

**European Association
of Establishments for Veterinary Education**

**Association Européenne
des Etablissements d'Enseignement Vétérinaire**



**REPORT on the STAGE 1 VISITATION to
Kafkas University, Faculty of Veterinary Medicine, Kars, Turkey**

21 – 25 March 2016

by the EXPERT GROUP:

Visitor on Training in Basic Sciences:

László FODOR (Chairman)
Budapest, Hungary

Visitor on Training in Clinical Sciences (Academic):

Arcangelo GENTILE
Bologna, Italy

Visitor on Training in Clinical Sciences (Practitioner):

Liz MOSSOP
Nottingham, UK

Visitor on Training in Animal Production:

Thomas BLAHA
Hannover, Germany

Visitor on Training in Food Safety:

Kurt HOUF
Gent, Belgium

Student Member:

Anna VALKÓ
Budapest, Hungary

EAEVE Coordinator:

Hans Henrik DIETZ
Copenhagen, Denmark

CONTENTS

Introduction

1. Objectives and Strategy

2. Organisation

3. Finances

4. Curriculum

4.1 General Aspects

4.2 Basic Subjects and Basic Sciences

4.3 Animal Production

4.4 Clinical Sciences

4.5 Food Hygiene & Technology and Veterinary Public Health

4.6 Electives, optional disciplines & other subjects

5. Teaching Quality and Evaluation

5.1 Teaching Methodology

5.2 Examinations

5.3 Student Welfare

6. Physical Facilities and Equipment

6.1 General

6.2 Clinical Facilities and Organisation

7. Animals and Teaching Materials of Animal Origin

8. Library and Educational Resources

9. Admission and Enrolment

10. Academic Teaching and Support Staff

11. Continuing Education

12. Postgraduate Education

13. Research

Student's report

Executive summary

Annex 1: Indicators

Annex 2: Decision of ECOVE

INTRODUCTION

The Kafkas University, Faculty of Veterinary Medicine (FVM) in Kars is one of 26 veterinary faculties scattered all over Turkey. The FVM Kars was founded in 1982 and began training of students in 1985. In 1992 the FVM Kars was connected to University of Kafkas, Kars. The city of Kars is situated in the north-eastern corner of Turkey bordering the republic of Armenia.

The FVM graduates veterinarians (DVM) for the Kars and Turkish society and also on an international level with a specific aim at livestock breeding and improvement. Further to this the Faculty has established a cooperation with Azerbaijan Nakhichevan State University Tebietsünasliq with respect to training and education of Azerbaijani students.

The FVM Kars was first evaluated by EAEVE in 2008 with a number of suggested deficiencies

- Virtually no hands-on (clinics, animal production, food hygiene) for students
- Complete absence of pigs in the curriculum
- No monitoring of extramural work
- Inadequate caseload in the clinics
- No quarantine facilities
- Pathology facilities in need of major improvements
- Complete understaffing of support staff

There were improvement of these deficiencies but the team did not consider them as rectified *per se*. The 2016 Self Evaluation Report was prepared according to the EAEVE SOP (2012 Budapest). However, the SER was very short and at some points the full information was not achieved until the time of the visitation.

The team experienced a well organized site visit, excellent hospitality and an open door policy, where all requests from the team were professionally fulfilled.

Suggestions have been made to help the Kafkas University, Faculty of Veterinary Medicine in Kars to improve even further and to continue to make the best of its potential to fulfill the objectives.

The team found evidence of major deficiencies and suggests that the Faculty is not approved at Stage I according to the rules laid down in the SOP.

1 OBJECTIVES & STRATEGY

1.1 Findings

The Faculty of Veterinary Medicine, Kars (FVM-Kars) is a Faculty within the Kafkas University (KAU) with the main campus located at the outskirts of Kars (population of 77,000) with Professor Gürsoy Aksoy serving as dean.

The FVM Kars presents a clear statement of objectives

- to provide high quality training, research and publishing in veterinary science
- to do research in animal husbandry, artificial insemination (AI), food science, clinical science, laboratory diagnostic services, animal nutrition, usage of veterinary drugs, and protection of ecological systems
- to help social and economical development of the region and the country

The education of DVM-graduates and research are the main foci of the FVM Kars and the curriculum is leading to the DVM title.

The faculty lists a number of strengths (SER, p.9).

A strategy is not mentioned in the SER.

1.2 Comments

The FVM Kars among other things lists insufficient financial support for the faculty and lack of administrative and support staff as weaknesses.

During meetings it became clear that the FVM does not have a written strategy.

It is the opinion of the 2016-team that the requirements regarding Objectives as they are laid down in Annex I of the SOP are met.

1.3 Suggestions

- An updated, short and clear strategy should be considered. Such a strategy would include more clearly stated objectives based on a clear and stepwise workplan and might be advantageous to the FVM Kars in the continuous negotiations for staff allocation with government decision makers.
- A clear and operational to-do list with respect to improving the weaknesses of the faculty (SER, p 10) and coping with the financial situation might be valuable in the future negotiations for improved infrastructure, and further improvement of financial support for teaching and research.

2 ORGANISATION

2.1 Findings

The FVM Kars is subdivided into 5 divisions each headed by a division head who must be a veterinarian

- Basic sciences
- Pre clinical sciences
- Clinical sciences
- Animal husbandry and Nutrition
- Food safety and public health

Each of the five divisions are subdivided into a total number of 20 Departments (SER, p15; names of Dept. Heads on SER,p.3).

The FVM activities are located in eight different locations most of them in the same building complex including a teaching hospital. The animal species housed at the faculty farm are cattle, sheep, goats, horses, poultry and dogs. There are five lecture halls, 1 library (and a University library), 1PC lab, 6 research labs and 8 student labs, 39 professors; 11 associate professors; 25 assistant professors; 12 research assistants; 31 technical and administrative staff.

FVM Kars is under the competent authority of the Council of Higher Education/YOK (“The Government”) in Turkey located in Ankara. The University is headed by a rector (Prof., Dr. **Sami Özcan**) who is appointed by the Turkish President for a 4 year period with a possible prolongation for an additional 4 years.

The Rector selects up to 3 vice rectors, 2 have been selected in Kars

- Prof., Dr. **Hidayet Erdogan** (veterinarian, former dean of the FVM)
- Prof., Dr. **Mehmet Citil** (veterinarian)

The University of Kafkas has 11 faculties including the veterinary faculty, each headed by a dean. Animal Science and Agriculture is not part of the Kafkas University.

A diagram of the university administrative organization is presented at page 14 of the SER supplemented by a similar diagram of the administration at faculty level at page 16 (SER).

The Rector is supported by the University Senate (academic affairs) and the University Executive board (implementation of e.g. activity plans and budgetary drafts).

The FVM is academically governed by the University Senate, a body of 35 persons, chaired by the Rector. The members of the senate are Directors of High Schools, Graduate Schools and Deans and 1 senator from each Faculty. Within the senate the FVM is represented by Prof., Dr. **Gürsoy Aksoy** (Dean) and Prof., Dr. **Isa Özyaydin** (member). The Senate meets twice a year.

Professor Gürsoy Aksoy is dean of the FVM and he has 2 vice deans (Vice Dean for Student Affairs (Prof., Dr. Ebru Karadag Sari) and Vice Dean for Finances and Organisation (Prof., Dr. Muammer Tilki). The Dean is selected by the Council of Higher Education among three professors from the

FINAL REPORT AS ISSUED BY ECOVE ON 11 MAY 2016

Faculty suggested by the rector. The Dean appoints a maximum of two vice deans and leads the Faculty Board among other responsibilities listed on the SER p13-14. Deans and vice deans serve for a period of three (3) years and may be prolonged as many times as proposed by the rector. Dean and vice deans are all substituted at the end of their term(s).

The dean is responsible to the rector for all faculty activities, their initiation and their follow-up including teaching, security, student social services, research and scientific publication.

The dean is supported by the Faculty Board which meets 4 times a year and decides on educational, research and service matters. The board consists of the 5 division heads, and three academicians elected by and among professors, two representatives of associate professors elected by and among associate professors and one academician elected by and among assistant professors (a total of 11 persons). The Faculty Board meets 4 times a year and is responsible for education.

Furthermore the dean is supported by the Faculty Executive Board which meets at the dean's discretion and assists the dean with administrative issues including preparation of the budget. This board consists of 3 professors, 2 associate professors and 1 assistant professor all elected for a three year term.

The FVM Kars is organised in 5 Divisions

- Basic Sciences
- Clinical Sciences
- Preclinical Sciences
- Food safety and public health
- Animal Nutrition and Breeding

please refer to the SER (p15) for details on each division.

Division heads are elected for a 3 year period by a department board which in its turn supports the department head.

The FVM Kars has 18 committees/commissions where the remit of each committee is more or less given by its name (e.g. Commission for educational coordination).

2.2 Comments

The FVM Kars has presented a very short description of the organisation, but the team was given relevant answers to all questions pertaining to this standard.

The organisation of the University of Kars which is a sovereign university is presented in an overall way somewhat lacking details about line(s) of command.

The website cannot be reached on the URL <http://www.veterinary.kafkas.edu.tr>, nor from the menu of the website (<http://www.kafkas.edu.tr/>) of the university. The website can be found on the URL <http://www.kafkas.edu.tr/veteriner>, but only in Turkish. The team did not manage to locate the English version, and was furthermore informed that it is not updated.

However, after a fruitful and very open discussion with the dean it became clear that despite the sometimes vague and unclear statements in the SER the FVM Kars

FINAL REPORT AS ISSUED BY ECOVE ON 11 MAY 2016

- has its main focus on teaching the DVM-program
- has adequate autonomy to adapt and develop its structure, organisation and curriculum
- is autonomous in decision making within the allocated budget
- has an organised structure for decision-making within the Faculty
- divisions are coordinated amongst themselves in terms of use of resources, coordination and integration
- must be headed by a veterinarian
- does not have a clear strategy to describe and obtain the desired level for common usage of available opportunities
- does not let students partake in the work of the committees and commissions
- does not get input from the local veterinary chamber with respect to evaluation of the curriculum or other changes at the faculty

A PhD-school (graduate school) for the veterinary program is not mentioned as part of the university organisation. However, there is a graduate school for health sciences.

It is noteworthy that the FVM does not have any commendations or recommendations with respect to the organisational structure.

It is the opinion of the 2016-team that the requirements regarding Organisation as they are laid down in Annex I of the SOP are fully met.

2.3 Suggestions

- The FVM Kars should consider to create an explicit strategy to prioritize its goals and following this a clear strategy for operationalisation and execution
- The website URL should be corrected and the English version updated

3 FINANCES

3.1 Findings

The financial status is partly described in the SER (p18 - 19) and the Faculty clearly states (SER p18) that “..funds by Ministry of Finance is not enough (generally this is the case),...”.

Financial resources stem from

- a. Government budget directly to the faculty
- b. Income generated by the faculty
 - i. Clinical support
 - ii. Farm support
 - iii. Research Fund
 - iv. Extra funding (for acute issues) directly from the rector’s office

There is no specific budget at the level of divisions and departments, but the whole Faculty budget is run by the dean’s office. Division and department heads do not give input to their short and long term fiscal needs. The FVM does not deliver quarterly or annual financial reports.

Income from service activities (animal hospitals, laboratories) goes directly to the FVM budget with no overhead paid to the university.

Students do not pay tuition, neither national nor international students.

Overall the finances are directly managed and supervised by the rectorate and a Faculty budget is prepared based on the previous year expenditure by the rector’s office and approved by the university Board.

In addition to the budget it should be mentioned that certain costs are paid directly by the university (e.g. heating, electricity, water, drainage, student’s transportation) and the rector has extra funding possibilities. The FVM e.g. received an extra 100,000 € in 2015. This amount is not incorporated in Table 3.1 (SER, p18). Major maintenance projects are paid directly by the university while minor maintenance issues are paid by the dean’s office. Further to this

It is the opinion of the 2016-team that the requirements regarding Finances as they are laid down in Annex I of the SOP are met.

3.2 Comments

The FVM Kars did not present its financial situation in a clear and profound way in the SER. However, the Faculty explained in detail and convincingly the overall structure and necessary details about the financial status and the budgeting procedures.

The number of students positively influences the financial situation but the FVM has no influence on this number as it is decided by the government.

Among the numerous ad hoc committees mentioned in Chapter 2 it is striking that there is no Faculty committee following closely and on a day-to-day basis the financial situation to support the dean’s office.

FINAL REPORT AS ISSUED BY ECOVE ON 11 MAY 2016

As the Kars region is considered a remote area in Turkey the salary at all levels is 20 - 25 % higher than in the western part of Turkey.

It is clear from the SER that the FVM would benefit from an increased funding.

The FVM Kars does not reveal a financial strategy and the Dean has little influence on the University funding of the FVM.

Corrections to Table 3.2., SER, p19.

- Pay – should read Salary
- Non Pay – should read Non Salary
- A column (not in the standard) reading Others (= the difference between the Total in Table 3.1. and Total in Table 3.2) should be added. The FVM does not run a surplus but spend all money allocated each year.

3.3 Suggestions

- The FVM Kars should consider to establish a clear strategy to improve the financial situation where possible which e.g. could be increased, external (non-governmental) funding for research, PhD-students, and residency-programmes.

4 CURRICULUM

4.1 GENERAL ASPECTS

4.1.1 Findings

The curriculum of the Kafkas University Kars meets the general requirements Section 5 Article 38 and Annex V point 5.4.1. of the Directive 2005/36/EC and 2013/55/EU on veterinary training. The present curriculum was introduced two years ago, so students following the new curriculum are in the 3rd year. The training lasts for 5 years including two extramural practicals each of 120 hours. The subjects to be included in the curriculum are defined by the government; however the number of hours, the location of the subjects and the electives are decided by the faculty. The curriculum is composed and can be modified by the Committee for Educational Coordination with minor involvement of students, it is finally accepted by the Faculty Board on the basis of the suggestion of the Dean.

Most subjects mentioned in the SOP are included in the curriculum as independent ones or part of others. The structure of the curriculum is similar to that of other establishments, the number of lectures, laboratory practicals and clinical works are appropriate, their ratio is generally well balanced. Self directed learning is not present. Pig diseases and food hygiene aspects of pigs and pig products appear in the curriculum; however pigs are almost neglected compared to the different subjects.

The academic year consists of two 14-week-long semesters, followed by an examination period and a retake period, both are 2 weeks long. The final semester, called “Internship” is devoted mainly to

FINAL REPORT AS ISSUED BY ECOVE ON 11 MAY 2016

clinical lectures and clinical training. Students have to attend at least 70% of the lectures and 80% of the practicals.

The content of the different subjects is defined by the responsible departments, there is no structured harmonisation of the subjects. The school offers a wide range of elective subjects.

The undergraduate curriculum is not divided into Bachelor and Master phases. However, the FVM offers master course as postgraduate training and PhD training.

Students receive “Doctor of Veterinary Medicine” title at graduation and they can work immediately as independent or employed veterinary surgeons. The students need not write diploma work.

4.1.2 Comments

A minimum knowledge on pig pathogens and swine diseases must be part of the Day1 competences of the graduates of FVM Kars.

It is the opinion of the 2016-team that the requirements regarding Curriculum General Aspects as they are laid down in Annex I of the SOP are met.

4.1.3 Suggestions

- Setting up a structured harmonisation of the subjects and involving students in curriculum issues are recommended.
- Increasing knowledge of the graduates on swine diseases is suggested.

4.2 BASIC SUBJECTS & BASIC SCIENCES

4.2.1 Findings

Basic subjects and basic sciences are taught as part of the curriculum and since the knowledge of the incoming students is variable, extra training on physics, chemistry and biology is provided in the first semester. All EU listed basic sciences are in the curriculum, they are mainly taught by veterinary surgeons focusing on clinical aspects and further studies. There is big emphasis on subjects of morphology. The number of theoretical lectures and practicals is generally appropriate; however there are no practicals in immunology.

In addition to the compulsory subjects several optional ones on basic sciences are offered. The curriculum contains certain subjects (Atatürk’s principles, Turkish, English), which are not connected to veterinary medicine but requested by the Turkish law.

Teaching anatomy is mainly based on bones, skeletons, models, formalinised organs and pictures. A total of nine cadavers serve the practical teaching of anatomy in a year. Carcasses after use are buried in the cemetery of the campus.

FINAL REPORT AS ISSUED BY ECOVE ON 11 MAY 2016

The laboratory practicals of basic subjects focus on clinical aspects (examination of blood, urine etc.), at the physiology practicals examinations are made on student owned companion animals or on the students themselves.

The group size at practicals of the basic subjects is ranging between 12 and 35, however the whole class has anatomy practical at the same time. In case of larger groups more teachers are present.

Concept of biosafety is taught within medical biology in the first semester; however implementation of these measures was not evident in the practical rooms of basic sciences. Disinfectant, towels, and eye-washers were missing from all students' laboratories. Students wear their own white coats and boots, while overcoats and belongings of the students are deposited in the laboratories.

4.2.2 Comments

Gaining dissection practice on fresh carcasses is essential.

Waste from anatomy training should be incinerated.

It is the opinion of the 2016-team that the requirements regarding Basic Subjects and Basic Sciences as they are laid down in Annex I of the SOP are met.

4.2.3 Suggestions

- Increasing the number of carcasses, especially fresh ones, including poultry is necessary in teaching anatomy. See also standard 7.
- Organs or parts of carcasses from slaughter house can be used in teaching anatomy.
- Introduction of laboratory practicals on immunology is recommended.
- Concepts of biosafety have to be implemented at the practicals of basic subjects and sciences.

4.3 ANIMAL PRODUCTION

4.3.1 Findings

The Faculty Farm

The Faculty of Veterinary Medicine of the Kafkas University in Kars has a "Faculty Farm", which is an education and research farm within the campus area of the Kafkas University. This farm has the following sections:

- Cattle: 100 cows, 50 heifers and about 100 older calves are kept in a considerably big cattle shed with a milking parlour adjacent to the cattle shed – both the cows and the heifers can use feed lots adjacent to the cattle shed. There are 13 suckling calves kept in calf-huts in an additional smaller barn;
- Sheep and goats: 411 sheep and 114 goats are kept in a barn with an adjacent divided feed lot for separating the sheep and the goats;
- Poultry (400 laying hens and 300 quails, both in cages) are kept in a poultry house, in which also one day-old broiler chickens were reared;
- Horses: 6 horses (a local breed) are kept in a separate house, all six horses are tethered with chains;

FINAL REPORT AS ISSUED BY ECOVE ON 11 MAY 2016

- Geese: 40 geese are kept outdoors, however, there is a goose house for rearing goslings (at present empty, but it is planned to increase the number of geese up to 400);
- Bees: 40 bee hives are in the possession of FVM Kars, but they are transported to the South of Turkey during winter.

This number of food producing animals kept on the farm is absolutely sufficient for demonstrating all students animal husbandry and animal production and for practical training on the farm. When a student becomes an intern, he or she has to participate in education and practices for clinical examinations such as obstetrical and insemination practices. On the farm, also economical management of the farm and feed ration adjustment is taught to students. The cost/benefit balance calculation is part of the course work during the internship on the farm. The Faculty Farm grows most of the forage feed plants itself, but buys supplementing concentrates. The animals are individually recorded and sick animals are taken to the faculty hospital (no drugs on the farm), but all reproduction activities (insemination, obstetrics and calving and lambing) and all vaccination activities are taught on the farm.

Some faculty members of the Division of Animal Nutrition and Zootechnics (Department of Zootechnics; Department of Animal Nutrition, and Department of Animal Management and Economics) have been recently more and more involved in some research projects supported by Tübitak and by university funds.

There is a small pilot slaughterhouse (it is at present not in use) and a teaching dairy plant, which has the capacity to produce cheese and yoghurt from about one ton milk per day (this production and the according teaching, however, takes only place in the summer months).

As for the clinical work with food producing animals, the faculty has two examination rooms and two surgical rooms designed for food animals and horses as well as one facility to demonstrate artificial insemination and one facility to teach obstetrics and gynaecology. There is also an X-ray unit and an ultrasound unit.

Animal Production in the Curriculum

Animal production (husbandry, zootechnics, nutrition, insemination, vaccination, production and economics) is well covered at FVM by the Division of Animal Nutrition and Zootechnics. Animal welfare and veterinary ethics, however, is taught only in the Department of Ethics and Veterinary History of the Division of Basic Sciences. There is no or little coordination between the lectures of these two Divisions.

Herd Health Visits

In the second semester of the 3rd year and the first semester of the 4th year the students must attend herd health visits run by the Division of Animal Nutrition and Zootechnics. There is every week one pre-planned visit for 25 to 40 students (busses are provided). During these two semesters, every student has the opportunity of at least one visit, some students may be on up to three visits. Farms that are visited are mainly cattle farms (from small family farms up to state farms with 100 to 200 cows), sheep flocks (from smaller flocks to one state flock with 1500 sheep) and some goose farms

(various sizes). During these visits, focusing on husbandry skills, nutrition and improving the animal performance is clearly stronger than focusing on biosecurity and animal welfare.

Ambulatory (“Mobile”) Clinic

During the internship of the students, in the fifth year, the students may attend the visits of the ambulatory (“mobile”) clinic run by the Division of Clinical Sciences. The farm visits by the mobile clinic may partly be pre-planned, but also partly initiated by calls of farmers that indicate that they have an animal health problem or a clinical case in their herd or flock. The teacher with the students carry out any necessary veterinary work including the use of drugs – unfortunately, this creates some frictions with the local veterinary practitioners.

4.3.2 Comments

The exposure of the undergraduate students to food producing animals is sufficient including access to the quite big Faculty Farm. However, there is only little demonstration of biosecurity and animal welfare at the farm. The teaching in the three departments of the Division of Animal Nutrition and Zootechnics is, compared to companion animals a major focus of FVM Kars. There is, however, a lack of any coordination between the departments dealing with food producing animals, and no coordination with the Departments of Food Hygiene and of Public Health.

The understanding and teaching of biosecurity and herd health medicine is, compared to animal production in the Division of Animal Nutrition and Zootechnics, and food animal diseases in the Division of Clinical Sciences, poorly developed.

It is for a Turkish Faculty of Veterinary Medicine in a very rural and almost remote area of Turkey very good that apart from the 14 hours of “porcine feed and nutrition disorders” in the 9th semester in the area of “Livestock Medicine and Breeding”, teaching of pigs, pig diseases and pig health is also done as an integrated part of e.g. parasitology.

It is the opinion of the 2016-team that the requirements regarding Animal Production as they are laid down in Annex I of the SOP are met.

4.3.3 Suggestions

- Although there is a good basis for exposing the FVM Kars students to farm animals the biosecurity, the hygiene and the animal welfare should be considerably improved to not only teach these important topics, but also demonstrate them on the Faculty Farm, e.g. horses should NOT be tethered.
- It is highly recommended to set up a structure at FVM that takes leadership in coordinating the curriculum and the actual teaching at the FVM, not only between but also within Divisions.
- There is a special need to coordinate the lectures on veterinary ethics and animal welfare (Department of Ethics and History) with those of the Division of Animal Nutrition and Zootechnics. Additionally, teaching of biosecurity and animal hygiene (reducing and interrupting infection chains in food animal herds and flocks) should be intensified, as well as the teaching of the epidemiology of transboundary diseases.

FVM Kars should look for potential international university partners for accepting FVM Kars students for external internships in swine medicine in case students want to be trained in porcine health management.

4.4 CLINICAL SCIENCES

4.4.1 Findings

The curriculum has a high proportion of clinical science delivery with over 2,000 hours of delivery, approximately 50% of teaching delivery time within the entire curriculum. Half of this is delivered through clinical training, and half through a mix of lectures and lab/desk work. All EU directive/SOP subjects are included and there is an emphasis on surgery and clinical medicine which is in line with other veterinary curricula. Teaching is discipline based. A range of elective topics are also offered to students in clinical science, including subjects such as large animal medicine and surgery, and First Aid. However most of these subjects are not delivered as clinical training, but rather as lectures and non-clinical animal work.

Final year students carry out internships (workplace based learning) in the clinic across all departments. Third and fourth year students also spend time in the clinic working alongside the interns. Students are responsible for admitting all patients, including history taking and communicating with the client. A schedule is set for the students in the clinic and each teacher has responsibilities for small groups of students at different times. Students keep a log of their skills which are signed off by the clinician. Group size in the clinic is variable depending on case load; typically there will be 12 students observing a small animal operation.

In buiatrics, cattle numbers are high, and farmers generally bring cases to the school (a mobile clinic is rarely used). The school has its own transportation for farmers should this be needed. However, equines are not commonly transported to the school and the decrease in use of the mobile clinic means equines are rarely seen in the clinic. The number of canine cases seen is increasing due to an increase in pet ownership in the city.

The hospital offers an informal 24 hour emergency service, but students are not involved in this. Clients arrive ad hoc during daytimes with no scheduled appointments.

Hospitalisation facilities are very limited for all species, and students are not involved in overnight care, this is the responsibility of the clinician. Isolation facilities are present but currently unusable, there is no intensive care facility or proper facility for equine surgery, so these clinical subjects cannot be properly delivered.

During quiet times in the clinics, students may be given seminars and can access material from previous cases on request to the relevant clinician. They can also attend the farm and practice clinical examination of all species.

The total number of necropsies is low – whilst cattle (mostly calves) and sheep predominate, there are virtually no necropsies in equines, dogs and cats. Post mortem facilities are adequate for smaller

species (sheep, calves, dogs) but for larger animals must be carried outdoors at the cemetery with no facilities.

Students take part in two periods of extra-mural studies, 15 days agriculture or research and 15 days clinical practice with an experienced veterinarian as supervisor. The faculty will assist with finding placements if necessary and this placement can also occur at the faculty. The students are insured by the university for liability and accidents.

4.4.2 Comments

There are adequate hours and balance of clinical science teaching within the curriculum. Ratios R6 and R7 are met.

Students have to take it in turn to obtain direct practical experience and because of the low case numbers this is extremely limited in small animals and equines, with very low opportunities for surgery in particular – very few students are able to undertake ovariohysterectomy. Case load for equines and small animals is too small, even though it is increasing. This issue is addressed in Standard 7.

Overall, there is not enough practical hands-on experience provided in the clinics, despite the high bovine numbers. This is a potential major deficiency.

There is no 24/7-service with student participation. This is a potential major deficiency.

The attempt to develop a relationship with the municipal kennels was a very good strategy, but this has failed.

The faculty clearly has a good relationship with local farmers who provide a good number of cases and are charged very little for examinations and treatment.

The student responsibility for admitting the patients is helpful for their learning.

Interpreting the balance of species delivery is difficult because teaching is by discipline. A previous deficiency was noted around the delivery of pig disease, whilst pigs are listed within elective topics it is hard to see from the SER where they occur in the core curriculum. The team were told verbally that pig teaching is included where relevant. Some species based teaching would also help this issue and ensure the balance of teaching between species is correct.

Hospitalisation facilities are very limited for all species. This is a potential major deficiency.

Isolation facilities are ill used and not suitable for isolation purposes. This is a potential major deficiency.

There are discrepancies in the total number of hours spent in clinics between the SER and timetables provided during the visit, the numbers in the SER are over-estimated and this was corrected during the visitation.

There is little coordination between departments and so overlap of subjects occurs, equally some topics could be omitted for this reason. There is also overlap between core and elective topics; the

department responsible for the teaching decides what is delivered in each area. A small curriculum committee has planned the new curriculum without the input of students or many of the teachers. The Faculty Board has approved this curriculum.

There is little integration between public health, pathology and other relevant disciplines which is not an economic strategy.

It is the opinion of the 2016-team that the requirements regarding Curriculum Clinical Sciences as they are laid down in Annex I of the SOP are NOT met.

4.4.3 Suggestions

- A 24/7-service including students must be established.
- The isolation facilities must be cleared, cleaned, renovated and kept tidy.
- Consideration of species based teaching in the clinical part of the curriculum should be made. The newly proposed small animal hospital would allow this division to occur in the clinics.
- The ambulatory clinic should be properly utilised and focus on equine treatment if possible in order to increase the case load.
- An attempt to re-establish the relationship with the municipal kennels should be initiated, with treatment subsidised by the faculty instead of relying on payment. Alternatively a relationship should be developed with the local private practitioners to allow students to work alongside them.
- More attempts to increase the necropsy case load should be undertaken and facilities for large animal necropsies improved.
- The length of the clinical EMS placement should be extended in order to allow students to develop more skills. This placement should always occur outside the faculty.

4.5 FOOD HYGIENE & TECHNOLOGY AND VETERINARY PUBLIC HEALTH

4.5.1 Findings

Generally the teaching of the different topics in food hygiene and legislation, food microbiology, technology and veterinary public health (VPH) are under the supervision of 1 of the 5 faculty's divisions: the Division of Food Safety and Public Health, comprising two departments: Dept. of Food Hygiene and Production, and the Department of Public Health. Academic staff consists of 3 associate and 1 assistant professors. There is one research assistant (currently on maternity leave), but no technical staff and PhD students are currently present. The division has constructed the food hygiene and technology/VPH curriculum in line with both Turkish and European legislation, and takes care that all main requirements within the EAEVE SOP and the EU regulations, including the requirements for official veterinarians in EU 854/2004, and animal welfare in the transformation phase, are at least to some extent included.

The facilities are in good working order and consist of two rather small labs, and a place for cleaning in the main building, all used for practical training in basic food microbiology and chemical analysis. A pilot slaughterhouse and a dairy plant are present on the campus. The dairy

FINAL REPORT AS ISSUED BY ECOVE ON 11 MAY 2016

plant has a capacity of 1 ton milk per day and is fully equipped and running for the production of different kinds of cheese and yoghurt. Students are actively involved in both dairy technology and hygiene procedures, and a HACCP system is in place. The pilot slaughterhouse at the faculty is currently not used for teaching. It does have the infrastructure to slaughter ruminants and poultry at a low capacity. Meat inspection is taught in the municipal slaughterhouse, 20 minutes drive outside the campus. It is a small capacity slaughterhouse for cattle and sheep, and has no EU export license. Students are taken there by the faculty bus.

Lectures are given in both the current and the new curriculum, four blocks of compulsory lectures, each 14 weeks of 2 hours per week, are scheduled in semester 7: food hygiene and control (including HACCP and risk analysis), and VPH, and semester 8: meat hygiene and technology, and dairy hygiene and technology. Each is taken care of by a different member of the staff.

Lecture material is available for the students under the form of pdf and/or PowerPoint slides. Relevant handbooks in Turkish are available to the lectures as a basis for the lecture, but are not compulsory for the students.

Lectures on porcine zoonosis and meat inspection, as well as stunning at slaughter are included in the theoretical lectures.

Practical lectures are given by the lecturers themselves. Practical training in food hygiene and control includes 28 hours of basic microbiological and chemical analysis of drinking water and animal originated foods such as milk and milk products, meat and meat products, eggs and fish. Materials used during practical work are obtained by the lecturers. Training is provided in 2 groups of approximately 35 students each. Practical training in food technology mainly focus on dairy technology, and takes places in the faculty dairy plant. Meat technology is demonstrated using video material. Meat inspection comprises 28 hours of practical training currently carried out in the municipal slaughterhouse. Training mainly focuses on ruminants, and includes both ante and post mortem inspection by the students, under the supervision of the lecturer.

Approximately 6% of the curriculum (256h/4280h) is spent on food hygiene and technology and veterinary public health. Major matrices included are red meat (ruminants), poultry (chicken and geese), and milk and dairy products.

4.5.2 Comments

The department of VPH is only recently created and is still struggling to find a delineated though complementary structure within the division.

Both organisation and content of the electives in VPH (semester 9) as well as in food hygiene and production (semester 10) have still to be prepared.

There is no real integration or collaboration from other departments, although the division checks that necessary basic knowledge e.g. on zoonotic bacteriology, virology and parasitology is covered in years 1 to 3.

It is the opinion of the 2016-team that the requirements regarding Food Hygiene & Technology and VPH as they are laid down in Annex I of the SOP are fully met.

4.5.3 Suggestions

- Demonstration material e.g. pictures of *post mortem* lesions and video material should be made available on a continuous basis to the students, e.g. via an internet platform.
- International textbooks on food sciences and VPH should be made more easily available both for lecturers and students.
- The division could benefit from a regular organised meeting with the other Turkish colleagues in food sciences and VPH to discuss and exchange teaching materials and experiences.
- The division should attract PhD and master students to support the teaching staff as well as to extend the research.

4.6 ELECTIVES, OPTIONAL DISCIPLINES & OTHER SUBJECTS

4.6.1 Findings

A comprehensive list of electives is offered to the students. Electives are spread all over the five years study period. Each semester, students can choose among 5 electives, with a minimum of at least one elective subject to be taken per semester. Each offered elective is limited to a group of maximum 30 students.

During the 9th semester the list of electives (called: veterinary field courses) is divided according to the professional branch:

- a) Farm animals, veterinary medicine and breeding (15 subjects)
- b) Small animals, veterinary medicine and breeding (15 subjects)
- c) Poultry, veterinary medicine and breeding (13 subjects)
- d) Food safety and public health (8 subjects)

The list of the electives indicates the number of ECTS for each of them. Students have to choose the above mentioned electives in order to obtain 10 ECTS.

4.6.2 Comments

The list of electives is quite long and complete, and subjects are allocated consistently according to the rationality of basic courses in the first years and professional courses in the last years.

It is the opinion of the 2016-team that the requirements regarding Electives as they are laid down in Annex I of the SOP are fully met.

4.6.3 Suggestions

- None.

5 TEACHING QUALITY & EVALUATION

5.1 TEACHING METHODOLOGY

5.1.1 Findings

The content of the subjects is defined by the teachers, there is no harmonisation between the departments.

Teaching is based on lectures, practicals and clinical work. Theoretical lectures follow face-to-face conventional methods; they are supported with power point presentations. Power point presentations are given to students upon request, some of them are uploaded on the homepage of the establishment. Teachers are available for consultations if students need it. Lecture notes written by

FINAL REPORT AS ISSUED BY ECOVE ON 11 MAY 2016

staff members or teachers of other schools are recommended. A selection of textbooks written in Turkish is available in most subjects.

There is no 24-hour service, students are only on duty during working hours on weekdays. Interaction with clients and hands-on experience are provided, but students cannot perform surgery alone, only a few steps of the whole procedure supervised by practical teachers. The group size of interns is big, there are 15 students observing one surgery.

Pedagogical training is offered by FVM Kars but teachers generally do not attend it.

Academic staff members teach not only veterinary students but students of other faculties too. Veterinarians from outside the faculty are not invited as guest lecturers to the FVM Kars.

Problem based learning is not applied at FVM Kars. A logbook is used in the evaluation of learning outcomes regarding clinical skills.

Students can evaluate teaching of different subjects and teachers using a uniform questionnaire, however these feedback forms go to the Dean and the Vice Dean for Education. Teachers do not get information on the outcome of the evaluation, there is no student feedback, and there is no effect of the evaluation.

5.1.2 Comments

A formalised analysis of the feedback results would improve the teaching activity of the academic staff.

Setting up 24-hour service may increase the caseload allowing more students to perform surgery.

It is the opinion of the 2016-team that the requirements regarding Teaching Methodology as they are laid down in Annex I of the SOP are met.

5.1.3 Suggestions

- Structured evaluation of the feedback forms is recommended.

5.2 EXAMINATIONS

5.2.1 Findings

Veterinary training at Kars University comprises 5 years (with a maximum of 8), including 10 semesters, each representing 30 ECTS. Examination dates are decided by the faculty council in advance, but the departments choose the type of examination (oral, written, practical, multiple-choice questions, clinical examination, continuous assessment or all), provided the decision is confirmed by the faculty council.

In each semester, per course, there are three examination sessions: mid-term, final and make-up examination. Mid-term exams take place while teaching continues, approximately 8 weeks after the start of the semester, and is followed by the final exam at the end of each semester. Students have to take the final exam at the end of each semester. In calculating students' grades, 40 % mid-term

examination grades and 60 % of the final or make-up examination grades are considered. Students are successful if lecture success grades are 60 and above (CC and above, 2.00 and above). Students failing the final examination have to take the make-up examination after two weeks. If students fail to turn up for the make-up exam on the chosen day, the lecturer records it as 'no-show'. The entry 'no-show' equals failure. In the case of a no-show because of a valid reason the entry 'no-show' is cancelled if proof of a valid reason is submitted. In this situation that student takes an extra exam.

Students can retake examinations as many times as needed, though within the maximum time frame of 8 years. It is not required that students sit and pass examinations in basic subjects before continuing to later disciplines. The only limitation is at the last semester, which cannot be started if a student failed more than two whole subjects. At present, there are no external examiners, and no exam quality control is in place.

5.2.2 Comments

Many topics within the veterinary curriculum are built on subsequent and necessary knowledge. The possibility of proceeding within the curriculum without completing previous subjects (passing the examination) is a risk for efficient education.

The limitless retake of examinations can have a bad impact on the motivation of students to keep to the curriculum of five years.

It is the opinion of the 2016-team that the requirements regarding Examinations as they are laid down in Annex I of the SOP are met.

5.2.3 Suggestions

- Lectures could benefit from (central) organized training possibilities to prepare examination forms as MCQ and exam scoring.

5.3 STUDENT WELFARE

5.3.1 Findings

The faculty offers different measures supporting student welfare. The general student support is one of the strengths of the faculty, there are good connections between students and teachers. Students can ask for further explanation from all professors at any time, and senior students support more junior students. Officially, the vice-dean for student affairs deals with the personal problems of the students. Problems can be told by the representatives of each year personally or students can use the faculty's website to send messages individually. Academic staff acts as guidance counsellors for the group of students they are teaching, because the faculty does not have a professional in this role. Career planning and management is also a topic during lectures from the Department of Veterinary History and Deontology.

Students have the opportunity to participate in the Erasmus programme, and spend their internship of the 10th semester in other Turkish faculties or abroad, but only in a limited number.

There are several canteens in the faculty, which are used often by students for eating, gathering and studying. There are no study rooms, studying can be done in empty lecture halls, canteens and libraries. There are several clubs and sport teams of the faculty, but there are no student meeting rooms in the faculty, students arrange meetings in the city centre of Kars themselves. Wireless internet is available everywhere on campus and students can also use lockers free of charge.

At the moment there is no student involvement in faculty management.

Biosafety is supervised by teachers in laboratories and clinics. White coats and boots have to be brought by students, but gloves and masks are provided by the faculty. There are no eye washers or eye protectors and antiseptics or disinfectants are missing sometimes. Students have governmental health insurance and liability insurance is provided by the university. Vaccination against rabies or other infectious diseases can be made voluntarily, but is not common among students. The Medical Faculty of the university has a hospital on campus, which services can be used by veterinary students.

5.3.2 Comments

Students have limited locations for studying quietly or in small groups informally.

It is the opinion of the 2016-team that the requirements regarding Student Welfare as they are laid down in Annex I of the SOP are met.

5.3.3 Suggestions

- Biosafety measures should be enforced for students at all times.
- The Commission for Educational Coordination should have a student member. Students should have membership of other committees where relevant
- Establishing a quiet study room for students would be beneficial.
- Students should be encouraged by the faculty to form an International Veterinary Students Association chapter for Kars so that they can participate in exchange programmes

6 PHYSICAL FACILITIES & EQUIPMENT

6.1 GENERAL ASPECTS

6.1.1 Findings

The veterinary faculty is located on the large main campus of the Kafkas University near the city of Kars. The teaching units, lecture halls, laboratories, autopsy room are can be found in three buildings connected to each other. The teaching hospital and the slaughter house together with the dairy plant are placed in two other buildings. The faculty farm is in a walking distance from the main buildings of the faculty, there are 4 buildings used for housing of different animal species. There are four lecture halls each with 99 seats, 4 with 50 seats and one with 100 seats.

The clinical building was built in 1995, the main buildings were erected in 2000. The other buildings were built between 2001 and 2008. The facility is purpose made, its general condition is good; however, certain renovation is getting necessary. The quality of the floor in some rooms is

FINAL REPORT AS ISSUED BY ECOVE ON 11 MAY 2016

not only poor but can be dangerous. The buildings, the corridors and the rooms are generally spacious.

The post mortem room cannot be used for the necropsy of large animals.

Students have no room, where they could read and study between lectures or practicals.

Disinfectant and towels are not available in the laboratories, necropsy room and in the examination rooms of the clinics.

Safety equipment (eye washers, first-aid-kit etc) in most areas is missing and the FVM does not have a health and occupational politics or a health and safety officer.

The university provides transportation for students.

Equipment in some laboratories is up-to-date, while in most laboratories it is old but functioning.

6.1.2 Comments

None of the lecture halls have enough seats for a whole class.

Biosafety measures have to be active and controlled all around the establishment.

Safety procedures and safety equipment is missing, which is a potential major deficiency.

A facility for necropsy of all major species is necessary.

It is the opinion of the 2016-team that the requirements regarding Physical Facilities and Equipment as they are laid down in Annex I of the SOP are NOT met.

6.1.3 Suggestions

- Safety procedures for students and staff and safety equipment must be prioritized.
- The necropsy room and its ante room have to be completely rebuilt.
- Biosafety procedures should be enforced in all areas of the FVM.
- Continuous renovation of the facility is recommended.

6.2 CLINICAL FACILITIES & ORGANISATION

6.2.1 Findings

The clinical facilities (including the teaching hospital) are located in the “fourth building” and are under the responsibility of the Division of Clinical Science. This division is structured in five clinical departments:

- a) Department of Surgery
- b) Department of Internal Medicine
- c) Department of Obstetrics and Gynaecology
- d) Department of Artificial Insemination and Reproduction
- e) Department of Wild Animal Disease and Ecology

FINAL REPORT AS ISSUED BY ECOVE ON 11 MAY 2016

The total academic staff belonging to the clinical division consists of 30 veterinarians. None are diplomats of the European Board of Veterinary Specialisation (EBVS).

The teaching hospital includes the following rooms:

- 3 laboratories (1 laboratory for semen evaluation; 1 laboratory for clinical diagnostics, equipped with adequate devices for clinical pathology and gas analysis and haematology; 1 laboratory for gynaecology and obstetrics); inpatient tests only are carried out by these laboratories
- 1 demonstrating room for surgical procedures;
- 1 room for x-ray diagnostic, equipped with digital x-ray-device. The device is of good standard although access to the room for large or very lively animals could be difficult.
- 1 sterilization room, used also for the storage of surgical equipment;
- 1 examination room for wild animals;
- 1 examination room for companion animals;
- 2 operating theatres for companion animals surgery (one for orthopaedics and one for soft tissues surgery, connected to each other by a preparatory room);
- 2 rooms for examination and/or surgical procedures on small ruminants or calves
- 3 examination/operation rooms for large animals (equipped with stocks adequate for abdominal surgery and other surgical procedures)
- 1 premise with 8 boxes for the hospitalization of large animals (actually mostly adequate for bovine)
 - 1 premise with 2 boxes for hospitalization of large animals (actually mostly adequate for bovine), however the time of the visit the boxes were occupied by hospitalized wild birds
- 1 premise with 3 boxes for isolating hospitalization of large animals (according to the SER), but currently not used as isolation unit.
- a completely new facility is being built as “Wild Animal Treatment and Rehabilitation Centre”, financed by the Ministry of Forestry and Water Affairs and that will be handed over to the university and promised to be supported for the future by the ministry itself .
- some of the examination rooms are provided with camera remote control, connected with some professors’ offices and other didactic rooms.

The clinical division is equipped with the following diagnostic equipment, mostly shared by different departments.

- Two ultrasound machines, one very old (> 12 years) and one 5 years old (but mainly suited for gynaecology)
- Two x-ray devices, one mobile and one digital
- One new video endoscope
- One quite outdated breathing circuit for anaesthesia in small animals
- Portable blood gas analyser
- Automatic chemistry analyser for clinical pathology
- Automatic cell counter for haematology

The flow of the animals presented at the clinic is the following:

FINAL REPORT AS ISSUED BY ECOVE ON 11 MAY 2016

- Final year students receive the animals and register the owner's personal data as well as the animal signalment, anamnesis and prior treatment.
 - Record keeping of the examined animals is departmental with no centralised computerized system: the record books are kept at the reception, divided by discipline.
 - In the record books also the name of the accepting students is indicated.
 - Owners pay an entrance fee and then further fees according to procedures carried out and drugs required
- In case of large animal, the transfer from the owner's lorry to the investigation room is managed directly by students.
- Clinician on duty examines the patient
 - There is neither a species orientation nor a discipline orientation among the veterinarians. They take care of the clinical case according to a rotation of duty. A list of the rotation of the duty of veterinary staff for each department was shown to the team during the visit.
- If necessary samples are taken and brought by students to the laboratory for investigation.
 - The laboratory does not carry out external services
- There is good collaboration and animals are referred to other colleagues if necessary for further investigation (e.g. x-ray, ultrasound, surgery).
- If necessary animals are operated on by surgeons.
- If necessary animals are sent to pathology for necropsy or are buried in the cemetery of the faculty
 - It is not clear whether all dead animals are effectively used for didactic necropsies. This is particular valid for adult large animals whose post mortem examination is not possible at the pathology department due to the lack of an appropriate necropsy room.

Owners pay an entrance fee and then, according to the treatment, an additional fee at the end of the stay at the clinic, including surgery and drugs used. Fees are heavily subsidised by the faculty.

If there are few patients available for students, lecturers may provide them with some non clinical work (mainly in the demonstrating room). However the material to be used for this demonstration is quite scarce.

The faculty (department of pathology) has a facility for postmortem gross pathology diagnostic that can be used exclusively for companion animals, small ruminants, calves and wild animals.

- There is no hoist for moving cadavers and the cadavers have to be pulled into the room. The necropsy room is very poor to satisfy updated requirements for biosecurity. Also the necropsy tools (knives, forceps, scissors and so on) were quite old and worn. No specific necropsy attire (such as boot or safety glasses/face masks) is made available to the students. No basic cleaning supplies (e.g. disinfectant solution) were present at the moment of the visit of the expert team.

FINAL REPORT AS ISSUED BY ECOVE ON 11 MAY 2016

- The remains of cadavers used for necropsy are buried in the so called «cemetery area» located not far away from the farm. In this area bones and skulls of in the past buried animals are present on surface.
- No rooms for post mortem examination of large animal is present at the clinic and necropsy (actually very few) are eventually carry out in the above mentioned «cemetery area», in the open.

6.2.2 Comments

There is good collaboration between the different departments (e.g. internal medicine and surgery), assisted by the fact that all clinical departments are in the same buildings. However, division of cases according to animal species and/or according to speciality is not present.

The equipment in the investigation and surgical rooms is commonly worn and unsuitable. One of the diagnostic rooms for large animals contained a dangerous uncovered drain with potential for injury.

There is no provision for hospitalizing patients in critical care. There is no intensive care unit or suitably qualified veterinarians to deliver a critical care service.

The area described in the SER as an isolation unit was used for different purposes at the time of the visit (hospitalization of wild birds). The team considered this situation as lack of adequate isolation facility for both large and small animals.

Hospitalisation facilities are very limited for all species. This is a potential major deficiency.

Isolation facilities are ill used and not suitable for isolation purposes. This is a potential major deficiency.

The lack of a regular use of the mobile clinic is not appropriate, this would increase case exposure for students especially in equines.

The teaching hospital does not provide an official 24h service, for either large or small animals. Veterinarians are available for on call service, but the support to their activity from the student or from support staff is only on a voluntary basis.

There is no 24/7-service with student participation. This is a potential major deficiency.

The diagnostic instrumentation is sufficient for executing essential diagnostic procedures: however new / modern devices should be strongly considered in order to improve and increase the quality of the clinical service.

The faculty lacks adequate facilities for carrying out necropsies in adult cattle and horses. The existing necropsy room used for small animals requires improvements with respect to biosecurity and cleaning management (e.g. eye wash, protective equipment for students).

It is the opinion of the 2016-team that the requirements regarding Clinical Facilities and Organisation as they are laid down in Annex I of the SOP are NOT met.

6.2.3 Suggestions

The establishment of an adequate necropsy room for large animals should be considered a priority, as well as improving equipment and supplies to the existing necropsy room

The finalizing of the planned building of a new companion animal clinic is strongly suggested and urgently recommended. In the new building the presence of an isolation unit should be taken into consideration, as well as intensive care facilities. The new clinic also presents an opportunity to consider division of staff by species.

All the examination/operating rooms should have furniture and equipment replaced in order to allow disinfection and appropriate biosecurity.

Some diagnostic equipment should be replaced, or additional equipment purchased. This may indirectly increase referral of companion animals (e.g. new device for ultrasound, anaesthesia, intensive care). The same can be said in respect to instruments that can help to increase the quality of clinical activity for the sports horses that are present in Kars (e.g. new device for musculoskeletal ultrasound, artificial vagina for stallion collection).

The current isolation unit requires cleaning and removal of wildlife cases so that it can be used properly for small and large infectious cases.

A change to clinic organization should be considered, with particular attention to species orientation. Further division according to EBVS categories should be considered.

The concept of the mobile clinic has to be completely reconsidered, and corresponding contractual arrangements should be set up. The contact with the kennels should be reconsidered.

The teaching hospital should provide a 24/7 service and include students in delivery

The introduction of an electronic system for recording clinical records is strongly recommended.

7 ANIMALS & TEACHING MATERIALS OF ANIMAL ORIGIN

7.1 Findings

7.1.1 Anatomy

Models, skeletons, and formaldehyde fixated organ systems are available in all species, and some plastinated specimens are also used. The department has (one) ruminant, (one) equine, swine (one) and (one) poultry models. Cadaver numbers are low and only cattle, horses, dogs and a cat are recorded. The SER states that internal organs from ruminants post slaughter house are also utilised for teaching. Cadaver pools are present for formaldehyde fixations. Framed images are available for students to learn from.

7.1.2 Pathology

FINAL REPORT AS ISSUED BY ECOVE ON 11 MAY 2016

The number of necropsies being performed averages 197 per year, predominantly sheep, followed by cattle (mostly calves) and poultry. Equine numbers are very small. Cadavers are sourced from the hospital, faculty farm and external farms.

7.1.3 Animal production

263 cattle, 411 sheep, 114 goats as well as several hundred poultry (chickens, quail and geese) are kept at the education and research farm on campus. 6 horses and 2 donkeys are kept as well as bees. The farm is utilised for practical teaching e.g. husbandry throughout the curriculum, and clinical cases are brought to the hospital as necessary. The reproduction and AI departments carry out practical work with students on the farm-kept animals.

7.1.4 Food hygiene and public health

There is a pilot slaughterhouse on campus for students to learn ante- and post mortem inspection and the slaughtering process. Students visit the local municipal slaughterhouse for learning ante and post mortem inspection additionally. There is also a milk processing plant. Materials for food microbiology and chemical analysis used during practical work are obtained by the lecturer

7.1.5 Teaching hospital

The teaching hospital has five departments – surgery, internal medicine, obstetrics and gynaecology, reproduction and AI, wild animals and ecology. All species are treated in one hospital and there is no species divisions for departments. A new companion animal hospital is planned for the future.

7.1.6 Consultations and patient flow

Approximately 1,600 animals per year are examined at the teaching hospital. Dog and cat cases are low (324/year) but increasing. Cattle and sheep are strongly represented. Equine cases are very low (30 per year). Students take responsibility for registering the patients and taking the history. Record keeping is on paper and kept by each department.

At the moment of the individual expert's visit the record books indicated the following figures related to animal completely admitted to the different department as from January (three months activity):

- Cattle = 458
- Horses = 5
- Small ruminants = 24
- Cats = 33
- Dogs = 80
- Wild Animals = 4

There are no nurses or technicians present in the hospital

7.1.7 Vehicle for animal transport

This is available but rarely used, in general farmers bring their own animals.

7.1.8 On-call emergency service

This is provided informally but students are not involved.

7.1.9 Mobile clinic and other on farm services/outside teaching

A vehicle with a capacity of 15 is utilised for taking students to farms. There are no records of how many cases are seen except in reproduction where 300 ruminants per year are seen.

There is a shelter in Kars housing approximately 300 dogs but no contract is currently running for providing stray dogs to the teaching hospital to be used for teaching purposes. A contract was active in the past but was rescinded because the municipality did not pay for the drugs used for the treatment.

7.2 Comments

The welfare standards of the farm are poor for some species e.g. the horses which were tethered for the majority of the day.

The pilot slaughterhouse is rarely used and most of the teaching takes place in the municipal facility. It is not practical to transport organs from this facility to the faculty for teaching.

Case load in pathology is low especially in large animals (adult cattle and horses) and facilities for large animal necropsy do not exist. This is a potential major deficiency.

Case load for clinical training is improving, but still low in small animals and very low in equine.

Low caseload in companion animals and horses is a potential major deficiency.

Material for anatomical training is limited, viscera are not available as the campus slaughterhouse is not used regularly. There is an over-reliance on preserved specimens.

Insufficient access to cadaver material for dissection in anatomy is a potential major deficiency.

There was a heavy smell of formaldehyde in many areas of the anatomy department. This is a health hazard and a potential major deficiency.

The number of ruminant reproductive visits is good although still less than one per day.

There is no centralised method of patient record keeping.

It is the opinion of the 2016-team that the requirements regarding Animals and Teaching Materials of Animal Origin as they are laid down in Annex I of the SOP are NOT met.

7.3 Suggestions

- The welfare standards of the animals on the faculty farm should be improved. The farm has plenty of space and full advantage should be taken of this (e.g. keeping the horses without tethering).

- The FVM must continue to work on increasing the number of cases seen in the hospital and in pathology through development of relationships with local animal keepers.
- More attempts must be made to obtain specimens for anatomical training, with communication between the anatomy and public health departments.
- Alternative methods of fixation must be considered.
- Students must be involved in emergency cases out of hours and these should be properly organised.
- The mobile clinic should be better utilised and records kept of cases seen.
- Electronic records for all patients would assist with clinical care and student learning and prevent communication issues between departments

8 LIBRARY & EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES

8.1 Findings

The University Main Library is 2 km away from the faculty buildings. There are 22 seats, it is equipped with 10 computers. The main library receives around twenty journals per year as hard copies and has full access to fourteen electronic journals or databases, however there are only a few veterinary journals among them. WIFI is working at the campus so the electronic journals are available from anywhere in the campus, but they cannot be reached from outside and there is no training for students on how to use electronic databases. There are around eighty thousand textbooks available, but only five thousand of them are veterinary books.

The faculty has a small own library in a single room with a few seats and 15 computers with internet connection. It is open only on weekdays during business hours and used by students for studying. Mainly veterinary text books and some journals are available here. One librarian is working at the faculty library. There are also libraries at the departments, students can use them upon request.

8.2 Comments

In order to improve the research based teaching at FVM Kars, the library has to be developed.

It is the opinion of the 2016-team that the requirements regarding Library and Educational Resources as they are laid down in Annex I of the SOP are met.

8.3 Suggestions

- Providing comprehensive international handbooks and improvement of library service is recommended.
- Use of library has to be taught to the students.

9 ADMISSION & ENROLMENT

9.1 Findings

Admission is based on student's results and ranking in the nationwide examination applied by Centre for Evaluation, Selection and Placement of the Turkish Council of Higher Education (YÖK), combined with the student's choice for a certain Turkish veterinary faculty. The test is taken in the last year of secondary school and consists of 2 stages: a first stage in March, a second in mid-June, accounting for 30 and 70% of the points respectively. Examination is related to the content taught in secondary school, including mathematics, chemistry and physics. However, it is not regarded as a specific selection tool for veterinary studies. Students from different scientific backgrounds and different high schools can apply for veterinary study. Number of students taken this exam, as well the number of times students can sit for this exam are not limited, and no *numerus clausus* system is in place for the veterinary program.

A fixed number of students per veterinary faculty are accepted each year, though quota is determined by the Turkish Council of Higher Education. The budget that is attributed to the faculty is fixed, and not related to the number of students. Potential shortage of scientific knowledge is covered by teaching basic sciences (physics, chemistry, medical biology courses; SER table 4.2) to all students, regardless their scientific background.

The veterinary curriculum takes up to five years with a maximum of eight. The current total number of students is 694, of which 52 (7,5%) are in an additional 6, 7 or 8th year. Drop out: last year, 47 students left de faculty before obtaining the diploma, of which 26 moved towards another veterinary faculty within Turkey; 21 quitted veterinary studies. The real drop out percentage is calculated as 3% (21 on 694).

At present, approximately 22% of the students are female, and 0,7 % students are from abroad, none from within the European Union. Foreign students don't have to sit for the Centre for Evaluation, Selection and Placement of the Turkish Council of Higher Education, but are selected based on their results in their home countries.

9.2 Comments

The faculty evaluates the number of students currently entering as too high in relation to the yearly budget, and the number even increased over the last years. Though the yearly quota is beyond the faculty decision, continuous attempts should be taken to normalize this balance.

It is the opinion of the 2016-team that the requirements regarding Admission and Enrolment as they are laid down in Annex I of the SOP are met.

9.3 Suggestions

- Apart from the national examination another selection programme can be established for further testing the entry level knowledge of students. This can be also helpful in decreasing the number of applicants.

10 ACADEMIC TEACHING & SUPPORT STAFF

10.1 Findings

The Faculty of Veterinary Medicine of the Kars University has an impressive number of academic teaching staff corresponding to 90 academic FTE positions:

- 17 assistants
- 23 assistant professors
- 13 associated professors
- 37 full professors ($37/90 = 41\%$)

This number is consistent with the recommended EAEVE ratio (R1) between the number of undergraduate veterinary students and the number of the total FTE academic ($R1 = 7.74$).

All but 3 (one in the dept. of anatomy; two in the dept. of biochemistry) are veterinarians. Therefore, the high percentage of veterinarians within the academic staff ($87/90 = 97\%$) enable the related ratios to be within the recommended EAEVE values ($R3 = 8.0$; $R4 = 0.89$).

None of the academic staff has a European specialist status (EBVS). Moreover there is no official strategy for entering the system of European colleges.

The non-academic staff (including all university budgeted support staff, independently from the function) corresponds to 17 FTE, giving a ratio (R5) between FTE supportive staff and FTE academic staff clearly below the recommended EAEVE ratio ($R5 = 0.19$).

However, the SER, Table 10.2 (SER, p54) indicates the presence of staff employed by private companies that are committed at the FVM with the function of cleaners (total of 14) and night watchman (1 person). These were not considered by the team as FTE.

The system of recruitment for non-academic staff is the following: the government gives non-academic position to the different universities in Turkey that the rector then distributes positions to the faculties. It is easier to get a position of professorships than to obtain a position of non-academic staff. The dean has no power to move personnel within the non-academic staff or between academic and non-academic staff, this must be done by the rector on the Dean's requirement.

Recruiting new staff and/or filling vacant positions is completely dependent on the agreement of the University. Advertisements for new positions are published in journals and on the internet and are distributed at national and international level.

However, all posts which become vacant are not automatically filled but go back to the university. The establishment has limited power in the decision of staffing levels and benefits.

Staff members have the possibility and are encouraged to attend scientific meetings. Their participation is financially support by either the FVM, the Kars University or Tübitak. There is no system of documenting and recording the post-graduate education of the academic staff.

Some of the academic staff have spent professional time abroad.

The process of promoting academic positions is mainly due to the scientific production, e.g. awarding the PhD title is the first requirement to become an assistant professor. To be awarded the title associate professor an assistant professor should meet certain requirements including scientific production, participation in congresses, academic activity, and also have been for a certain period at the position of assistant professor. These advances in the carrier are in any case subordinate to the decision of the Rector. Although possible, recruitment of external staff from other universities to directly hierarchically more elevated academic position is not the use, and all staff goes through the above mentioned academic positions.

Junior staff expressed satisfaction with the working conditions, the salary and the financial situation of FVM Kars and few of them would like to apply for positions in other establishments in Turkey.

10.2 Comments

The list of academic teaching staff per discipline (SER p53) reveals potential imbalances with no professor for Food Hygiene and Production and none for Public Health.

The SER highlights the fact that most of the academic staff members are veterinarians as positive, which is understandable, but it also underestimates the need for some non-veterinary specialists in some of the disciplines (e.g. Microbiology, Virology, Biochemistry, Zootechnics and Economics).

The team noted a severe shortage of technicians or animal caretakers in practically all departments. This shortage implies that a lot of the technical services that support the clinical, scientific and teaching activities of the Faculty are done by academic staff and undergraduate students. The academic staff has been complaining about this shortage for years but no satisfactory measures have been undertaken so far from the part of the University.

All decision on recruitments as well as the allocation of financial resources for staff both at the level of academic and non-academic level are the responsibility of the rector. The FVM only has limited influence on this.

It is the opinion of the 2016-team that the requirements regarding Academic Teaching and Support Staff as they are laid down in Annex I of the SOP are partly met.

10.3 Suggestions

- An increase of non-administrative non-academic staff is strongly suggested in order to improve the support of academic staff during all their activities.
- It might be useful to set a strategy for stimulating young staff to enter residency programs of the EBVS (European Board of Veterinary Specialisation).

11 CONTINUING EDUCATION

11.1 Findings

No programme is currently delivered by the FVM for continuing education of local veterinarians. Some staff members are involved in discussions with the regional veterinary organisation about developing such a programme.

Faculty veterinarians engage with CE on an ad hoc basis. The faculty funds conference attendance (approx. one conference every two years) and several staff have spent periods of time abroad (Europe and US) training at other veterinary schools.

11.2 Comments

Staff who have spent time abroad have clearly benefitted from this process and returned to the faculty with good ideas and skills.

The CE programme stated in the SER was not evident with no courses delivered in the last three years.

It is the opinion of the 2016-team that the requirements regarding Continuing Education as they are laid down in Annex I of the SOP are met.

11.3 Suggestions

- A more formal system of continuing education provision for faculty staff should be implemented with a minimal number of hours required per year
- A regional CE programme for local veterinarians would be a positive addition and may help recruit referral patients to the hospital

12 POSTGRADUATE EDUCATION

12.1 Findings

The post-graduate programme at the Kafkas University in Kars is centralised in the “Institute of Health Sciences of Kafkas University”. Graduates of the FVM have to be accepted by this institute (equivalent of a post-graduate school) either for the 2-year Master Student Programme or for the 4-years Doctoral Student Programme (equivalent to PhD). At the time of the visitation 40 master students and 64 doctoral students were enrolled in these two programmes.

The distribution of these post-graduate students among the disciplines and departments of the FVM Kars is uneven with a high number of post-graduate students in the departments of basic sciences like anatomy, histology/embryology, physiology and microbiology (quite a lot of these post-graduate students are not graduates of FVM Kars, but from other faculties of the Kafkas University), and very few post-graduate students are enrolled in the applied disciplines of FVM Kars such as animal husbandry and food hygiene and technology. The post-graduate students in the

doctoral programme (PhD) are encouraged to write and submit publications during their 4-year-term, but there is no mandatory requirement to publish.

There is no harmonised and standardised procedure for financing the post-graduate students, which leads to a drop-out due to lack of funding.

There is no minimum publication requirements for postgraduates programs

In the FVM Kars, there are no EBVS Diplomates in the academic staff and no residency programme for any of the European Colleges is implemented in Kars.

12.2 Comments

Although the overall number of post-graduate students (both master and Ph.D. students) at FVM Kars is impressive, there is a striking imbalance in terms of the distribution of post-graduate students throughout the departments of FVM Kars. This imbalance may be smaller, if only the veterinary post-graduate students would be taken into consideration, since in the basic science departments (anatomy/histology/embryology, physiology and microbiology) is a considerable number of students from other health-related faculties of Kafkas University, i.e. non-veterinary post-graduate students, enrolled.

The lack of any European Diplomates at FVM Kars isolates the academic staff in several departments from international developments in veterinary medicine.

It is the opinion of the 2016-team that the requirements regarding Postgraduate Education as they are laid down in Annex I of the SOP are met.

12.3 Suggestions

- FVM Kars should try to get more influence and leadership in recruiting and funding post-graduate students for all of its departments.

13 RESEARCH

13.1 Findings

In 2015 the academic staff produced:

- 100 publications in international scientific journals,
- 44 publications in national scientific journals,
- 44 presentations/posters at international congresses,
- 112 presentations/posters at national congresses
- 4 books

For the last year the faculty has been running 58 research projects (22 recently completed), mainly financed by the University (scientific research project funding body of the university), the Tubitak (Scientific and technological research council of Turkey) but also from the Developmental Agency of Kars. Some of them are joint projects with other universities of Turkey.

Moreover a project on vector borne diseases at the parasitology department was funded by EU.

FINAL REPORT AS ISSUED BY ECOVE ON 11 MAY 2016

The faculty commission for scientific research and project evaluation has the duty of addressing the lines of the research of the faculty. It does not include PhD students.

Undergraduate students are not “scientifically involved” in research although due to the lack of supportive staff and technicians they collaborate by offering voluntary labour in different laboratories. Undergraduate students are not requested to prepare a scientific work for being awarded the DVM title.

PhD-students’ projects (around 60 at the moment of the visit) are mainly financed by the Kafkas University and by Tubitak, the latter sometimes financing partially or totally the salary of PhD students.

Some PhD students spend some time abroad but this is not the custom. Some PhD students are already employed as research assistants. PhD students are encouraged to but are not compelled to produce refereed publications in order to obtain the PhD title.

The academic staff has established individual collaborations with farmers and private companies but no official agreements has been made.

An ambitious project on wildlife medicine has been set up and funded by the Ministry of Forestry and Water Affairs - a Laboratory for Wildlife Treatment and Rehabilitation Centre is under construction and will be handed over to the university (not the FVM) as soon it is ready.

13.2 Comments

The academic staff, with some departments being more effective than others, is keen on running research projects. Although the majority of the research projects are funded by the university, there is also a considerable funding are provided by the Tubitak. Lately one project has been funded by the EU.

The FVM Kars does not have a research strategy. See suggestions in Standard 3 - Finances.

It is the opinion of the 2016-team that the requirements regarding Research as they are laid down in Annex I of the SOP are fully met.

13.3 Suggestions

- The faculty should consider joining European research groups to get access to EU funding e.g. Horizon 2020.
-

STUDENT’S REPORT FVM KARS

The role of the student representative is to assess the faculty from the student’s point of view. The aim of this report is to give an overview of student’s opinion of the faculty and highlight the strengths and weaknesses of the undergraduate life in FVM Kars. The report contains personal opinions, therefore they should not be considered as requirements and not in the least as major deficiencies. The intention of the suggestions mentioned here is to propose ideas for improvement of circumstances for students in the future.

FINAL REPORT AS ISSUED BY ECOVE ON 11 MAY 2016

Most high school students choose FVM Kars for veterinary education after surveying all of the 26 veterinary faculties in Turkey. Their choice is based upon the fact that FVM Kars is reasonably well respected and offers a really good hands-on experience on livestock animals, which give the main job opportunity for veterinarians in the area. In general students are happy with their choice and satisfied with their education, although they have a few recommendations in certain areas.

Teaching is based on lectures, practices and clinical work. Attendance is documented on every occasion, 30% of theoretical lectures and 20% of practices can be missed at the maximum. Power point presentations are used by lecturers in most cases and also serve as learning materials, as well as textbooks and lecture notes. Relationship between teachers and students is quite good, students can knock on every professor's door, if they need further explanation on a specific subject. Material used for practices gives enough individual work for students, which means teaching groups have generally a good size, except for interns of the 10th semester. A group comprising 15 of such students observe one animal's surgery, which cannot be made by them completely, only a few steps of the whole procedure supervised by practical teachers. There is no 24/7 service at the clinics, students are only on duty during working hours on weekdays. The number of patients per day vary between two and ten and there is no arranged programmes in the case of a less busy day. The case load is quite good regarding cattle, but low at horses and companion animals. Summarising students' opinions of teaching it is recommended to increase the hands-on experiences in clinical practices and create the opportunity to work with a wider variety of species for every student. In the case of a slower working day simulations of different clinical situations, discussions of previous patients' case history or other activities should be organized.

The examination process is absolutely fair for students, who can retake an examination as many times as needed in the maximum time frame of 8 years. The only limitation is the internship, which cannot be started if students failed more than two subjects completely. Even though there is no exam quality control in place, this student-friendly examination system leaves no room for them to complain, but may cut down their motivation to prepare with all-out effort to each exam and finish their studies at the faculty after the minimum of 5 years.

Students can evaluate teachers and the quality of teaching at different subjects by filling out a uniform questionnaire in paper form, but they have never experienced any consequences, and therefore lost their faith in this system. It follows that a completely new system should be organized, which can encourage students to share their opinions with teachers, who can reflect on these. A feed-back system from graduates should be also considered.

There is no official support system in place, still the general student support is one of the strong points of the faculty. There is a friendly atmosphere between teachers and students, and junior students are supported by seniors. Personal problems are dealt with officially by the vice-dean for student affairs, who can be reached by the representatives of each year personally or by students individually through the faculty's website. Academic staff act as guidance counsellors and can also be reached with problems. Career planning and management is also part of the subjects in the curriculum.

There are several places at the faculty for students to spend their free time. Food is available in different canteens at reasonable prices. The University Main Library is 2 km away, therefore it is not used frequently by veterinary students, who prefer the small library of the faculty instead. This

FINAL REPORT AS ISSUED BY ECOVE ON 11 MAY 2016

library has a few seats and 15 computers with internet connection, moreover wireless internet is available everywhere on campus. There is no study room in the faculty, studying can be done in canteens, libraries and empty lecture halls. There are no meeting rooms for students, but they still have several clubs related to sciences and sports. Sport facilities are available in several types of sport e.g. football, basketball, and students can arrange joint events with the other faculties of the university. On the whole students have good opportunities to spend their free time at the faculty, but establishing a quiet space for studying and another room for meeting would be beneficial.

Studying outside the faculty is limited, but students have the opportunity to spend their internship in other Turkish faculties or abroad and also participate in an Erasmus programme. There is no local veterinary student association and students are not familiar with IVSA. At the moment there is no student involvement in faculty management. It is recommended for students to familiarise themselves with official associations inside and outside of the faculty and create such groups to further represent their opinions.

As a summary for this student report it can be stated that FVM Kars has friendly, enthusiastic and well supported students, who only need a few changes to further improve their life as veterinary students. As to their professional life based on the conversations with undergraduates and alumni it can be said that the faculty provides what is needed to start a career as a veterinarian.

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

The Kafkas University, Faculty of Veterinary Medicine (FVM) in Kars is one of 26 veterinary faculties scattered all over Turkey. The FVM Kars was founded in 1982 and began training of students in 1985. In 1992 the FVM Kars was connected to University of Kars. The city of Kars is situated in the north-eastern corner of Turkey bordering the republic of Armenia.

The visit to the Kafkas University, Faculty of Veterinary Medicine 21 – 25 March 2016 was carried out in a cordial and very friendly atmosphere. The team was supplied with all further information that was requested.

The self-evaluation report was very short and in some places misleading due to lack of information. There were omissions and misunderstanding which were rectified during the visit. It is the opinion of the team that the Faculty might have put more emphasis on profound, sufficiently detailed and updated information in the SER.

All over the campus the team noted that the Faculty was clean inside the majority of the buildings but with a tendency to untidiness in the farm buildings, some areas of the clinics and in most of the surrounding areas. This reflected the general impression of the whole University of Kafkas.

The team saw many examples of excellent teaching. By excellent teaching the team means a process where there is productive and intensive interaction between teachers at different levels and students. But it also includes an environment conducive of teaching where it is obvious that there is mutual respect for each other at all levels from first year students to senior professors.

FINAL REPORT AS ISSUED BY ECOVE ON 11 MAY 2016

The Faculty of Veterinary Medicine, Kars has its strengths and weaknesses, opportunities and threats. The team has identified several strong points:

1. The university has a dedicated, enthusiastic and open-minded staff. The same is true for students, who are well appreciated within the university as excellent students.
2. A clear focus on student related activities
3. A stable financial status
4. A good salary situation for all groups of staff
5. A strong, focal research interest
6. Access to a huge number of relevant clinical, bovine cases

As it often occurs, strengths are accompanied with a number of weaknesses. Their identification by the team should provide the faculty with incentives for further improvements:

1. There is a general lack of awareness of safety and biosecurity within the Faculty, and the Faculty does not have an Occupational Health & Safety organisation
2. Many of the laboratories used for teaching purposes are in need of maintenance and repair
3. Inter-departmental organisation and harmonisation of teaching should be focused
4. Intra-divisionary organisation of the clinical work should be improved with a strong focus on effective student training
5. Focus on general improvement of English language skills among staff and students
6. Internationalisation of young scientific staff
7. Focus on post graduate education for clinical staff (e.g. diplomate status)
8. Increase the number of or reallocate technical staff to research areas
9. Increase the number of necropsies
10. The amount of clinical work with horses and companion animals is currently low
11. Initiate/revive the ambulatory clinic including organised herd health visits
12. Extramural areas, storage rooms and many areas in the farm, the clinics and laboratories should be cleared for unused, stored materials, be cleaned, maintained and kept clean and tidy

The Category I deficiencies pointed out in the 2008 visitation have not been fully addressed and the team is of the opinion that these deficiencies have not been satisfactorily rectified.

All together, it is the opinion of the team's evaluators that the University of Kafkas, Faculty of Veterinary Medicine, Kars does not fulfil all the standards provided for Stage I evaluation.

Annex 1 Indicators (ratios)

					GUIDELINES
R1:	$\frac{\text{n}^\circ \text{ of undergraduate veterinary students}}{\text{n}^\circ \text{ of total FTE academic staff in veterinary training}}$	=	$\frac{697}{90}$	=	7.74 <8.381
					GUIDELINES
R2:	$\frac{\text{n}^\circ \text{ of undergraduate students}}{\text{n}^\circ \text{ of total FTE academic staff}}$	=	$\frac{697}{107}$	=	6.5 <9.377
					GUIDELINES
R3:	$\frac{\text{n}^\circ \text{ undergraduate veterinary students}}{\text{n}^\circ \text{ of FTE veterinarians in veterinary training}}$	=	$\frac{697}{87}$	=	8.0 <11.057
					GUIDELINES
R4:	$\frac{\text{n}^\circ \text{ of students graduating annually}}{\text{n}^\circ \text{ of FTE veterinarians in veterinary training}}$	=	$\frac{77}{87}$	=	0.89 <2.070
					GUIDELINES
R5:	$\frac{\text{n}^\circ \text{ of total FTE support staff in veterinary training}}{\text{n}^\circ \text{ of total FTE academic staff in veterinary training}}$	=	$\frac{17}{90}$	=	0.19 0.505-1.907
					GUIDELINES
R6:	$\frac{\text{supervised practical training}}{\text{theoretical training}}$	=	$\frac{1946}{2334}$	=	0.83 >0.602
					GUIDELINES
R7:	$\frac{\text{laboratory \& non clinical animal work}}{\text{clinical work}}$	=	$\frac{1104}{842}$	=	1.31 <1.809
					GUIDELINES
R8:	$\frac{\text{teaching load}}{\text{self directed learning}}$	=	$\frac{4280}{0}$	=	0.00 2.59-46.60
					GUIDELINES
R9:	$\frac{\text{total n}^\circ \text{ hours in the vet curriculum}}{\text{n}^\circ \text{ hours in FH/VPH}}$	=	$\frac{4280}{256}$	=	16.72 8.86-31.77
					GUIDELINES
R10:	$\frac{\text{n}^\circ \text{ of hours obligatory extramural work in veterinary inspection}}{\text{total n}^\circ \text{ hours in the vet curriculum}}$	=	$\frac{28}{4280}$	=	0.11 0.074-0.556
					GUIDELINES
R11:	$\frac{\text{n}^\circ \text{ of food-producing animals seen at the Establishment}}{\text{total n}^\circ \text{ hours in the vet curriculum}}$	=	$\frac{1322}{4280}$	=	17.17 >0.758

FINAL REPORT AS ISSUED BY ECOVE ON 11 MAY 2016

	$\frac{\text{n}^\circ \text{ of students graduating annually}}{77}$				
					GUIDELINES
R12:	$\frac{\text{n}^\circ \text{ of individual food-animals consultations outside the Faculty}}{\text{n}^\circ \text{ of students graduating annually}}$	=	$\frac{\text{not recorded}}{77}$	=	X >8.325
					GUIDELINES
R13:	$\frac{\text{n}^\circ \text{ of herd health visits}}{\text{n}^\circ \text{ of students graduating annually}}$	=	$\frac{0}{0}$	=	0.00 >0.326
					GUIDELINES
R14:	$\frac{\text{n}^\circ \text{ of equine cases}}{\text{n}^\circ \text{ of students graduating annually}}$	=	$\frac{31}{77}$	=	0.40 >2.700
					GUIDELINES
R15:	$\frac{\text{n}^\circ \text{ of poultry/rabbit cases}}{\text{n}^\circ \text{ of students graduating annually}}$	=	$\frac{26}{77}$	=	0.33 >0.407
					GUIDELINES
R16:	$\frac{\text{n}^\circ \text{ of companion animals seen at the Establishment}}{\text{n}^\circ \text{ of students graduating annually}}$	=	$\frac{325}{77}$	=	4.22 >48.06
					GUIDELINES
R17:	$\frac{\text{n}^\circ \text{ of poultry flocks/rabbits production units visits}}{\text{n}^\circ \text{ of students graduating annually}}$	=	$\frac{0}{77}$	=	0.00 >0.035
					GUIDELINES
R18:	$\frac{\text{n}^\circ \text{ of necropsies of food producing animals + equines}}{\text{n}^\circ \text{ of students graduating annually}}$	=	$\frac{160}{77}$	=	2.08 >1.036
					GUIDELINES
R19:	$\frac{\text{n}^\circ \text{ of necropsies of poultry/rabbits}}{\text{n}^\circ \text{ of students graduating annually}}$	=	$\frac{27}{77}$	=	0.35 >0.601
					GUIDELINES
R20:	$\frac{\text{n}^\circ \text{ of necropsies of companion animals}}{\text{n}^\circ \text{ of students graduating annually}}$	=	$\frac{11}{77}$	=	0.13 >1.589

Annex 2 Decision of ECOVE

The Committee concluded that the following Major Deficiencies had been identified:

- Inadequate Self Evaluation Report
- Overall, there is not enough practical hands-on experience provided in the clinics, despite the high bovine numbers.
- There is no 24/7-service with student participation.
- Hospitalisation facilities are very limited for all species.
- Isolation facilities are ill used and not suitable for isolation purposes.
- Biosafety and worker safety procedures and safety equipment are missing.
- The case load in pathology is low especially in large animals and facilities for large animal necropsy do not exist. The ratio R18 is good due to necropsies in calves.
- Low caseload in companion animals and horses.
- Insufficient access to cadaver material for dissection in anatomy.

The 'Kafkas University, Faculty of Veterinary Medicine in Kars' is classified after Stage 1 Evaluation as holding the status of: **NON-APPROVAL**.