each student in clinical animal work in preclinical subjects (diagnostic imaging, diagnostic pathology, medicine, obstetrics, reproduction and reproductive disorders, and surgery), and in propaedeutics in non-clinical animals. In some preclinical subjects the number of practical hours is higher than theoretical hours.

## **FINAL REPORT AS ISSUED BY ECOVE ON 29 SEPTEMBER 2021**

The list of electives is wide and includes a lot of subjects, allowing the student to learn something more in different aspects of small animal and equine clinics. There are courses termed MOOC, which is an interesting initiative for students, postgraduates and practitioners.

The practical rotations under academic staff supervision (excluding EPT) during years 3 and 4 in small animal/exotic/equine are very complete, covering all basic disciplines the student has to practice before entering 5<sup>th</sup> year, so giving a sense of confidence and preparedness.

Y1 is devoted to first contact with animals and learning basic handling skills. In the 1<sup>st</sup> semester, each student has 1.5 hours of practical handling work on each of the main veterinary species (domestic carnivores, cattle, horses, and exotics) and 1.5 hours of practical work on cardiac auscultation. During the 2<sup>nd</sup> semester, each student has 6 hours of practical work to learn how to conduct a general clinical examination of different species and how to take a blood sample, and 5 hours of practical work in parasitology to learn how to search for and recognise skin parasites. During the 1<sup>st</sup> semester of Y2, each student spends 9.5 hours on practical work in parasitology, to learn how to look for and recognise parasites by coproscopy, necropsy, and blood sampling (virtual and live animals), and 1.5 hours on the basics of locomotor examination. At this point, students must also complete 6 hours in the simulation room to acquire or improve their basic handling techniques. The simulation room is also open to students who wish to put in additional practice beyond the compulsory 6 hours.

Summarizing, one could say that in the first two years, all practical exercises are specifically designed to facilitate the start of clinical rotations.

A "discovery" session is organised in the VTH at the end of the 1<sup>st</sup> semester of Y2. Students begin clinical rotations in the 2<sup>nd</sup> semester of the 3<sup>rd</sup> year (S10). Before this, numerous practical or clinical exercises are carried out to facilitate students' adjustment to clinical rotations. Each student spends three half-days in a rotation to learn how the VTH works and to prepare for his or her entry into the clinic in Y3; therefore, during this year students spend 17 weeks in clinics, one semester dedicated to courses and lectures and in the other spend every morning in clinical rotations.

Y4 is fully dedicated to clinical rotations. It is the last year of the core curriculum, and all students rotate among small animals, farm animals and equine clinics, for a total of 28 weeks (Table 3.1.6 of SER).

Y5 is the last year of the undergraduate course:

- If they enrol in a clinical track, students typically choose one area of focus (equines, livestock, or small animals), but other alternatives are also possible
- During the year, 14 weeks are dedicated to the preparation of the thesis and at least 14 weeks to clinical training.

Students in the small animal track may supplement their 14 weeks of clinical training in the VTH with external internships.

Students enrolled in the equine-exclusive track have 8 weeks of clinical training at the equine clinic of the VTH and 8 weeks in a private equine clinic, whereas students enrolled in a mixed equine track spend 4 weeks at the equine clinic of the VTH and 4 weeks in a private equine clinic.

In total, undergraduate students spend four semesters in clinical rotations for a total of 59 weeks. For each species, undergraduate students are managed under the direct supervision of residents, clinical practitioners, associate professors, and professors.

During their time in core clinical rotations and emergency services in Y3, Y4 and Y5, the target experiences of undergraduate students involve:

- In Y3, students learn technical and biosecurity procedures and nursing techniques (70% observation, 30% hands-on). No written reports are required, and students do not participate in emergency services.
- In Y4, students learn the diagnostic approach (50% observation, 50% hands-on). They are involved in report writing. They further apply the biosecurity practices they have studied.
- In Y5, students become autonomous (30% observation, 70% hands-on). They are in charge of preparing reports, which are then completed by interns and approved by senior clinicians.

The student/teacher ratio depends on the clinical rotation, from 4 (e.g. small animal surgery) to 8 (e.g. hospital).

#### **3.1.3.2. Comments**

- In France there is a period of preparation for and admittance to the veterinary curriculum (two years), which is not within the purview of the Establishment, but that prepares students to have the adequate profile for the undergraduate period. This is an excellent practice which not all European countries have.
- The core curriculum is good, at least the design for small animals/exotic and equine. The preparation of students starts from year 1, but mainly from year 2 and above, with non-clinical animal work and clinical animal work in preclinical subjects. The students have well organised rotations in years 3 and 4.
- The list of electives is wide with a variety of subjects, the course MOOC gives the Establishment an additional value.
- Year 5 is very good, such in the design as in the tack, the number of practical hours and the tutorial system. The proportion of 30 observation/70 hands-on for students to take decisions, learn the diagnostic approach and subsequent involvement in report writing, completes a well-designed curriculum.

#### **3.1.3.3. Suggestions for improvement**

None.

#### **3.1.3.4 Decision**

The Establishment is compliant with Substandard 3.1.3.

### **3.1.4. Clinical Sciences in food-producing animals (including Animal Production and Herd Health Management)**

#### **3.1.4.1. Findings**

In Y1 and Y2 students are prepared for the clinical rotations. All practical exercises are specifically designed to facilitate the start of clinical rotations. There is a constant association between lectures and active ‘hands-on’ learning. Clinical cases are used for practical work in, for example,

haematology (cytology) or toxicology (biochemistry). So, teaching units combine lectures and active learning.

In Y3 the clinical work starts with a total of three weeks in food-producing animals (from a total of 17 weeks clinical rotation), divided in two weeks hospital and one week reproduction.

During Y4, fully dedicated to clinical rotations, the responsibility increases indicated by the ratio observation/hands-on of 70%-30% in Y3 to 30%-70% in Y5.

Y5 is the last year of the undergraduate course. Students in the livestock-exclusive track have 18 weeks of external training, in which four weeks take place at the UCRA (Rural Clinic Unit of L'Arbresle) and are dedicated to Herd Health Management and the remaining fourteen weeks must be spread among at least three different clinics in order to increase the breadth of skills acquired. Students in the mixed-livestock track must complete 10 weeks in two different clinics. The role of the academic advisor is mainly restricted to the preparation of the internship (scope, specific objectives, finding placements) or to a reflective review at the end. Some teachers may phone the internship supervisor during the internship, but that is not usual.

There are four specific macro-competences (Advise and prevent, Establish a diagnosis, Care-treat, Act for veterinary public health) and four interdisciplinary macro-competences (Work in a company, Communicate, Act as a scientist, Act responsibly). Each macro-competence is broken down into several skills, which are themselves broken down into abilities. For each ability a level of performance is specified according to the following scale: “*has seen*”, “*has done*” and “*knows how to do*”. These performance levels are not applicable on a daily basis in the clinics, but only levels to be achieved at the end of Y4.

An assessment form for students in clinical rotations is available (Appendix 20).

#### **3.1.4.2. Comments**

- Students entering the clinic rotations are fully prepared for the clinical work. The increased responsibility starting Y3 up to and including Y5 guarantees the students the possibility to meet the Day One Competences.
- The Competency Matrix gives a clear overview of the progress of students regarding the eight competencies after Y4. Although this assessment tool is not currently used on a daily basis, the final version to be introduced in 2022 will allow daily feedback to students.
- During the mixed-livestock track, but also in the 18-weeks livestock track, students seem not to have any structural contact with the academic supervisor, who is especially involved during the preparation of the track and in the review assessment afterwards. An additional thought is whether underperforming students are sufficiently visible which could open the possibility to take action to improve the performances of those students.

#### **3.1.4.3. Suggestions for improvement**

None.

#### **3.1.4.4. Decision**

The Establishment is compliant with Substandard 3.1.4.

### **3.1.5. Food Safety and Quality**

#### **3.1.5.1. Findings**

The lessons concerning food quality and safety are mainly practical lessons given in years 3 and 4 of the Curriculum. They are issued both on the premises of the Establishment (15 days) and in

## **FINAL REPORT AS ISSUED BY ECOVE ON 29 SEPTEMBER 2021**

external premises including a ruminant slaughterhouse, a meat processing structure and a training centre for veterinary meat inspectors (10 days). Theoretical instruction is given in the form of theoretical courses (40 hours) and seminars (24 hours). The training is given by 4 teacher-researchers assisted, for INFOMA (pig and ruminant seized carcasses and offal) and the slaughterhouse, by a veterinary inspector appointed by the ministry for VetAgro Sup.

No visit to a pig or poultry slaughterhouse is scheduled for the Establishment's outdoor activities. They are replaced by virtual tours for pigs and poultry and examination of photographs of lesions for poultry.

In addition, 5 days of external internships must be devoted by each student to activities related to veterinary public health and food safety and quality. This allows each student to have a better idea of the reality on the ground in this discipline.

A set of tools are in place or are being developed to illustrate the dimensions that cannot be shown in the field (ASADIA software for the interpretation of post-mortem lesions at the slaughterhouse, virtual visits to slaughterhouses, etc.). A project of virtual slaughterhouse visits with non-compliance scenarios is being developed with other French and Belgian establishments.

Regarding the control of risks in the food chain, the basic concepts are given in year 3 and illustrated in year 4 through case studies prepared by the students and discussed with the teachers following the principles of the HACCP method.

In their fifth year, students may choose to take the ENSV's CEAV-SPV devoted to veterinary public health for 1,144 hours, divided into 404 hours of lectures and seminars and 740 hours of external internships in this discipline. Very few students take advantage of this opportunity, which is rather followed by older postgraduate veterinarians.

### **3.1.5.2. Comments**

- The combination of the ASADIA system, the inspection of carcasses and offal collected by INFOMA and the participation to the CIBEVIAL ruminant slaughtering activities in Corbas are giving an excellent view of the ante- and post-mortem inspection during the 5 weeks devoted to FSQ.

### **3.1.5.3. Suggestions for improvement**

- It is recommended to carry out the project to develop tools for virtual visits to slaughterhouses and food processing facilities which will be essential in the future to maintain quality training, especially, but not only, for the slaughter of pigs and poultry which cannot currently be visualized by the students of the Establishment.

### **3.1.5.4. Decision**

The Establishment is compliant with Substandard 3.1.5.

## **3.1.6. Professional Knowledge**

### **3.1.6.1. Findings**

Subjects associated with professional knowledge are built into curriculum hours (313 hours) described in the SER at 3.1.2. The subjects include, among other things, clinical practical training in common animal species, animal health economics, practice management, information literacy,

data management, ethics, legislation and communication. These subjects are covered by lectures (53 hours), seminars (114 hours), supervised self-learning (90 hours), desk and lab work (2 hours) and clinical practical (53 hours). The Establishment currently set up a working group from academia members and private practitioners. The goal of this group is updating the curriculum in professional knowledge training. They start this project in this recent academic year (2020/2021) and cooperating private practitioners provide lectures for students from different years of study (starting from first). The topics of their lectures are aimed at nonmedical aspects of veterinary profession, also called “soft skills”.

#### **3.1.6.2. Comments**

- Implementation of new lectures into the curriculum taught by private practitioners is one of the ways that the Establishment proves its willingness to provide up-to-date education in a very challenging time period.

#### **3.1.6.3. Suggestions for improvement**

None.

#### **3.1.6.4 Decision**

The Establishment is compliant with Substandard 3.1.6.

**3.2 Each study programme provided by the Establishment must be competency-based and designed so that it meets the objectives set for it, including the intended learning outcomes. The qualification resulting from a programme must be clearly specified and communicated and must refer to the correct level of the national qualifications framework for higher education and, consequently, to the Framework for Qualifications of the European Higher Education Area.**

**The Establishment must provide proof of a QA system that promotes and monitors the presence of an academic environment highly conducive to learning including self-learning. Details of the type, provision and updating of appropriate learning opportunities for the students must be clearly described, as well as the involvement of students.**

**The Establishment must also describe how it encourages and prepares students for self-learning and lifelong learning.**

#### **3.2.1. Findings**

The new framework implemented by the Establishment in September 2018 is competency-based and is in accordance with the Day One Competences. The achievement of learning goals is granted by the development of a competency matrix, designed by the Education Director with the contribution of all teachers.

Teachers, students and support staff are regularly discussing, at different levels (CEVE, Teacher’s Assembly, Students Affairs), the achievement of the intended learning outcomes. The Competency matrix and all syllabi are available for students on the pedagogical platform.

The adequacy and suitability of the premises are regularly assessed, and upgrades or adaptations of these premises are under the direct responsibility of the Education Director of the Establishment. Self-learning and lifelong learning are promoted mainly through the availability of digital resources and the personalisation of students’ courses. Students are also encouraged to take courses outside the Establishment in order to be prepared after the completion of their degree to be trained from a

variety of different sources. To promote self-learning and the development of practical skills, the Establishment has developed a skills lab that have been designed to increase its accessibility outside of the standard hours of instruction.

Under the supervision of a teacher, students are also able to organise optional conferences on many subjects. The experience of organising and/or participating in these conferences also prepares students for lifelong learning by placing the responsibility squarely in their own hands. The QMS of the Establishment includes surveys and evaluation of individual modules of veterinary training, the curriculum of each semester, skill acquisition, clinical rotation and EPT evaluation.

### **3.2.2. Comments**

- The competency-based programme is designed to meet all the intended learning outcomes of each teaching unit and it is efficiently monitored by the QMS of the Establishment.

### **3.2.3. Suggestions for improvement**

None.

### **3.2.4. Decision**

The Establishment is compliant with Substandard 3.2.

## **3.3 Programme learning outcomes must:**

- **ensure the effective alignment of all content, teaching, learning and assessment activities of the degree programme to form a cohesive framework**
- **include a description of Day One Competences**
- **form the basis for explicit statements of the objectives and learning outcomes of individual units of study**
- **be communicated to staff and students**
- **be regularly reviewed, managed and updated to ensure they remain relevant, adequate and are effectively achieved.**

### **3.3.1 Findings**

Intended learning outcomes of the year are communicated by the Dean, the Dean of the Veterinary Campus, the Education Director and the Director of the Department of Education and Student Life (Student Affairs) (DEVE) to each class at the beginning of every year. Learning objectives are also the content of the syllabuses of each course and are discussed by the lead teacher at the beginning of the teaching unit.

At the beginning of the semesters, syllabuses and learning objectives are discussed by all teachers involved in the teaching unit and updates are made as necessary. A formalised process of teaching evaluation also ensures the coherence of teaching, learning, and assessment activities and identifies teaching units that require improvement (see 3.4).

Learning outcomes are regularly discussed between teachers and students and the Student Affairs. The coherence between the learning outcomes and the needs of the veterinary profession are monitored by a Professional Assessment Board and guaranteed by feedbacks and inputs from the alumni.

The Establishment follows the national competency framework that was modelled directly on the EAEVE reference system (Day One Competences).

### **3.3.2. Comments**

- The programme learning outcomes are adequately designed, aligned and communicated to staff and students. They are also adequately managed and regularly reviewed.

### **3.3.3. Suggestions for improvement**

None.

### **3.3.4. Decision**

The Establishment is compliant with Substandard 3.3.

**3.4 The Establishment must have a formally constituted committee structure (which includes effective student representation), with clear and empowered reporting lines, to oversee and manage the curriculum and its delivery. The committee(s) must:**

- **determine the pedagogical basis, design, delivery methods and assessment methods of the curriculum**
- **oversee QA of the curriculum, particularly gathering, evaluating, making change and responding to feedback from stakeholders, peer reviewers and external assessors, and data from examination/assessment outcomes**
- **perform on going and periodic review of the curriculum at least every seven years by involving staff, students and stakeholders; these reviews must lead to continuous improvement. Any action taken or planned as a result of such a review must be communicated to all those concerned**
- **identify and meet training needs for all types of staff, maintaining and enhancing their competence for the ongoing curriculum development.**

### **3.4.1. Findings**

The Teachers' Assembly is responsible for the organisation of the core curriculum. The Council for Teaching and Student Life (CEVE) and the Joint Teaching Assessment Board (JTAB) are in charge in determining when improvements to the curriculum are necessary. The management and the monitoring the curriculum content and its delivery is operated by a typical and complete PDCA quality assurance process. The latter is clearly described in the SER.

The progression through the semester, the workload, the quality of the campus facilities and the level of satisfaction of teaching related to all teaching units and clinical rotations are regularly evaluated by the students. Furthermore, the Establishment sends an annual questionnaire to students at the end of Y4 and Y5, then three years after graduation, in order to monitor the skills outlined in the national competency framework. The results of students and alumni evaluation are discussed by both the JTAB and the CEVE and necessary improvements are reported into an "Improvement Action Form" by the Quality Department. Regular feedbacks on the results of occupational surveys are provided to the Establishment by the MAA.

On a regular base, the Establishment organizes discussions with local representatives of the veterinary profession or, together with the other French Veterinary Establishment, meets the MAA and national representatives of the profession to obtain feedback regarding their needs.

### **3.4.2. Comments**

- Teacher's Assembly, CEVE and JTAB activity guarantee the adequate management and periodic review of the curriculum. Stakeholders and students are actively involved in all related processes.
- Although all newly appointed academic staff have to undergo a mandatory pedagogical training, such training is not mandatory for the more junior staff involved in similar clinical training.

### **3.4.3. Suggestions for improvement**

- It is suggested that all staff, senior and junior, should receive mandatory pedagogical training. The Visitation Team understands that this will be implemented later in 2021.

### **3.4.4. Decision**

The Establishment is compliant with Substandard 3.4.

**3.5 External Practical Training (EPT) is compulsory training activities organised outside the Establishment, the student being under the direct supervision of a non-academic person (e.g. a practitioner). EPT cannot replace the core intramural training nor the extramural training under the close supervision of academic staff (e.g. ambulatory clinics, herd health management, practical training in FSQ and VPH).**

**Since the veterinary degree is a professional qualification with Day One Competences, EPT must complement and strengthen the academic education inter alia by enhancing student's professional knowledge.**

#### **3.5.1. Findings**

EPT is compulsory, with 20 weeks a requirement for all students, spread over four years Y1-Y4; 4 weeks per year in the first three years and 8 weeks in Y4. There is also now a requirement of a two-week EPT abroad. This new rule in curriculum was created in 2017 according to an audit of the EPT training, which reveals that during the audit period, about 42% of veterinary students had completed a placement abroad of at least one month during their studies. Students can apply for funds to financially support this training. There are several funds available for these purposes.

EPT is an integral part of the curriculum enhancing student's professional knowledge around the diversity of activities in practice, the husbandry of food and leisure animals in conjunction with veterinary public health requirements.

Objectives for each EPT are discussed between the academic advisor and the student prior to placement. Each student has the same advisor for the first four years, which improves consistency and follow-up among placements.

In Y5 students choose EPTs to suit their chosen career paths. A student can also choose a tutored EPT, set up with Ministerial financial support. This allows students alternative periods in a clinic with training in the Establishment. Host veterinary clinics apply and are approved by the French Veterinary Council.

#### **Addendum regarding COVID-19**

According to the restrictions due to the pandemic situation, the Establishment has taken the decision to suspend EPT from March 16<sup>th</sup> 2020 to May 11<sup>th</sup> 2020. After May 11<sup>th</sup> 2020, all the outsourced internships were resumed, where possible. In the recent academic year (2020/2021)

most of the EPTs could take place (they remained authorised). Difficulties were encountered for the "veterinary public health" EPTs because the supervisors were mostly teleworking and for the "monogastric" EPTs. During the recent academic year (2020/2021) most of (if not all) scheduled EPTs will be fulfilled without postpones or delays.

### **3.5.2. Comments**

- The EPT has a wide range of varieties, especially the parts chosen by students. The involvement of clinical supervisors/tutors is very intense in terms of directing the student, helping him/her to choose the proper place to perform the EPT training, even in mandatory EPT training abroad.
- The long list of Board-certified clinicians with wide contacts abroad help in these decisions.

### **3.5.3. Suggestions for improvement**

None.

### **3.5.4. Decision**

The Establishment is compliant with Substandard 3.5.

**3.6 The EPT providers must have an agreement with the Establishment and the student (in order to state their respective rights and duties, including insurance matters), provide a standardised evaluation of the performance of the student during their EPT and be allowed to provide feedback to the Establishment on the EPT programme. There must be a member of the academic staff responsible for the overall supervision of the EPT, including liaison with EPT providers.**

### **3.6.1. Findings**

For each EPT an agreement with the Dean, the student and the practice involved is mandatory. The agreement specifies the rules and responsibilities of each party. Students are covered by VetAgro Sup's insurance while on an external EPT (Appendix 19).

For each EPT an assessment sheet (Appendix 18) and a follow-up notebook needs completion by the student, the academic advisor and the EPT supervisor for the evaluation of the EPT. There is a working group consisting of the Education Director, the Head of DEVE and another academic, which evaluate and suggest improvements and tools for monitoring the courses. Any changes proposed are discussed with students in the CEVE.

### **3.6.2. Comments**

- The organisation of EPT training is a very important task for the Establishment, either for teachers or for students as well. The follow-up notebook ("Livret de suivi de stages") follows the student's path through all EPTs from first to fifth year. It helps the student and his/her supervisor/tutor to direct the proper direction in their professional life even if a minority have yet to decide, even in fifth year.
- It is obvious, that the academia members are playing an essential role in the decision-making process for EPT providers, especially the ones chosen by student.

### **3.6.3. Suggestions for improvement**

None.

#### **3.6.4. Decision**

The Establishment is compliant with Substandard 3.6.

**3.7 Students must take responsibility for their own learning during EPT. This includes preparing properly before each placement, keeping a proper record of their experience during EPT by using a logbook provided by the Establishment and evaluating the EPT. Students must be allowed to complain officially and/or anonymously about issues occurring during EPT. The Establishment must have a system of QA to monitor the implementation, progress and then feedback within the EPT activities.**

#### **3.7.1. Findings**

Students are responsible for choosing their EPT location and for refining specific objectives with their advisor at the beginning of the EPT. Logbooks allow monitoring and reflection by the student, the academic advisor and successive EPT supervisors. While there is not an official list of EPT providers, traditionally the academic mentors provide sufficient information to students about possibilities of EPT locations for each year of study as well as catering for individual students interest/needs. Recently, the Establishment is cooperating with Le SNVEL (Le Syndicat National des Vétérinaires d'Exercice Libéral, National Syndicate of Veterinary Practitioners ) on the project 'StageVet' (<https://www.stagevet.fr/>), which will allow to search for EPT provider on nation-wide basis. Currently the project is under GDPR adjustments.

#### **3.7.2. Comments**

- Although academic members encourage students to show activity in choosing their EPT provider, they closely supervise the process and advise if the decisions made by students may not be beneficial; this also applies when the students are choosing their EPTs abroad.
- Due to legal reasons, the Establishment cannot provide a list of providers with assessments, but students have their own databases of providers with reviews from older students from previous years.
- The Establishment is preparing the project StageVet, which will cover such needs.

#### **3.7.3. Suggestions for improvement**

None.

#### **3.7.4. Decision**

The Establishment is compliant with Substandard 3.7.

**4.1 All aspects of the physical facilities must provide an environment conducive to learning, including internet access. The veterinary Establishment must have a clear strategy and programme for maintaining and upgrading its buildings and equipment. Facilities must comply with all relevant legislation including health, safety, biosecurity, accessibility to people with reduced mobility, and EU animal welfare and care standards.**

#### **4.1.1. Findings**

The veterinary campus of VetAgro Sup is spread over two locations:

- The main campus located 14 km west of Lyon in Marcy L'Etoile. It is easily accessible by public transport.

## **FINAL REPORT AS ISSUED BY ECOVE ON 29 SEPTEMBER 2021**

- The second campus, which among French veterinary establishments is unique to VetAgro Sup, is an extramural extension of the large animal clinic named the '*Unité Clinique Rurale de l'Arbresle*' (UCRA). It is located in the countryside, 14 km from the main campus (approximately 30 km from Lyon).

Hands-on food inspection is carried out at the CIBEVIAL slaughterhouse in Corbas, 30 minutes away from the Establishment; this facility has all required official certifications. Students also receive practical training in FQS at INFOMA (National Training Centre for MAA Officials), also in Corbas.

Extramural studies (ambulatory) also take place in a rural practice in St Symphorien sur Coise (35 km away from the Establishment), and in pig and poultry facilities (visits) in Bourg-en-Bresse (90 km away) and Charlieu (120 km away).

A total of 21 buildings make up the main campus, all within walking distance of each other.

Internet access is provided all over campus by free Wi-Fi or private access. Intranet is available for campus employees. The Learning Management System, a Moodle platform (VetAgroTice; <https://vetagrotice.vetagro-sup.fr/>), is available at home for students and teaching staff. The Hospital Information System (Clovis) can only be accessed from on campus for security reasons (GDPR rules).

The safety of the Establishment is ensured by means of closed-circuit television installed at the main entrance of the VTH and all buildings. Access is controlled by individual badges that staff and students use to enter the various buildings. Security officers keep watch 24/7.

Of the 42,000 m<sup>2</sup> of buildings, the total area dedicated to core curriculum is 7,695 m<sup>2</sup> and the total area dedicated to research is 5,035 m<sup>2</sup>.

Students are involved in research activities in the framework of student research training (see SER, 10.2. Student research training), in particular during experimental veterinary thesis, personal projects or co-accredited master internships for instance.

Results from a benchmark analysis of the different analysis laboratories from the Establishment (CMI survey) shows that the repartition of the different activities of these laboratories (research, teaching, service) is quite variable from one laboratory to the other, with a mean of 39% for research, 24% for teaching, and 37% for services.

The QA department conducts internal audits according to a precise schedule and makes sure that the Establishment complies with EU and national legal regulations.

### **4.1.2. Comments**

- According to the general figures, the environment to learning is fine, the internet access is good, including intranet.
- The learning Management System, available at home for students and teaching staff is an excellent tool.
- The hospital information system is up to date.
- The QA department and several committees ensure every aspect complies with EU and national regulations.

- Work has been done to improve the access for people with reduced mobility.

#### **4.1.3. Suggestions for improvement**

None.

#### **4.1.4. Decision**

The Establishment is compliant with Substandard 4.1.

**4.2 Lecture theatres, teaching laboratories, tutorial rooms, clinical facilities and other teaching spaces must be adequate in number, size and equipped for the instructional purposes and must be well maintained. The facilities must be adapted for the number of students enrolled. Students must have ready access to adequate and sufficient study, self-learning, recreation, locker, sanitary and food service facilities.**

**Offices, teaching preparation and research laboratories must be sufficient for the needs of the academic and support staff.**

#### **4.2.1. Findings**

##### **Teaching facilities include:**

- 6 lecture theatres (from 50 to 450 seats), for a total capacity of 1,250, which can simultaneously accommodate all students enrolled in the initial training;
- 14 classrooms (from 10 to 50 seats), for a total capacity of 440 seats;
- 7 teaching laboratories (tutorials and practicals), with a capacity of 15 to 50 students (total capacity of 225 seats);
- 8 meeting rooms (12 to 25 seats), for a total capacity of 146.

All these rooms are fully equipped with video projectors, and a blackboard or electronic board; most have hard-wired internet access. Students with disabilities have access to all these facilities. One 125-seat amphitheatre is currently not usable for safety reasons.

The StarLeaf video conference system can be used to share lectures given in one amphitheatre to any other on campus. In the main amphitheatre, the system can be used to connect with distant sites such as another French veterinary establishment or another university.

A summary description of the research units can be found on the institution's website (<http://www.vetagro-sup.fr/recherche-expertise/les-unites-de-recherche/>) in French.

#### **Regarding the measures due to COVID-19:**

The measures put in place result from the ministerial instructions communicated by the General Directorate for Education and Research (DGER) and from the reflections of the internal crisis unit of the Establishment. They were communicated and discussed in all the bodies concerned (Management Board, CEVE, CHSCT).

They consist in particular of the following recommendations:

- wearing a mask is compulsory (surgical mask or category 1 mask tested in approved laboratories) everywhere and in all circumstances, except when eating alone or at a distance of more than 2 meters with less than 6 per room;
- room capacity limited to 50% of capacity (1 seat out of 2) except at CHUV. During the first lockdown, the limit was capped at 4m<sup>2</sup> per person;

## **FINAL REPORT AS ISSUED BY ECOVE ON 29 SEPTEMBER 2021**

- increase the frequency of cleaning of common areas (all surfaces, at least once a day at the end of the day and twice a day for sanitary facilities) and make disinfectants and hydroalcoholic gel available in all rooms;
- for rooms with special equipment (e.g. microscopes, computers, etc.), provision of disinfectant wipes;
- establishment of a circulation direction to limit crossings as much as possible and prohibition to stay in groups;
- posters and videos in all common areas reminding about the instructions;
- transmission of a booklet explaining in a practical way the nature and interest of the measures adopted.

### **Lecturing & group work**

The Establishment has multiple meeting rooms or classrooms that can be reserved for teaching activities depending on the size of the group.

### **Practical work**

Pre-clinical training takes place in dedicated facilities, which are equipped with microscopes, histological and parasitological samples, bones and dry anatomical parts, and specific microbiological equipment. Safety devices are available in all of these labs as per French regulations.

### **Skill labs**

VetSkill is a 169-m<sup>2</sup> skill lab that hosts a growing number of workshops with which students can be trained without the use of animals.

### **Study and self-learning**

The library is located on the ground floor and can be easily accessed by people with disabilities. Its surface area is 700 m<sup>2</sup>, with almost 100 seats and 7 computer stations, in case users encounter a problem with their own laptops.

A 12-m<sup>2</sup> soundproofed, semi-glazed collaborative work room was created within the library space. This room can accommodate 8 users and is equipped with a dedicated Wi-Fi band and 12 electrical outlets, as well as a whiteboard and an interactive screen.

### **Catering, canteens, accommodation**

The student residence and the university dining hall are managed by the Regional Centre for School and University Life (CROUS). The residence comprises 325 single rooms, ranging from 18 to 21 m<sup>2</sup>, with toilets, kitchen, and refrigerator, and a broadband network connection. The university dining hall (1200 m<sup>2</sup>, 198 seats, 400 meals/day) is open for lunch during the week and is accessible to the Establishment's employees.

A student-run cafeteria (161 m<sup>2</sup>) is also available in the main building, right next to the VTH. Another room (33 m<sup>2</sup>) located near the main entrance hall is available for anyone who wishes to warm up a takeaway dish in the microwave or to have a coffee around several standing tables.

### **Locker rooms**

Lockers (400) are available for Y3, Y4, and Y5 students. They are located on different floors according to the class year. Changing rooms and lavatories are available near the lockers (2 × 3 m<sup>2</sup>), as well as at the entrances to sensitive areas (surgery, 16 m<sup>2</sup>; necropsy, 43 m<sup>2</sup>; dissection, 26 m<sup>2</sup>; and isolation, 42 m<sup>2</sup>).

### **Accommodation for on-call students**

Close to the Emergency and Intensive Care Unit (for companion animals) (SIAMU), there is a resting room (14 m<sup>2</sup>) that has been recently renovated with two sofas, a table (6-8 seats), and a kitchenette. Three toilets are directly accessible (one at the entrance and two from the waiting room). At the Emergency and Intensive Care Centre (for equine species) (CUSI), students have access to the students' lounge (26 m<sup>2</sup>) and a small kitchen (14 m<sup>2</sup>). The sanitary facilities are on the same level of the building.

Students who monitor hospitalised cases (small animals and exotic animals) have access to the hospital meeting room (35 m<sup>2</sup>) but do not stay overnight. If an animal needs continuous surveillance, it is transferred to the SIAMU.

Interns (for small animals) have access to a call room (83 m<sup>2</sup>, kitchenette, shower, restroom, four beds). At the CUSI, interns have access to a separate lounge (36 m<sup>2</sup>) and a call room (17 m<sup>2</sup>) equipped with a bed, a shower, and sanitary facilities.

Residents are not on duty on site. They are called in case of emergencies, whether for small animals or horses. However, they are able to access their personal offices at any time, day or night.

### **Leisure**

Students have their own facilities on campus for cultural and leisure activities, a student-run cafeteria (approx. 170 m<sup>2</sup>, located in the main building, open on weekdays), the office of the student union ('*Cercle Bourgelat*', approx. 50 m<sup>2</sup>), the office of the 'Junior Enterprise' (13 m<sup>2</sup>), a student-run store area (approx. 45 m<sup>2</sup>), and a kennel for their dogs (102 users in Sept. 2019). Students have access to common services, including the library and internet.

### **Sanitary (toilets, washing and shower facilities, etc.)**

Sanitary facilities are located throughout the Establishment. Their number and locations (89 sites, 773 m<sup>2</sup>) comply with EU and national regulations on establishments of higher education that are open to the public.

### **Staff offices and research laboratories**

Staff offices are fairly standard, with a desk, chairs, and shelves for storage, internet connection, intranet access, and basic IT equipment. They total 4,970 m<sup>2</sup> for 256 rooms.

Research laboratories (2,300 m<sup>2</sup>, 117 rooms) are equipped according to their needs and activities; most are located within the teaching units. The notable exception is the Victor Galtier Building which is completely separate from the other facilities and houses teaching laboratories for bacteriology and virology, an analytical laboratory, specialised diagnostic rooms, the *E. coli* research laboratory (National Reference Laboratory including a level-2 and a level-3 unit), and another level-3 research unit.

#### **4.2.2. Comments**

- Lecture theatres, teaching laboratories, tutorial rooms, clinical facilities and other teaching spaces are adequate in number, size and equipped for the instructional purposes. The facilities are adapted for the number of students enrolled.
- Students have access to adequate and sufficient study, self-learning, recreation, locker, sanitary and food service facilities.
- Offices, teaching preparation and research laboratories, according to the number and area quoted in the text, should be sufficient for the needs of the academic and support staff.

#### **4.2.3. Suggestions for improvement**

None.

#### **4.2.4. Decision**

The Establishment is compliant with Substandard 4.2.

### **4.3 The livestock facilities, animal housing, core clinical teaching facilities and equipment used by the Establishment for teaching purposes must:**

- **be sufficient in capacity and adapted for the number of students enrolled in order to allow safe hands-on training for all students**
- **be of a high standard, well maintained and fit for the purpose**
- **promote best husbandry, welfare and management practices**
- **ensure relevant biosecurity and bio-containment**
- **be designed to enhance learning.**

#### **4.3.1. Findings**

##### **Healthy animals and research animals**

The number of animals housed in the different facilities of the Establishment varies based on the teaching activities currently taking place and the period of the year. Pastures and paddocks are readily available for horses and livestock animals are sufficient for teaching.

All animals used for teaching activities are the property of the Establishment; the livestock herd is registered with the relevant national authorities.

Facilities for research animals are adequately equipped to meet the needs of various research projects and the different species involved and meet the European and French regulations. The main laboratory is accredited by the Association for Assessment and Accreditation of Laboratory Animal Care International (AAALAC) for animal welfare and the safety of employees; Biovivo-ICLB was the first public structure in France to benefit from this accreditation.

##### **Hospitalised animals**

The VTH is able to admit most species (dogs, cats, exotics, horses, cattle, sheep, goats, pigs, poultry).

##### ***Small animals***

Hospitalisation facilities for companion animals include:

- Two treatment rooms ( $2 \times 19 \text{ m}^2$ ) and three hospitalisation rooms in medicine ( $3 \times 11 \text{ m}^2$ ) as well as two treatment rooms ( $2 \times 19 \text{ m}^2$ ) and four hospitalisation rooms in surgery ( $4 \times 11 \text{ m}^2$ ), for a total of 45 dog cages and 25 cat cages, supplemented by 2 exotic animal cages.
- One room in the immediate vicinity, separate and with restricted access, for the hospitalisation of contagious animals ( $21 \text{ m}^2$ , 5 cages).

All rooms are equipped with examination supplies and basic treatment equipment.

##### ***Equine***

Twenty-six stalls are available for the hospitalisation of horses (9-12  $\text{m}^2$ /stall).

High-level hospitalisation can be done at the intensive care unit (CUSI, 190 m<sup>2</sup>), which is equipped with advanced facilities (6 stalls, 2 of which are combined with a small box stall for new-born foals and a padded box stall for horses with neurological disorders) and connected monitoring tools.

***Livestock animals (SHAR)***

Bovines can be hospitalised in 12 stalls (12.5 m<sup>2</sup>/stall). An examination room equipped with handling equipment is adjacent to the stalls and is used for training. Small ruminants have their own hospital (105 m<sup>2</sup>, 14 stalls), separated from cattle by a service road. Poultry are hospitalised in a dedicated area of the same building as small ruminants.

An isolation building with strict operating procedures is reserved for the quarantine of large animals suspected of being contagious.

**Clinical activities**

The VTH is contained within the main building and is directly connected with the teaching area and the offices and laboratories of the academics as well as head offices, and includes:

- The clinic for small animals, with an emergency and intensive care unit (SIAMU) and a preventive medicine unit;
- The equine clinic (Clinéquine), with an emergency and intensive care unit (CUSI); it is supplemented by the outdoor facilities, and by a separate building hosting both the LERC (Lyon Equine Research Centre) and the Equine Reproduction Centre;
- The cattle clinic (SHAR) is part of the VTH, but in a separate area of approximately 800 m<sup>2</sup>. An amphitheatre of approximately 100 seats is equipped for demonstrations and tutorials using large species.

***Livestock animals***

The livestock facilities were partly renovated in 2019 and include:

- a training area, equipped with a cattle crush and restraining cages for foot trimming;
- a teaching room connected to the cattle hospital, with material and equipment for handling cows in a safe manner;
- a pharmacy and a first line laboratory;
- a cattle barn that houses the cows used for practical training;
- an outdoor meadow area equipped with a hoist for recumbent cows;
- pastures;
- a dedicated surgery room equipped with a swivel table for operating on standing or lying cattle and the equipment to perform volatile anaesthesia and endoscopy
- a small ruminant barn that is in a separate building.

This hospital is supplemented by a satellite site (UCRA) that operates as a private rural clinic. VetAgro Sup is able to provide its rural clientele with highly trained hospital practitioners. To travel between sites, veterinarians and students have at their disposal three vehicles with integrated storage for equipment and medicines.

***Equine (Clinéquine)***

Equine facilities are adapted for both housing and handling horses. The examination room is wide enough to allow safe handling of a horse with students present, and is provided with equipment for examination (endoscopy, rectal palpation, etc.). The clinical amphitheatre for large animals (equine and cattle) is used as an equine ultrasound room.

Two surgery rooms are operational, each with an adapted stall for anaesthesia and recovery and a dedicated space for surgical preparation. One room is reserved for surgery with a higher risk of

contamination (abdominal, wounds, and respiratory tract) and the other one for bone and joint surgery. An educational gallery is located between the two rooms and allows students to view surgeries without entering the surgical room.

The clinic is supplemented with two stalls for horses waiting to be admitted for consultation, eight paddocks with shelters, and one large car park for horse trailers and vehicles.

CUSI, the emergency and intensive care unit for horses, has its own facilities connected to the Clinéquine. It comprises six stalls, two of which are combined with a small box stall for the newborn foals and one padded box stall for horses with neurological disorders, one consultation space, one monitoring room, and dedicated equipment storage areas. All hospitalised animals are kept under video surveillance.

The breeding centre includes one breeding shed, one laboratory for semen and embryo observation, one palpation and ultrasound room (three mares), and three box stalls for stallions. Depending on the season, the 14 mare stalls, located right next to the breeding centre, are used for either research or breeding activities.

### ***Small animals (CHUVAC)***

The consultation area consists of eight consultation rooms, three sampling or examination rooms, and four pre-consultation areas. The central pharmacy is located at the entrance of the clinic (see below).

Consultation rooms are allocated to various specialties, with dedicated equipment for each. In each room, there is space for 10 students to safely observe the teacher, the student in charge of the case, the animal, and the owner.

The surgical area is not accessible to the public and includes six operating rooms, one room dedicated to endoscopy and dentistry, one room for various electrophysiology exams (e.g. electromyogram, electrocardiogram, tests of auditory evoked potential), one preparation room for dogs, and one preparation room for cats.

All consultation rooms are connected to the Hospital Information System (Clovis) for patient follow-up/diagnostic services.

### **Effect of COVID-19 affected work both at the VTH at the VetAgro Sup campus, teaching at the Corbas slaughterhouse, and extramural studies at the different facilities**

During the COVID-19 pandemic, the Establishment endeavoured to ensure the continuity of the clinical training within the VTH, which was successfully achieved by taking account of the health context affecting clients.

The teaching exercises in CORBAS were interrupted by lockdowns corresponding to the beginning of the second semester for the students. They have been replaced by distance learning, using existing slide supports, either in using pictures and the AsaDia software programme (<https://association.asa-spv.fr/asadia>) used in the slaughterhouse, either using videos with from the teaching department to illustrate the slaughter and dressing chain and those from the DGAL produced in association with other structures for the problem of animal mistreatment during the killing process. These materials were made available to the students and used, discussed and commented on by teams. AsaDia was also already in use before the COVID-19 crisis, as the DGAL videos had not yet been used since they were only made available in 2020.

As for the extra-mural activities in the outpatient clinic (UCRA and farm visits), a total interruption was observed during the first lockdown (i.e. 6 weeks from March 15). During the two other lockdowns, the impact was more moderate or insignificant (but with sanitary precautions).

Teaching at UCRA, avian/porcine visits, weekly ambulant clinics took place but within the respect of the barrier gestures and sanitary recommendations given by the Establishment (disinfection of the minibus after each use, permanent and systematic wearing of the mask, distancing, etc.).

The veterinary practitioners who received teaching staff and students for avian/porcine and ambulant visits respected the barrier gestures and the distancing rules.

The activity was maintained (according to the derogation from the Ministry of Agriculture) and certificates of circulation were delivered to students when necessary.

More specifically for the UCRA, the practitioners have always continued the visits and secretarial work in telework. When the students were all absent (first lockdown), the practitioners continued to do their visits while respecting the barrier gestures, then they applied the instructions given by the Establishment (disinfection kit for vehicles between 2 people, max 2 to 3 students per car with mask for everyone and application of all other barrier gestures). In the farms, wearing of masks and distancing rules were systematically applied.

## **Diagnostic Services**

### ***Diagnostic laboratories***

There is a central laboratory in the main building. Samples are taken to a dedicated room in the VTH either for immediate analysis or to be sent to specialised laboratories located in the main building (Biochemistry, Cytology, Toxicology, Parasitology). Bacteriological samples are sent either to the LAV on campus or to external laboratories. Histological samples are analysed in the Anatomopathological unit.

SHAR AND SIAMU have their own first-line lab facilities; the second one can also be used by the equine team for night emergencies.

### ***Imaging department***

The small animal area is composed of one radiology room equipped with flat panel detectors.

The equine area shares the same technical rooms and additionally has one radiology room equipped with plane sensor, one reading room, and one standing horse MRI room (0.27 Tesla).

Clinicians also have access to a pet MRI (1.5 Tesla - operated since 11/2020 by HawkCell company), and a small animal CT-scanner located on the veterinary campus.

### ***Necropsy room***

A specific building is dedicated to necropsies. It consists of a large necropsy room, designed to facilitate the transportation of bodies, and equipped with a hoist for handling large animal carcasses. This hoist is also connected to two cold rooms for the conservation of all corpses and carcasses. This facility is equipped to perform euthanasia and necropsies on all species and to store cadavers under proper conditions in the cold rooms.

Prior to attending a necropsy, students and staff must change into appropriate protective attire in a dedicated locker room. Boots and overcoats, which never leave the building, are provided to both students and teachers; overcoats are washed on site at an appropriate temperature before being used for the next student group.

Cadavers and all necropsy waste are collected and treated by an approved company according to current regulations. A dedicated computer is available to record necropsy reports and minimise the amount of paper used.

### **Other facilities**

In addition to consultations in small animal reproductive pathology and reproductive surgery, students are also trained in the *CERREC* (*Centre d'Etude et de Recherche en Reproduction et Elevage des Carnivores*).

The **Central Pharmacy** oversees the medications for all clinics. In order to increase security regarding the storage and use of medicines in the equine and small animal hospitals and SIAMU, these premises will soon be equipped with locked medicine cabinets.

### **Equipment used for clinical services**

One can find in the SER the list of the equipment used in surgery and examination rooms, and anaesthesia equipment. The small animal emergency and intensive care are fully equipped, even with imaging advanced equipment. In the surgical equine area there are an arthroscopy column and an image intensifier (scope); a “lameness locator”, helping to refine the diagnosis of lameness; an on-board endoscope, which makes it possible to carry out endoscopies of horses with a rider or a horse-drawn carriage. The equine clinic shares the emergency laboratory with the SIAMU on a 24/7 basis.

### **Premises used for the practical teaching of FSQ & VPH**

Facilities used for the practical instruction of FSQ and VPH are detailed in Substandard 3.1. The current state of legislation makes it very difficult for food processing units or food business operators to host students for training. This is the reason why students receive only theoretical training and off-campus instruction is limited to one slaughterhouse. To make up for this deficit, many tutorials and practical sessions are organised on campus.

#### **4.3.2. Comments**

- The livestock facilities, animal housing, core clinical teaching facilities and equipment used by the Establishment for teaching purposes are good.
- All clinical aspects for Small Animals, Equine and Livestock animals, such as facilities, equipment, diagnostic services, necropsy room etc., are good enough to ensure a qualified teaching. Pet MRI is operated by a private company housed on campus. This latter use of combined private/public funds is an interesting way to control expenses.
- The biosecurity is well developed and upheld.
- The pharmacy is an excellent example of a facility providing top quality work for clinical activities and drug security.
- The Preventive Medicine unit within the small animal clinic provides an excellent opportunity for undergraduate students to learn how to undertake physical examination, acquiring self-confidence in communication with the clients, vaccination techniques etc.

#### **4.3.3. Suggestions for improvement**

None.

#### **4.3.4. Decision**

The Establishment is compliant with Substandard 4.3.

**4.4 Core clinical teaching facilities must be provided in a veterinary teaching hospital (VTH) with 24/7 emergency services at least for companion animals and equines. Within the VTH, the Establishment must unequivocally demonstrate that standard of education and clinical research are compliant with all ESEVT Standards, e.g. research-based and evidence-based clinical training supervised by academic staff trained to teach and to assess, availability for staff and students of facilities and patients for performing clinical research and relevant QA procedures.**

**For ruminants, on-call service must be available if emergency services do not exist for those species in a VTH.**

**The Establishment must ensure state-of-the-art standards of teaching clinics which remain comparable with or exceeding the best available in the private sector.**

**The VTH and any hospitals, practices and facilities (including EPT) which are involved with the curriculum must meet the relevant national Practice Standards.**

#### **4.4.1. Findings**

The VTH is open Monday to Friday from 8:00 am to 6:00 pm; however, depending on the service in question, the operating hours may be extended. Consultations for companion animals take place from the first week of September to the 18<sup>th</sup> of July, with one period of closure for a week at the end of December. SIAMU is open 24 hours a day, 7 days a week, except between the last week of July and the first week of September. CERREC is open 7 days a week, except between Christmas and New Year. Clinéquine, CUSI and UCRA are open year-round 24 hours a day, 7 days a week. SHAR is closed between the last week of July and the second week of September.

Clinical rotations in the animal species clinics are done in blocks so that students can follow patients from admission to discharge. Hands-on training is conducted in small groups (less than four students/supervisor). Within the VTH, students benefit from supervision by 83 academics and temporary hospital practitioners, 39 of whom are graduates of one or more European or American universities. The clinicians continuously train 19 residents.

#### ***Small animals***

Consultations are supervised by 33 academics and temporary hospital practitioners, 23 of whom are holders of a specialist diploma (European and/or American college). The services offered include surgery (soft tissues and orthopaedics), reproduction, internal medicine, endoscopy, dermatology, ophthalmology, anaesthesiology, emergency and intensive care, imaging, cardiology, oncology, neurology and behavioural pathology, endocrinology, and haematology.

SIAMU is open 24 hours a day, 7 days a week, but is closed every year in August for intensive cleaning. Three groups of students (Y4 and Y5) and one group of interns perform rotations there. Supervision is provided by two specialists, both graduates of the European College of Emergency and Intensive Care, complemented by a hospital practitioner.

#### ***Equine***

The equine clinic operates 24 hours a day, 7 days a week, all year round. The students are trained by 10 academics and temporary hospital practitioners, all of them being holders of an equine specialist diploma. There are always five residents in training: two in surgery, two in medicine, and one in reproduction.

***Livestock animals***

Hospitalisations and consultations are supervised by 6 academics and temporary hospital practitioners, one of whom is holder of a specialist diploma (European college-ECBHM). The services offered include: surgery, internal medicine, imaging, necropsy, etc. A satellite livestock health department is managed by UCRA, where five hospital practitioners rotate in order to provide 24/7 service. UCRA operates as a private rural clinic. Prior to its acquisition by the Establishment in 2000, it was a private practice; it now serves to expose students to the real-life experiences of a rural veterinarian.

UCRA hosts students on rotation, as well as for farm visits and medical or surgical visits to the animal(s) to be treated in a herd. UCRA is equipped with three vehicles for transporting equipment and medicines to treat animals on the farm. Each vehicle can accommodate four students in addition to the clinician driving. If any animal requires it, hospital practitioners can transfer cases to the livestock hospital of the Establishment.

Students have several opportunities for hands-on training.

**4.4.2. Comments**

- VTH, SIAMU, CRREC, Clinéquine, CUSI and UCRA give emergency care 24/7 days, not only for small animal and equine but livestock animals.
- The students' groups are fine, 4 students per group, and the supervision is good.
- The number of 83 academics and temporary hospital practitioners, (39 of them are graduates of one or more European or American universities) is amazingly high.
- The core clinical teaching facilities include in the veterinary teaching hospital (VTH) a 24/7 emergency services for companion animals and equines. For ruminants, on-call service is available, and an emergency service.
- Research-based and evidence-based clinical training supervised by academic staff trained to teach and to assess, availability for staff and students of facilities and patients for performing clinical research and relevant QA procedures is fine and with a wide range of chances for students.
- There are a lot of services in all species for rotations of students; the chances for practical teaching and supervised training are good for students.
- The Establishment has a very high level of service, comparable with or even exceeding the best available in the private sector.

**4.4.3. Suggestions for improvement**

- Potential problems due to the distance of the campus and other external clinical services is an aspect to check; in fact, the Establishment is aware of this potential problem.

**4.4.4. Decision**

The Establishment is compliant with Substandard 4.4.

**4.5 The Establishment must ensure that students have access to a broad range of diagnostic and therapeutic facilities, including but not limited to: diagnostic imaging, anaesthesia, clinical pathology, intensive/critical care, surgeries and treatment facilities, ambulatory services, pharmacy and necropsy facilities.**

#### **4.5.1. Findings**

Imaging is a multi-facility support service, equipment includes: an X-ray machine with a small animal plane sensor; an X-ray apparatus for horses with synchronisation between the X-ray tube and the detector plate and a dedicated equine ultrasound machine connected to a large screen so that all students can watch. Additional ultrasound machines can be used in the field or in other clinical units if they are needed more urgently (e.g. large animal reproduction). There is a small animal MRI machine (1.5 Tesla) and a small animal CT-scanner located on the veterinary campus. The service is also equipped with one standing horse MRI room (0.27 Tesla).

Many laboratories offer services that are used in the diagnosis of animal patients. All laboratories are operated according to the recommendations of the relevant standard(s), such as ISO 9001, GLP, ISO 15189, or ISO 17025, depending on the type of activity in question.

Within these laboratories, there is a wide range of available equipment, such as one Immulite 2000, one Konelab<sub>1</sub> and one Konelab<sub>2</sub>, two Perkin Elmer RIA devices and associated counters, one BioRad Bioplex multiplex immunoassay device, one BioMerieux Vidas device, and multiple qPCR devices.

#### **4.5.2. Comments**

- The students have access to a broad range of diagnostic and therapeutic facilities, as has been described in other point of this chapter.

#### **4.5.3. Suggestions for improvement**

None.

#### **4.5.4. Decision**

The Establishment is compliant with Substandard 4.5.

**4.6 Appropriate isolation facilities must be provided to meet the need for the isolation and containment of animals with communicable diseases. Such isolation facilities must be properly constructed, ventilated, maintained and operated to provide for animal care and for prevention of spread of infectious agents. They must be adapted to all animal species commonly handled in the VTH.**

#### **4.6.1. Findings**

There are two isolation facilities:

- One dedicated to large animals (such as horses and cows), in its own free-standing building. In order to prevent contamination, the building is as isolated and autonomous as possible. It contains four stalls, a changing room with a complete set of appropriate boots and attire, a room for the storage of supplies such as medicines, ropes, and medical equipment, washing and cleaning equipment, and a hay and straw storage room. Each stall can be adapted to house either a cow (feed fence) or a horse. Any person entering the stall area must be entirely equipped with protective clothing.
- One for small animals (cats, dogs, etc.), located in the VTH but without interior access to it. It has its own entrance and equipment and contains five cages. It is divided into two areas: an anteroom for putting on protective gear and a second room with the cages.

There are two rooms in the '*Small animal isolation area*': a common hospitalisation room for dogs and cats (8-018), and an equipment and preparation room (8-017).

The register available to this area confirms a hospitalisation of:

- 6 animals in 2021 (data to 21/05),
  - 6 animals in 2020,
  - 15 animals in 2019,
  - 10 animals in 2018,
  - 18 animals in 2017.
- SIAMU also has a room for dogs (two cages) and cats (three cages) that might be or are contagious but require emergency or intensive care

#### **4.6.2. Comments**

- The number of isolation facilities is fine and the equipment inside also. Nevertheless, the number of cages in the small animal isolation area may be insufficient depending on an increase with the number of contagious cases.

#### **4.6.3. Suggestions for improvement**

None.

#### **4.6.4. Decision**

The Establishment is compliant with Substandard 4.6.

### **4.7 The Establishment must have an ambulatory clinic for production animals or equivalent facilities so that students can practise field veterinary medicine and Herd Health Management under academic supervision.**

#### **4.7.1. Findings**

On-site services (ambulatory clinics) are provided to farms on a regular basis by UCRA (see 4.4). Y4 students spend a total of five half-days with UCRA practitioners, traveling back and forth between the two campuses using three fully equipped vehicles that can each fit one hospital practitioner and four students. Students treat individual animals, perform surgery, and conduct herd health management. They participate in the everyday life of a veterinary practitioner for food-producing animals. Students have a case log in which they record the cases they have seen, which are later transferred to Clovis. The animals seen are mainly dairy cattle and beef herd cattle, and sometimes goats or sheep.

When necessary, animals or corpses are sent for hospitalisation or necropsy to SHAR, where Y4 students are also involved in their care. There is constant communication regarding clinical cases transferred between UCRA and SHAR by phone, email, or in person.

In addition, field veterinary medicine is taught to Y4 students through another ambulatory clinic. Once a week, from 8:15 am to 1:30 pm, eight students and a supervisor (teacher, hospital practitioner) travel to St Symphorien sur Coise (private practice) and shadow one of the three veterinarians during his/her visits. The animals seen are mainly dairy cattle, and sometimes goats or sheep. When necessary, animals or corpses are sent for hospitalisation or necropsy to SHAR.

The principles of herd health management, including population medicine, breeding, and reproduction monitoring, are taught to students in various teaching modules in Y3, Y4, and Y5.

The Establishment has signed health care contracts with some farmers to ensure students' exposure to a broad range of activities.

Clinéquine also offers similar field visits with horses. Visits are performed on an on-call basis. Y3, Y4, or Y5 students in their equine rotation may choose to join a visit if they are available; there is no mandatory requirement.

The Establishment has a 5-6 seat minibus fully equipped for ambulatory clinics in equine medicine, and another with 9 seats for ambulatory clinics in livestock medicine. Students must supply their own clean boots and protective clothing, as well as a thermometer and a stethoscope for ambulatory clinics for food-producing animals.

#### **4.7.2. Comments**

- Good ambulatory clinics that let students be involved in all the clinical protocols.
- Although there is no mandatory requirement, the fact that Y3, Y4, or Y5 students in their equine rotation may choose to join a visit if they are available is a good idea.

#### **4.7.3. Suggestions for improvement**

None.

#### **4.7.4. Decision**

The Establishment is compliant with Substandard 4.7

### **4.8 The transport of students, live animals, cadavers, materials from animal origin and other teaching materials must be done in agreement with national and EU standards, to ensure the safety of students and staff and to prevent the spread of infectious agents.**

#### **4.8.1. Findings**

The Establishment has its own fleet of vehicles for regular activities and ambulatory clinics (see 4.4). The Establishment uses an external company to transport students by bus from the veterinary campus to the slaughterhouse or INFOMA in Corbas.

One livestock truck is fully equipped to carry either horses or cattle. The driver has a certificate of proficiency for the transport of live animals.

Another livestock truck is equipped to carry corpses of large animals. A well-equipped smaller vehicle is used for the transport of dog corpses from the regional animal shelter operated by the Society for the Protection of Animals (*'Société Protectrice des Animaux'*), SPA.

All vehicles are disinfected using the disinfection station at the large animal isolation unit, and regularly inspected by the Departmental Directorate for the Protection of Populations (DDPP). All systems of transportation have been approved by the relevant authorities.

#### **4.8.2. Comments**

- The number of vehicles is good for ambulatory and student transportation. The fact that all vehicles are disinfected using the disinfection station at the large animal isolation unit, and regularly inspected by DDPP and that all systems of transportation have been approved by the relevant authorities is important for biosecurity.
- The number of licensed drivers is important.

#### **4.8.3. Suggestions for improvement**

None.

#### **4.8.4. Decision**

The Establishment is compliant with Substandard 4.8

**4.9 Operational policies and procedures (including e.g. biosecurity, good laboratory practice and good clinical practice) must be taught and posted for students, staff and visitors and a Biosafety manual must be available. The Establishment must demonstrate a clear commitment for the delivery of biosafety and biosecurity, e.g. by a specific committee structure. The Establishment must have a system of QA to monitor and assure clinical, laboratory and farm services, including a regular monitoring of the feedback from students, staff and clients.**

#### **4.9.1. Findings**

The Establishment falls under the authority of different sets of regulations, especially those governing safety, security, and environmental impact. As such, it is subject to regulatory control of its facilities and equipment (of varying frequencies according to French regulations) and inspected by multiple agencies.

The Establishment is monitored by a specialised team 24 hours a day, 7 days a week. There are well-established procedures that describe how to safeguard employees, students, and equipment in case of fire or accidents involving people. Fire safety training and fire drills are organised several times a year, as well as lockdown or evacuation drills in case of, e.g. a terrorist attack or similar threat.

Work-related accidents and high-risk situations are recorded in the online occupational health and safety register, where they are analysed and reviewed by the risk prevention specialist and by the Committee on Health, Safety, and Working Conditions (CHSCT). There is one Internal Emergency Plan (*'Plan d'Urgence Interne'*, PUI) and one Special Event Emergency Plan (*'Plan Particulier d'Intervention'*, PPI-ORSEC).

A Specific Security Plan (*'Plan Particulier de Mise en Sûreté'*, PPMS) also describes the internal procedures for ensuring the safety of staff and students in the event of a major hazard outside the Establishment.

Emergency telephone numbers are listed on the back (5 × 8 cm) of the Establishment badge, and in many places of the School and on the intranet.

Numerous health and safety training courses are offered to staff.

Specific procedures have been laid out for the proper disposal of waste, in particular biohazardous waste, chemical waste, and recyclable waste. Disposal of biohazardous waste and chemical waste (e.g. resulting from anatomopathology, oncology, or research) is carried out by specialised companies under State approval and subject to traceability.

The management of biosecurity, hygiene, and safety is centralised in the Quality, Hygiene, and Safety Unit, which brings together all laboratory quality managers (including one specialised in Good Laboratory Practices), the biological risk manager, the risk prevention specialist and his/her assistant.

A biosecurity manual is available in hard copy

## **FINAL REPORT AS ISSUED BY ECOVE ON 29 SEPTEMBER 2021**

An internal body (SBEA) is responsible for animal welfare and monitors the permanent animal resources of the Establishment and the animals intended for research (e.g. horses, dogs, sheep, cattle).

The Ethics Committee reviews all proposals for research projects involving animals and all uses of animals in teaching; in addition, it performs regular checks of clinics, animals used for teaching, and the competencies of staff members.

The composition of the Ethics Committee is provided in Appendix 13. Among the 23 members, eight are student representatives and are considered as "Volunteer external non-scientist members". The Establishment always had PhD students in the Ethics Committee since 1999 and started including veterinary students in 2018. Veterinary students are in charge of the link between the Committee and the students. They attend meetings and they are offered to give their opinion about the research projects, the clinical research projects, but moreover about clinical activities and teaching activities.

In the VetAgroTice pedagogical platform, a specific page describes the activities of the Ethics Committee (see [Comité d'éthique - VetAgro Sup \(vetagro-sup.fr\)](http://Comité d'éthique - VetAgro Sup (vetagro-sup.fr))) and the possibility for any member of VetAgro Sup community to ask questions or send information to the Ethics Committee. Confidentiality is guaranteed.

If a problem arises, the permanent secretary of the Ethics Committee informs the chair of the Committee and the Dean of VetAgro Sup. If it is a concern related to clinical activities, two specific members of the Ethics Committee are also involved in the action. The permanent secretary contacts the students to collect information and also contacts the teacher in charge of the activity to inform of the complaint and to request explanations or corrective actions. The permanent secretary organises a meeting or sends the explanations and/or description of corrective actions to the students.

The whistle-blower policy was recently established. The process is improving every time a new alert is received.

The Establishment solicits feedback from its internal and external stakeholders through a number of means:

- internally: students' opinions are gathered through evaluations of theoretical and practical teaching, including clinical rotations, and their progress is assessed via evaluations of acquired skills; staff and student opinions are registered on a dedicated portal for suggestions on the website.
- externally (e.g. VTH customer): external stakeholders can complete surveys via Google Opinion, and the Establishment carefully considers all responses. Responses to the surveys are managed by the Communications Team in liaison and consultation with the VTH and management. It is also possible to submit complaints via the web portal (Improve-IT). External members of the veterinary profession and other associated stakeholders may serve on various boards of the Establishment (including the COS) in order to contribute their different perspectives.

Any measures that are decided upon in response to either internal or external feedback are included in an action plan and their effectiveness is later verified.

#### **4.9.2. Comments**

- Operational policies and procedures are good, the number of relevant committees and their structure is also good.
- The Establishment has a system of QA to monitor and assure clinical, laboratory and farm services, including a regular monitoring of the feedback from students, staff and clients.

#### **4.9.3. Suggestions for improvement**

None.

#### **4.9.4. Decision**

The Establishment is compliant with Substandard 4.9.

### **Standard 5. Animal resources and teaching material of animal origin**

**5.1 The number and variety of healthy and diseased animals, cadavers, and material of animal origin must be adequate for providing the practical and safe hands-on training (in the areas of Basic Sciences, Clinical Sciences, Pathology, Animal Production, Food Safety and Quality) and adapted to the number of students enrolled.**

**Evidence must be provided that these data are regularly recorded and that procedures are in place for correcting any deficiencies.**

#### **5.1.1. Findings**

The aim regarding the strategy of the Establishment is to give the opportunity to all students to use animals and materials of animal origin resulting in acquiring the Day One Competences. A tension exists between on the one hand striving to a diversity of veterinarian's daily experiences by the use of live or dead animals, and on the other hand the Establishment's efforts to reduce the use of animals from the permanent herd as much as possible based on the principles of the 3Rs and with the support of the Ethics Committee. The Establishment has set up an animal welfare policy with the Ethics Committee. To include animals in the teaching programme an approval of the Ethics Committee is needed. Moreover, undergraduates practice and rehearse using devices and dummies before they are allowed to activities on live animals (VetSkill). In Appendix 23 the workshops available in VetSkill are listed.

The Establishment has created a permanent working group with the task of increasing the caseload of the VTH, but also to regularly recording the balance between the number of students and the number of animals and materials of animal origin. Additionally, a veterinarian has been hired with the task of developing first-opinion consultations. He/she is also in charge of increasing the number of consultations for exotic animals. A vehicle has been purchased for the transportation of live cattle, another one for cadavers and a technician has the task to collect sick animals for the VTH or cadavers for necropsy. So, there is a strong effort to enhance the number of cases in the VTH.

The Establishment relies on the EAEVE and AVMA indicators to monitor if the number and variety of healthy and diseased animals, cadavers, and material of animal origin is in accordance with the number of students enrolled. Nevertheless, it is still constrained by the case log of the veterinary hospital and the ambulatory activity. Cases seen by students during their EPTs are not counted, since they have not been seen in consultation by a teacher from the Establishment. With

the *CompetVet* tool, students and academic advisors will be able to count cases that have been validated by the internship supervisor.

Tables 5.1.1. to 5.1.4. show that during the years the number of cadavers used in practical anatomical training, and intramural/extramural patients is more or less constant. Only the number of horses used for pre-clinical training varies but is decreasing during the last year. In table 5.1.6. the necropsies are listed showing a small number of pigs, rodents, birds and exotics, the ESEVR indicators I18 and I20 being below the minimum required value. I18 is just beyond the minimum level caused by a compensating number of ruminants. In anatomy, apart from the heart/lung practical section, which is carried out on bovine parts (from slaughterhouses), the Establishment does not carry out dissections on whole bovines or bovine limbs. The Establishment considers that the goat model, developed for more than 30 years, is a very good approach to the anatomy of small and large domestic animals.

For the different species during Y1 up to and including Y3 two or three students carry out dissections per organ system.

To enhance the number of necropsies of cattle the Establishment has set up a free system for the recovery/transportation of corpses. No cattle necropsies are performed during field visits that are conducted with teachers from livestock pathology or reproduction, or hospital practitioners from UCRA.

In the Establishment a so called “pedagogical herd” (dogs, horses, cows) is housed. Dogs and horses are the property of the Establishment, but the cattle are yearly rented during one academic year and return to the owners at the end of the year. The interventions done in all animals are recorded. At the end of their service in the teaching herd, dogs and horses are given to private individuals.

The SER gives a lot of examples of different programmes or ways to get more experience in animal handling, nursing and so on. There are programmes like “Adopt a horse” or “Adopt a dog” in which students take responsibility for all aspects of the animals’ daily care.

Training in Food Safety and Quality occurs in a slaughterhouse (cattle and small ruminants) and in different facilities of the National Training Centre for Officials of the Ministry of Agriculture and Food (INFOMA).

There are different suggestions given (5.6) to enhance the provision of students with more clinical cases or hands-on training. Initiatives exist for more cooperation with dispensaries and other establishments (3D-printing), development and implementation of plastination of anatomical parts, and a new fee system to encourage clients to donate bodies.

### **5.1.2. Comments**

- The Establishment is very active in enhancing the number of clinical cases. A permanent working group has been installed to increase the caseload for the VTH, but also to regularly recording the balance between the number of students and the number of animals and materials of animal origin.
- A vehicle has been purchased for the transportation of live cattle, another one for cadavers and a technician has the task to collect sick animals for the VTH or cadavers for necropsy.
- However, the number of necropsies of rabbits, rodents, birds, exotics and pigs are below the minimum level referring to the ESEVT Indicators.

- There is much attention in the clinic to get experience in animal handling and nursing. Initiatives as the development of new techniques, cooperation with other establishments in the area of Lyon and a fee system for donating bodies has been taken to possibly lead to short-term results.

### **5.1.3. Suggestions for improvement**

- It is suggested to make efforts to increase the number of necropsies of rabbits, rodents, birds, exotics and pigs.

### **5.1.4. Decision**

The Establishment is partially compliant with Substandard 5.1 because of a need to increase the necropsies of rabbits, rodents, birds, exotics and pigs.

## **5.2 In addition to the training provided in the Establishment, experience can include practical training at external sites, provided this training is organised under direct academic supervision and following the same standards as those applied in the Establishment.**

### **5.2.1. Findings**

External practical training (EPT) of students occurs during the first four years on multiple sites such as different clinics and practices, a slaughterhouse, facilities of INFOMA and by visits of pig and poultry facilities. Table 3.5.1. shows the curriculum days for each student.

Some EPTs have fixed themes, but others can be chosen by students and are more flexible in the planning. For each EPT, there are clearly identified pedagogical objectives and levels of skill acquisition. All students have the same academic advisor during the first four years to improve consistency and follow-up achieving goals. Student's individual objectives are discussed with the academic supervisor.

Y5 students have the opportunity to complete a tutored EPT of 18 weeks. Students are allowed to be alternate periods in a clinic with training in the Establishment or in a single clinic interspersed with 2-week periods in the Establishment. These tutored EPTs rely on a strong relationship between the student, the mentor (contact person within the clinic who supervises the student's activities), and an academic advisor. Because of the various discussions with them, tutored EPT are often seen as a companionship.

There is an agreement (see Memorandum DGER/SDES/2017-785) between the company supervisor, the student and the Dean in which the responsibilities of each party during the EPT have been set out. This elaborately formulated agreement guarantees the fact that the EPTs are organised under direct academic supervision and follow the same standards as those applied in the Establishment.

### **5.2.2. Comments**

- Students have the possibility to get much experience "in the field" among others through the EPTs. They take place on multiple sites, as clinics, slaughterhouse and other facilities.
- Student's individual goals has been discussed with the academic advisor, but the EPT's has been carried under the responsibility of the employees of the different organisations.

**5.2.3. Suggestions for improvement**

None.

**5.2.4. Decision**

The Establishment is compliant with Substandard 5.2.

**5.3 The VTH must provide nursing care skills and instruction in nursing procedures. Under all situations students must be active participants in the clinical workup of patients, including problem-oriented diagnostic approach together with diagnostic decision-making.**

**5.3.1. Findings**

At the VTH, students are trained and supervised by clinical teacher-researchers and by hospital practitioners, as well as by animal health technicians (specialised nurses) for technical handling techniques. During the years Y3 on to Y5 the focus of students is shifting more and more from observation to active handling (diagnoses, synthesising data and parameters).

An integrated approach exists between the years because each day round tables are held to discuss ongoing VTH cases or other clinical cases. The focus is on diagnostic strategies and differential diagnoses as well as prevention and treatment. So, it is excellent to see that students (also from Y3) actively interact with clinicians on a daily basis.

**5.3.2. Comments**

- The VTH is functioning very well, not in the least because of the efforts and motivation of driven teachers, hospital practitioners and animal health technicians.

**5.3.3. Suggestions for improvement**

None.

**5.3.4. Decision**

The Establishment is compliant with Substandard 5.3.

**5.4 Medical records must be comprehensive and maintained in an effective retrieval system (preferably an electronic patient record system) to efficiently support the teaching, research, and service programmes of the Establishment.**

**5.4.1. Findings**

The Establishment has an internally developed Hospital Information System (Clovis), which enables the electronic management of all information regarding animals and their owners. The application is integrated with the imaging database and the systems of internal laboratories (e.g. histology, biochemistry). The IT-system has been secured by a document in which the following issues are described: 1) ownership of source code and data, 2) maintenance, 3) service (impact, urgency) and 4) the waiting time in case of emergency. Students have permanent access to all data in the database, not only during their sessions in the VTH. This allows them to carry out retrospective case studies, particularly in the context of their veterinary thesis.

In Appendix 10, a detailed SWOT analysis has been described. One of the weaknesses is “an IT master plan that has to be refreshed”. According to the Establishment, this weakness results from

the analysis of HCERES which considered the IT master plan was not adapted to the Establishment's ambitions, particularly in terms of tools for consolidating the various indicators that the Establishment needs. A special grant was awarded to the Establishment by the Ministry of Agriculture for the updating of this plan in 2022.

#### **5.4.2. Comments**

- The Hospital Information System (Clovis) has been secured by a service agreement among others including the ownership of the source code and data. Students have permanent access to all data in the database, but according to students, working within the system at home is not easy. That is not an ideal situation for the times when students have to work more from home.

#### **5.4.3. Suggestions for improvement**

None.

#### **5.4.4. Decision**

The Establishment is compliant with Substandard 5.4.

### **Standard 6. Learning resources**

**6.1 State-of-the-art learning resources must be adequate and available to support veterinary education, research, services and continuing education. When the study programme is provided in several tracks/languages, the learning resources must be available in all used languages. Timely access to learning resources, whether through print, electronic media or other means, must be available to students and staff and, when appropriate, to stakeholders. State-of-the-art procedures for bibliographical search and for access to databases and learning resources must be taught to undergraduate students.**

#### **6.1.1. Findings**

The library provides training in documentary research tools and bibliographic resource management. Bibliographic reference management software Zotero is used for these purposes. In first and third year of curriculum there are presentations and three-hour documentary training course for students focused on preparation and creation of the veterinary thesis. QA is carried-out by survey, which revealed a very positive response to this course. Library hosts once a week Thursday workshops called "*Ateliers du jeudi*" which provides training in small groups on specialised themes.

Selection of acquisitions is based on proposals of teachers and students. The content of collections was evaluated using Moberly and Page's 2018 recommendations for "Essential and core books for veterinary medicine".

The library is open to all stakeholders without distinction with variable lending rights according to category of user.

VetAgro Tice, the e-learning platform hosts material for 133 undergraduate courses. It comprises 80% of pedagogical content with average of 34.4 accessible files per course.

The library produces an annual report on its activities, which is circulated within the Establishment to promote the library's activities for next year.

### **6.1.2. Comments**

- The Establishment pays particular attention to feedback from students about their satisfaction with learning resources from Library. According to the 2016 and 2019 surveys (done once in four years) they identify that the biggest problem is not the space at all, but the space for teamwork.
- In the 2016 survey, 42% of respondents are satisfied or very satisfied, while almost one in five is not very or not at all satisfied. Many comments emphasise the need for dedicated spaces for teamwork in smaller groups.
- In the 2019 survey, the group workspace generated the most comments. There is a VetCampus 2021-2027 project presented by the Establishment, which takes this problem in account, planning to build extra spaces for small group to work. It is encouraging and shows the attitude of the Establishment to meet the needs of students.

### **6.1.3. Suggestions for improvement**

None.

### **6.1.4. Decision**

The Establishment is compliant with Substandard 6.1.

**6.2 Staff and students must have full access on site to an academic library administered by a qualified librarian, an Information Technology (IT) unit managed by an IT expert, an e-learning platform, and all the relevant human and physical resources necessary for the development of instructional materials by the staff and their use by the students.**

**The relevant electronic information, database and other intranet resources must be easily available for students and staff both in the Establishment's core facilities via wireless connection (Wi-Fi) and from outside the Establishment through a hosted secured connection, e.g. Virtual Private Network (VPN).**

#### **6.2.1. Findings**

The head librarian holds a Master's degree in Library and Information Studies and is accompanied by three competent librarians, technicians and also during the academic year two students help in the evenings.

The Library is open from 8:30 am to 7:00 pm from Monday to Thursday, to 5:00 pm on Friday. During revision and exam period, the library closes at 8:00 pm. For two weeks a year, when library closes (usually Christmas period and in August), all electronic resources remain available on the internet.

Library has a stable budget for acquisition for the last few years. In addition, through its participation in the Couperin purchasing group the library has access to digital products negotiated at the national level without any additional costs.

The main library is located on the ground floor of the main building, thus is accessible to students with disabilities and spreads out on 700 m<sup>2</sup>. The library offers a reading corner and soundproof collaborative workroom.

Most departments have their own library. Two of the most important are the National Veterinary Toxicology Information Centre (CNITV) and the Veterinary Pharmacovigilance Centre of Lyon (CPVL). These contain specialised documents related to veterinary toxicology and pharmacology, which are also included in the veterinary library catalogue.

VetAgro Sup is a part of network of four French veterinary establishments, which enables access, provision of articles and interlibrary loan. There is also a federation of 11 universities and “*Grand écoles*” in Lyon and Saint-Etienne called “*Université de Lyon*”, through which specialised documentary resources in human health are accessible.

The library portal is continually updated and provides centralised access to documentary resources in a simple, user-friendly interface. It also offers access to several scientific databases such as PubMed, Web of Science, Wiley Online, Science Direct, Scopus (discontinued in 2021) and Sagaweb. Full text articles from these databases are available for users.

The Veterinary Library Catalogue lists the information resources of the veterinary library (paper and digital).

Library has a Wi-Fi terminal and photocopier/printer/scanner are available for a very low fee.

The e-learning platform (VetAgro Tice) is permanently securely accessible even from outside the Establishment and used by all courses. The management of this platform falls under the responsibility of the digital learning specialist in cooperation with IT unit. There is a regular training offered to teachers to use this platform (88 completed training sessions in 2018/19 academic year). In addition, the support for teachers facing difficulties or searching for solutions of particular problem is available by Innovation and Digital Support Manager or the computer specialist.

#### **6.2.2. Comments**

- Overall satisfaction of students with digitalisation and e-resources in learning resources is very good. The Wi-Fi connection is excellent in library and lecture rooms and satisfactory on most places of the campus, as well as amount of charging points for laptops or tablets, especially in renovated meeting rooms.
- The possibility for secure access to e-learning platform (VetAgro Tice) from outside plays an important role in self learning process, especially during the pandemic restrictions.

#### **6.2.3. Suggestions for improvement**

None.

#### **6.2.4. Decision**

The Establishment is compliant with Substandard 6.2.

**6.3 The Establishment must provide students with unimpeded access to learning resources, internet and internal study resources, and equipment for the development of procedural skills (e.g. models). The use of these resources must be aligned with the pedagogical environment and learning outcomes within the programme and have mechanisms in place to evaluate the teaching value of changes in learning resources.**

#### **6.3.1. Findings**

The learning resources available for students consist of library, Skills lab and multiple co-working spaces. Recent document collection is made up of nearly 6.000 books (400 titles are digital) and 22.700 theses from French and foreign veterinary establishments (paper and digital). Yearly collection grow is 150-200, quarter of which is digital. The history of the Establishment is mirrored by a collection of valuable books from 16<sup>th</sup> to 19<sup>th</sup> century stored in the library.

## **FINAL REPORT AS ISSUED BY ECOVE ON 29 SEPTEMBER 2021**

The Establishment subscribes to Elsevier's Freedom Journal Packages and Wiley's STM Collection, which provides access to the full text of more than 4,500 online scientific journals. The Establishment also benefits from the ISTEEX platform providing staff and students with access to more than 21 million documents (articles, book chapters, e-books, databases, etc.) covering a large variety of fields.

The skill lab, "Vetskills" was established in 2019 and offers 35 different workshops (see Appendix 23). Each station was verified by at least one teacher, who wrote the guide for the procedure to be followed. Some of these stations have been created as part of the veterinary thesis project. Students from Y1 and Y2 can enter Y3 clinics only upon demonstrating of the ability to perform certain procedures. This is also part of the curriculum in the first two years of study. The Establishment has found the use of skill lab efficient leading to fewer manipulations and less pain to live animals, as well as addressing some major concerns: ethical, pedagogical and economic.

The co-working space called "Le Lab" is available upon simple reservation by students and staff. This space hosts every Friday from 1:30 to 3:00 pm session called "VetAgro Sup Lab", which aims to find innovative solutions to variety of topics, and these are open to all – students, staff and teachers.

There is also a small room available during the day with no need for reservation, offers free access to computers and beside other uses, meet the needs of students who do not have a personal computer.

### **Addendum for COVID-19**

According to the restrictions due to the pandemic situation, a significant part of the teaching process has become online. For this reason, students with poor internet connection were identified and 4G keys have been purchased. Also, students in difficulties were equipped with laptops and financial support for students who have lost their students jobs has been put in place.

The distance teaching was organised in two forms – synchronous and asynchronous mode. For the synchronous teaching, the Establishment made the decision to use Teams tool from Microsoft. The Establishment also put in place tutorials, information meetings, teacher training and dedicated web pages to train the teachers and students to use this tool. The tutorials are available on the VetAgro Tice platform. Asynchronous teaching was covered by Moodle VetAgro Tice platform.

#### **6.3.2. Comments**

- The current trend of Skill labs across the Establishments in Europe is present and expanding within Lyon. The lab is well managed by a dedicated veterinarian. The students give very good feedback on the training provided by this lab.
- There is a nationally important collection of old veterinary related textbooks, stored and cared for by the Library.

#### **6.3.3. Suggestions for improvement**

None.

#### **6.3.4. Decision**

The Establishment is compliant with Substandard 6.3.

## **Standard 7. Student admission, progression and welfare**

**7.1 The Establishment must consistently apply pre-defined and published regulations covering all phases of the student “life cycle”, e.g. student admission, progression and certification.**

**In relation to enrolment, the Establishment must provide accurate and complete information regarding all aspects of the educational programme in all advertisings for prospective national and international students.**

**Formal cooperations with other Establishments must also be clearly advertised.**

### **7.1.1. Findings**

First-year students, coming from an educational pathway (preparatory programme) under the responsibility of the Ministry of Education, are admitted to the Establishment through various pathways associated with several competitive examinations (A, A-TB, B, C, D, and E). These different pathways and the associated exams are managed by a national organisation (*‘Service des Concours Agronomiques et Vétérinaires’*, SCAV).

On its website, VetAgro Sup presents all these different selection pathways and offers potential students the link to the SCAV website, which provides further details on each (calendar, tests, etc.). It also presents the course of study: the common core in four years, then the year of in-depth training and the completion of a thesis, as well as the internships that students must complete during their studies.

In order to inform potential students about the veterinary curriculum, the Establishment organises an open day and participates in several trade fairs for high school students.

A complete registration packet, containing all relevant information for registration is sent electronically to the students admitted to the Establishment. Students also receive the Welcome Guide for Veterinary Students, which prepares them for important aspects of campus life (e.g. food and accommodation) and provides a thorough description of the course of studies (e.g. internships to be carried out, international exchange programmes, departments and research units, etc.) and the Veterinary Teaching Hospital Welcome Booklet, containing information regarding biosecurity, professional ethics, customer relations and general behaviour. In addition, international students are helped by a “sponsor” French student, assigned by the International Veterinary Student Association (IVSA) for the initial orientation.

The Establishment assigns an academic advisor to national and international students to support his/her pedagogical development.

### **7.1.2. Comments**

- The Establishment applies and adequately communicates the regulations regarding all phases of the student “life cycle”, enrolment and cooperation with other Establishments included.

### **7.1.3. Suggestions for improvement**

None.

### **7.1.4. Decision**

The Establishment is compliant with Substandard 7.1.

**7.2 The number of students admitted must be consistent with the resources available at the Establishment for staff, buildings, equipment, healthy and diseased animals, and materials of animal origin.**

**7.2.1. Findings**

The number of students admitted to the Establishment every year has been raised to 160 from the Academic Year 2018-2019. The number was increased after a specific request from the MAA in direct response to the recruitment needs of the veterinary profession. It is noteworthy that every year more than 40% of newly registered French Vets have been trained by non-French European Universities.

As a consequence of the increased number of incoming students, the Establishment has increased the number of groups for tutorials (from 4 to 6 groups) and practicals (from 8 to 9 groups) in order to guarantee an appropriate number of students per group. An agreement with the MAA has led to the increase of 5 new teachers.

The average number of undergraduate students registered at the Establishment in the last three years is 694. The average number of veterinary students that graduate annually is 131.

**7.2.2. Comments**

- The recent increase in students' number is generally supported by the resources available at the Establishment.
- Although at present some lecture halls are not fully adapted to the increase of students' number, in the new Vet Campus project all lecture halls will be adjusted up to 200 students.

**7.2.3. Suggestions for improvement**

None.

**7.2.4. Decision**

The Establishment is compliant with Substandard 7.2.

**7.3 The selection and progression criteria must be clearly defined, consistent, and defensible, be free of discrimination or bias, and take into account the fact that students are admitted with a view to their entry to the veterinary profession in due course.**

**The Establishment must regularly review and reflect on the selection processes to ensure they are appropriate for students to complete the programme successfully. If the selection processes are decided by another authority, the latter must regularly receive feedback from the Establishment.**

**Adequate training (including periodic refresher training) must be provided for those involved in the selection process to ensure applicants are evaluated fairly and consistently.**

**7.3.1. Findings**

The admission examination is organised by the MAA.

A student's admission to one of the four French veterinary establishments is based on his/her admission ranking and personal choice. The Establishment participates in the national Board of Examiners for the final examination (final decision on whether to accept students once all the tests have been completed and the marks awarded) and some academics also administer the oral examinations. In 2018, a total of 620 students, coming from six different paths (Concours A-E and ATB), enrolled in the four French veterinary establishments. The diversity of admission

examinations ensures the heterogeneity of student profiles, both in terms of the educational experiences of students as well as their geographical or socio-professional backgrounds, including underprivileged classes. In this perspective, the new admission system, together with the shortening of the duration of veterinary studies, aims to diversify recruitment by allowing high school students who would not previously have attempted the preparatory classes - because of modest social origin, geographical origin far from where preparatory classes are hosted – to attempt to enter directly after the baccalaureate.

#### **7.3.2. Comments**

- The complex selection process set by MAA is clearly defined. The Establishment can give to the MAA regular feedback to improve the selection process.

#### **7.3.3. Suggestions for improvement**

None.

#### **7.3.4. Decision**

The Establishment is compliant with Substandard 7.3.

**7.4 There must be clear policies and procedures on how applicants with disabilities or illnesses are considered and, if appropriate, accommodated in the programme, taking into account the requirement that all students must be capable of meeting the ESEVT Day One Competences by the time they graduate.**

#### **7.4.1. Findings**

Once admitted to the Establishment, students with a disability identify themselves to the DEVE so that accommodations can be made. Cases of illness, especially chronic ones, are considered in the same way as disabilities. Accommodations follow medical recommendations and may involve adaptations to examination sessions (e.g. the allocation of extra time) and/or the student's course of study (adaptation of the curriculum, clinical rotations, etc.). Changes to the curriculum must be authorised by the Dean, who is advised on this by the Council of Teachers.

The Establishment has two lifts to access the different floors. All teaching rooms, restrooms, and changing rooms meet standards of accessibility for people with reduced mobility.

If needed, the curriculum is adapted according to the recommendations of the Education Director and the DEVE after consultation with the Teachers' Assembly.

#### **7.4.2. Comments**

- The Establishment has in place adequate procedures to face and accommodate students with disabilities or illnesses.

#### **7.4.3. Suggestions for improvement**

None.

#### **7.4.4. Decision**

The Establishment is compliant with Substandard 7.4.

**7.5 The basis for decisions on progression (including academic progression and professional fitness to practise) must be explicit and readily available to the students. The Establishment must provide evidence that it has mechanisms in place to identify and provide remediation and appropriate support (including termination) for students who are not performing adequately.**

**The Establishment must have mechanisms in place to monitor attrition and progression and be able to respond and amend admission selection criteria (if permitted by national or university law) and student support if required.**

#### **7.5.1. Findings**

At the time of annual registration, students in all classes acknowledge having read the requirements for study and agree to respect them. This document clearly explains all the conditions that must be met in order to progress from one year to the next. These requirements are also presented to first-year students on the first day of the school year.

As already reported in Substandard 7.1, the Establishment assigns an Academic Advisor to national and international students to support his/her pedagogical development. Each academic advisor is responsible for between 5 and 13 students (median 8).

Before the finalization of the examination results at the end of the semester, any students who are having difficulties are reviewed individually by the Teachers' Assembly and an appointment between the student, the academic advisor and the Head of DEVE can be scheduled.

The academic advisor can alert at any time during the academic year any difficulties experienced by the assigned student. In addition, the DEVE team is constantly available to receive and listen to students.

The Establishment has also a Counselling Cell, composed by teachers and staff who have been trained in listening; each student can call upon at his/her discretion or via the academic advisor.

During the COVID-19 lockdown, Academic Advisor were called upon by the DEVE to ensure that the students they supervised were not experiencing any particular problem and to inform the Students Affairs if necessary.

In agreement with the Head of DEVE, students can choose a remediation tutors if they are required to retake a course. A remediation teaching contract is then identified and revised every semester for two years. This contract lists all the teaching units that the student must take during the semester: those that must be taken as part of the remediation and those that are part of the pedagogical progression.

Due to highly selective process of recruitment of students, the withdrawal of a student is an extremely rare situation and is handled with intense counselling prior to the final decision.

As reported in Substandard 7.3, the Establishment is not directly responsible for admission criteria. However, the deans of the four French veterinary establishments may propose changes to MAA.

#### **7.5.2. Comments**

- The Establishment communicates at the beginning of every year all criteria related to student's progression. The academic advisors are able to identify and suggest remediation for students who are not performing adequately.
- Although the Establishment has mechanisms in place to monitor attrition and progression, problems related to these topics are seldom experienced.

#### **7.5.3. Suggestions for improvement**

None.

#### **7.5.4. Decision**

The Establishment is compliant with Substandard 7.5.

### **7.6 Mechanisms for the exclusion of students from the programme for any reason must be explicit.**

**The Establishment's policies for managing appeals against decisions, including admissions, academic and progression decisions and exclusion, must be transparent and publicly available.**

#### **7.6.1. Findings**

Unless specifically permitted by the Council of Teachers and according to the French regulations, each year of study can only be repeated once. If a student does not have an average of at least 10 out of 20 for a given teaching unit, no credit is received for that unit. These units may be repeated in an end-of-summer remediation session and if two or more teaching units have still not been successfully completed, the student must repeat the entire year. However, students retain the benefit of validation of credit earned. Students who have only one teaching unit to make up can move on to the next year with the requirement that they must retake that course. The results for that unit will then be certified in the course of the following academic year.

Students may submit to the Dean a written request of re-examination of their case, citing compelling personal issues that may have affected their results. A Board of Appeals, composed by teachers and students elected by the CEVE, decides to accept or reject the request. If a student is able to show a significant personal problem that may have affected his/her results, the appeal is approved by the commission and the student can receive a new examination session.

The Council of Teachers can exclude a student if he/she repeats a year and fails to successfully complete two (or more) teaching units at the end of the 2<sup>nd</sup> session, then the student is excluded. Exclusion may also be the result of disciplinary actions (in response to, e.g. cheating, breaches of professional ethics, or unacceptable attitudes). No students have been excluded during the last five academic years.

#### **7.6.2. Comments**

- Although the Establishment has mechanisms for the exclusion of students from the programme, this event is particularly rare (1 case in the last seven years).

#### **7.6.3. Suggestions for improvement**

None.

#### **7.6.4. Decision**

The Establishment is compliant with Substandard 7.6.

**7.7 Provisions must be made by the Establishment to support the physical, emotional and welfare needs of students. This includes, but is not limited to, learning support and counselling services, career advice, and fair and transparent mechanisms for dealing with student illness, impairment and disability during the programme. This shall include provision of reasonable adjustments for disabled students, consistent with all relevant equality and/or human rights legislation.**

**There must be effective mechanisms for resolution of student grievances (e.g. interpersonal conflict or harassment).**

### **7.7.1. Findings**

Some information relevant to Substandard 7.7 has been already reported in Substandards 1.4 and 7.4 (academic advisor).

Students receive support from the DEVE in all matters concerning administrative registration, internship agreements, study abroad projects and associated grant applications and thesis projects. DEVE staff also meet individually with students for many reasons, such as answering orientation questions or counselling in the case of a difficult psychological situation.

The Establishment organises meetings to provide students with other information about study abroad and choices of further study during Y5.

The Establishment provides psychological support for students with the regular presence of a psychologist in the campus. The appointment is free for students. The on-staff physician, who provides preventive medical services, can also receive students who need more immediate assistance.

The Vice-Dean meets regularly with student representatives to discuss issues that arise related to safety, the prevention of excessive drinking (co-signed charter), and any experiences of discrimination or harassment.

In order to manage various aspects of student life on campus (school supplies; cultural, social, charitable, and festive activities; the activity of a student-run cafeteria; printing), the Vice-Dean meets also regularly with the board of the students' union '*Cercle Bourgelat*'.

New student activities are presented to the Vice-Dean, who provides guidance to ensure that security and operational elements are considered.

Financial support for student activities is also available through the submission of specific projects to a committee that manages the use of the CVEC fund.

The Establishment through the operational activity of different associations provides students with facilities for sport activities and events, and links with the veterinary profession.

Students involved in the management of the various association can receive 2 ECTS credits per years (maximum cap of 5 ECTS) related to the development of technical and interpersonal skills (problem solving, work in team, leadership, communication).

Need-based financial aid is available to students through the MAA, the Establishment (e.g. the "Catherine Fleury" endowment), two veterinary associations, and the French Veterinary Council.

Work-study jobs are offered by the Establishment to 50 veterinary students every year, with the financial support of AURA Region. In addition, the Association of Alumni and Friends of the Veterinary School of Lyon and VetAgro Sup (AAE) provides financial support for internships abroad.

### **7.7.2. Comments**

- The Establishment has in place procedures and organisations to support the physical, emotional and welfare needs of students.
- Student clubs actively contribute in many aspects of students' experience (mental health of students, the creation of soft and hard skills, animal handling, etc.) in the Establishment.

### **7.7.3. Suggestions for improvement**

None.

#### **7.7.4. Decision**

The Establishment is compliant with Substandard 7.7.

**7.8 Mechanisms must be in place by which students can convey their needs and wants to the Establishment. The Establishment must provide students with a mechanism, anonymously if they wish, to offer suggestions, comments and complaints regarding compliance of the Establishment with national and international legislation and the ESEVT standards.**

#### **7.8.1. Findings**

Students can convey their needs and wants during the monthly meeting of the reduced format of the CEVE, which brings together student representatives, teachers, the Head of DEVE, and his/her assistant. Any participant in the meeting is able to raise a topic for discussion.

When the question concerns an issue related to VetAgro Sup in general, the topic is taken up by the plenary CEVE (grouping both the veterinary and agricultural courses).

Students can submit their written questions, ideas, and complaints (anonymously, if desired) by using the “suggestion box” at the reception desk of the DEVE. Although information regarding the existence of the “suggestion box” is given at the beginning of each academic year and its content is regularly checked, students do not frequently use this way of communication. The Establishment has recently introduced a web interface, the “Improve-IT”, to enhance targeted communication to students.

Students are able, at any time, to make an appointment with the Head of DEVE, his/her assistant, and/or with the Vice-Dean, who participates fully in the management of student life.

#### **7.8.2. Comments**

- Students can convey their needs and wants to the Establishment in many ways including anonymous communication.
- There is some demotivation from the students to give their feedback. The reasons can be the time it takes so they can see actual changes and the fact that, it will not affect them anymore, once they fill out such surveys after completing the relevant curricular units.
- The feedback questionnaire to students covers their analysis of the teaching but does not include the teacher specifically. However, students can, if they wish, take advantage of the “further comments” section to record their comments concerning teachers. The team did in fact learn confidentially that such an approach had resulted, on two occasions, in exchanges between the teachers and management to find solutions.
- Although opinion surveys and teaching evaluations are not compulsory, feedback on the results of such evaluations and decisions taken are systematically given to students through their representatives on the CEVE and the JTAB in which they participate.

#### **7.8.3. Suggestions for improvement**

- To make the opinion surveys obligatory to fill and to give students timely feedback on what were the survey results and strategies to the follow up process.
- To add, in the surveys, teacher’s performance evaluation questions.

#### **7.8.4. Decision**

- The Establishment is partially compliant with Substandard 7.8 due to a need for an increase

in the students' analysis of both teaching and teaching staff. This partial compliance is linked to Substandard 9.5.

## **Standard 8. Student assessment**

**8.1 The Establishment must ensure that there is a clearly identified structure within the Establishment showing lines of responsibility for the assessment strategy to ensure coherence of the overall assessment regime and to allow the demonstration of progressive development across the programme towards entry-level competence.**

### **8.1.1. Findings**

The examination procedure is precisely defined:

To proceed to the next year, students must be successful in completing all teaching units of the current year. The exam can be taken during the first exam session or during the summer catch-up session. Only one missing teaching unit can be retaken during next year. In the case of more than one failed exam, the student can only once repeat the year to complete the missing units. 20 days for the first three years and 40 days for the fourth year of EPT should be completed. The number of days of EPT to be completed in the fifth year depends on the courses of study chosen by the student. Students must acquire a minimum of 4 ECTS from personalised courses per year.

For the first three years a student must pass two examination sessions per semester for each theoretical teaching units with a minimum mark 10 out of 20. Mostly the examinations are in the form of written examination, seldom oral and in the last period also digital evaluations have been used.

Clinical rotation is evaluated each week at the end of the rotation unit, documented on the form: Assessment of students in clinical rotation. The final evaluation is done by summarising all units taken by the student.

In 2021-2022 academic year, a new grid-based system is due to be implemented to assist teachers in the objective evaluation of the competences acquired by students in each single unit of the clinical rotations.

EPT student activity is recorded by "Livret de suivi de stage", a logbook, introduced in 2019.

The duration of EPT, the specific objectives of the training and the practical achievements of the student are verified by the person, responsible for the particular EPT unit. Student performances were assessed following the instructions in the logbook.

### **8.1.2. Comments**

- Written and recorded assessment of students for the actual clinical activities performed by them during intramural clinical rotations is not evident.

### **8.1.3. Suggestions for improvement**

- At least a logbook similar to the one recently introduced for EPT would be necessary until the electronic device for recording the competences defined in the competency matrix will successfully come into full operation.

### **8.1.4. Decision**

The Establishment is compliant with Substandard 8.1.

**8.2 The assessment tasks and grading criteria for each unit of study in the programme must be published, applied consistently, clearly identified and available to students in a timely manner well in advance of the assessment. Requirements to pass must be explicit.**

**The Establishment must properly document the results of assessment and provide the students with timely feedback on their assessments.**

**Mechanisms for students to appeal against assessment outcomes must be explicit.**

### **8.2.1. Findings**

The teaching objectives, the expected learning outcomes and the evaluation process for each teaching unit is described in the syllabus, which is available to students on their pedagogical platform. All changes should be communicated to students at the beginning of the study year.

The result of single teaching unit is finalised by a leading teacher of the unit and sent to the Student Affair Office. The results must be approved by the Council of teachers and published online. Student must get at least 10 out of 20 on average. In some complex courses, no unit should be graded less than 7 to pass the course and get ECTS.

After the grades have been finalised, students can make an appointment with the lead teacher of the teaching unit to discuss their examination results. Students who do not pass a teaching unit during the 1<sup>st</sup> session are encouraged to do this in order to understand their mistakes, identify their shortcomings, and thus better prepare for the catch-up session.

After the grades of the remedial session have been finalised, students who have failed one or more teaching units may appeal to the Board of Appeals only if they feel their results were affected by extenuating personal circumstances. In the case of a favourable opinion from the board, the student will be granted a new session.

### **8.2.2. Comments**

None.

### **8.2.3. Suggestions for improvement**

None.

### **8.2.4. Decision**

The Establishment is compliant with Substandard 8.2

**8.3 The Establishment must have a process in place to review assessment outcomes, to change assessment strategies and to ensure the accuracy of the procedures when required. Programme learning outcomes covering the full range of professional knowledge, skills, competences and attributes must form the basis for assessment design and underpin decisions on progression.**

### **8.3.1. Findings**

The review of the assessment is a part of the general evaluation of the teaching process. It is done by using a web questioner for students. The results of this evaluation are discussed by the Teachers Assembly and any improvements of the process are suggested when necessary.

In the present curriculum from 2018, the evaluation criteria are strictly related to the expected competences and learning outcomes described in the syllabus.

**8.3.2. Comments**

None.

**8.3.3. Suggestions for improvement**

None.

**8.3.4. Decision**

The Establishment is compliant with Substandard 8.3.

**8.4 Assessment strategies must allow the Establishment to certify student achievement of learning objectives at the level of the programme and individual units of study.**

**The Establishment must ensure that the programmes are delivered in a way that encourages students to take an active role in creating the learning process, and that the assessment of students reflects this approach.**

**8.4.1. Findings**

To facilitate learning, the teachers deposit all course material on the pedagogical platform as well as self-assessment tools, guidelines for the final assessment, and support documents such as tutorials. Teachers are available to answer student questions by e-mail or by appointment.

In 2018/2019 the Personalised teaching system was implemented. It is attractive to students to create their own professional track. The assessment of the selected electives is done in a similar way as assessment of EPT, using the logbook.

**8.4.2. Comments**

None.

**8.4.3. Suggestions for improvement**

None.

**8.4.4. Decision**

The Establishment is compliant with Substandard 8.4.

**8.5 Methods of formative and summative assessment must be valid and reliable and comprise a variety of approaches. Direct assessment of clinical skills and Day One Competences (some of which may be on simulated patients), must form a significant component of the overall process of assessment. It must also include the quality control of the student logbooks in order to ensure that all clinical procedures, practical and hands-on training planned in the study programme have been fully completed by each individual student.**

**8.5.1. Findings**

The newly designed competency matrix ensures that, within the final 'sum' of teaching units, undergraduate students are taught all the competencies required by the National Competency Framework and the ESEVT "Day One Competences" standards.

The evaluation of students always involves several teachers, including hospital practitioners, and is itself assessed through the system of teaching evaluations.

Although it could be assumed that clinical skills are regularly assessed by the teaching staff during clinical rotations, from the quality control point of view, students' activity in such clinical procedures is not fully recorded. At the moment there is no reliable formal procedure in place for systematic recording/documenting of students' activities during clinical rotation which would prove that the objective evaluation of students in clinical rotations is efficient and that the Day One Competences are achieved.

Starting from the 2019-2020 academic year, an ETP follow-up booklet is distributed to all students in order to guarantee that they complete their planned EPT units and to guide the EPT supervisors on what students can/should do during the internship. This booklet not only identifies the objectives to be achieved for each EPT, but also ensures close communication between all of a student's internship hosts and the Establishment.

#### **8.5.2. Comments**

- Although it could be assumed that clinical skills are regularly assessed by the teaching staff during clinical rotations, from the quality control point of view, students' activity in such clinical procedures is not fully recorded.
- The new electronic recording system, based on the competency matrix, which is to be implemented first as a one-year pilot project in the academic year 2021/2022, will represent a useful tool for the efficient and objective evaluation of students in clinical rotations in the future.
- Together with the newly introduced EPT logbook, this represents the means of confirming the Day One Competences of students.

#### **8.5.3. Suggestions for improvement**

None.

#### **8.5.4. Decision**

Although clinical skills are regularly assessed by the teaching staff to ensure Day One Competencies, the Establishment is partially compliant with Substandard 8.5 due to the need, from a quality control point of view, to fully record the clinical skills of students.

### **Standard 9. Academic and support staff**

**9.1 The Establishment must ensure that all staff are appropriately qualified and prepared for their roles, in agreement with national and EU regulations and must apply fair and transparent processes for the recruitment and development of staff.**

**A formal training (including good teaching and evaluation practices, learning and e-learning resources, biosecurity and QA procedures) must be in place for all staff involved with teaching.**

**Most academic staff (calculated as FTE) involved in veterinary training must be veterinarians. It is expected that more than 2/3 of the instruction that the students receive, as determined by student teaching hours, is delivered by qualified veterinarians.**

### **9.1.1. Findings**

The majority of academic positions are held by civil servants of the State (national competitive recruitment), paid by the Ministry of Agriculture and Food, what is to be considered as a guarantee of stability and standardisation and consistency in the level of recruitment. Permanent academic and support staff are first recruited through occupational transfers (legal right of civil servants to transfer), and then through public competitions, including a public lecture given after 24 hours of preparation in which the theme of the lecture is determined by the jury.

For recruitment of Associate or Full Professors specific requirements are set. To apply for a position as Associate Professor a PhD is obligatory. By exemption, the competition may also be opened to specialist veterinarians. To apply for a rank of Full Professor, a period of 3-10 years uninterrupted research is required, resulting in a substantial number of publications, supervision of a PhD student and the proven ability to secure external funding.

In 2019, 92% of the teaching staff were qualified veterinarians (97% within the VTH) and 42 of them were recognised specialists (EBVS or DESV). For a few teaching assignments staff members not being veterinarians are involved because of their specific knowledge. This is the case, for example, in molecular genetics, biostatistics, microbiology, animal husbandry, and pharmacy. Thus, this Establishment meets the requirement that more than 2/3 of the instruction that the students receive, as determined by student teaching hours, is delivered by qualified veterinarians. Following their appointment, permanent academic staff (mainly associate professors) are strongly encouraged to attend a four-week, full-time pedagogical training programme organised by the MAA. Every new employee receives basic health and safety training on arrival and participates in a new-employee orientation day to better understand the management of human resources and to learn more about the Establishment. At this moment, this training does not provide a basis in the theory of teaching. A request for a subsidy has been made to the Auvergne-Rhône-Alpes Region for the implementation of a training course in clinical pedagogy for other employees than permanent academic staff working with clinical students. In the suggestions for improvement (3<sup>rd</sup> bullet, page 88 of the SER) it is stated that starting in September 2020, interns and residents, who also participate in the training of veterinary students, will be trained in clinical pedagogy by the VetAgro Sup educational specialist. However, given the health context and the difficulty of organising the functioning of the veterinary clinics, it was not possible to set up this training.

### **9.1.2. Comments**

- Outstanding number of recognised specialists (EBVS or DESV).
- The level of recruitment of the majority of the academic positions can be qualified as stable and consistent. The teaching staff consists for the most part of veterinarians (97%). Only for a few teaching assignments non-veterinarians are involved. Permanent academic staff are strongly encouraged to a four-week full-time pedagogical training but many teachers, not belonging to the permanent academic staff, do not get the possibility to follow this training.
- Further information from the Establishment indicated that a pedagogical training, organised by the Ministry of Agriculture, is currently only open to newly recruited academics and this remains beyond the control of the Establishment. Besides that, training in clinical pedagogy is planned to train other staff working with clinical students. A request for a subsidy has been made to the Auvergne-Rhône-Alpes Region for the implementation of a training course for trainers.

### **9.1.3. Suggestions for improvement**

- It is suggested to enhance the efforts to implement a mandatory pedagogical training for all teachers in the Establishment involved in teaching clinical students.

### **9.1.4. Decision**

The Establishment is compliant with Substandard 9.1.

**9.2 The total number, qualifications and skills of all staff involved with the programme, including teaching staff, ‘adjunct’ staff, technical, administrative and support staff, must be sufficient and appropriate to deliver the educational programme and fulfil the Establishment’s mission.**

**A procedure must be in place to assess if the staff involved with teaching display competence and effective teaching skills in all relevant aspects of the curriculum that they teach, regardless of whether they are full or part time, residents, interns or other postgraduate students, adjuncts or off-campus contracted teachers.**

### **9.2.1. Findings**

According to the ESEVT Indicators mentioned in the SER (page 98) the total number of academic staff involved in veterinary training related to the number of undergraduate students (I1) and the number of FTE support staff involved in veterinary training divided by the number of students graduating annually (I3) is appropriate. The number of FTE veterinarians involved in veterinary training divided by the number of students graduating annually is between the median and the minimal value (I2). In 9.6 it is stated that the Establishment has difficulty recruiting certain specialists, especially because the level of remuneration offered cannot be competitive with the private sector (e.g. diagnostic imaging, clinical pathology). To address this problem, a working group has been started to identify ways of improving the attractiveness of academic teaching and research positions. Nothing concrete has been proposed to date, except that the Establishment can act on a case-by-case basis depending on recruitment. This has enabled the recruitment of a veterinary imaging specialist and a specialist in equine surgery for temporary needs, and a specialist in clinical pathology for a permanent need. For permanent academic staff (tenured), there are no plans yet to raise the pay scales, only the allowances, which will be progressively evolved. It is also envisaged to pay overtime.

In the PDCA-diagram the teaching staff assessment has been presented. According to the SER procedures, the evaluation and continuous improvement of teaching are well-established and integrated into the QMS of the Establishment. There are three types of evaluation of teaching: a generic evaluation that is conducted each semester, the evaluation of specific teaching units, and the evaluation of clinical rotations. They are all based on the same operation:

- an electronic questionnaire is sent to the students concerned, the items of which have been defined by the joint committee.
- follow-up if necessary;
- analysis of the numerical results and verbatim reports;
- presentation of the results to the CEVE and identification of areas for improvement and action sheets;

- the results in figures are circulated to the students and the solutions are discussed with the students' representatives;
- evaluation of the effectiveness of the actions during the next survey (e.g. 12 months later for an annual course).

The Establishment sends a questionnaire to former students once a year at the end of the year. Each alumnus is asked once, 3 years after graduation, to answer the questionnaire. The response level is very low: e.g. 37 in 2020, 28 in 2019, and 37 in 2018.

### **9.2.2. Comments**

- The total number of academic staff involved in veterinary training related to the number of undergraduate students is appropriate. There is a competition between the private practices and the Establishment regarding the recruitment of clinicians. In different conversations during this Visitation, it was stated that salary is not the main driver for joining the Establishment as a teacher. It is attractive for individuals who wish to undertake research, teaching and appreciate contact with students.
- A working group discusses several ways to enhance the motivation to join the Establishment.
- Evaluation of teaching has been done, among other things, by electronic questionnaires. They are not mandatory, and the response level has a minimum of 40%. Especially the quality of teaching has been investigated. The questionnaire does not contain questions about the quality of teachers. However, if students feel there is a need, they can make remarks in the questionnaire about the teacher, but there are no specific questions included about the teacher.

### **9.2.3. Suggestions for improvement**

None.

### **9.2.4. Decision**

The Establishment is compliant with Substandard 9.2.

**9.3 Staff must be given opportunities to develop and extend their teaching and assessment knowledge and must be encouraged to improve their skills. Opportunities for didactic and pedagogic training and specialisation must be available. The Establishment must clearly define any systems of reward for teaching excellence in operation.**

**Academic positions must offer the security and benefits necessary to maintain stability, continuity, and competence of the academic staff. They must have a balanced workload of teaching, research and service depending on their role. They must have reasonable opportunities and resources for participation in scholarly activities.**

### **9.3.1. Findings**

The Commission on Staff Education and Training proposes training priorities for all staff according to the Establishment's project and examines any individual request for training that does not fall within the annual framework. Each staff member, in collaboration with his or her manager, creates a plan for the coming year that can include goals for training or continuing education. This plan has been discussed during the yearly individual review with the supervisor. A formal list of training

priorities is created. The Ministry of Agriculture and Food covers the costs of a large number of training courses. Moreover, a digital learning specialist maintains a blog that discusses digital innovations.

There is no system for financially valuing teaching excellence in the sense of a bonus or salary modulation.

A government decree stipulates that a teacher-researcher's activity must be equally balanced between research (50%) and teaching (50%). A benchmark grid reflects the equivalence of teaching activities to the number of hours dedicated to different activities. There is a flexible approach if teachers need time for preparing an examination, a competition for promotion or another activity.

### **9.3.2. Comments**

- Staff has sufficient opportunities for training priorities. There are many possibilities in collaboration with the supervisor. The Ministry of Agriculture and Food covers the costs of a large number of training courses.

### **9.3.3. Suggestions for improvement**

None.

### **9.3.4. Decision**

The Establishment is compliant with Substandard 9.3.

**9.4 The Establishment must provide evidence that it utilises a well-defined, comprehensive and publicised programme for the professional growth and development of academic and support staff, including formal appraisal and informal mentoring procedures.**

**Staff must have the opportunity to contribute to the Establishment's direction and decision-making processes.**

**Promotion criteria for academic and support staff must be clear and explicit. Promotions for teaching staff must recognise excellence in, and (if permitted by the national or university law) place equal emphasis on all aspects of teaching (including clinical teaching), research, service and other scholarly activities.**

### **9.4.1. Findings**

Based on the Strategic Plan 2021-2025 human resources policy plays an essential role in improving the quality and efficiency of the services provided, in particular through increasing its attractiveness as a workplace and facilitating the management of a diversity of employment statuses.

Three strategic areas are described:

- improve conditions for the recruitment and promotion of staff;
- strengthen the management of jobs and skills;
- improve the collective efficiency of operations and the quality of work life.

These strategic axes are translated, in compliance with the Establishment's budgetary constraints, into action plans for the coming years. These action plans should provide a programme for professional growth and development of academic and support staff, but they are not described as such in the SER.

The functioning of each of the bodies within the Establishment and the modalities of appointment of staff representatives to these bodies are communicated to each new employee at the time of the signature of the contract. In addition, staff are regularly reminded at the time when the elections of

the representatives to these boards take place. On an additional note, apart from the Teachers' Council, representatives of each category of staff are provided for in each of the statutory bodies of the Establishment.

The Establishment sends out a weekly newsletter that publicises opportunities for competitions or mobility for employees. If interpreted correctly, this is mainly about jobs outside the Establishment. In the SER, procedures are clearly described for the recruitment of associate or full professors.

#### **9.4.2. Comments**

- The attractiveness of the Establishment as a workplace is part of the Strategic Plan 2021-2025. It is the more important because of the competition in recruitment with the private practices. It is anticipated that staff, willing and capable to contribute to Establishment's decision-making process, will meet the opportunities.

#### **9.4.3. Suggestions for improvement**

None.

#### **9.4.4. Decision**

The Establishment is compliant with Substandard 9.4.

### **9.5 A system for assessment of teaching staff must be in operation and must include student participation. Results must be available to those undertaking external reviews and commented upon in reports.**

#### **9.5.1. Findings**

In 9.2.1. the PDCA-diagram about teaching staff assessment has already been discussed, together with the participation of students in the procedures. The role of the Joint Teaching Assessment Board and the CEVE is not clear in relation to the evaluation of teaching staff and the annual professional interviews. It is important to know how the information about evaluation of teachers reaches the supervisors.

#### **9.5.2. Comments**

- Student participation in assessment of teaching staff is insufficient. Besides that, results of external reviews are not available for those undertaking external reviews.

#### **9.5.3. Suggestions for improvement**

- Improved and structural student participation including feedback in assessment of teaching staff. The results should be available for those undertaking external reviews.

#### **9.5.4. Decision**

- The Establishment is partially compliant with Substandard 9.5 due to a need for an increase in the students' analysis of both teaching and teaching staff. This partial compliance is linked to Substandard 7.8.

## **Standard 10. Research programmes, continuing and postgraduate education**

**10.1 The Establishment must demonstrate significant and broad research activities of staff that integrate with and strengthen the veterinary degree programme through research-based teaching.**

### **10.1.1. Findings**

The Establishment has defined a framework for its research and is currently carrying out more than 30 funded research projects in a wide variety of fields. Most large-scale projects are carried out in collaboration with teams from other French universities and research units to form consortia that are sometimes of very good quality and internationally recognized.

In addition to the annual programme support allocation per scientific executive (1,900 € recurrent × number of executives, plus 20,000 k€ according to the performance of the unit, i.e. approx. 220 k€ distributed to the units each year), the Establishment annually finances thesis grants (half or full grants) and research projects through internal calls for application or shared calls for application.

The direct budget that the Establishment commits each year to research thus exceeds the annual allocation granted by its supervisory authority (DGER) (approx. 330-340 k€/year) for research in recent years.

In addition to this funding, there are 4.65 FTE contractual jobs (fixed-term and permanent contracts) for research support.

The “Veterinary Clinical Investigation Centre” allows the recruitment of clinical cases in the 4 veterinary teaching establishments and makes it possible to anchor research within the clinic in direct contact with the students.

The majority of senior researchers are teacher-researchers of the Establishment, of which 61 out of 81 (75%) are veterinary surgeons. On the other hand, only 13 PhD students out of 33 (39%) are veterinarians.

### **10.1.2. Comments**

- Research is constantly progressing in the Establishment but the scientific output of the Establishment per researcher could be improved.
- The number of residents (22), doctoral students (40), ongoing funded research projects (36) and the amounts obtained (1.2 million Euro) are relatively low in view of the number of permanent teacher-researchers (86). No international research collaboration is cited apart from a European H2020 project launched in 2020.
- Establishment researchers should more often be leaders of the research groups in which they participate.

**10.1.3. Suggestions for improvement**

- An extended policy to encourage research should be put in place. Monitoring scientific output by researcher and not just by research unit should be an additional tool for monitoring and continuous improvement.

**10.1.4. Decision**

The Establishment is compliant with Substandard 10.1.

**10.2 All students must be trained in scientific method and research techniques relevant to evidence-based veterinary medicine and must have opportunities to participate in research programmes.**

**10.2.1. Findings**

Students are made aware of research throughout the course through compulsory or optional activities delivered by teacher-researchers. The basics concerning scientific information, statistics, the methodology of critical reading of scientific articles and the search for bibliographical references are given at the beginning of the course. These notions are illustrated in the clinical activities of the last two years and in the framework of the end of studies thesis, which includes an experimental part in 60% of cases. Opportunities to participate in research programmes or in a second Masters conducted in parallel are open for the most motivated students.

The optional course "Jobs in research" did not attract the envisaged interest and there were no applicants. The proposal was temporarily withdrawn in favour of the optional course 'Ethics and practice of animal research', which allows students to discover some of the research activities related to animals.

**10.2.2. Comments**

- Several optional research awareness activities are available for some interested students, but the actual student involvement in this type of activity remains low for the majority of students.

**10.2.3. Suggestions for improvement**

- Additionally, a policy to encourage research should be strengthened to specifically attract undergraduate veterinary students to both undertake a research project as well continuing on to a career in research.
- It would be interesting to integrate illustrations of research carried out in each discipline into all teaching units in order to attract more students in this important field.

**10.2.4. Decision**

The Establishment is partially compliant with Substandard 10.2 due to the need to increase the participation of undergraduates in research projects and to increase the awareness of research careers. This Substandard is linked to Substandard 10.4.

**10.3 The Establishment must provide advanced postgraduate degree programmes, e.g. PhD, internships, residencies and continuing education programmes that complement and strengthen the veterinary degree programme and are relevant to the needs of the profession and society.**

**10.3.1. Findings**

The Establishment supervises interns (30), residents (22) in French specialization or within the framework of 13 specialization colleges of the EBVS (14 different programmes) and doctoral students (40) in collaboration with French universities. Some students participate in post-graduate programmes in other disciplines organized by universities or with other French veterinary schools.

In order to increase research activities in the Establishment and their attractiveness for students, training through research and doctoral training are included in the Establishment project and the Establishment is in the process of setting up actions on these subjects:

- since September 2019, a new call for application ‘Training through research’ to support student research projects, some of which are co-supervised by PhD students;
- from the start of the 2021 academic year, new possibilities for funding doctoral contracts on veterinary subjects financed by the MAA via the CPER (until now this was reserved for agronomic disciplines);
- a process for accreditation to deliver a doctorate (with ED205 EDISS in particular) from January 2022 to include doctoral training as a training course/diploma of the Establishment.

The continuing education activity is important and brings together nearly 3,000 learners each year.

**10.3.2. Comments**

- The number of doctoral students and residents could be increased given the number of teacher-researchers present in the Establishment.

**10.3.3. Suggestions for improvement**

- New incentives for the supervision of doctoral students and residents should be put in place by the Establishment.

**10.3.4. Decision**

The Establishment is compliant with Substandard 10.3.

**10.4 The Establishment must have a system of QA to evaluate how research activities provide opportunities for student training and staff promotion, and how research approaches, methods and results are integrated into the veterinary teaching programmes.**

**10.4.1. Findings**

Quality assurance in research is mainly managed by the Establishment's Scientific Council, which intervenes at different levels to advise on scientific strategy and to support a whole series of evaluations. A system of evaluation of research objectives and performance based on 12 indicators

serves as the basis for monitoring and management review to make decisions. An annual report is also published.

The Establishment does not have indicators or objectives concerning the involvement of veterinary students and post-graduates in research.

**10.4.2. Comments**

- The research quality assurance system is primarily aimed at monitoring research units but could also identify areas for improvement to increase the quantity and quality of research within the Establishment. On the other hand, initiatives aimed at promoting research among students are not formally part of the process.
- The Visitation Team was aware that about 60% of students undertake an experimental practice thesis which includes research work respecting the principles of the scientific approach (from the analysis of the pre-existing bibliography to that of the obtained results), but not necessarily participating in a research project linked and supervised by a member of staff.

**10.4.3. Suggestions for improvement**

- Incentives for research and research awareness should be strengthened by the Establishment.

**10.4.4. Decision**

The Establishment is partially compliant with Substandard 10.4 due to the need to increase the participation of undergraduates in research projects and to increase the awareness of both research careers as well as the number of doctoral students. This Substandard is linked to Substandard 10.2.

**11. ESEVT Indicators**

		Establishment values	Median values <sup>(1)</sup>	Minimal values <sup>(2)</sup>	Balance
I1	n° of FTE academic staff involved in veterinary training / n° of undergraduate students	<b>0.16</b>	0.16	0.13	0.039
I2	n° of FTE veterinarians involved in veterinary training / n° of students graduating annually	<b>0.77</b>	0.87	0.59	0.176
I3	n° of FTE support staff involved in veterinary training / n° of students graduating annually	<b>1.54</b>	0.94	0.57	0.977
I4	n° of hours of practical (non-clinical) training	<b>698.33</b>	905.67	595.00	103.333
I5	n° of hours of clinical training	<b>2329.00</b>	932.92	670.00	1659.000
I6	n° of hours of FSQ & VPH training	<b>391.00</b>	287.00	174.40	216.600
I7	n° of hours of extramural practical training in FSQ & VPH	<b>42.67</b>	68.00	28.80	13.867
I8	n° of companion animal patients seen intramurally / n° of students graduating annually	<b>93.83</b>	70.48	42.01	51.818
I9	n° of ruminant and pig patients seen intramurally / n° of students graduating annually	<b>2.12</b>	2.69	0.46	1.658
I10	n° of equine patients seen intramurally / n° of students graduating annually	<b>11.66</b>	5.05	1.30	10.362
I11	n° of rabbit, rodent, bird and exotic seen intramurally / n° of students graduating annually	<b>1.84</b>	3.35	1.55	0.290
I12	n° of companion animal patients seen extramurally / n° of students graduating annually	<b>0.00</b>	<b>6.80</b>	<b>0.22</b>	<b>-0.223</b>
I13	n° of individual ruminants and pig patients seen extramurally / n° of students graduating annually	<b>12.70</b>	15.95	6.29	6.401
I14	n° of equine patients seen extramurally / n° of students graduating annually	<b>0.92</b>	2.11	0.60	0.324
I15*	n° of visits to ruminant and pig herds / n° of students graduating annually	<b>1.74</b>	1.33	0.55	1.189
I16*	n° of visits of poultry and farmed rabbit units / n° of students graduating annually	<b>0.14</b>	0.12	0.04	0.092
I17	n° of companion animal necropsies / n° of students graduating annually	<b>1.45</b>	2.07	1.40	0.052
I18	n° of ruminant and pig necropsies / n° of students graduating annually	<b>1.06</b>	2.32	0.97	0.088
I19	n° of equine necropsies / n° of students graduating annually	<b>0.43</b>	0.30	0.09	0.334
I20	n° of rabbit, rodent, bird and exotic pet necropsies / n° of students graduating annually	<b>0.50</b>	<b>2.05</b>	<b>0.69</b>	<b>-0.195</b>
I21	n° of FTE specialised veterinarians involved in veterinary training / n° of students graduating annually	<b>0.31</b>	0.20	0.06	0.244
I22	n° of PhD graduating annually / n° of students graduating annually	<b>0.074</b>	0.15	0.09	-0.016

1. Median values defined by data from Establishments with Approval status in April 2016

2. Recommended minimal values calculated as the 20<sup>th</sup> percentile of data from Establishments with Approval status in April 2016

## **FINAL REPORT AS ISSUED BY ECOVE ON 29 SEPTEMBER 2021**

*\* Virtual visits performed by students before the on-site visits not included in the table (if taken into account, I15 would be 1.87 and I16 would be 0.27)*

### **Comments on the Indicators**

- Indicators I4 and I7 appear lower than the median, but they are balanced out by the very high number of on-site FSQ & VPH teaching hours (I6), and by the number of hours in clinical training (I5). Additionally, some on-site activities are conducted as virtual tours. Moreover, a mandatory 5-day internship in a VPH-related field must be performed between Y2 and Y4 (evolution of internship models).
- The number of ruminants, pigs (I9), rabbits, rodents, birds, and exotic animals (I11) seen on campus is below the median. To compensate for the low number of pig patients, models have been developed in the simulation room (Skill Lab). It should be noted that the VTH experiences strong competition with an internationally renowned specialist in exotic animal medicine and surgery in downtown Lyon. In addition, the development of a private hospital centre with multiple specialists in the area of Lyon also interferes with the recruitment of cases. However, the Establishment has been working since the last ESEVT visit to improve these indicators and has already:
  - Renovated the bovine surgery room and equipped it with a secure surgery table;
  - Recruited a hospital practitioner in exotic animals to assist the academic instructors and increase the number of consultations;
  - Initiated the creation of a new consultation room & a new hospitalisation room for exotic animals.
- In addition, there is a student club on campus focused on the care and ownership of exotic animals (reptiles principally), through which students can perform practical work supervised by an academic instructor, with a well-developed clinical approach.
- The Indicators concerning off-campus consultations, I13 and I14, are below the median, as well as Indicator I12, concerning companion animals. With respect to Indicator I12, the Establishment does not have any off-site facility for companion animal medicine and surgery, nor an ambulatory clinic. However, to compensate, many EPTs are specifically designed to increase contact with pets, as well as other species. Finally, calculation of the Indicators does not include on-call activities at racecourses or during equestrian competitions, but these constitute a means of exposure for students (mainly interns) to equine medicine cases. The low number of cases seen in ambulatory clinics is also compensated by the number of equine consultations seen on campus.
- The number of necropsy exams is lower than the median for companion animals (I17) and for ruminants & pigs (I18), and lower than the minimum for rabbits, rodents, and exotic animals (I20). This decrease in necropsy cases is due to two factors: the increased reluctance of owners to permit a necropsy for their pet, and the low number of cases seen in the VTH for rabbits, rodents, exotic animals, and pigs. Suggestions for improvement are detailed in Substandard 5.1.

### **Suggestions for improvement on the Indicators**

- Students are required to complete multiple EPTs in which they practise, in a hands-on manner, activities that are complementary to the instruction they receive in practical lessons, visits, and clinical teaching. To formalise the contribution of these experiences, cases seen during an EPT

will soon be recorded in detail in the internship booklet and certified by the internship supervisor. This will enable each student to maintain a complete inventory of the cases he or she observes in order to track the exposure of the student to different activities. This information will also be utilised by CompetVet to better evaluate the skills acquired during the internship (on all species). In addition, contracts with private veterinary practices are currently being studied through cooperation with SNVEL.

- To improve the recruitment of corpses for necropsy, a new procedure is being implemented to manage the treatment of dead animals at the VTH (e.g. financial compensation, prior agreement). Through this, owners are made aware of the pedagogical importance and financial compensation for the necropsy before the animal's death.
- Agreements have been signed with the local SPA and a local shelter to increase the number of consultations and procedures (e.g. sterilisations) and necropsies (when deaths occur in kennels and catteries). For ruminants and pigs, an additional cattle crush was acquired and a technician was recruited to increase the number of cadavers collected from farms in the district, in partnership with the GDS 69. For exotic animals, an autopsy room dedicated to wildlife is being created as part of the development of the Veterinary-Agronomic Expertise group on Wildlife (EVAAS) expertise centre. An opportunity to collaborate with the St. Forgeux wildlife care centre located 30 km from the Establishment, through which students would be involved in their activities, is currently being considered. Finally, to improve the efficiency of the VTH, a private consulting firm has been engaged to propose new strategies of communication for increasing the number of customers and thus clinical cases.

**12. ESEVT Rubrics** (summary of the decision on the compliance of the Establishment for each ESEVT Substandard, i.e. (total or substantial) compliance (C), partial compliance (PC) (Minor Deficiency) or non-compliance (NC) (Major Deficiency))

<b>Standard 1: Objectives, Organisation and QA Policy</b>	<b>C</b>	<b>PC</b>	<b>NC</b>
1.1 The Establishment must have as its main objective the provision, in agreement with the EU Directives and ESG recommendations, of adequate, ethical, research-based, evidence-based veterinary training that enables the new graduate to perform as a veterinarian capable of entering all commonly recognised branches of the veterinary profession and to be aware of the importance of lifelong learning. The Establishment must develop and follow its mission statement which must embrace all the ESEVT standards.	X		
1.2 The Establishment must be part of a university or a higher education institution providing training recognised as being of an equivalent level and formally recognised as such in the respective country. The person responsible for the veterinary curriculum and the person(s) responsible for the professional, ethical, and academic affairs of the Veterinary Teaching Hospital (VTH) must hold a veterinary degree. The decision-making process of the Establishment must allow implementation of its strategic plan and of a cohesive study programme, in compliance with the ESEVT standards.	X		
1.3 The Establishment must have a strategic plan, which includes a SWOT analysis of its current activities, a list of objectives, and an operating plan with a timeframe and indicators for its implementation.	X		
1.4 The Establishment must have a policy and associated written procedures for the assurance of the quality and standards of its programmes and awards. It must also commit itself explicitly to the development of a culture which recognises the importance of quality, and quality assurance, within their Establishment. To achieve this, the Establishment must develop and implement a strategy for the continuous enhancement of quality. The development and implementation of the Establishment's strategy must include a role for students and other stakeholders, both internal and external, and the strategy must have a formal status and be publicly available.	X		
1.5 The Establishment must provide evidence that it interacts with its stakeholders and the wider society. Such public information must be clear, objective and readily accessible; the information must include up-to-date information about the study programme, views and employment destinations of past students as well as the profile of the current student population. The Establishment's website must mention the ESEVT Establishment's status and its last Self Evaluation Report and Visitation Report must be easily available for the public.	X		
1.6 The Establishment must monitor and periodically review its activities, both quantitative and qualitative, to ensure that they achieve the objectives set for them and respond to the needs of students and society. The Establishment must make public how this analysis of information has been utilised in the further development of its activities and provide evidence as to the involvement of both students and staff in the provision, analysis and implementation of such data. Any action planned or taken as a result of this data analysis must be communicated to all those concerned.	X		
1.7 The Establishment must undergo external review through the ESEVT on a cyclical basis. Evidence must be provided of such external evaluation with the assurance that the progress made since the last ESEVT evaluation was linked to a continuous quality assurance process.	X		
<b>Standard 2: Finances</b>			
2.1 Finances must be demonstrably adequate to sustain the requirements for the Establishment to meet its mission and to achieve its objectives for education, research and services. The description must include both expenditures (separated into personnel costs, operating costs, maintenance costs and equipment) and revenues (separated into public funding, tuition fees, services, research grants and other sources).	X		
2.2 Clinical and field services must function as instructional resources. Instructional integrity of these resources must take priority over financial self-sufficiency of clinical services operations. The Establishment must have sufficient autonomy in order to use the resources to implement its strategic plan and to meet the ESEVT Standards.	X		
2.3 Resources allocation must be regularly reviewed to ensure that available resources meet the requirements.	X		
<b>Standard 3: Curriculum</b>			
3.1 The curriculum must be designed, resourced and managed to ensure all graduates have achieved the graduate attributes expected to be fully compliant with the EU Directive 2005/36/EC (as amended by directive 2013/55/EU) and its Annex V.4.1. The curriculum must include the subjects (input) and must allow the acquisition of the Day One Competences (output) listed in Annex 2. This concerns Basic Sciences, Clinical Sciences in companion animals (including equine and exotic pets), Clinical Sciences in food-producing animals (including Animal Production and Herd Health Management), Food Safety and Quality, and Professional Knowledge.	X		
3.1.1. General findings			
3.1.2. Basic sciences	X		
3.1.3. Clinical Sciences in companion animals (including equine and exotic pets)	X		
3.1.4. Clinical Sciences in food-producing animals (including Animal Production and Herd Health Management)	X		

3.1.5. Food Safety and Quality	X		
3.1.6. Professional Knowledge	X		
3.2 Each study programme provided by the Establishment must be competency-based and designed so that it meets the objectives set for it, including the intended learning outcomes. The qualification resulting from a programme must be clearly specified and communicated and must refer to the correct level of the national qualifications framework for higher education and, consequently, to the Framework for Qualifications of the European Higher Education Area. The Establishment must provide proof of a QA system that promotes and monitors the presence of an academic environment highly conducive to learning including self-learning. Details of the type, provision and updating of appropriate learning opportunities for the students must be clearly described, as well as the involvement of students. The Establishment must also describe how it encourages and prepares students for self-learning and lifelong learning.	X		
3.3 Programme learning outcomes must: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>ensure the effective alignment of all content, teaching, learning and assessment activities of the degree programme to form a cohesive framework</li> <li>include a description of Day One Competences</li> <li>form the basis for explicit statements of the objectives and learning outcomes of individual units of study</li> <li>be communicated to staff and students</li> <li>be regularly reviewed, managed and updated to ensure they remain relevant, adequate and are effectively achieved.</li> </ul>	X		
3.4 The Establishment must have a formally constituted committee structure (which includes effective student representation), with clear and empowered reporting lines, to oversee and manage the curriculum and its delivery. The committee(s) must: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>determine the pedagogical basis, design, delivery methods and assessment methods of the curriculum</li> <li>oversee QA of the curriculum, particularly gathering, evaluating, making change and responding to feedback from stakeholders, peer reviewers and external assessors, and data from examination/assessment outcomes</li> <li>perform ongoing and periodic review of the curriculum at least every seven years by involving staff, students and stakeholders; these reviews must lead to continuous improvement. Any action taken or planned as a result of such a review must be communicated to all those concerned</li> <li>identify and meet training needs for all types of staff, maintaining and enhancing their competence for the ongoing curriculum development.</li> </ul>	X		
3.5 External Practical Training (EPT) is compulsory training activities organised outside the Establishment, the student being under the direct supervision of a non-academic person (e.g. a practitioner). EPT cannot replace the core intramural training nor the extramural training under the close supervision of academic staff (e.g. ambulatory clinics, herd health management, practical training in FSQ and VPH). Since the veterinary degree is a professional qualification with Day One Competences, EPT must complement and strengthen the academic education inter alia by enhancing student's professional knowledge.	X		
3.6 The EPT providers must have an agreement with the Establishment and the student (in order to state their respective rights and duties, including insurance matters), provide a standardised evaluation of the performance of the student during their EPT and be allowed to provide feedback to the Establishment on the EPT programme. There must be a member of the academic staff responsible for the overall supervision of the EPT, including liaison with EPT providers.	X		
3.7 Students must take responsibility for their own learning during EPT. This includes preparing properly before each placement, keeping a proper record of their experience during EPT by using a logbook provided by the Establishment and evaluating the EPT. Students must be allowed to complain officially and/or anonymously about issues occurring during EPT. The Establishment must have a system of QA to monitor the implementation, progress and then feedback within the EPT activities.	X		
<b>Standard 4: Facilities and equipment</b>			
4.1 All aspects of the physical facilities must provide an environment conducive to learning, including internet access. The veterinary Establishment must have a clear strategy and programme for maintaining and upgrading its buildings and equipment. Facilities must comply with all relevant legislation including health, safety, biosecurity, accessibility to people with reduced mobility, and EU animal welfare and care standards.	X		
4.2 Lecture theatres, teaching laboratories, tutorial rooms, clinical facilities and other teaching spaces must be adequate in number, size and equipped for the instructional purposes and must be well maintained. The facilities must be adapted for the number of students enrolled. Students must have ready access to adequate and sufficient study, self-learning, recreation, locker, sanitary and food service facilities. Offices, teaching preparation and research laboratories must be sufficient for the needs of the academic and support staff.	X		
4.3 The livestock facilities, animal housing, core clinical teaching facilities and equipment used by the Establishment for teaching purposes must: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>be sufficient in capacity and adapted for the number of students enrolled in order to allow safe hands-on training for all students</li> </ul>	X		

**FINAL REPORT AS ISSUED BY ECOVE ON 29 SEPTEMBER 2021**

<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• be of a high standard, well maintained and fit for the purpose</li> <li>• promote best husbandry, welfare and management practices</li> <li>• ensure relevant biosecurity and bio-containment</li> <li>• be designed to enhance learning.</li> </ul>			
<p>4.4 Core clinical teaching facilities must be provided in a veterinary teaching hospital (VTH) with 24/7 emergency services at least for companion animals and equines. Within the VTH, the Establishment must unequivocally demonstrate that standard of education and clinical research are compliant with all ESEVT Standards, e.g. research-based and evidence-based clinical training supervised by academic staff trained to teach and to assess, availability for staff and students of facilities and patients for performing clinical research and relevant QA procedures.</p> <p>For ruminants, on-call service must be available if emergency services do not exist for those species in a VTH.</p> <p>The Establishment must ensure state-of-the-art standards of teaching clinics which remain comparable with or exceeding the best available in the private sector.</p> <p>The VTH and any hospitals, practices and facilities (including EPT) which are involved with the curriculum must meet the relevant national Practice Standards.</p>	X		
<p>4.5 The Establishment must ensure that students have access to a broad range of diagnostic and therapeutic facilities, including but not limited to: diagnostic imaging, anaesthesia, clinical pathology, intensive/critical care, surgeries and treatment facilities, ambulatory services, pharmacy and necropsy facilities.</p>	X		
<p>4.6 Appropriate isolation facilities must be provided to meet the need for the isolation and containment of animals with communicable diseases. Such isolation facilities must be properly constructed, ventilated, maintained and operated to provide for animal care and for prevention of spread of infectious agents. They must be adapted to all animal species commonly handled in the VTH.</p>	X		
<p>4.7 The Establishment must have an ambulatory clinic for production animals or equivalent facilities so that students can practise field veterinary medicine and Herd Health Management under academic supervision.</p>	X		
<p>4.8 The transport of students, live animals, cadavers, materials from animal origin and other teaching materials must be done in agreement with national and EU standards, to ensure the safety of students and staff and to prevent the spread of infectious agents.</p>	X		
<p>4.9 Operational policies and procedures (including e.g. biosecurity, good laboratory practice and good clinical practice) must be taught and posted for students, staff and visitors and a Biosafety manual must be available. The Establishment must demonstrate a clear commitment for the delivery of biosafety and biosecurity, e.g. by a specific committee structure. The Establishment must have a system of QA to monitor and assure clinical, laboratory and farm services, including a regular monitoring of the feedback from students, staff and clients.</p>	X		
<b>Standard 5: Animal resources and teaching material of animal origin</b>			
<p>5.1 The number and variety of healthy and diseased animals, cadavers, and material of animal origin must be adequate for providing the practical and safe hands-on training (in the areas of Basic Sciences, Clinical Sciences, Pathology, Animal Production, Food Safety and Quality) and adapted to the number of students enrolled.</p> <p>Evidence must be provided that these data are regularly recorded and that procedures are in place for correcting any deficiencies.</p>		X	
<p>5.2 In addition to the training provided in the Establishment, experience can include practical training at external sites, provided this training is organised under direct academic supervision and following the same standards as those applied in the Establishment.</p>	X		
<p>5.3 The VTH must provide nursing care skills and instruction in nursing procedures. Under all situations students must be active participants in the clinical workup of patients, including problem-oriented diagnostic approach together with diagnostic decision-making.</p>	X		
<p>5.4 Medical records must be comprehensive and maintained in an effective retrieval system (preferably an electronic patient record system) to efficiently support the teaching, research, and service programmes of the Establishment.</p>	X		
<b>Standard 6: Learning resources</b>			
<p>6.1 State-of-the-art learning resources must be adequate and available to support veterinary education, research, services and continuing education. When the study programme is provided in several tracks/languages, the learning resources must be available in all used languages. Timely access to learning resources, whether through print, electronic media or other means, must be available to students and staff and, when appropriate, to stakeholders. State-of-the-art procedures for bibliographical search and for access to databases and learning resources must be taught to undergraduate students.</p>	X		
<p>6.2 Staff and students must have full access on site to an academic library administered by a qualified librarian, an Information Technology (IT) unit managed by an IT expert, an e-learning platform, and all the relevant human and physical resources necessary for the development of instructional materials by the staff and their use by the students.</p> <p>The relevant electronic information, database and other intranet resources must be easily available for students and staff both in the Establishment's core facilities via wireless connection (Wi-Fi) and from outside the Establishment through a hosted secured connection, e.g. Virtual Private Network (VPN).</p>	X		
<p>6.3 The Establishment must provide students with unimpeded access to learning resources, internet and internal study resources, and equipment for the development of procedural skills (e.g. models). The use of these resources must be aligned with the pedagogical environment and learning outcomes within the programme and have mechanisms in place to evaluate the teaching value of changes in learning resources.</p>	X		
<b>Standard 7: Student admission, progression and welfare</b>			

**FINAL REPORT AS ISSUED BY ECOVE ON 29 SEPTEMBER 2021**

7.1 The Establishment must consistently apply pre-defined and published regulations covering all phases of the student “life cycle”, e.g. student admission, progression and certification. In relation to enrolment, the Establishment must provide accurate and complete information regarding all aspects of the educational programme in all advertisements for prospective national and international students. Formal cooperations with other Establishments must also be clearly advertised.	X		
7.2 The number of students admitted must be consistent with the resources available at the Establishment for staff, buildings, equipment, healthy and diseased animals, and materials of animal origin.	X		
7.3 The selection and progression criteria must be clearly defined, consistent, and defensible, be free of discrimination or bias, and take into account the fact that students are admitted with a view to their entry to the veterinary profession in due course. The Establishment must regularly review and reflect on the selection processes to ensure they are appropriate for students to complete the programme successfully. If the selection processes are decided by another authority, the latter must regularly receive feedback from the Establishment. Adequate training (including periodic refresher training) must be provided for those involved in the selection process to ensure applicants are evaluated fairly and consistently.	X		
7.4 There must be clear policies and procedures on how applicants with disabilities or illnesses are considered and, if appropriate, accommodated in the programme, taking into account the requirement that all students must be capable of meeting the ESEVT Day One Competences by the time they graduate.	X		
7.5 The basis for decisions on progression (including academic progression and professional fitness to practise) must be explicit and readily available to the students. The Establishment must provide evidence that it has mechanisms in place to identify and provide remediation and appropriate support (including termination) for students who are not performing adequately. The Establishment must have mechanisms in place to monitor attrition and progression and be able to respond and amend admission selection criteria (if permitted by national or university law) and student support if required.	X		
7.6 Mechanisms for the exclusion of students from the programme for any reason must be explicit. The Establishment’s policies for managing appeals against decisions, including admissions, academic and progression decisions and exclusion, must be transparent and publicly available.	X		
7.7 Provisions must be made by the Establishment to support the physical, emotional and welfare needs of students. This includes, but is not limited to, learning support and counselling services, career advice, and fair and transparent mechanisms for dealing with student illness, impairment and disability during the programme. This shall include provision of reasonable adjustments for disabled students, consistent with all relevant equality and/or human rights legislation. There must be effective mechanisms for resolution of student grievances (e.g. interpersonal conflict or harassment).	X		
7.8 Mechanisms must be in place by which students can convey their needs and wants to the Establishment. The Establishment must provide students with a mechanism, anonymously if they wish, to offer suggestions, comments and complaints regarding compliance of the Establishment with national and international legislation and the ESEVT standards.		X	
<b>Standard 8: Student assessment</b>			
8.1 The Establishment must ensure that there is a clearly identified structure within the Establishment showing lines of responsibility for the assessment strategy to ensure coherence of the overall assessment regime and to allow the demonstration of progressive development across the programme towards entry-level competence.	X		
8.2 The assessment tasks and grading criteria for each unit of study in the programme must be published, applied consistently, clearly identified and available to students in a timely manner well in advance of the assessment. Requirements to pass must be explicit. The Establishment must properly document the results of assessment and provide the students with timely feedback on their assessments. Mechanisms for students to appeal against assessment outcomes must be explicit.	X		
8.3 The Establishment must have a process in place to review assessment outcomes, to change assessment strategies and to ensure the accuracy of the procedures when required. Programme learning outcomes covering the full range of professional knowledge, skills, competences and attributes must form the basis for assessment design and underpin decisions on progression.	X		
8.4 Assessment strategies must allow the Establishment to certify student achievement of learning objectives at the level of the programme and individual units of study. The Establishment must ensure that the programmes are delivered in a way that encourages students to take an active role in creating the learning process, and that the assessment of students reflects this approach.	X		
8.5 Methods of formative and summative assessment must be valid and reliable and comprise a variety of approaches. Direct assessment of clinical skills and Day One Competences (some of which may be on simulated patients), must form a significant component of the overall process of assessment. It must also include the quality control of the student logbooks in order to ensure that all clinical procedures, practical and hands-on training planned in the study programme have been fully completed by each individual student.		X	
<b>Standard 9: Academic and support staff</b>			
9.1 The Establishment must ensure that all staff are appropriately qualified and prepared for their roles, in agreement with national and EU regulations and must apply fair and transparent processes for the recruitment and development of staff. A formal training (including good teaching and evaluation practices, learning and e-learning resources, biosecurity and QA procedures) must be in place for all staff involved with teaching.	X		

**FINAL REPORT AS ISSUED BY ECOVE ON 29 SEPTEMBER 2021**

Most academic staff (calculated as FTE) involved in veterinary training must be veterinarians. It is expected that more than 2/3 of the instruction that the students receive, as determined by student teaching hours, is delivered by qualified veterinarians.			
9.2 The total number, qualifications and skills of all staff involved with the programme, including teaching staff, 'adjunct' staff, technical, administrative and support staff, must be sufficient and appropriate to deliver the educational programme and fulfil the Establishment's mission. A procedure must be in place to assess if they display competence and effective teaching skills in all relevant aspects of the curriculum that they teach, regardless of whether they are full or part time, residents, interns or other postgraduate students, adjuncts or off-campus contracted teachers.	X		
9.3 Staff must be given opportunities to develop and extend their teaching and assessment knowledge and must be encouraged to improve their skills. Opportunities for didactic and pedagogic training and specialisation must be available. The Establishment must clearly define systems of reward for teaching excellence in operation. Academic positions must offer the security and benefits necessary to maintain stability, continuity, and competence of the academic staff. Academic staff must have a balanced workload of teaching, research and service depending on their role. They must have reasonable opportunities and resources for participation in scholarly activities.	X		
9.4 The Establishment must provide evidence that it utilises a well-defined, comprehensive and publicised programme for the professional growth and development of academic and support staff, including formal appraisal and informal mentoring procedures. Staff must have the opportunity to contribute to the Establishment's direction and decision-making processes. Promotion criteria for academic and support staff must be clear and explicit. Promotions for teaching staff must recognise excellence in, and (if permitted by the national or university law) place equal emphasis on all aspects of teaching (including clinical teaching), research, service and other scholarly activities.	X		
9.5 A system for assessment of teaching staff must be in operation and must include student participation. Results must be available to those undertaking external reviews and commented upon in reports.		X	
<b>Standard 10: Research programmes, continuing and postgraduate education</b>			
10.1 The Establishment must demonstrate significant and broad research activities of staff that integrate with and strengthen the veterinary degree programme through research-based teaching.	X		
10.2 All students must be trained in scientific method and research techniques relevant to evidence-based veterinary medicine and must have opportunities to participate in research programmes.		X	
10.3 The Establishment must provide advanced postgraduate degree programmes, e.g. PhD, internships, residencies and continuing education programmes that complement and strengthen the veterinary degree programme and are relevant to the needs of the profession and society.	X		
10.4 The Establishment must have a system of QA to evaluate how research activities provide opportunities for student training and staff promotion, and how research approaches, methods and results are integrated into the veterinary teaching programmes.		X	
<i>C: (total or substantial) compliance; PC: partial compliance (Minor Deficiency); NC: non-compliance (Major Deficiency)</i>			

## **Executive Summary**

### **Brief history of the Establishment and its previous EAEVE Visitations**

It will be difficult to give a “brief history” of the National Veterinary School of Lyon, as after being founded in 1791 (as the first veterinary school in the world) there have been about 260 years of history to consider!

In 2010, the National Veterinary School of Lyon merged with the National School of Veterinary Services (ENSV) and the National School for Agricultural Engineering of Clermont-Ferrand (ENITAC) to create VetAgro Sup.

VetAgro Sup is unusual among the Veterinary Teaching Establishments in that this merger has linked the education of veterinarians, agronomists, and veterinary public health officers. As a result, the Establishment offers three curricula (veterinary medicine, agricultural science, and veterinary public health).

In 2015, the Establishment was evaluated by the ESEVT and ECOVE granted an “Approval” status, valid until 2025. However, in 2018 and led by the Dean, the Establishment decided to be proactive and to apply for full accreditation under the ESEVT SOP as established in Zagreb in 2019.

### **Brief comment on the SER**

Although the SER was very well written and very comprehensive, the Team identified several gaps in the data provided. As a result, there was an unusually large number of questions sent to the Establishments prior to the Visitation. Despite this very large number of questions, the requested data was provided before the visit. Additional information was provided on site.

### **Brief comment on the Visitation**

The Visitation was well prepared, well organised and carried out in a cordial and professional atmosphere. The Liaison Officer was easily and efficiently available when requested, either in person or by email. The programme of the Visitation was easily adapted when requested by the Visitation Team, who had full access to the information, facilities and individuals they asked for. Due to the COVID-19 pandemic situation, it proved necessary to run a split Team, with three of the experts working from home and five on site. The Team used Microsoft Teams to coordinate the Visitation. The Establishment had gone to a lot of trouble to provide a “roving video” during the Visitation, especially during the Tuesday “walkabout” and the visits conducted off site. Despite this useful input, the Team was unanimous in that such a split Team, although working to a sufficient level, does not replace a complete Team on a Visitation.

### **Areas worthy of praise (i.e. Commendations), e.g.:**

- The Establishment has a modern, ambitious, clear and well-constructed strategic plan based on a SWOT analyses.
- Student clubs contributing to the mental health of students, the creation of soft and hard skills and animal handling.
- The skills lab, which although relatively new, is already making so much impact.
- The preparation of the students for the clinical rotations, internally and externally.

## **FINAL REPORT AS ISSUED BY ECOVE ON 29 SEPTEMBER 2021**

- The development of the Competency matrix project in defining and recording Day One Competences.
- Excellent working atmosphere in small animal clinic with students heavily involved in all medical and surgical procedures.
- A highly integrated and effective Pharmacy.
- Student involvement within the Intensive Care Unit.
- An outstanding number of fully Boarded Clinical Teachers employed within the Establishment.
- The Preventive Medicine unit within the small animal clinic provides an excellent opportunity for undergraduate students to learn how to undertake physical examination, acquiring self-confidence in communication with the clients, vaccination techniques etc.

### **Areas of concern (i.e. Minor Deficiencies):**

- partial compliance with Substandard 5.1 because of a need to increase the necropsies of rabbits, rodents, birds, exotics and pigs;
- partial compliance with Substandard 7.8 and Substandard 9.5 due to a need for an increase in the students' analysis of both teaching and teaching staff;
- partial compliance with Substandard 8.5 due to the need, from a quality control point of view, to fully record the clinical skills of students;
- partial compliance with Substandard 10.2 and Substandard 10.4 due to the need to increase the participation of undergraduates in research projects and to increase the awareness of research careers.

### **Items of non-compliance with the ESEVT Standards (i.e. Major Deficiencies):**

None.

## **Glossary**

AAE: Association of Alumni and Friends of the Veterinary School of Lyon and VetAgro Sup  
AAALAC: Association for Assessment and Accreditation of Laboratory Animal Care International  
CA: Conseil d'Administration / Board of Directors  
CE: Conseil des Enseignants / Council of Teachers  
CEAV: Certificate of Advanced Studies  
CEVE: Conseil de l'Enseignement et de la Vie Etudiante / Council for Teaching and Student Life  
CHSCT: Comité d'Hygiène, de Sécurité et des Conditions de Travail / Committee on Health, Safety, and Working Conditions  
CNITV: Centre National d'Informations Toxicologiques Vétérinaire / National Centre for Veterinary Toxicological Information  
COP: Contrat d'Objectifs et de Performance / Performance Contract  
CPER: Contrat Plan Etat Région / State-Region Contract Plan  
CPVL: CPVL: Centre de Pharmacovigilance Vétérinaire de Lyon / Veterinary Pharmacovigilance Centre of Lyon  
CROUS: Regional Centre for School and University Life  
CUSI: Centre d'Urgences et de Soins Intensifs / Emergency and Intensive Care Centre (for equine species)  
DDPP: Direction Départementale pour la Protection des Populations / Departmental Directorate for the Protection of Populations  
DEFV: Diplôme d'Etudes Fondamentales Vétérinaires / Diploma of Fundamental Veterinary Studies  
DESV: Diplôme d'Etudes Spécialisées Vétérinaires / Diploma of Specialised Veterinary Studies  
DEVE: Direction de l'Enseignement et de la Vie Etudiante / Department of Education and Student Life (Student Affairs)  
DGER: Direction Générale de l'Enseignement et de la Recherche / General Directorate for Education and Research  
EAEVE: European Association of Establishments for Veterinary Education  
EBVS: European Board of Veterinary Specialisation  
ECOVE: European Committee of Veterinary Education  
EPT: External Practical Training  
ESEVT: European System of Evaluation of Veterinary Training  
ESG: Standards and Guidelines for Quality Assurance in the European Higher Education Area  
EVAAS: Expertise Vétérinaire et Agronomique Animaux Sauvages / Veterinary-Agronomic Expertise group on Wildlife  
FSQ: Food Safety and Quality  
FTE: Full-Time Equivalent  
HCERES: Haut Conseil de l'Evaluation de la Recherche et de l'Enseignement Supérieur / High Council for the Evaluation of Research and Higher Education  
IT: Information Technology  
INFOMA: name of the National Training Centre for MAA officials  
JTAB: Joint Teaching Assessment Board

## **FINAL REPORT AS ISSUED BY ECOVE ON 29 SEPTEMBER 2021**

MAA: Ministère de l'Agriculture et de l'Alimentation / Ministry of Agriculture and Food

MESRI: Ministère de l'Enseignement Supérieur et de la Recherche et de l'Innovation / Ministry of Higher Education, Research, and Innovation

PDCA: Plan Do Check Act

QA: Quality Assurance

SCAV: Service des Concours Agronomiques et Vétérinaires / Department of Agronomic and Veterinary Exams

SER: Self Evaluation Report

SIAMU: Soins Intensifs, Anesthésiologie et Médecine d'Urgence / Emergency and Intensive Care Unit (for companion animals)

SNVEL: Syndicat National des Vétérinaires d'Exercice Libéral / National Syndicate of Veterinary Practitioners

SOP: Standard Operating Procedure

UCRA: Unité Clinique Rurale de l'Arbresle / Rural Clinic Unit of L'Arbresle

VPH: Veterinary Public Health

VTH: Veterinary Teaching Hospital

## **Decision of ECOVE**

The Committee concluded that no Major Deficiencies had been identified.

The Veterinary Education Establishment (VEE) of VetAgro Sup, Lyon is therefore classified as holding the status of: **ACCREDITATION**.