

**European Association
of Establishments for Veterinary Education**



VISITATION REPORT

Faculty of Veterinary Medicine, University of Erciyes

Kayseri, Turkey

On 16-21 September 2018

By the Visitation Team:

HUEY, Robert (CHAIRPERSON) Belfast, Northern Ireland: Visitor in Food Safety and Quality

PUSTA Dana, Cluj-Napoca, Romania: Visitor in Basic Sciences

WAPENAAR Wendela, The Netherlands (resident of: Nottingham, UK): Visitor in Clinical Sciences in Food-Producing Animals

CORBERA, Juan Alberto Las Palmas, Spain: Visitor in Clinical Sciences in Companion Animals

SACCHI, Paola Torino, Italy: Visitor in Quality Assurance

WADSWORTH, David Thornton-Cleveleys, UK: Practitioner

DREWS, Mark Copenhagen, Denmark: Student

DUFFUS Philip, Bristol, UK: ESEVT Coordinator

Contents of the Visitation Report

Introduction

1. Objectives and Organisation

2. Finances

3. Curriculum

4. Facilities and equipment

5. Animal resources and teaching material of animal origin

6. Learning resources

7. Student admission, progression and welfare

8. Student assessment

9. Academic and support staff

10. Research programmes, continuing and postgraduate education

11. Outcome Assessment and Quality Assurance

12. ESEVT Indicators

13. ESEVT Rubrics

Executive Summary

Glossary

Decision of ECOVE

Introduction

Brief history of the Establishment and of its previous ESEVT Visitations (*if any*)

Erciyes University (hereinafter referred to as the ‘Establishment’) is a State University established in 1978. The Faculty of Veterinary Medicine of Erciyes University (FVMEU) is a young veterinary teaching Establishment which only started in 1995 at facilities within the main town. In 2012 the Establishment was moved to a new building housing classrooms, offices and some laboratories. The construction of another set of 3 buildings was initiated shortly after. Clinical activities started in March of 2012 in a rather pioneering way.

The relatively rapid expansion of FVMEU has resulted in a current total of 82 academic staff. Over the last 18 years the FVMEU has graduated 788 clinically qualified veterinarians, 204 master and 35 PhD degrees. Currently, there are 392 students enrolled in the 5-year veterinary curriculum along with 299 master and 73 PhD students.

The main purpose of the FVMEU in requesting an EAEVE visit in 2012 was to have some guidance in completing and structuring its premises and curriculum in the most logical and efficient way. After this Visitation in November 2012, a decision of “Non-Approval” was given by ECOVE. This decision followed the identification of 10 major deficiencies:

1. Insufficient access to clinical cases for all students in large animals;
2. Insufficient access to clinical cases for all students in companion animals;
3. Incompleteness of or inadequate accessibility and maintenance of clinic and pathological records;
4. Lack of a functional mobile clinic for farm animals or lack of specific contractual arrangements to compensate;
5. Lack of adequate instrumentation to enable up-to-date-training in diagnostic and treatment;
6. Inadequate teaching and hands-on work in meat hygiene and meat inspection in slaughter house;
7. Lack of adequate facilities to perform necropsies;
8. Lack of a 24-hour emergency service, 7 days per week, at least in clinics for companion animals;
9. Lack of hospitalization facilities for small companion animals, equines and farm animals;
10. Lack of isolation facilities for animals being handled in the Establishment for small and large animals.

In addition to these major deficiencies, a number of further potential problems were identified:

1. In some departments there is a biohazard risk for students as chemicals and hazardous materials were not properly stored in safety cabinets, and eye washes are not present in all laboratories where hazardous material is used
2. The necropsy room was perceived as a potential source of problems due to its hygienic conditions
3. The above issues were felt to constitute a significant biohazard risk which, unless fully resolved, could indicate a potential category 1 deficiency
4. The experimental animal unit must be improved with regard to standards of animal welfare and hygiene. Until this unit is improved, there is also an indication of a potential category 1 deficiency

FINAL REPORT AS ISSUED BY ECOVE ON 22 NOVEMBER 2018

5. The Veterinary Teaching Hospital was a source of real concern for the Team due its lack of organization, fragmentation of services, the use of a discipline-orientated rather than species orientated system, the lack of an emergency clinic as well as of a mobile clinic and isolation facilities. The ESEVT team felt the Hospital should be fully reorganized by establishing a) common services, b) species-oriented clinical activities, c) isolation facilities, d) an emergency service for large and small animals within the hospital building, e) a fully active mobile clinic, and f) a Hospital Director with appropriate power and responsibilities. Without such improvements there might well be an indication of a potential category 1 deficiency
6. Although particularly crucial for the Veterinary Teaching hospital, the number of support staff should be increased for the whole vet school. Unless resolved, this issue could again constitute a potential category 1 deficiency.

Since receiving this relatively long list of critical observations from EAEVE, FMVEU has embarked on a series of improvements with the aim of rectifying as many of the criticisms as possible. Details of these efforts are discussed within the 11 chapter headings.

This Visitation Report is written in agreement with the ESEVT SOP 2016.

1. Objectives and Organisation (see Standards 1.1 to 1.6)

1.1. Findings

1.1.1. Brief description of the Strategic Plan

The Strategic Plan for FMVEU is published on-line and is designed to emphasise the need to provide a more effective and efficient service for the community. In order to deliver this plan FMVEU has a number of priorities:

- To review and change the curriculum in favour of more practical training
- To be accredited by EAEVE in accordance with ESEVT SOP 2016 by 2021
- To increase the number and specialisation of academic and support staff
- To develop collaborations with national and international veterinary teaching Establishments
- To improve the teaching and research facilities, including clinical facilities
- To activate and fully engage with a QA system for all services of FMVEU.

The Swot Analysis is outlined within the SER and is an extensive and self-critical summary of the situation at FMVEU

1.1.2. Brief description of the Operating Plan

- Although the SER has a Table setting out the strategies and objectives, there is very little information on “indicators of achievement”
- The Operating Plan is set out in three areas: Teaching Quality, Research Quality and the Quality of both academic staff and students

1.1.3. Brief description of the organisation of the Establishment

- The key overseeing body within FMVEU is the **Faculty Board**; chaired by the dean, it is the body for strategic decisions and coordination of academic affairs, educational plans and scientific research. Meeting four times a year, the Board consists of 12 members with heads of all divisions, 3 representatives of professors, 2 representatives of associate professors, 1 representative of assistant professors and 1 representative of students
- **The Dean** is appointed by the High Education Council (YOK) from three professors put forward by the rectorate.
- **The Board of Directors** is a body that assists the dean in administrative activities implementing the principles identified by the Faculty Board decisions and consists of 13 members; dean, 5 head of departments, 3 representatives of professors, 2 representatives of associate professors, 1 representative of assistant professors and 1 representative student.
- There are five academic divisions acting as the operative units in charge of teaching and research activities. The Heads of these divisions are elected among and by the heads of the departments for three years. Under the five divisions there are approximately 22 Departments
- Finally, there are almost thirty committees/commissions
- Students are also included in a number of these committees within FMVEU and incidentally also within the University senate.

1.1.4. Brief description of the process and the implication of staff, students and stakeholders in the development, implementation, assessment and revision of the Strategic Plan and organisation of the Establishment

FINAL REPORT AS ISSUED BY ECOVE ON 22 NOVEMBER 2018

- The strategic plan of FVMEU was prepared by the Dean, the administrative staff and a strategic plan committee. The draft was then submitted to students, staff and other stakeholders for suggested revisions and/or additions. When completed, it is published on the FVMEU website.

1.2. Comments

- Probably the outstanding issue facing VMEU is the need for a radical review of the curriculum when considering international standards. The Establishment believes that this issue is also shared by many of the other veterinary teaching Establishments in Turkey
- As a result, FVMEU plans to organize a series of meetings with deans and academic staff of other veterinary Establishments in Turkey, to discuss and clarify how to implement Day One Competencies (DOC) and harmonize their curricula in favour of increased practical training linked to reductions in didactic teaching.

1.3. Suggestions for improvement

None

1.4. Decision

The Establishment is compliant with Standard 1 Objectives and Organisation.

2. Finances (see Standards 2.1 to 2.5)

2.1. Findings

2.1.1. Brief description of the global financial process of the Establishment and its autonomy

- As the Establishment is a fully state-owned university it is financed by the Turkish Government. There is a standard system for budget proposals and budget allocation which is explained in the SER
- The budget allocated to the university is then further allocated to the constituent faculties according to the needs and demands by the expenditure units. The Financial Audit of expenditure in FVMEU is undertaken by carried out by the Faculty Secretary, Dean together with the Establishment Strategy Development Department
- FVMEU's annual budget consists of:
 1. Grants allocated directly by the Rectorate
 2. Research funds provided by the Establishment Scientific Projects Support Unit (BAP)
 3. Revolving fund service fees derived from the activities of FVMEU (hospital and other diagnostic unit revenues)
- Academic and support staff salaries and social insurance contribution, including the costs of internet, heating, water and electricity are covered by the Rectorate
- Travel payments, consumables, equipment purchases and maintenance and building maintenance are covered by FVMEU's annual budgets
- After the budget is transferred to the Establishment from the Ministry of Finance and then allocated to the faculties, priorities for expenditure are decided by the Dean of the Faculty. Therefore, FVMEU administration has sufficient autonomy for the use of the budget.

2.1.2. Brief description of the budget (expenditures, revenues, balance) of the last 3 years

- This data is clearly set out within the SER in Tables 2.1.1, 2.1.2 and 2.1.3

2.1.3. Brief description of the projected budget (expenditures, revenues, balance) of the next 3 years

- The financial income stream for FVMEU is expected to increase over the next 3 years, due to a number of factors. Firstly, the increasing revenue derived from both the of VTH and emergency clinical services
- Secondly, the state budget is expected to increase by approximately 10% each year
- Finally, in 2018 the Establishment was selected as one of the ten top research universities in Turkey. Therefore, the budget of the Establishment and FVMEU for the next years is expected to increase.

2.1.4. Brief description of the planned or on-going investments

- A number of funded projects are currently under construction or in the process of equipment installation: a calf intensive care unit, equipment and rooms for the 24/7 emergency clinic and equipment and vehicles for the ambulatory service
- In addition, a student reading room, social activity clubs and internet room were established in 2018 as well as a Conference hall built and opened in May 2018
- Funding has been set aside in the 2019 budget for an expansion of the VTH to now include newly built facilities for ruminant, equine, exotic and wild animals. Before this new building is completed further funds have been set aside for new sterilization units and hospitalization cages.

2.1.5. Brief description of the process and the implication of staff, students and stakeholders in the development, implementation, assessment and revision of the budget of the Establishment

- Each year, the Faculty administration meets with department and division heads, academic and support staff and the director of VTH to ascertain their equipment and consumables requests. After these meetings a priority list is prepared and presented to the Rectorate. The Rectorate meets with the University Senate where the annual investment and development budget of the Establishment is drawn up, discussed and approved
- After the budget is transferred to FVMEU, the Dean decides where and how to use it
- Students are not involved in this process.

2.2. Comments

None

2.3. Suggestions for improvement

None

2.4. Decision

The Establishment is compliant with Standard 2 Finances.

3. Curriculum (see Standards 3.1 to 3.10)

3.1. General curriculum

3.1.1. Findings

3.1.1.1. Brief description of the educational aims and strategy in order to propose a cohesive framework and to achieve the learning outcome

- In Turkey all universities are ruled according to major Higher Education Law no. 2547, which adopted the 2005/36/EC directives and the Establishment curriculum was renewed in accordance to 2013/55/EU
- The present curriculum was implemented in the Establishment in 2014, after the EAEVE evaluation Visitation and report in 2012 and it consists of 10 semesters of study. The 10-th semester of study is nominated as an internship, by the faculty
- There is a pyramidal structure of revising the curriculum, starting with each teacher, the head of the department, Coordination Commission of Education and Teaching, and after approval it is submitted to the Faculty Board and University Senate. The Teaching and Education Commission checks on a yearly basis the curriculum for overlap and inconsistencies
- The logbook for EPT was implemented, starting with this academic year (September 2018).

3.1.1.2. Brief statement if all EU-listed subjects are taught in the core curriculum to each student (independently of the tracking system)

- Some of EU-listed subjects, such as Professional communication in Basic Sciences; Preventive medicine in Clinical Sciences; Herd health management in Animal Production and a part of Professional Knowledge, are included in different topics of study. The faculty provided during the Visitation a list of equivalence between the EU-listed subjects and the subjects included in the curriculum of the faculty
- Basic sciences are taught during the first 4 semesters, semester 5-6 are mostly dedicated to preclinical sciences, semesters 7-9 are for clinical knowledge, skills and competences, including FSQ and semester 10 is an internship and it is dedicated to medical teaching and practice in VTH
- There is a total number of 213 hours for Basic subjects, 1,908 in Basic Sciences, 1,486 hours in Clinical Sciences, 345 in Animal Production, 280 hours in Food Safety and Quality and 34 h for Professional Knowledge
- EPT (External Practical Training) consists of a minimum of 200 hours, 20 working days, during the summer between 8th and 9th semester, supervised by a practitioner.

3.1.1.3. Brief description of how curricular overlaps, redundancies, omissions and lack of consistency, transversality and/or integration of the curriculum are identified and corrected

- The Education, Teaching and Coordination Commission propose a draft of the curriculum changes based on the requests from the teachers
- The Faculty Board and finally, the Establishment Senate approve the curriculum.

3.1.1.4. Description of the selection procedures of the Electives by the students and the degree of freedom in their choice

- A very comprehensive list of electives provided by the Establishment, consisting of a total of 90 electives, 16 hours of lectures for each. There are 35 subjects belonging to Basic Sciences and Basic Subjects; 23 subjects for Clinical Sciences, 22 in Animal Production, 2 in Food Safety and 8 in Professional Knowledge.

- Minimum number of students is 10 for each subject, otherwise they have to have their second option.
- All the electives are only theoretical, so there is no limitation regarding the maximum number of students.

3.1.1.5. Brief description of the process and the implication of staff, students and stakeholders in the development, implementation, assessment and revision of the curriculum

- The Education, Teaching and Coordination Commission is formed exclusively by teachers from the faculty. No students or stakeholders are involved in this commission.

3.1.2. Comments

- The design of the curriculum is not focused on the learning outcomes and it is not applying the student-oriented teaching and problem-based learning concepts
- The curriculum is organized on subjects of study and does not include species-oriented teaching concepts
- There was no understanding from academic staff how learning outcomes underpin and ensure the effective alignment of assessment of the degree programme. Programme learning outcomes were present in course outline but were not used for educational strategy or assessment
- The committee structure to manage the curriculum is not leading to a common approach to teaching. A more collaborative approach between departments would benefit student learning.

3.1.3. Suggestions of improvement

- The programme outcome should be designed to ensure the effective alignment of all content, teaching, learning and assessment activities to the degree programme in veterinary medicine
- The committee structures which involve curriculum design, development and evaluation must include student representatives
- The curriculum committee must determine the pedagogical basis, design, delivery methods and assessment methods of the curriculum
- Input from pedagogy experts and assessment strategy experts are required to bring together the curriculum and have a more aligned programme between different departments and courses. The education committee may have active oversight of the curriculum but there is no indication that efforts are made to align teaching, evaluation of teaching or assessment in the curriculum
- Since the veterinary degree is a professional qualification with Day One Competences, the academic education (intra-mural and extra-mural) must strengthen and enhance for the student the handling of all common domestic species of animals, the communications skills for all types of veterinary activities, the management and the economic activity of veterinary practices, animal and animal products units, the hands-on practical and clinical training and the real-life experience
- The Curriculum committee must gather and process data from examination and assessment outcomes
- The reviewing of the curriculum must also include, beside staff members, students and stakeholders.

3.2. Basic sciences

3.2.1. Findings

3.2.1.1. Brief description of the theoretical and practical education in basic sciences

- All topics belonging to Basic subjects and Basic Sciences are taught in the frame of FVMEU and they are all according to the EU-listed subjects in Directive 2013/55/EU
- Basic subjects comprise a total of 213 hours – 114 hours of lectures and 99 hours of laboratory and desk-based work and Basic Sciences form a total of 1,908 hours – 1,017 hours of lectures and 891 hours of laboratory and desk-based work
- In Basic subjects the ratio between theoretical hours (114 h) / practical education (99 h) is 1,1515 and in Basic Sciences the ratio theoretical (1,017 h) / practical education (891 h) is 1,1414. In general, in Basic Subjects and Basic Sciences the total ratio between theory, (1,131 h) and practical education (990 h) is 1,1424
- The animal material for Anatomy is represented by animal carcasses from the clinics, ERUTAM, DEKAM and municipal shelters. Equine, cow and sheep cadavers are purchased, when they are needed. The organs are provided by the slaughterhouses
- The animal material for Pathology is represented by dead animals from VTH
- The cadavers and organs are stored in freezers and refrigerators and residues are disposed of by the Kayseri Municipality Medical Waste Disposal Service.

3.2.2. Comments

- Both in Basic Subjects and Basic Sciences, there are no SSL and seminars
- During the first years of study, some of the practicals contain video demonstrations and some activities are represented by theoretical presentations and demonstrations
- The exposure of students to healthy living animals is not compulsory during the first two years of study
- In some Basic Sciences, such as anatomy, physiology, biochemistry etc, there is an extensive interval between the theoretical approaches (1st and /or 2nd year) and the practical application (10th semester, during the internship programme)
- The anatomy department has state-of-the art installations for storage, manipulation and handling of the cadavers for dissection
- Considering that in most of the accommodation belonging to preclinical sciences, there is a wide range of research laboratories, each department should use one of these research laboratories for practical work with small groups of students. As a result, this will minimise the time and distance that teachers accrue in order to bring materials to the practical lab.

3.2.3. Suggestions of improvement

None

3.3. Clinical Sciences in companion animals (including equine and exotic pets)

3.3.1. Findings

3.3.1.1. Brief description of the theoretical, practical and clinical education in Clinical Sciences in companion animals

- A list of subjects within the FVMEU curriculum was not included in the SER; however, during the Visitation a complete detailed curriculum was provided. The hours presented covers the face to face contact of the student with academic staff
- In table 3.1.1. of the SER the total clinical animal work is 638 hours (total 4,704 h); which represents 13.5 % of the total training within the curriculum. Also, 55% of the curriculum is taught by theoretical lectures
- In table 3.1.2. of the SER Supervised Self-Learning hours have not been included. There is no reference to the European Credit Transfer System (ECTS). Also, the participation of the students in the learning process have not been incorporated because the hours dedicated for seminars are “zero”
- In relation to the Directive 2013/55/EU subject, the following applied:
- *Obstetrics, reproduction and reproductive disorders* theory is taught in the subjects Obstetrics and Gynaecology I (48 hours), O&G II (48 hours) and Reproduction, Artificial Insemination and Andrology (32 hours). The Practical hours are the same but taught in the clinical rotations (Subjects named “Clinics”)
- *Diagnostic Pathology* is taught in the subject Necropsy (with the following hours 16 Theory (T), 32 Practical (P))
- *Medicine and surgery including anaesthesiology* is taught in many subjects with a total of 400 hours (324 T and 76 P)
- Although in the SER table 3.1.2. does not cover curriculum hours in the EU-Listed subject “*Preventive Medicine*”, during the Visitation a complete disaggregation of the FVMEU curriculum in the EU directive listed subject was provided. 36 hours related to *preventive medicine* (20 T and 16 P hours) is taught split into 10 subjects
- 16 hours are dedicated to theoretical training of *diagnostic imaging*. The teaching activities are focused on basic principles of radiology, radiation protection and positioning. Some hours related to the diagnostic radiology are included. Ultrasound is included as an elective. Only theoretical training (16 h.) is included in table 3.1.2
- *State Veterinary Services and public health* is included in the subject Veterinary Medicine Public Health (32 T hours) and a total of 10 hours (4 T, 6 P) in the subject Internship Veterinary Medicine Public Health (10th semester)
- *Veterinary legislation, Forensic medicine and certification* is taught in the subject Forensic Veterinary Medicine (16 T hours)
- *Therapy in all common domestic animal species* (268 h) is included in the different 8 Internships (10th semester)
- In relation to *propaedeutics of all common animal species*, 48 hours is taught in the subjects: External diseases (16 h T), Introduction to Internal Diseases I (16 h T) and II (16 h T). Practical training is completed in the clinical rotations. There is insufficient information about the number of practices/sessions and duration (hours/student) completed in the clinical examination in each species (at least in dogs/cats, horses and cows).

3.3.1.2. Description of the core clinical exercises/practicals/seminars in companion animals prior to the start of the clinical rotations

FINAL REPORT AS ISSUED BY ECOVE ON 22 NOVEMBER 2018

- A general reference to four courses is included: Introduction to Internal Medicine I and II, External diseases and General Veterinary Surgery. The content of the courses is related to the knowledge of basic clinical examination skills and common diseases. Students complete the anamnesis and the physical examination of the patients in the VTH. This learning activity is registered in a logbook or documents signed by the academic staff at the VTH
- Theoretical and practical training in relation with Biosecurity is taught according to the SER; however, only a reference to a training activity during the first year was evidenced by the students.

3.3.1.3. *Description of the core clinical rotations and emergency services (both intramural VTH and ambulatory clinics) in companion animals and the direct involvement of undergraduate students in it*

- The information provided in the SER for the description of the core clinical rotations (3.1.5) is insufficient. Only the total hours of every groups in the VTH is included. The number of student/group (size of groups), hours in every clinical service by every student (i.e. cardiology, anaesthesia, dermatology, ophthalmology, orthopaedics, etc.) is not described in the SER. During the Visitation, additional information was provided by the Establishment as follows: For theoretical training, the group of students (80) is divided in two theoretical groups (40 each). For practical training the group (80) is divided in 4 groups (10 students each). Each practical group are scheduled in every of the clinical services: Internal Medicine, Surgery, Obstetrics and Artificial Insemination within the VTH
- Clinical practical training in all common domestic animals is completed in a total of the subjects named “Clinics” taught in the 5th, 6th, 7th, 8th and 9th semesters. The students are included in groups of 7-10 students
- Although the description of the direct involvement of the undergraduate students is insufficient in the SER, there was clear evidence that the students actively participate in the clinical activities. Hands-on clinical training performed by students under the supervision of an academic teacher is included in the learning process developed in the VTH
- There is insufficient information in the SER about the description, duration (hours/student) and subjects where clinical laboratory skills are taught (clinical pathology, clinical microbiology, clinical parasitology etc.)
- Although there is no information related to the Ambulatory Clinic for the Large Animals/Equine Medicine Services in the SER, during the Visitation evidence was provided showing that the VTH offers an Ambulatory Clinic, at least in Reproduction and Internal Medicine, and mainly to ruminant farms
- There is no information on the relationship between the veterinary profession (public and private) and the clinical service in the SER
- The clinical cases are mainly first opinion patients
- Diagnostic of Clinical Laboratory is an elective subject
- Parasitic zoonosis is an elective subject.

3.3.2. **Comments**

- The percentage of the hours dedicated to clinical animal work in the curriculum is low (13.5%) especially considering that the clinical day-one skills learning process is a time-consuming activity. On the other hand, the percentage of theoretical training (55% of the curriculum) could be reduced

- New teaching-learning methods inherent to the European Higher Education Area (EHEA so-called [Bologna process](#)) and student's centred learning ([link](#)), such as seminars and supervised self-learning, should be implemented in the curriculum and/or formally described in the subjects description (syllabus)
- In order to guarantee that this EU core subject is taught correctly, the Preventive Medicine program could be unified in one subject in the next revision of the curriculum.
- In relation to *Diagnostic imaging*, the hours dedicated for the subject are focused on basic radiology. It is necessary to include practical training prior to the clinical rotation to guarantee that the Day-One competence 1.23 (as described in ANNEX 2, SOP) is completed. Particularly, ultrasound basic skills should be included as compulsory for all the students
- There is insufficient information about the number of practices/sessions and duration (hours/student) for learning necropsy techniques. In addition, this information has not been included in Chapter 5 (5.1.7)
- Practical training in propaedeutics is included in the internship; it could be included as practical training prior to the clinical rotation to guarantee that Day-One competence 1.17 (as described in ANNEX 2, SOP) is completed. In order to promote the best clinical learning outcome, clinical skills in relation to propaedeutics, diagnostic imaging, clinical laboratory skills and necropsy technique should be taught prior to the clinical rotation system. Crucially, clinical analysis such as haematology (CBC, etc.), clinical chemistry, urine analysis etc are a basic day-one competence that should be presented to all students
- The number of elective subjects is very high. The workload of the academic staff in these subjects could be reoriented to the core clinical learning process, which would then guarantee the day-one competence for all the students, including preclinical, clinical and extramural (ambulatory clinic) activities.

3.3.3. Suggestions of improvement

- As described above the percentage of the hours dedicated to clinical animal work in the curriculum is insufficient and should be markedly increased. This could be achieved by reducing the percentage of theoretical training (currently 55% of the curriculum). This change is especially important when considering that the clinical day-one skills learning process is a time-consuming activity.
- A harmonization of the international standards as the ECTS and EHEA should be encouraged
- Diagnostic Imaging hours should be increased (theoretical and practical) and learning should include all the different modern techniques employed for the clinical diagnosis such as radiology, ultrasound, CT, MRI, endoscopy etc.
- The competence related to clinical pathology should not be included as an elective subject
- The Parasitic Zoonosis must be a compulsory subject for all the students in order to guarantee the day one skills of the students and the competences related to the Public Health.

3.4. Clinical Sciences in food-producing animals (including Animal Production)

3.4.1. Findings

3.4.1.1. Brief description of the theoretical, practical and clinical education in Clinical Sciences in food-producing animals

Theoretical education

- The theory taught is sufficient although there is limited signposting to certain areas (i.e. Herd Health, EBVM); there is a strong focus on basic principles, and although certain species areas are minimally covered (i.e. pigs, taught as ‘optional’ in the Department of internal medicine), the overarching comparative teaching is sufficient to expect essential cross species knowledge
- There is a very limited amount of population based medicine teaching (herd/flock health) in the early (before year 4) years of the course. In semester 9 in Livestock economics the importance of population health related to finances/economic viability are covered, but in earlier years this is limited to breeding and selection and there is no compulsory teaching until Semester 9 on the use of data to analyse disease trends and patterns such as (sub)clinical mastitis in herds/flocks. The Health Economics Department providing the sessions related to herd health management focus on rural economics, marketing and organization of the livestock sector and there is no demonstrable expertise in data analysis of animal disease recording
- In conversations with several staff members population based medicine is considered and is integrated in teaching sessions particularly on clinics in year 3-5 but this is not transparently stated in the learning outcomes for those sessions. Other staff members in the Obstetrics & Gynaecology Department do not cover the importance of fertility in a herd/flock of food producing animals and focus on the individual. Evidence from practitioners indicated that limited application of herd health management is taught. Although the Saray dairy farm is an excellent example of how data which is used to monitor and manage a large dairy herd could be an invaluable resource for farm animal veterinary education
- Occasionally, practical sessions at the start of a semester are often more theoretical than practical
- The concept of evidence-based medicine is not taught in year 1-4; in year 5 students discuss clinical treatment but there is scope for better integration of evidence based teaching considering multiple sources of evidence.

Practical education:

- Practical education takes place on several courses throughout the degree; often 2 hours of lectures are followed by 2 hours of practical classes. The practical education taking place has relevance to the clinical education (blood smears, FEC). Although practical classes are monitored, there are variable consequences to not attending classes, where an absence can be moderated by high marks in other subjects, leading to the possibility of students progressing through the course with limited knowledge in certain practical areas.

Clinical education:

- Clinical education is satisfactory at the individual animal level, students are, often on a voluntary basis, included in cases from the start (history taking) to treatment and aftercare. They are involved in practical classes in year 3-5
- Caseload per student in the clinics is high (1,713 bovids in the first 9 months of 2018). Students see these patients in large groups of approximately 12 students, while interns (5th year students) are doing the majority of the hands-on tasks
- Student get unlimited opportunity to write case reports, take history and observe, although the majority of these opportunities have a limited structure and can be avoided by students not keen to take on experience with certain species/activities
- The majority of clinical teaching is performed by senior and junior members of staff, with limited involvement of PhD and MSc students
- There is a strong focus on disease and less on the other subjects important to manage a case; for example, in the Department of Internal Medicine; these ‘disease’ lectures are compulsory whilst lectures on clinical laboratory diagnosis (supporting treatment decisions) and ‘emergency clinic’ are optional.

3.4.1.2. Description of the core clinical exercises/practicals/seminars in food-producing animals prior to the start of the clinical rotations

- In 3rd and 4th year clinical exercises are recorded in attendance sheets/logbooks kept by students, in these logbooks certain skills are ticked off as completed, with no further information around performance. Skills taught are important first opinion skills, such as injections, bandaging, udder examination, CMT, rectal examination, dystocia
- Core clinical exercises focus the majority of time on first opinion cases (calf diarrhoea, obstetrics). Seminars are used to explain theory to students to underpin their practical learning
- Data provided during the visit indicated that preventive medicine is taught but as an ‘embedded’ (‘hidden’) module/course
- Biosecurity is good in places (Saray Farm) and limited in others (isolation unit); there is the assumption that biosecurity, similar to preventive medicine does get taught, but is integrated in other courses or discussed by teachers on clinics when deemed appropriate to the case
- There is limited compulsory exposure to basic animal husbandry procedures; if students want to be involved in milking, feeding, animal handling, this is possible, but it is not a mandatory part of the core curriculum. For example, theoretical knowledge on handling cattle is delivered in a lecture on animal behaviour and students will only be exposed to cattle in year 3-5.

3.4.1.3. Description of the core clinical rotations, emergency services (both intramural VTH and ambulatory clinics) and herd health visits in food-producing animals (i.e. ruminants, pigs and poultry) and the direct involvement of undergraduate students in it

Core clinical rotations:

FINAL REPORT AS ISSUED BY ECOVE ON 22 NOVEMBER 2018

- Core clinical rotations in the VTH and on the teaching farm (ERUTAM) are hands-on for poultry (occasionally), cattle, sheep, pigs and goats. On the commercial farm (Saray) the teaching is observation only
- In the VTH, EPT and on the teaching farms students can gain experience with a range of cases/conditions; caesareans, rectal examinations, treatment of uterine infections, involvement in (collecting data for) research studies, selection for breeding, flock health plans, AI, basic surgical procedures, necropsy and communication techniques with farm animal clients
- The number of large ruminant cases in the ambulatory clinic (Table 5.1.4 in the SER) is currently insufficient; the ambulatory clinic has only recently started and is not providing a sufficient caseload at the moment. The school is making steps to improve this by building relationships with surrounding farms. In addition, during the Visitation it transpired that the table does not indicate reality as farm animal patients are coming in but are not recorded although a national treatment record system does exist to log medical treatment
- Ruminant and pig cases seen on extramural placements are insufficient, this shortcoming is brought up by students and highlighted by the insufficient case load reported in the SER
- Nevertheless, when combining the different areas of case exposure (teaching farm, other farms, clinics, EPT) there is adequate exposure to farm animal cases, except pigs.

Emergency service:

- There is an afterhours service for all species which is overseen by qualified vets (research assistants, junior staff). Students can also be involved, but it is not mandatory.

Herd health:

- Although limited elsewhere, the Saray Farm facility offers a great opportunity for training students in the concepts of HH management and importantly, the staff at the farm are willing to be involved. The use of their data (mastitis, milk production, fertility etc) could be a great resource for training students in the classroom after they have visited the farm. This is currently not being utilised as the farm is used for demonstration purposes and post graduate research.

Direct involvement:

- Direct involvement on EPT is dependent on the student and/or practitioner and is variable. Direct involvement on the teaching farm and VTH is good. Direct involvement on the commercial farm visited as part of core teaching is minimal. Report writing is often not compulsory but is encouraged.

3.4.1.4. *Brief description of the theoretical and practical education in Animal Production*

- The key concepts are covered: breeding, economy, zootechnic, husbandry, and in a limited fashion herd health management. On the teaching farm, students have a lot of opportunities and are actively encouraged to develop skills and apply knowledge on a voluntary basis, supported by staff from the relevant departments. There is the

opportunity to stay overnight, take part in PhD/MSc research. None of the opportunities are compulsory.

3.4.2. Comments

- Herd health medicine and preventive medicine need to be better defined and explained in the curriculum. During the Visitation it became clear that although the key concepts are taught, there is limited transparency for FVMEU staff and students on why herd health medicine and preventive medicine are an important subject in themselves within the curriculum. Considering the more disease prevention aspects in the role of particularly farm animal veterinarians, this is an area to improve
- The after-hours emergency service should be formalised and become a mandatory rotation for all clinical students
- Production animal teaching staff are enthusiastic and competent at their subject. The area has good opportunities to deliver first opinion case teaching. Senior and junior academic staff deliver the majority of teaching which is a great opportunity for undergraduate students to interact with senior staff.

3.4.3. Suggestions of improvement

- Consider a more structured approach towards compulsory versus voluntary teaching
- Improve herd health management teaching (i.e. explore further collaboration with/use of Saray Farm)
- Improve recording of farm animal cases in the VTH (use national treatment records perhaps for example).

3.5. Food Safety and Quality (FSQ)

3.5.1. Findings

3.5.1.1. Brief description of the theoretical and practical education in FSQ

- The Food Hygiene and Technology Division is one of the five Divisions within the Faculty under the direction of the Academic Vice-Dean
- Teaching is carried out mainly during the 8th semester and consists of 280 teaching hours - that is 128 hours of theoretical training and 152 hours of practicals
- In addition, 40 teaching hours are available during the Clinical years as a compulsory “internship” under the supervision of Official Veterinarians, during which students are trained to solve problems in food processing plants, to take precautions in case of foodborne, emerging and zoonotic diseases, to understand the legislation and the sanitation procedures
- The students can also choose the ‘Food Safety and Quality’ option during the 200 hours of External Practical Training
- Laboratory based Food Hygiene rotation takes place during third year over a period of 5 weeks
- Clinical rotations in Meat Hygiene (over 10 weeks) and Milk Hygiene (over 13 weeks) take place during the 4th year
- There are two electives offered on Food Safety and Quality, each of 16 hours duration, Food Codex and Sanitation in Food Businesses.

3.5.1.2. Description of the teaching in slaughterhouses and in premises for the production, processing, distribution/sale or consumption of food of animal origin

- The two red meat slaughterhouses, cattle and sheep, used for practical training by the faculty are modern, demonstrate best practice, hygienic design and operation. Both management teams were vocal in their support for this collaboration which is to the benefit of both parties
- The group of students observed had good access for the observation and teaching of ante-mortem inspection, the slaughter process, dressing and operational hygiene, cleaning and carcass handling. There was sufficient space available to ensure the safety of the students
- Post-mortem inspection was demonstrated by the staff in good facilities allowing both observation and participation as appropriate. Neither students or staff used protective gloves
- All students visit a poultry slaughter establishment located some distance, 190 km, from the Faculty. Pig slaughter is taught theoretically using videos
- All students visit a milk and meat processing establishment to observe production. A fish farm is visited by all students
- All students complete a series of practicals at the SCMYO pilot milk product processing establishment and are taught individually how to make two types of local cheese, yogurt and kefir and how to monitor and control the processes within the Establishment.

3.5.2. Comments

- There is an excellent working relationship between students and staff and between the Faculty, Government Veterinary Services, industry and the local community
- Consequently, and because of the knowledge and enthusiasm of the teaching staff, the students receive a very high-quality instruction in FSQ.

3.5.3. Suggestions of improvement

None

3.6. Professional knowledge

3.6.1. Findings

3.6.1.1. Brief description of the theoretical and practical education in professional Knowledge

- 16 hours of lecture each are dedicated to professional ethics, animal welfare, animal ethology under the chapter of basic sciences.
- Under the title of Professional Knowledge: 1 hour of lectures and 2 hours of seminar are dedicated to ethics and behaviour. 16 hours of lectures and 2 hours of seminars are dedicated to Veterinary Legislation.

3.6.1.2. Brief description of the organisation, selection procedures and supervision of the EPT

- 200 hrs of EPT is embedded and is a compulsory part of the course in semesters 7, 8 and 9. FVMEU works closely with the Kayseri Chamber of Veterinary Surgeons who hold a list of suitable placements in private practices, laboratories, slaughterhouses etc
- Participating practices must have been in operation for at least 5 years. Students provide FVMEU with a choice of three facilities. The Chamber organises health insurance for the students and works closely with FVMEU.

3.6.1.3. Description of the procedures (e.g. logbooks) used to ascertain the achievement of each core practical/clinical activity (pre-clinical, clinical, ambulatory clinics, EPT) and professional knowledge by each student (independently of the tracking system)

- Logbooks are completed on a daily basis by the students who are interviewed by the practice principal each day. The daily entry is signed
- Log books are checked by the staff of FVMEU, signed and a grading given to each student, though this does not form part of the examination system.

3.6.2. Comments

- Professional Knowledge teaching is organised by the Department of history and deontology in semester 1 (History of Veterinary Medicine), semester 9 (Communication, legislation and ethics) and semester 10 (Ethics and Business Economics)
- Information literacy and data management are taught within the herd health management programme which is itself taught in other areas of the course
- Students take part in simulated consultations as part of the Communication training
- EPT is obligatory (200 hrs) during semesters 7,8 and 9. Practitioners are responsible for signing student log books at the end of the placement
- FVMEU cooperates with the local Chamber of Veterinary Surgeons who provide placements for students in private practices, laboratories etc. Students supply three choices of EPT provider to the Faculty. Students complete a daily log of work done and procedures undertaken. This is signed by the practitioner and checked by the Faculty. It does not form part of the progression process
- There are contractual obligations between the Faculty and providers and attention is paid to comments by the student about the suitability of the practice and vice versa.

3.6.3. Suggestions of improvement

None

Standard 3. Decision

The Establishment is compliant with Standard 3 except for Sub-Standards 3.1, 3.3 and 3.4.

The Establishment is partially compliant with Sub-Standard 3.1 because of:

- Ensuring the effective alignment of all content, teaching, learning and assessment activities of the degree programme
- Overseeing the QA of the curriculum, particularly in gathering and then evaluating feedback from students and other stakeholders
- EPT must complement and strengthen the academic education and have effective academic oversight for its efficacy

The Establishment is partially compliant with Sub-Standard 3.4 because of:

- Herd health management teaching should be improved for Day 1 Competence acquisition by students.

The Establishment is not compliant with Sub-Standard 3.3 because of:

- The curriculum does not allow a sufficient acquisition of Day 1 Competences by students in clinical sciences.

The Establishment is not compliant with Sub-Standard 3.4 because of:

- Students do not receive Day 1 Competence in emergency care on a compulsory basis

4. Facilities and equipment (see Standards 4.1 to 4.15)

4.1. Findings

4.1.1. Brief description of the location and organisation of the facilities used for the veterinary curriculum

- The FVMEU is located near the city centre and is well served by both public and private transport. It is composed of two buildings. The VTH is located in a 4,312 m² building and the rest of the FVMEU is located in the main building (13,704 m²)
- External facilities for farm and research animals are provided by the University. Also, the FVMEU provides access for FSQ learning in external private facilities.

4.1.2. Description of the adequacy for the veterinary training of the premises for:

1) Lecturing, group work and practical work

- Six classrooms for 64-80 students are available and fully equipped. Additional chairs could be added to increase to 72-90 places. However, although the lecture rooms can accommodate up to 90 students, the groups are divided into two with lectures been given twice.
- At least 11 small classrooms are available for 10, 20, 25 and 50 places with equipment for work in groups.
- 1 full equipped conference hall for 265 people is provided.
- In the main building there are several students' labs which are adequate for the number of students and for the proposed learning activities programmed for the different subjects. The equipment and materials required for the different practical training classes are located in the different Departments (also located in the same floor of the building).

2) Housing healthy, hospitalised and isolated animals

- The Establishment uses research premises at a Large Animal Farm: The *Erciyes University Agricultural Research and Application Centre* (ERUTAM) located 20 km away from FVMEU. These premises have 100 cattle, 200 sheep, 10 goats and 2,000 chickens. Also, mice and rats are available in another facility: the *Experimental Research and Application Centre* (DEKAM)
- Although there was an insufficient description in the SER of the available number of boxes for the hospitalization of patients (dogs, cats, horses, cows and small ruminants) and isolation facilities, during the Visitation it was noted that several hospitalization wards were provided in converted portacabins
- An isolation facility for the hospitalization of infectious patients is provided with a separate external entrance and is mainly used for dogs diagnosed with Parvovirus. There is only one cage for one patient, and no aprons or clear instructions for the users are provided. Clear instructions for the cleaning and disinfection of the ward is also missing
- There are three wards in the VTH for the hospitalization of cats, dogs and avian species. A total of 434 animals were hospitalized in the last twelve months (including 206 dogs and 176 cats). These facilities are not provided with washable/disposable bedding for the patients and no visible food utensils. Heat pads were used to provide the animal welfare in the hospitalization unit. Also, birds were on the floor with no means of perching and cages are not adequate for housing avian species
- There is an isolation pen for small ruminants situated about 100m from the main buildings

- Fluid Therapy Infusion Pumps were not found on the intensive care unit
- There is no hospitalisation facility for equines – very few horses are treated each year (approximately 20 in the last two years). According to the information provided during the visit, the region has little horse ownership.
- According to the information provided in the VTH electronic system (VETO@ORCL), the caseload of ruminants attended intramurally has been increasing during the last few years: 53, 472, 988 and 1355 calves (data from 2015, 2016, 2017 and during the current year, respectively). Also, for the same years there was an increase for dogs (300, 1803, 3355 and 3126) and cats (171, 1168, 2408 and 2449). As a result, the facilities should be adapted for this increasing number of patients, particularly for ruminants and small animals.
- Separation of cats from dogs is not available in the reception/waiting room. Also, the design of the hospitalization ward/cages is not particularly cat-friendly. The facilities have not been designed in order to provide sufficient facilities for cats.

3) Clinical activities, diagnostic services and necropsy

- A general list of the premises for clinical activities is included in the SER (4.1.4)
- The VTH is divided in several Departments: Internal Medicine Department, Surgery Department (including Anaesthesia and Radiology), Reproduction divided into Gynaecology/Andrology Department and Artificial Insemination Department. The Pathology and Virology Departments are also located in the VTH Building
- The necropsy room is a newly built facility, but the Pathology Support Staff and a dedicated vehicle for the transportation of the carcasses are not provided. There are forklifts and leak proof containers to transport carcasses to the pathological department. The necropsy room is only designed for small animals or small ruminants; also, the design does not include adequate drainage and cleaning of the cold store chamber. The facility is provisional and not working on a daily basis
- Current facilities not adequate for equine or large ruminant necropsies
- Although the Students only participate on Emergency clinical work until 12:00 p.m. (according to SER, see 3.1.5), during the visit it has been found that 4/5 students are present during the emergency clinical service during the night. Four clinicians are contracted by the VTH for clinical activity at nights and weekends; therefore, the VTH provide a 24/7 service for small animals. The average case-load is around 8/10 cases a day for this out of hours service. The students are supervised by an intern with senior staff available by telephone if necessary. Students attend on a voluntary basis
- The Pharmacy is located in the Obstetrics and Gynaecology Clinic. No qualified pharmacist staff is required according to the Establishment. Ketamine and other induction anaesthetic drugs are located inside of the surgery room and under the anaesthetist personnel
- Anaesthesia protocols do not include opioids or high pain relief drugs, such as tramadol, pethidine, methadone, morphine and its derivatives. The analgesia is limited to the use of buprenorphine, NSAIDs and local anaesthesia.

4) FSQ & VPH

- Slaughterhouses, food processing units, fish processing unit, poultry processing unit and modern private farms are utilised by FVMEU near Kayseri city (less than 27 km)
- However, the meat and milk processing plants are located at 40 km and the chicken slaughterhouse is located at 188 km from FVMEU.

5) Study and self-learning, catering, locker rooms, accommodation for on call students and leisure

- A central Erciyes University Library is located in the Centre of the Campus and accessible for all students. The FVMEU provides reading rooms, study rooms, computer rooms and 4 meeting and study rooms for the students
- Canteen style facilities are provided in the main building of FVMEU with full catering facilities located in the nearby buildings of the Erciyes University. Locker rooms are available for the students in the main building and at the VTH.

4.1.3. Description of the adequacy for the veterinary training of the vehicles used for student transportation, ambulatory clinic, live animals and cadaver transportation

- The University provides the Establishment with vehicles (mini-bus) for the transportation of the students and is administered by Dean's office
- Although insufficient information is provided in SER about a vehicle for the Ambulatory Clinics, during the Visitation it is evidenced that one vehicle is provided by the VTH for this purpose
- There are forklifts and leak proof containers for cadavers. However, the VTH keeps the cadavers under refrigeration until its transportation for cremation outside the University. This service is provided by a private company three days a week.

4.1.4. Description of the adequacy for the veterinary training of the equipment used for teaching purposes and clinical services

- Although insufficient information was provided in the SER in order to fully evaluate the adequacy of the equipment, during the Visitation it was evidenced that the Department's laboratories are fully equipped and well maintained for research, teaching and clinical purposes.

4.1.5. Description of the adequacy of the biosecurity rules in the Establishment

- The description of the biosecurity procedures is not described within the SER. Only a reference to the Biosafety Assessment committee of FVMEU and the responsibility of the Dean's office in its implementation is evidenced in the SER
- The responsibility for Animal Welfare is not clearly defined, especially in the VTH. No technical Support Staff is identified for the promotion and effecting Animal Welfare
- In the VTH, patients with suspected infectious diseases are attended to in a specific room. The triage is done by PhD students or veterinary staff of the VTH just based on an owner interview. No protocol nor defined classification of the patients was apparent. Several patients are treated in this room at the same time with potentially different diseases or complains. As well as students, owners are permitted access to this facility. Although cleaning and disinfection is undertaken, no written protocols or procedures were present.

4.1.6. Brief description of the process and the implication of staff, students and stakeholders in the development, implementation, assessment and revision of facilities, equipment and biosecurity rules of the Establishment

- Insufficient information is provided in the SER in order to identify the procedures and implications for the staff, students and stakeholders in such activities
- There is insufficient evidence that the biosecurity rules are written and communicated to all stakeholders. Although some activities have been recently established as a biosecurity training programme and some notice or advice are found elsewhere, there

is limited evidence that a formal biosecurity training programme has been completed by students and staff

- There is limited evidence of the results and measurements of the effectiveness of the biosecurity rules, such as annual self-reports, internal/external audits, analysis of the results of indicators, etc.

4.2. Comments

- The facilities for teaching, research and clinical purpose are adequate but the increasing clinical caseload requires adaptation to the facilities. During the Visitation, plans for a projected Large Animal Hospital were presented and have been financially approved by the Rector of the University. It is anticipated that within the next two years the capacity of the physical facilities will match the increased workload in Large Animal Clinical Activities. The current VTH facilities could be modified and used exclusively as a Small Animal Veterinary Clinic. The new facilities will include a building for diagnostic imaging and adequate rooms for equine and large animals necropsy activity
- Although there is not clear written evidence that the QA system includes a clear strategy and procedure for the maintenance and upgrading of the equipment, the procedure for the maintenance and upgrading of such equipment is done
- The current mixed practice activity does not promote specialization. A more integrated VTH centred on clinical services by species (Small Animal, Ruminant and Equine) would increase the opportunity for Academic staff to become specialists and provide a better and more specialized clinical service to the stakeholders
- Quality Assurance, as referenced in chapter 11, is not evident in all the activities of the Establishment. Specifically, QA should include procedures which guarantee the involvement of staff, students and stakeholders in the development, implementation, assessment and revision of facilities, equipment and biosecurity rules of the Establishment
- The VTH SA cases were triaged at the door and potentially infectious animals examined in a separate room with no internal access to the main building. Biosecurity in this room was not in evidence, there were no rules or protocols displayed, more than one animal was present within the room at the same time, disinfection of the room between cases did not appear to take place
- The hospitalisation facility would be improved by providing washable / disposable bedding for the dogs and cats, heat pads and a kennel kitchen within the unit where food for patients can be prepared and feeding utensils cleaned. Perches should be supplied for the birds. Cages, especially in the bird / poultry area were not cleaned between patients. Heating for the animals in winter was insufficient, heat pads for more urgent cases were not available. There were no written protocols posted to advise staff on the relevant biosecurity measures and although the facility is new, it did not promote the best husbandry, welfare and management practices
- The VTH should consider using opioids and other major pain relief drugs to provide better patient pain control and management. Pain control teaching would be improved with the demonstration of a greater number of analgesics than currently used
- Academic staff who teach Animal Welfare should be responsible for overseeing animal welfare in the campus, especially at the VTH. This should ensure continuity, uniformity, application and periodic review of standards
- The necropsy room should function as a clinical service with support and academic staff
- A comprehensive biosecurity plan should be written and communicated to all the stakeholders, monitored, staff trained and revised periodically
- The organization by specialties of clinical services would be of benefit to the Academic

Staff enabling them to focus in a specialty as described in the EBVS Colleges; i.e. anaesthesia, cardiology, dermatology, diagnostic imaging, traumatology, equine medicine, etc. In the future, the presence of diplomates from the EBVS colleges should be encouraged

- The two cattle and sheep slaughterhouses used for ante-mortem and post-mortem training are modern, well maintained and fit for purpose. There is sufficient space for practical training to be carried out safely and effectively and for the students to obtain hands on competency
- All students also have access to a meat processing establishment and a fish farm
- The poultry slaughterhouse is 190 km distance from the Faculty and was not observed directly during the visit. However, indications are that it is fit for purpose and visited by all students
- Access to the pilot milk product processing establishment is a real asset for the Faculty and provides an excellent training facility for students, permitting hands on involvement in the production of two local cheeses, yogurt and kefi (kefir)
- The new small animal isolation unit had no facilities for personnel or students to change clothes, there were no clean or infected areas demarcated and no facility to change clothes from dirty to clean without the possibility of carrying contagion to clean areas There were no written protocols and the room had not been cleaned and disinfected after the last patient had left the facility. There did not appear to be any protective clothing or washing facility for the staff and dedicated feeding utensils for the patients. Relevant biosecurity and biocontainment measures were not in force
- A new calf isolation unit has been built situated some 100m from the main building. There were no biosecurity measures in place and no appropriate notices and protocols for staff and students.

4.3 Suggestions for improvement

- Greater attention should be paid to biosecurity and biocontainment throughout the VTH, procedures developed and instituted. New buildings, especially the VTH and isolation units, need disinfection facilities incorporated. Thought should be given to the comfort and security of the hospitalised animals to make the premises fit for purpose
- The facilities failed to comply with the appropriate legislation on biosecurity and EU animal welfare and care standards (see rubric 4.7 and above)
- Operational policies and procedures should be posted for students and staff (see rubric 4.7 and above)
- The isolation units require biosecurity and management protocols to be written, posted and complied with. Cleaning and disinfection regimes to be instituted and complied with and appropriate clothing and washing facilities for personnel to be supplied. The facility should have an ability for personnel to move from clean to infected areas and back to clean without risk of carrying contagion outside the designated area. Protocols were needed to deal with the disposal of potentially infected clothing and equipment
- The VTH and facilities involved with the curriculum do not meet the VEDEK standard. FVMEU should take part in the national practice standard scheme.

4.4. Decision

The Establishment is compliant with Standard 4 except for Sub-Standards 4.6, 4.7, 4.8, 4.9, 4.12 and 4.13.

The Establishment is partially compliant with Sub-Standard 4.6 because of:

FINAL REPORT AS ISSUED BY ECOVE ON 22 NOVEMBER 2018

- Facilities must comply with all relevant health, safety and biosecurity standards

The Establishment is partially compliant with Sub-Standard 4.9 because of:

- The VTH must meet the relevant National Practice Standards

The Establishment is partially compliant with Sub-Standard 4.12 because of:

- Operational policies and procedures (including biosecurity, good laboratory practice and good clinical practice) must be taught and posted for students, staff and visitors

The Establishment is not compliant with Sub-Standards 4.7 and 4.8 because of:

- The need to embark on the planned development of the VTH for both Large animals and Companion animals

The Establishment is not compliant with Sub-Standard 4.13 because of:

- Management and Procedures within Isolation Facilities
- Biosecurity and Animal Welfare

5. Animal resources and teaching material of animal origin (see Standards 5.1 to 5.6)

5.1. Findings

5.1.1. Brief description of the global strategy of the Establishment about the use of animals and material of animal origin for the acquisition by each student of Day One Competences

- The strategy of the Establishment to adequately apply teaching consisting of Day One Competences is divided into three parts: preclinical, clinical and farm training. The diversity of material from animal origin is not adequate in some species (e.g. horses and pigs seen intra-murally and necropsies performed on equine and pigs) (see table 5.1.2 and 5.1.6 in the SER). However, since the Visitation in 2012, the Establishment has increased the diversity and caseload and are attempting to further increase these numbers in cooperation with external stakeholders
- During the current Visitation it was ascertained that a number of cases have not been recorded and as such the data provided in the SER is incorrect in a number of places
- For preclinical training and laboratory practice, FVMEU provides healthy as well as diseased material and cadavers originating from VTH, ERUTAM, DEKAM and from extramural practices
- Animal handling is taught during the introductory lectures to Internal Medicine in Semester 9. There are theoretical and practical classes
- A satisfactory and increasing number of companion animals, ruminants and exotic animals and avian are seen within the VTH. Ruminant clinical training is provided by ERUTAM farm visits
- Basic sciences and pre-clinical training are taught in 1st – 2nd year of study and clinical training is taught and implemented in 3rd - 5th years of study (5th being an internship year) at the Establishment. Table 5.1.2. of the SER indicates that no common domestic species are provided in preclinical subjects other than poultry, rabbits, rats and mice. During the Visitation it became clear that only dogs and cats owned by staff and students were occasionally brought in for teaching purposes
- During the clinical years, students are exposed to diverse cases and techniques (e.g. handling/restraining techniques, injection techniques and catheter application) and are evaluated based on technique performance and number of cases undertaken. Students are encouraged to participate in daily clinical practice by staff and can voluntarily participate in the daily VTH operations.

5.1.2. Description of the adequacy for the veterinary training of the enrolled students of:

-) the number and diversity of cadavers and material of animal origin used in anatomy, necropsy and FSQ;
 -) the number and diversity of healthy live animals used for pre-clinical training;
 -) the number of visits in herds/flocks/units of food-producing animals;
 -) the number and diversity of patients examined/treated by each student;
 -) the balance between species, between clinical disciplines, between first opinion and referral cases, between acute and chronic cases, between consultations and hospitalisations, between individual medicine and population medicine
- The balance between species is adequate except for equine and porcine species
 - The balance between clinical disciplines is good
 - Regarding the balance between first opinion and referral cases, very few referral cases come into the VTH, but this does not limit the veterinary training with regards to Day One Competences

- The balance between acute and chronic cases is adequate
- Regarding consultations and hospitalisations: limited hospitalisation occurs in the VTH, particularly for farm animal species, which limits student learning opportunities in general nursing skills and animal handling
- As for the balance between individual medicine and population medicine, there is insufficient emphasis on the importance of a population-based approach to veterinary medicine.

5.1.3. Description of the organisation and management of the VTH and ambulatory clinics

- The VTH provides a short-term treatment for equine and ruminant cases until the large animal hospitalization units are constructed
- Small animal isolation units are not adequate and only a few units on the VTH site are suitable for cattle isolation. The VTH is mainly occupied with the treatment of companion animals with estimates of over 10,000 cases seen yearly, and also operates 24 hours 365 days a year.
- The VTH staff consist of clinical academics and support staff. There is a lack of well-trained veterinary nurses and technical support. A limited facility for hospitalization and intensive care of companion animals is available. Intensive care units are also provided for neonatal lamb, calves, and kids. Consultations covering internal medicine, surgery, gynaecology, obstetrics, artificial insemination and 24/7 emergency services are undertaken
- Students have compulsory nightshifts and weekends with a clinical academic available if required
- An ambulatory service was established in 2018 which functions as an emergency transportation for companion animals. For farm animals, a separate vehicle is used. There is currently limited opportunity for students to be involved as the service has only recently been established.

5.1.4. Description of the group size for the different types of clinical training and of the hands-on involvement of students in clinical procedures in the different species

- Within the clinics the group size does vary, but can become large due to combining 3rd, 4th and 5th year students in the clinic. Group sizes around patients can be up to 12 or more, which can make a hands-on experience challenging
- Group size in practical training outside the clinics can also vary and at times comprise up to half a class visiting a farm/feed plant; however, these classes are not compulsory and group sizes tend to be around 25 as indicated by the registers. Group size was not seen as a limitation to learning when discussed with the students.

5.1.5. Description of the patient record system and how it is used to efficiently support the teaching, research, and service programmes of the Establishment

- There is a patient data management system in the VTH which is predominantly used for small animal cases. The system was developed in house and can be accessed by students after a staff member has given them access to the system. This patient management system is not used for farm animal cases on a consistent basis
- In addition to the electronic patient system, paper-based case records are kept which while overlapping with regards to information kept, are not exactly the same
- For all treatment provided to small and large animal cases there is a national system which needs to be completed by the prescribing veterinarian; this system is not accessible to students.

5.1.6. Description of the procedures developed to ensure the welfare of animals used for educational and research activities

- There are no clear guidelines to ensure the welfare of animals used for educational and research activities; for example, the use of farm animals and the number of rectal examinations which can be performed on one animal are not stated
- With clinical cases in the VTH, ensuring the welfare of the animal is the clinical academic's responsibility; there is no committee which has a clear responsibility or overview of the welfare of animals in teaching.

5.1.7. Brief description of the process and the implication of staff, students and stakeholders in the development, implementation, assessment and revision of the number and variety of animals and material of animal origin for pre-clinical and clinical training, and the clinical services provided by the Establishment

- Staff can be involved in the development, implementation, assessment and revision of the number and variety of animals and material of animal origin for pre-clinical and clinical training. The final decision is made by the Head of Department with support from the university
- Students and stakeholders are not involved in the development, implementation, assessment and revision of the number and variety of animals and material of animal origin for pre-clinical and clinical training.

5.2. Comments

- The recording of clinical farm animal cases (live animal and necropsies) needs to improve
- To encourage an increase in live animal exposure, introduce compulsory teaching practicals to replace the current voluntary attendance system
- With the planned expansion of the VTH, develop a system for disposal of large animal cadavers, as currently they are cut into smaller pieces and disposed within medical waste
- Related to Rubric 9.2. Although nursing skills are taught on the course, there is a shortage of technical support (nursing staff) to take on tasks normally undertaken by nursing staff and not senior academic clinicians. In due course, there is an opportunity to train future veterinary nursing technicians within the veterinary school.

5.3. Suggestions for improvement

- Related to Rubrics 5.1 & 5.2. The number of (companion animal, equine) cadavers and equine cases (intramural and extramural) and ruminant and pig cases (extramural) is insufficient to provide sufficient practical training for the number of students involved
- There are opportunities to increase equine cases for teaching by building relationships with practices/equine establishments to provide hands on training & live animal to create an adequate clinical educational experience
- For teaching of gross pathology, abattoirs and local practitioners need to be involved to create a bigger network and so increase case material.

5.4. Decision

The Establishment is compliant with Standard 5 except for Sub-Standards 5.1 and 5.2.

FINAL REPORT AS ISSUED BY ECOVE ON 22 NOVEMBER 2018

The Establishment is not compliant with Sub-Standards 5.1 and 5.2 because of:

- Caseload of Equine cases and equine and companion animal necropsies for practical training

6. Learning resources (see Standards 6.1 to 6.4)

6.1 Findings

6.1.1. Brief description of the main library (facilities, equipment, staff, (e)books and (e)periodicals, software for databases)

- The main library of Erciyes University (the Establishment) is Kadir Has Central Library (KHCL), which is located 1.5 km from the faculty. There also is a subsidiary small library in the faculty, consisting of 1 reading room for 15 students and 1 computer room (15)
- The staff of the main library is represented by 1 department manager, 6 librarians, 4 chiefs, 4 officers, 1 technician, 5 assistants, all of them full time employed and 1 technician for the subsidiary library in the faculty
- Main library has a total surface of 10 400 m², 5 floors and a total capacity of 663 seats, a study room with a capacity of 50 seats, a conference hall for 128 persons, one computer room with 100 computers and 4 computers for online catalogue browsing
- The total number of veterinary books in the main library is 485 and 29 periodicals, and there also are 144 e-books and 163 e-periodicals in the veterinary medicine field

6.1.2. Description of the available electronic information and e-learning courses, and their role in supporting student learning and teaching in the core curriculum

- Materials available in the library are transferred to electronic media using the programme called “Yordam 2001 - Library Information - Document Automation” and presented to the users on the internet. This electronic media provides purchasing, cataloguing, lending and announcement services for students and staff
- KHCL has database subscriptions to 57 national and international databases.

6.1.3. Description of the accessibility for staff and students to electronic learning resources both on and off campus

- Wi-fi access exists in 9 spots inside the university, among them being the Faculty of Veterinary Medicine. Students and staff have access to learning resources on and off campus
- Opening hours of the library are extended in periods of examination

6.1.4. Description of how the procedures for access to and use of learning resources are taught to students

- Tours of the library are organized regularly by the university for students, but are not compulsory
- Student and staff training programs in the use of the database are held at regular intervals but are not compulsory for students and staff
- In 2017, 282 students from different faculties belonging to the university were trained to use the databases.

6.1.5. Brief description of the process and the implication of staff, students and stakeholders in the development, implementation, assessment and revision of learning resources

- Staff members and students can apply to a commission to purchase books. If the purchased is approved the title of the book is put on a list which is available on the website.

6.2. Comments

FINAL REPORT AS ISSUED BY ECOVE ON 22 NOVEMBER 2018

- Only a few students are trained to use the library resources (e.g. database usage) due to the lack of compulsory training and due to their insufficient interest in reading books
- Students have very little knowledge and interest in reading e-books or articles in English and therefore the library is not frequently or effectively used by students
- Furthermore, most students use lecture hand-out notes to obtain knowledge and therefore are not interested in additional reading
- Students are mostly using the library during end of semesters and in examination periods.

6.3. Suggestions for improvement

None

6.4. Decision

The Establishment is compliant with Standard 6.

7. Student admission, progression and welfare (see Standards 7.1 to 7.15)

7.1. Findings

7.1.1. Brief description of the admission procedures for standard and for full-fee students

- High education Council (YOK) manage the admission of standard students. The selection procedure is administrated by a central system (OSYM) and it is based on a two-step examination (one basic and one field qualification exam) including multiple-choice questions. The students are selected and placed in the undergraduate programs according to the scores they obtain in the examination and to the preferences they express. Students can appeal against an admission decision within 10 days of the announcement of the results. Appeal processes are managed by OSYM
- Information on purpose and goal of the programme, admission requirements, criteria and procedures, degree requirements, tuition and fees, are available for students on the Establishment web site
- Education is free, and students benefit from scholarships funded by the Government
- During the last 4 years, 68,25 students were admitted each year on average and 50,33 students graduate annually
- Regarding full fee students, foreign students apply to the departments and pay university fees, whereas overseas Turks take exams under Ministry and may benefit from scholarships
- During the last four years, the Establishment has admitted no full fee students.

7.1.2. Description of how the Establishment adapts the number of admitted students to the available educational resources and the biosecurity and welfare requirements

- The Establishment accepts 70-80 students each year and plans to keep the number stable for the next 3 years. The number of admitted students is set each year by the YOK. The Establishment has no autonomy in determining the number of new students
- A specific commission manage biosecurity issue and organize periodic meetings. The Establishment provide students with equipment and rules to follow in clinics and laboratories. Equipment (eyewashes, emergency showers), and appropriate notices are available in the laboratories; fire extinguishers can be found on the corridors at every level.
- A library, sport facilities, student clubs and public services are available on the campus
- Counselling services are available within the University.

7.1.3. Description of the progression criteria and procedures, the available remediation and supports, the rate and main causes of attrition

- The training period is 5 years (10 semesters). Each semester the students have to take 30 ECTS courses. One midterm and one final exam are applied for each course. In order to graduate, students have to complete 300 ECTS
- 51.66% of the students graduate in 5 years, 23.84% in 6 years, 14.57% in 7 years and 9.93% in 8 years or more
- In order to monitor and to evaluate students' performances an advisor is assigned to each class. The students who do not perform adequately are directed to the administration that takes the responsibility in supporting them
- There are no formal statistics or data about the rate of attrition.

7.2. Comments

- The Establishment has no autonomy in determining the number of new students, but currently the number of admitted students does not influence their ability to access

further educational resources and facilities

- The policy for students with disabilities is not clearly defined
- Students can easily approach individual members of academic staff who are willing to discuss every kind of problem students might be facing. The relationships between teachers and students are good
- Student courses evaluations are carried out by Erciyes University using an on-line survey managed by the Student Information System (OBISIS), but the results are not shared with the Establishment. The Establishment is going to put in place an autonomous questionnaire for students, but no data is yet available
- The rate of attrition is not monitored.

7.3. Suggestions for improvement

- There is a need to monitor progression and the rate of attrition, as well as having in place mechanisms for student support as related to progression and attrition

7.4. Decision

The Establishment is compliant with Standard 7 except for Sub-Standard 7.9.

The Establishment is partially compliant with Sub-Standard 7.9 because of:

- A need to monitor progression and the rate of attrition.

8. Student assessment (see Standards 8.1 to 8.9)

8.1. Findings

8.1.1. Brief description of the student's assessment strategy of the Establishment

- Students have to take a midterm and a final exam for each course in each semester. The exams can be written (multiple choices, filling gap, short/long answer questions), oral, practical, clinical or mixture of them and the contribution of theoretical and practical exams vary among semesters
- A detailed description for each course contents is available for students before the beginning of the semester including learning outcomes, planned learning activities, teaching and assessment methods
- Every semester there are one midterm examination, one final examination and one resit examination. Students who fail the final and the resit examination can take the summer school. The students take this option, especially for the Pathology course, due to the difficulty of the latter subject
- The assessment of preclinical practical skills is carried out on healthy animals, cadavers, organs and laboratory tests. The assessment of clinical practical skills is carried out on animal patients in the clinics.

8.1.2. Description of the assessment methodology to ensure that every graduate has achieved the minimum level of competence, as prescribed in the ESEVT Day One Competences

- From the 6th semester students take part in rotations. Every student is provided with a logbook to note the applications. Lecturers check the logbooks and evaluate the practical activity. Grading is done according to theoretical examination and to participation in practical activities
- Students have to spend an extramural training period between the 4th and the 5th year supervised by a practitioner. Every student has an extramural work logbook to fill. The supervising practitioner evaluates the student's capabilities and the stage commission evaluates the logbooks.

8.1.3. Description of the processes for providing to students a feedback post-assessment and a guidance for requested improvement

- Minimum thresholds of attendance to theoretical and practical courses are fixed in order to access the final exams. There are no explicit requirements for barrier assessment. Usually, students receive assessment outcomes within seven working days. There is no formal procedure for providing feedback post assessment; however, students who require feedback can have a personal feedback directly from the teachers. Students can appeal against assessment outcomes to the Dean's office.

8.1.4. Brief description of the process and the implication of staff, students and stakeholders in the development, implementation, assessment and revision of the student's assessment strategy

- There is no evidence of any process of development, implementation, assessment and revision of the student's assessment strategy, or of the involvement of staff, students and stakeholders in such development.

8.2 Comments

- There is no evidence of a clearly identified structure showing lines of responsibility for the assessment strategy. The absence of such a structure makes it hard to identify

mechanisms by which the Establishment can monitor the appropriateness of assessments and ensure the effective alignment of all content as stated in sub-standard 3.3.

- There is no quality control on the mechanism used to ensure that the logbooks achieve their aims
- E-learning platforms are very limited, or even absent, in teaching and student assessment.

8.3 Suggestions for improvement

- The Establishment must adopt a clearly defined and shared strategy for student assessment. Staff, students and stakeholders should be involved in its development, implementation, assessment and revision
- The Establishment should identify a structure to develop a policy for student assessment and to ensure that the methodologies applied for assessment are appropriate to verify the gathering of clinical skills and Day One Competences.

8.4. Decision

The Establishment is compliant with Standard 8 except for Sub-Standards 8.1, 8.8 and 8.9.

The Establishment is partially compliant with Sub-Standard 8.8 because of:

- An absence of a process linking assessment design to programme learning outcomes and the assessment strategy does not ensure the achievement of learning objectives

The Establishment is partially compliant with Sub-Standard 8.9 because of:

- Insufficient quality control of the student's logbooks

The Establishment is not compliant with Standard 8.1 because of:

- There is no clearly identified management structure demonstrating the lines of responsibility for the assessment strategy

9. Academic and support staff (see Standards 9.1 to 9.6)

9.1. Findings

9.1.1. Brief description of the global strategy in order to ensure that all requested competences for the veterinary programme are covered for both academic and support and that they are properly qualified and prepared for their roles

- The FVMEU have institutional programmes for the recruitment, training and promotion of the academic staff. The evaluation is focused on training abroad and research activities, emphasized in the field of study/academic expertise. Most of the Academic Staff have a PhD degree. There are no European Board of Veterinary Specialisation (EBVS) Diplomates
- Departments decide if a new staff member is required, make a request to the Dean, which is then passed to the Faculty Board and finally to the Rector. The final arbiter is the High education Council (YOK). The Board makes its decision based on a demonstration of need
- Every year, the most appropriate member of the academic staff for teaching the individual courses is proposed by the Department to the Faculty Board. Students participate in this process. Finally, the approval of the academic planning is made by the Senate of the Erciyes University. A software programme (OBISIS) is used for the academic planning and academic evaluation surveys
- Learning resources are available in the library for the academic staff and students
- The University ensures that all staff are appropriately qualified and prepared for their roles. The training is compulsory (mainly for security work issues). During the PhD programme some teaching training is delivered. Pedagogical seminars start during the last academic year
- Although the SER states that the Biosecurity guidelines are understood by both students and staff, there is limited evidence of the activities programmed for the staff
- According to the indicators shown in the SER, only 5 veterinarians are involved in the curriculum. This is a misinterpretation of the calculation of the indicators. Only the 5 practitioners within the clinic were included as they are involved in veterinary training. In Table 9.1.2. in the SER 94.86% of the academic Staff are Veterinarians; therefore, the I2 should be approximately 0.93. (Establishment value of I2 is 1.36.)

9.1.2. Description of the adequacy of the number of academic and support staff in the different departments/units with the number of students to be taught

- The Dean receives the demands of academic staff from the Departments which are communicated to the Rector's Office with the Administrative Board of the Establishment then deciding
- Legal regulations for the recruitment, appointment and promotion of the academic Staff are defined by the University
- Turkish law defines support staff competences in relation to the particular services carried out. Candidates are under basic training for 1-2 years
- A total of 82 Academic Staff (58% permanent) and 32 Support Staff (65% permanent) are the personnel related to the veterinary programme for the 382 students (mean)
- 81 new students are admitted each year (2017-2018). However, the number of new students is increasing year by year.

9.1.3. Brief description of the process and the implication of staff, students and stakeholders in the development, implementation, assessment and revision of the strategy for allocating, recruiting, promoting, supporting and assessing academic and support staff

- Incentives are paid to the Academic Staff after an external evaluation focused mainly on research activities. The information is made public to stakeholders using the Erciyes University Software Academic Data Management System (AVESIS)
- The University has training programmes for Support staff. This activity is organized by Erciyes University Continuing Education Centre (ERSEM)
- OBISIS is used for the assessment of the academic performance of the academic staff. Undergraduates, graduates and exchange students participate in the evaluation process. This OBISIS evaluation has no discernible effect on academic staff.

9.2. Comments

- None of the veterinarians are officially recognised specialists, either national or international. The FVMEU should encourage Academic Staff to obtain specialist training e.g. European or American Diplomate qualifications
- The new teaching-learning methodology focused on the student-centred learning inherent in the EHEA (so-called Bologna process) should be adopted, as it encourages the implementation of teaching training activities i.e. redaction of subject learning outcomes, design of a competences centred curriculum, application of new teaching strategies, the use of new IT education strategies such as e-learning platforms, methodologies for the assessment of the students etc
- The number of Support Staff in many departments is very low, or absent in some. The Faculty should be more creative in employing further numbers of technicians and support staff.

9.3. Suggestions for improvement

- The number of Support Staff in many Departments is very low, or even absent in some Departments
- This results in professional staff having to carry out tasks that could be carried out by staff with technical rather than professional training, leading to a reduced time for professional teaching staff to pursue their research and teaching responsibilities
- The Establishment could “lead the way” in creating a training programme for Veterinary Technicians, proficient in the basics of both scientific methods and animal handling and care. This should be given active consideration.

9.4. Decision

The Establishment is compliant with Standard 9 except for Sub-Standard 9.2.

The Establishment is not compliant with Sub-Standard 9.2 because of:

- Insufficient number of support staff in both the technical and clinical areas

10. Research programmes, continuing and postgraduate education (see Standards 10.1 to 10.4)

10.1. Findings

10.1.1. Brief description of how the research activities of the Establishment and the implication of most academic staff in it contribute to research-based undergraduate veterinary education

- The Faculty ranks, with regard to its research activity, amongst the top 10 in Turkey
- The research activity of the Faculty is mostly funded by the university (Erciyes University BAP). The researchers can also apply for grants to Scientific and Technological Research Council of Turkey (TUBITAK) or to Turkish Accreditation Agency (TURKAK)
- Within the Faculty and university there are research centres and laboratories which attract researchers to the campus and facilitate collaboration, such as: DEKAM, ERUTAM, GENKOK, ERVEK, Equine and Equestrian Application and Research Centre, Vaccine, Research and Development Application and Research Centre (ERAGEM), ERNAM and ETTO) at the Establishment
- Potential PhD students are encouraged to participate in research activities and can apply for their own research grants to the university or the national bodies (TUBITAK 2209-A)
- The teaching staff provide opportunities for students to participate in research programmes on a voluntary basis
- In the Faculty MSc students are enrolled for 4 semesters (2 years), and PhD students for 8 semesters (4 years) after graduation. Some of the PhD training is organized in collaboration with Selkuc and Kırıkkale Faculties of veterinary medicine.

10.1.2. Description of how the postgraduate clinical trainings of the Establishment contribute positively to undergraduate veterinary education and how potential conflicts in relation to case management between post- and undergraduate students are avoided

- Research projects, MSc and PhD programmes, are relevant to the interests of the Faculty and university, the local community and stakeholders
- In order to avoid conflicts between undergraduate and postgraduate students, undergraduate students are supervised by a member of the teaching staff during their clinical training.

10.1.3. Brief description of the process and the implication of staff, students and stakeholders in the development, implementation, assessment and revision of research, continuing and postgraduate education programmes organised by the Establishment

- MSc and PhD programmes are proposed by the departments and then approved by university Senate
- Continuing education programmes are organized by the faculty for undergraduate, postgraduate and stakeholders at their request; in 2018 there were 5 courses at different departments.

10.2. Comments

- Within the Faculty, and generally in Turkey, there are no residency programmes. The faculty members plan to run an internal specialization programme in collaboration with all veterinary faculties in the country, but at the moment they have a limited knowledge concerning EBVS specializations

- Payment for non-research tasks carried out by PhD students (such as teaching, demonstrating and support at practicals) is a common practice in many institutes and faculties. Consideration should be given to the introduction of this policy at FVMEU
- In order to encourage international collaboration and involvement of undergraduate and graduate students in research, consideration should be given to the introduction of a fund that could be used to assist with their attendance at international conferences and training seminars
- The instruction of students in the use of data and their involvement in scientific research is voluntary, rather than compulsory. Students should understand the significance of scientific methods and research techniques relevant to evidence based veterinary medicine.

10.3. Suggestions for improvement

- The final graduation thesis is not mandatory. It is recommended that the Faculty implement an appropriate research-based project for all undergraduate students, in order to improve their knowledge as to scientific methods and research.

10.4. Decision

The Establishment is compliant with Standard 10 except for Sub-Standard 10.2.

The Establishment is partially compliant with Sub-Standard 10.2 because of:

- Students should be trained in scientific and research techniques relevant to evidence-based veterinary medicine

11. Outcome Assessment and Quality Assurance (see Standards 11.1 to 11.10)

11.1. Findings

11.1.1. Description of the global strategy of the Establishment for outcome assessment and Quality Assurance (QA), in order to demonstrate that the Establishment:

-) has a culture of QA and continued enhancement of quality;
-) operates *ad hoc*, cyclical, sustainable and transparent outcome assessment, QA and quality enhancement mechanisms;
-) collect, analyse and use relevant information from internal and external sources for the effective management of their programmes and activities (*teaching, research, services*);
-) informs regularly staff, students and stakeholders and involves them in the QA processes;
-) closes the loop of the QA Plan-Do-Check-Act (PDCA) cycle;
-) is compliant with ESG Standards.

- The Establishment accepts international standards (ESG) and follows national initiatives and regulations in the field of QA since 2015. Since 2010, the Establishment is member of a national association for evaluation and accreditation of veterinary education
- The Establishment has a strategic plan for the period 2017-2022. This document as well as mission statement and vision are published on the Faculty web site. SWOT analysis and operating plan with strategies, objectives and timeframe for implementation (immediate, mid-term, long term) are stated
- There are several commissions participating to the QA system under the coordination of the Faculty Board
- Internal assessment is carried out every year; an external independent assessment is carried out every five years. The reports are made public
- Each unit of the Establishment have meetings at regular intervals to discuss quality issues
- Student course evaluations are carried out by Erciyes University using an on-line survey managed by the Student Information System (OBESIS), but the results are not shared with the Establishment. The Establishment is going to put in place an autonomous questionnaire for students, but as yet no data is available
- Feedback from the EPT collaborators and from animal owners' on VTH services, are collected. Information about academic performances are obtained by research outputs from each department. There is no evidences as to how feedback is used to implement and to review the programme.

11.1.2. Brief description of the specific QA processes for each ESEVT Standards

- The strategic plan, prepared by a Strategic Plan committee and shared with stakeholders, staff and student, is made public on the web site and scheduled for implementation
- The Faculty Board has responsibility to review and update the curriculum. The Dean is responsible for the implementation of the curriculum. The Education Teaching and Coordination commission collects and evaluates proposals and suggestions from staff, students and stakeholders and reviews the course plans for overlaps and consistency once a year. Outcomes are discussed and areas for improvements are detected by the Academic Council meeting once a semester

- Student admission process is managed by the YOK and the Establishment has no autonomy in admission procedures and criteria deciding. Rate and causes of attrition are not monitored
- There is no Assessment Strategy, and currently no mechanism to monitor the appropriateness of assessment
- Information about development, implementation, assessment and revision of the student's assessment strategy are insufficient. The quality of exams is not assessed
- Research laboratory and diagnostic services are approved by a national Accreditation Agency. Research is seen as vitally important and the output is monitored. There are ambitions to increase the number of publications
- Postgraduate programmes are assessed and revised according to SAGENS Guidelines.

11.1.3. Brief description of the process and the implication of staff, students and stakeholders in the development, implementation, assessment and revision of the QA strategy of the Establishment

- Information given by the SER is insufficient
- Internal and external stakeholder commission, academic staff and the head of student council participate within the Quality committee
- The Establishment has implemented the QA system only recently. Outcome assessment, quality assurance and all related processes are under development and not fully operating for all ESVT Standards
- The Establishment does not collect data and analyse measurable indicators for student's attrition, progression and exam outcomes.

11.2. Comments

- The Establishment has only recently adopted an Establishment wide QA policy
- Outcome assessment, quality assurance and all related processes and procedures are under development and not fully operating for all ESVT Standards
- The detailed QA structure and the staff responsible for quality assessment in each of the standards are not clearly identified
- The Establishment does not collect data and analyse measurable indicators for student's attrition, progression and exam outcomes
- The Establishment is failing to use stakeholders, including students, effectively to feedback on its activities and to then suggest improvements
- In relation to most of the standards there is no evidence of an explicit QA loop.

11.3. Suggestions for improvement

- The Establishment should ensure that objectives arising from the annual review are linked to actions and targets, that can then be reviewed in subsequent years
- There should also be specific confirmation of individuals who will be responsible for these actions
- The Establishment should analyse and discuss student opinions about teaching and assessment, and the results should be fed back to the students. Student inputs can be helpful to check the effective alignment of all content, teaching, learning and assessment, and to ensure that the programmes are delivered in a way that encourages students to take an active role in creating the learning process
- The Establishment should review how internal and external stakeholders are involved in its activities, and how their feedback can be ascertained and then used to review the programmes, so enhancing the quality assurance process. This must include the

enrolment of more students on the relevant Commissions.

11.4. Decision

The Establishment is compliant with Standard 11 except for Sub-Standards 11.3, 11.4, 11.7 and 11.9.

The Establishment is partially compliant with Sub-Standard 11.3 because of:

- Delivery of the Programmes must ensure that students are encouraged to take an active role in creating the learning process

The Establishment is partially compliant with Sub-Standard 11.4 because of:

- The Establishment must consistently apply pre-defined and published regulations covering all phases of the student “life cycle”, e.g. student admission, progression, recognition and certification

The Establishment is not compliant with Sub-Standard 11.7 because of:

- Collection, analysis and use of relevant information are insufficient for an effective management of its programme and activities

The Establishment is not compliant with Sub-Standard 11.9 because of:

- The Establishment must monitor and periodically review their programmes to ensure that they achieve the objectives set for them and respond to the needs of students and society. These reviews must lead to continuous improvement of the programme. Any action planned or taken as a result must be communicated to all those concerned.

12. ESEVT Indicators

12.1. Factual information

Name of the Establishment:		Faculty of Veterinary Medicine, Erciyes University			
Name & mail of the Head:		Prof. Dr. Abdullah INCI, ainci@erciyes.edu.tr			
Date of the form Filling:		10.07.2018			
Raw data from the last 3 full academic years		2016	2017	2018 (until October)	Mean
1	n° of FTE academic staff involved in veterinary training	79	82	82	81,0
2	n° of undergraduate students	375	378	392	381,7
3	n° of FTE veterinarians involved in veterinary training	75	77	77	76,3
4	n° of students graduating annually	53	57	58	56,0
5	n° of FTE support staff involved in veterinary training	15	16	16	15,7
6	n° of hours of practical (non-clinical) training	1442	1442	1442	1442,0
7	n° of hours of clinical training	638	638	638	638,0
8	n° of hours of FSQ & VPH training	280	280	280	280,0
9	n° of hours of extra-mural practical training in FSQ & VPH	29	29	29	29,0
10	n° of companion animal patients seen intra-murally	2971	5765	5851	4862,3
11	n° of ruminant and pig patients seen intra-murally	812	1489	1866	1389,0
12	n° of equine patients seen intra-murally	16	21	67	34,7
13	n° of rabbit, rodent, bird and exotic patients seen intra-murally	241	511	513	421,7
14	n° of companion animal patients seen extra-murally	0	0	54	18,0
15	n° of individual ruminants and pig patients seen extra-murally	25	27	40	30,7
16	n° of equine patients seen extra-murally	2	3	5	3,3
17	n° of visits to ruminant and pig herds	59	38	48	48,3
18	n° of visits of poultry and farmed rabbit units	8	8	8	8,0
19	n° of companion animal necropsies	4	3	7	4,7
20	n° of ruminant and pig necropsies	68	79	60	69,0
21	n° of equine necropsies	0	0	1	0,3
22	n° of rabbit, rodent, bird and exotic pet necropsies	53	52	76	60,3
23	n° of FTE specialized veterinarians involved in veterinary training	0	0	0	0,0
24	n° of PhD graduating annually	9	6	8	7,7

FINAL REPORT AS ISSUED BY ECOVE ON 22 NOVEMBER 2018

FVM – Erciyes University SER 2018 • ESEVT INDICATORS

Name of the Establishment:		Faculty of Veterinary Medicine, Erciyes University			
Name & mail of the Head:		Prof. Dr. Abdullah INCI, ainci@erciyes.edu.tr			
Date of the form Filling:		10.07.2018			
Raw data from the last 3 full academic years		Establishment	Median Values1	Minimal Values2	Balance3
I1	n° of FTE academic staff involved in veterinary training / n° of undergraduate students	0,21	0,16	0,13	0,09
I2	n° of FTE veterinarians involved in veterinary training / n° of students graduating annually	1,36	0,87	0,59	0,77
I3	n° of FTE support staff involved in veterinary training / n° of students graduating annually	0,28	0,94	0,57	-0,29
I4	n° of hours of practical (non-clinical) training	1442,00	905,67	595,00	847,00
I5	n° of hours of clinical training	638,00	932,92	670,00	-32,00
I6	n° of hours of FSQ & VPH training	280,00	287,00	174,40	105,60
I7	n° of hours of extra-mural practical training in FSQ & VPH	29,00	68,00	28,80	0,20
I8	n° of companion animal patients seen intra-murally / n° of students graduating annually	86,83	70,48	42,01	44,82
I9	n° of ruminant and pig patients seen intra-murally / n° of students graduating annually	24,80	2,69	0,46	24,34
I10	n° of equine patients seen intra-murally / n° of students graduating annually	0,62	5,05	1,30	-0,68
I11	n° of rabbit, rodent, bird and exotic seen intra-murally / n° of students graduating annually	7,53	3,35	1,55	5,98
I12	n° of companion animal patients seen extra-murally / n° of students graduating annually	0,32	6,80	0,22	0,10
I13	n° of individual ruminants and pig patients seen extra-murally / n° of students graduating annually	0,55	15,95	6,29	-5,75
I14	n° of equine patients seen extra-murally / n° of students graduating annually	0,06	2,11	0,60	-0,54
I15	n° of visits to ruminant and pig herds / n° of students graduating annually	0,86	1,33	0,55	0,32
I16	n° of visits of poultry and farmed rabbit units / n° of students graduating annually	0,14	0,12	0,04	0,10
I17	n° of companion animal necropsies / n° of students graduating annually	0,08	2,07	1,40	-1,32
I18	n° of ruminant and pig necropsies / n° of students graduating annually	1,23	2,32	0,97	0,26
I19	n° of equine necropsies / n° of students graduating annually	0,01	0,30	0,09	-0,09
I20	n° of rabbit, rodent, bird and exotic pet necropsies / n° of students graduating annually	1,08	2,05	0,69	0,38
I21*	n° of FTE specialised veterinarians involved in veterinary training / n° of students graduating annually	0,00	0,20	0,06	-0,06
I22*	n° of PhD graduating annually / n° of students graduating annually	0,14	0,15	0,09	0,05

¹ Median values defined by data from FVMEU with Approval status in 2017

² Recommended minimal values calculated as the 20th percentile of data from FVMEU with Approval status in 2017

³ A negative balance indicates that the Indicator is below the recommended minimal value

* Indicators used only for statistical purpose

13. ESEVT Rubrics (summary of the decision on the compliance of the Establishment for each ESEVT Standard, i.e. (total or substantial) compliance (C), partial compliance (PC) (Minor Deficiency) or non-compliance (NC) (Major Deficiency))

Standard 1: Objectives and Organisation	C	PC	NC
1.1. The Establishment must have as its main objective to provide, in agreement with the EU Directives and ESG recommendations, adequate, ethical, research-based, evidence-based veterinary training that enables the new graduate to perform as a veterinarian capable of entering all commonly recognised branches of the veterinary profession and to be aware of the importance of lifelong learning.	X		
1.2. The Establishment must develop and follow its mission statement which must embrace all the ESEVT standards.	X		
1.3. The Establishment must be part of a university or a higher education institution providing training recognised as being of an equivalent level and formally recognised as such in the respective country.	X		
1.4. The person responsible for the veterinary curriculum and the person(s) responsible for the professional, ethical, and academic affairs of the Veterinary Teaching Hospital (VTH) must hold a veterinary degree.	X		
1.5. The organisational structure must allow input not only from staff and students but also from external stakeholders.	X		
1.6. The Establishment must have a strategic plan, which includes a SWOT analysis of its current activities, a list of objectives, and an operating plan with timeframe and indicators for its implementation.	X		
Standard 2: Finances			
2.1. Finances must be demonstrably adequate to sustain the requirements for the Establishment to meet its mission and to achieve its objectives for education, research and services.	X		
2.2. The finance report must include both expenditures and revenues and must separate personnel costs, operating costs, maintenance costs and equipment.	X		
2.3. Resources allocation must be regularly reviewed to ensure that available resources meet the requirements.	X		
2.4. Clinical and field services must function as instructional resources. Instructional integrity of these resources must take priority over financial self-sufficiency of clinical services operations. Clinics must be run as efficiently as possible.	X		
2.5. The Establishment must have sufficient autonomy in order to use the resources to implement its strategic plan and to meet the ESEVT Standards.	X		
Standard 3: Curriculum			
3.1. The curriculum must be designed, resourced and managed to ensure all graduates have achieved the graduate attributes expected to be fully compliant with the EU Directive 2005/36/EC as amended by directive 2013/55/EU and its Annex V.4.1.	X		
3.2. The learning outcomes for the programme must be explicitly articulated to form a cohesive framework.	X		
3.3. Programme learning outcomes must be communicated to staff and students and: -) underpin and ensure the effective alignment of all content, teaching, learning and assessment activities of the degree programme; -) form the basis for explicit statements of the objectives and learning outcomes of individual units of study; -) be regularly reviewed, managed and updated to ensure they remain relevant, adequate and are effectively achieved.		X	
3.4. The Establishment must have a formally constituted committee structure (which includes effective student representation), with clear and empowered reporting lines, to oversee and manage the curriculum and its delivery. The committee(s) must: -) determine the pedagogical basis, design, delivery methods and assessment methods of the curriculum, -) oversee QA of the curriculum, particularly gathering, evaluating, making change and responding to feedback from stakeholders, peer reviewers and external assessors, and data from examination/assessment outcomes, -) review the curriculum at least every seven years by involving staff, students and stakeholders, -) identify and meet training needs for all types of staff, maintaining and enhancing their competence for the on-going curriculum development.		X	
3.5. The curriculum must include the subjects (input) listed in Annex V of EU Directive 2005/36/EC and must allow the acquisition of the Day One Competences (output) (see Annex 2). This must concern all groups of subjects, i.e. Basic Sciences, Clinical Sciences, Animal Production, Food Safety and Quality, and Professional Knowledge.		X	X
3.6. External Practical Training (EPT) are training activities organised outside the Establishment, the student being under the direct supervision of a non academic person (e.g. a practitioner). EPT cannot replace the core intramural training nor the extramural training under the close supervision of academic staff (e.g. ambulatory clinics, herds visits, practical training in FSQ).	X		
3.7. Since the veterinary degree is a professional qualification with Day One Competences, EPT must complement and strengthen the academic education by enhancing for the student the handling of all common domestic animals, the understanding of the economics and management of animal units and veterinary practices, the communication skills for all aspects of veterinary work, the hands-on practical and clinical training, the real-life experience, and the employability of the prospective graduate.		X	
3.8. The EPT providers must have an agreement with the Establishment and the student (in order to fix their respective rights and duties, including insurance matters), provide a standardised evaluation of the performance of the student during their EPT and be allowed to provide feedback to the Establishment on the EPT programme.	X		
3.9. There must be a member of the academic staff responsible for the overall supervision of the EPT, including liaison with EPT providers.	X		
3.10. Students must take responsibility for their own learning during EPT. This includes preparing properly before each placement, keeping a proper record of their experience during EPT by using a logbook provided by the Establishment and evaluating the EPT. Students must be allowed to complain officially or anonymously about issues occurring during EPT.	X		
Standard 4: Facilities and equipment			
4.1. All aspects of the physical facilities must provide an environment conducive to learning.	X		

FINAL REPORT AS ISSUED BY ECOVE ON 22 NOVEMBER 2018

4.2. The veterinary Establishment must have a clear strategy and programme for maintaining and upgrading its buildings and equipment.	X		
4.3. Lecture theatres, teaching laboratories, tutorial rooms, clinical facilities and other teaching spaces must be adequate in number, size and equipped for the instructional purposes and must be well maintained. The facilities must be adapted for the number of students enrolled.	X		
4.4. Students must have ready access to adequate and sufficient study, self-learning, recreation, locker, sanitary and food services facilities.	X		
4.5. Offices, teaching preparation and research laboratories must be sufficient for the needs of the academic and support staff.	X		
4.6. Facilities must comply with all relevant legislation including health, safety, biosecurity and EU animal welfare and care standards.		X	
4.7. The Establishment's livestock facilities, animal housing, core clinical teaching facilities and equipment must: -) be sufficient in capacity and adapted for the number of students enrolled in order to allow hands-on training for all students -) be of a high standard, well maintained and fit for purpose -) promote best husbandry, welfare and management practices -) ensure relevant biosecurity and bio-containment -) be designed to enhance learning.			X
4.8. Core clinical teaching facilities must be provided in a VTH with 24/7 emergency services at least for companion animals and equines, where the Establishment can unequivocally demonstrate that standard of education and clinical research are compliant with all ESEVT Standards, e.g. research-based and evidence-based clinical training supervised by academic staff trained to teach and to assess, availability for staff and students of facilities and patients for performing clinical research and relevant QA procedures. For ruminants and pigs, on-call service must be available if emergency services do not exist for those species in a VTH. The Establishment must ensure state-of-the-art standards of teaching clinics which remain comparable with the best available in the private sector.			X
4.9. The VTH and any hospitals, practices and facilities (including EPT) which are involved with the curriculum must meet the relevant national Practice Standards.		X	
4.10. All core teaching sites must provide dedicated learning spaces including adequate internet access.	X		
4.11. The Establishment must ensure students have access to a broad range of diagnostic and therapeutic facilities, including but not limited to: pharmacy, diagnostic imaging, anaesthesia, clinical pathology, intensive/critical care, surgeries and treatment facilities, ambulatory services and necropsy facilities.	X		
4.12. Operational policies and procedures (including biosecurity, good laboratory practice and good clinical practice) must be taught and posted for students, staff and visitors.		X	
4.13. Appropriate isolation facilities must be provided to meet the need for the isolation and containment of animals with communicable diseases. Such isolation facilities must be properly constructed, ventilated, maintained and operated to provide for animal care in accordance with updated methods for prevention of spread of infectious agents. They must be adapted to all animal types commonly handled in the VTH.			X
4.14. The Establishment must have an ambulatory clinic for production animals or equivalent facilities so that students can practise field veterinary medicine and Herd Health Management under academic supervision.	X		
4.15. The transport of students, live animals, cadavers, materials from animal origin and other teaching materials must be done in agreement with national and EU standards, to ensure the safety of students and staff and to prevent the spread of infectious agents.	X		
Standard 5: Animal resources and teaching material of animal origin			
5.1. The number and variety of healthy and diseased animals, cadavers, and material of animal origin must be adequate for providing the practical training (in the area of Basic Sciences, Clinical Sciences, Pathology, Animal Production, Food Safety and Quality) and adapted to the number of students enrolled.			X
5.2. It is essential that a diverse and sufficient number of surgical and medical cases in all common domestic animals and exotic pets be available for the students' clinical educational experience and hands-on training.			X
5.3. In addition to the training provided in the Establishment, experience can include practical training at external sites, provided this training is organised under direct academic supervision and at the same standards as those applied in the Establishment.	X		
5.4. The VTH must provide nursing care skills and instruction in nursing procedures.	X		
5.5. Under all situations students must be active participants in the workup of patients, including physical diagnosis and diagnostic problem oriented decision making.	X		
5.6. Medical records must be comprehensive and maintained in an effective retrieval system (preferably an electronic patient record system) to efficiently support the teaching, research, and service programmes of the Establishment.	X		
Standard 6: Learning resources			
6.1. State-of-the-art learning resources must be available to support veterinary education, research, services and continuing education. Timely access to learning resources, whether through print, electronic media or other means, must be available to students and staff and, when appropriate, to stakeholders. State-of-the-art procedures for bibliographical search and for access to databases and learning resources must be taught to undergraduate students.	X		
6.2. Staff and students must have full access on site to an academic library, which is administered by a qualified librarian, an Information Technology (IT) unit, which is managed by an IT expert, an e-learning platform, and the relevant human and physical resources necessary for development by the staff and use by the students of instructional materials.	X		
6.3. The Establishment must provide students with unimpeded access to learning resources which include scientific and other relevant literature, internet and internal study resources, and equipment for the development of procedural skills (e.g. models). The use of these resources must be aligned with the pedagogical environment and learning outcomes within the programme, and have mechanisms in place to evaluate the teaching value of innovations in learning resources.	X		
6.4. The relevant electronic information, database and other intranet resources must be easily available for students and staff both in the Establishment's core facilities via wireless connection (Wi-Fi) and from outside the Establishment via Virtual Private Network (VPN).	X		
Standard 7: Student admission, progression and welfare			

FINAL REPORT AS ISSUED BY ECOVE ON 22 NOVEMBER 2018

7.1. The selection criteria for admission to the programme must be consistent with the mission of the Establishment. The number of students admitted must be consistent with the resources available at the Establishment for staff, buildings, equipment, healthy and diseased animals, and materials of animal origin.	X		
7.2. In relation to enrolment, the Establishment must provide accurate information in all advertisements regarding the educational programme by providing clear and current information for prospective students. Further, printed catalogue and electronic information must state the purpose and goals of the programme, provide admission requirements, criteria and procedures, state degree requirements, present Establishment descriptions, clearly state information on tuition and fees along with procedures for withdrawal, give necessary information for financial aid programmes, and provide an accurate academic calendar.	X		
7.3. The Establishment's website must mention the ESEVT Establishment's status and its last Self Evaluation Report and Visitation Report must be easily available for the public. Not applicable.	X		
7.4. The selection and progression criteria must be clearly defined, consistent, and defensible, be free of discrimination or bias, and take account of the fact that students are admitted with a view to their entry to the veterinary profession in due course.	X		
7.5. The Establishment must regularly review and reflect on the selection processes to ensure they are appropriate for students to complete the programme successfully, including consideration of their potential to meet all the ESEVT Day One Competences in all common domestic species (see Annex 2).	X		
7.6. Adequate training (including periodic refresher training) must be provided for those involved in the selection process to ensure applicants are evaluated fairly and consistently.	X		
7.7. There must be clear policies and procedures on how applicants with disabilities or illnesses will be considered and, if appropriate, accommodated in the programme, taking into account the requirement that all students must be capable of meeting the ESEVT Day One Competences by the time they graduate.	X		
7.8. The basis for decisions on progression (including academic progression and professional fitness to practise) must be explicit and readily available to the students. The Establishment must provide evidence that it has mechanisms in place to identify and provide remediation and appropriate support (including termination) for students who are not performing adequately.	X		
7.9. The Establishment must have mechanisms in place to monitor attrition and progression and be able to respond and amend admission selection criteria (if permitted by national or university law) and student support if required.		X	
7.10. Mechanisms for the exclusion of students from the programme for any reason must be explicit.	X		
7.11. Establishment policies for managing appeals against decisions, including admissions, academic and progression decisions and exclusion, must be transparent and publicly available.	X		
7.12. Provisions must be made by the Establishment to support the physical, emotional and welfare needs of students. This includes, but is not limited to, learning support and counselling services, careers advice, and fair and transparent mechanisms for dealing with student illness, impairment and disability during the programme. This shall include provision of reasonable accommodations/adjustments for disabled students, consistent with all relevant equality and/or human rights legislation.	X		
7.13. There must be effective mechanisms for resolution of student grievances (e.g. interpersonal conflict or harassment).	X		
7.14. Mechanisms must be in place by which students can convey their needs and wants to the Establishment.	X		
7.15. The Establishment must provide students with a mechanism, anonymously if they wish, to offer suggestions, comments and complaints regarding compliance of the Establishment with the ESEVT standards.	X		
Standard 8: Student assessment			
8.1. The Establishment must ensure that there is a clearly identified structure within the Establishment showing lines of responsibility for the assessment strategy to ensure coherence of the overall assessment regime and to allow the demonstration of progressive development across the programme towards entry level competence.			X
8.2. The assessment tasks and grading criteria for each unit of study in the programme must be clearly identified and available to students in a timely manner well in advance of the assessment.	X		
8.3. Requirements to pass must be explicit.	X		
8.4. Mechanisms for students to appeal against assessment outcomes must be explicit.	X		
8.5. The Establishment must have a process in place to review assessment outcomes and to change assessment strategies when required.	X		
8.6. Programme learning outcomes covering the full range of professional knowledge, skills, competences and attributes must form the basis for assessment design and underpin decisions on progression.	X		
8.7. Students must receive timely feedback on their assessments.	X		
8.8. Assessment strategies must allow the Establishment to certify student achievement of learning objectives at the level of the programme and individual units of study.		X	
8.9. Methods of formative and summative assessment must be valid and reliable and comprise a variety of approaches. Direct assessment of clinical skills and Day One Competences (some of which may be on simulated patients), must form a significant component of the overall process of assessment. It must also include the quality control of the student's logbooks in order to ensure that all clinical procedures, practical and hands-on training planned in the study programme have been fully completed by each individual student.		X	
Standard 9: Academic and support staff			
9.1. The Establishment must ensure that all staff are appropriately qualified and prepared for their roles, in agreement with the national and EU regulations. A formal training (including good teaching and evaluation practices, learning and e-learning resources, biosecurity and QA procedures) must be in place for all staff involved with teaching. Most FTE academic staff involved in veterinary training must be veterinarians. It is expected that greater than 2/3 of the instruction that the students receive, as determined by student teaching hours, is delivered by qualified veterinarians.	X		
9.2. The total number, qualifications and skills of all staff involved with the programme, including teaching staff, 'adjunct' staff, technical, administrative and support staff, must be sufficient and appropriate to deliver the educational programme and fulfil the Establishment's mission.			X
9.3. Staff who participate in teaching must have received the relevant training and qualifications and must display competence and effective teaching skills in all relevant aspects of the curriculum that they teach, regardless of	X		

FINAL REPORT AS ISSUED BY ECOVE ON 22 NOVEMBER 2018

whether they are full or part time, residents, interns or other postgraduate students, adjuncts or off-campus contracted teachers.			
9.4. Academic positions must offer the security and benefits necessary to maintain stability, continuity, and competence of the academic staff. Academic staff should have a balanced workload of teaching, research and service depending on their role; and should have reasonable opportunity and resources for participation in scholarly activities.	X		
9.5. The Establishment must provide evidence that it utilises a well-defined, comprehensive and publicised programme for the professional growth and development of academic and support staff, including formal appraisal and informal mentoring procedures. Staff must have the opportunity to contribute to the Establishment's direction and decision making processes.	X		
9.6. Promotion criteria for academic and support staff must be clear and explicit. Promotions for teaching staff must recognise excellence in, and (if permitted by the national or university law) place equal emphasis on all aspects of teaching (including clinical teaching), research, service and other scholarly activities.	X		
Standard 10: Research programmes, continuing and postgraduate education			
10.1. The Establishment must demonstrate significant and broad research activities of staff that integrate with and strengthen the veterinary degree programme through research-based teaching.	X		
10.2. All students must be trained in scientific method and research techniques relevant to evidence-based veterinary medicine.		X	
10.3. All students must have opportunities to participate in research programmes.	X		
10.4. The Establishment must provide advanced postgraduate degree programmes, e.g. PhD, internships, residencies and continuing education programmes that complement and strengthen the veterinary degree programme and are relevant to the needs of the profession and society.	X		
Standard 11: Outcome Assessment and Quality Assurance			
11.1. The Establishment must have a policy for quality assurance that is made public and forms part of their strategic management. Internal stakeholders must develop and implement this policy through appropriate structures and processes, while involving external stakeholders.	X		
11.2. The Establishment must have processes for the design and approval of their programmes. The programmes must be designed so that they meet the objectives set for them, including the intended learning outcomes. The qualification resulting from a programme must be clearly specified and communicated, and refer to the correct level of the national qualifications framework for higher education and, consequently, to the Framework for Qualifications of the European Higher Education Area.	X		
11.3. The Establishment must ensure that the programmes are delivered in a way that encourages students to take an active role in creating the learning process, and that the assessment of students reflects this approach.		X	
11.4. The Establishment must consistently apply pre-defined and published regulations covering all phases of the student "life cycle", e.g. student admission, progression, recognition and certification.		X	
11.5. The Establishment must assure themselves of the competence of their teachers. They must apply fair and transparent processes for the recruitment and development of staff.	X		
11.6. The Establishment must have appropriate funding for learning and teaching activities and ensure that adequate and readily accessible learning resources and student support are provided.	X		
11.7. The Establishment must ensure that they collect, analyse and use relevant information for the effective management of their programmes and other activities.			X
11.8. The Establishment must publish information about their activities, including programmes, which is clear, accurate, objective, up-to date and readily accessible.	X		
11.9. The Establishment must monitor and periodically review their programmes to ensure that they achieve the objectives set for them and respond to the needs of students and society. These reviews must lead to continuous improvement of the programme. Any action planned or taken as a result must be communicated to all those concerned.			X
11.10. The Establishment must undergo external quality assurance in line with the ESG on a cyclical basis.	X		
<i>C: (total or substantial) compliance; PC: partial compliance (Minor Deficiency); NC: non-compliance (Major Deficiency)</i>			

Executive Summary

Erciyes University (the Establishment) is a State University established in 1978. The Faculty of Veterinary Medicine of Erciyes University (FVMEU) is a young veterinary teaching Establishment which only started in 1995.

The relatively rapid expansion of FVMEU has resulted in a current total of 82 academic staff, with 392 students enrolled in the 5-year veterinary curriculum along with 299 master and 73 PhD students.

The main purpose of the FVMEU in requesting an EAEVE Visitation in 2012 was to have some guidance in completing and structuring its premises and curriculum in the most logical and efficient way. After this Visitation in November 2012, a decision of “Non-Approval” was given by ECOVE. This decision followed the identification of 10 major deficiencies and several minor deficiencies.

The current Visitation in 2018 was for the Establishment to ascertain the level they had achieved in remedying these major and minor deficiencies.

The SER was provided on time and written in full agreement with the ESEVT SOP 2016. Unfortunately, it was a document lacking a degree of cohesiveness between the chapters covering the 11 Standards, leading to an unusually long list of questions as sent to the Establishment prior to the Visitation.

The Visitation was very well organised and the Liaison Officer, the Dean and Vice-dean worked well together to develop the schedule of the Visitation, to search for the requested information and to organise all the relevant meetings and visits outside the main faculty buildings.

Areas worthy of praise (i.e. Commendations):

- The Anatomy department has state-of-the art installations for storage, manipulation and handling of the cadavers for dissection
- There is an excellent relationship between the Establishment and its parent University
- A good relationship developing between the Establishment and the community
- Well-funded and relevant research
- Ongoing financial support and then encouragement from University
- Impressive and growing caseload of small animals
- High ruminant caseload intramurally
- Excellent access to clinical cases for year 3-5 students
- An increasing potential for research collaboration within the wider University
- Motivated Staff
- High student morale

Areas of concern (i.e. Minor Deficiencies):

- Ensuring the effective alignment of all content, teaching, learning and assessment activities of the degree programme
- Herd health management teaching should be improved for Day 1 Competence acquisition by students in this area
- Overseeing the QA of the curriculum, particularly in gathering and then evaluating

- feedback from students and other stakeholders
- EPT must complement and strengthen the academic education and have effective academic oversight for its efficacy
 - Facilities must comply with all relevant health, safety and biosecurity standards
 - Operational policies and procedures (including biosecurity, good laboratory practice and good clinical practice must be taught and posted for students, staff and visitors
 - The VTH must meet the relevant National Practice Standards
 - A need to monitor progression and the rate of attrition
 - An absence of a process linking assessment design to programme learning outcomes and the assessment strategy does not ensure the achievement of learning objectives
 - Insufficient quality control of the student's logbooks.
 - Students should be trained in scientific and research techniques relevant to evidence-based veterinary medicine
 - Delivery of the Programmes must ensure that students are encouraged to take an active role in creating the learning process
 - The Establishment must consistently apply pre-defined and published regulations covering all phases of the student "life cycle", e.g. student admission, progression, recognition and certification

Items which are not compliant with the ESEVT Standards (i.e. Major Deficiencies):

- Non-compliance with substandard 3.5 because of insufficient time allocated to practical clinical training for the acquisition of Day One Competences;
- Non-compliance with substandard 3.5 and 4.8 because students do not receive Day One Competence in emergency care on a compulsory basis;
- Non-compliance with Substandard 4.7 because of lack of compliance of the facilities with the appropriate legislation on biosecurity and EU animal welfare and care standards;
- Non-compliance with substandard 4.7 because of the need to embark on the planned development of the VTH for both large animals and companion animals;
- Non-compliance with Substandard 4.13 because of inappropriate management and procedures within the isolation facilities;
- Non-compliance with Substandard 5.1 and 5.2 because insufficient caseload of equine clinical cases and equine and companion animal necropsies for practical training;
- Non-compliance with Substandard 8.1 because there is no clearly identified management structure demonstrating the lines of responsibility for the assessment strategy;
- Non-compliance with Standard 9.2 because of insufficient number of support staff in both the technical and clinical areas;
- Non-compliance with Substandard 11.7 because of insufficient collection, analysis and use of relevant information for an effective management of its programmes and activities;
- Non-compliance with Substandard 11.9 because there is no monitoring and periodical review of the programmes to ensure that they achieve the objectives set for them and respond to the needs of the students and society.

Glossary

EAEVE: European Association of Establishments for Veterinary Education

EBVS: European Board of Veterinary Specialisation

ECOVE: European Committee on Veterinary Education

EPT: External Practical Training

ESEVT: European System of Evaluation of Veterinary Training

ESG: Standards and Guidelines for Quality Assurance in the European Higher Education Area

FVMEU: The Faculty of Veterinary Medicine of Erciyes University

FSQ: Food Safety and Quality

FTE: Full-Time Equivalent

IT: Information Technology

QA: Quality Assurance

SER: Self Evaluation Report

SOP: Standard Operating Procedure

VPH: Veterinary Public Health

VTH: Veterinary Teaching Hospital

Standardised terminology

Accreditation: status of an Establishment that is considered by ECOVE as compliant with the ESEVT Standards normally for a 7 years period starting at the date of the last (full) Visitation;

Establishment: the official and legal unit that organise the veterinary degree as a whole, either a university, faculty, school, department, institute;

Ambulatory clinic: clinical training done extra-murally and fully supervised by academic trained teachers;

Establishment's Head: the person who officially chairs the above described Establishment, i.e. Rector, Dean, Director, Head of Department, President, Principal...;

External Practical Training: clinical and practical training done extra-murally and fully supervised by non academic staff (e.g. practitioners);

Major Deficiency: a deficiency that significantly affects the quality of education and the Establishment's compliance with the ESEVT Standards;

Minor Deficiency: a deficiency that does not significantly affect the quality of education or the Establishment's compliance with the ESEVT Standards;

Visitation: a full visitation organised on-site in agreement with the ESEVT SOP in order to evaluate if the veterinary degree provided by the visited Establishment is compliant with all ESEVT Standards; any chronological reference to 'the Visitation' means the first day of the full on-site visitation;

Visitation Report: a document prepared by the Visitation Team, corrected for factual errors and finally issued by ECOVE; it contains, for each ESEVT Standard, findings, comments, suggestions and identified deficiencies.

Decision of ECOVE

The Committee concluded that the following Major Deficiencies had been identified:

1. Non-compliance with substandard 3.5 because of insufficient time allocated to practical clinical training for the acquisition of Day One Competences;
2. Non-compliance with substandard 3.5 and 4.8 because students do not receive Day One Competence in emergency care on a compulsory basis;
3. Non-compliance with Substandard 4.7 because of lack of compliance of the facilities with the appropriate legislation on biosecurity and EU animal welfare and care standards;
4. Non-compliance with substandard 4.7 because of the need to embark on the planned development of the VTH for both large animals and companion animals;
5. Non-compliance with Substandard 4.13 because of inappropriate management and procedures within the isolation facilities;
6. Non-compliance with Substandard 5.1 and 5.2 because insufficient caseload of equine clinical cases and equine and companion animal necropsies for practical training;
7. Non-compliance with Substandard 8.1 because there is no clearly identified management structure demonstrating the lines of responsibility for the assessment strategy;
8. Non-compliance with Standard 9.2 because of insufficient number of support staff in both the technical and clinical areas;
9. Non-compliance with Substandard 11.7 because of insufficient collection, analysis and use of relevant information for an effective management of its programmes and activities;
10. Non-compliance with Substandard 11.9 because there is no monitoring and periodical review of the programmes to ensure that they achieve the objectives set for them and respond to the needs of the students and society.

The Faculty of Veterinary Medicine, Erciyes University is therefore classified as holding the status of: **NON-ACCREDITATION**.