

**European Association
of Establishments for Veterinary Education**



RE-VISITATION REPORT

To the Faculty of Veterinary Medicine of the Firat University, Elazig, Turkey

On 02 – 04 June 2021

By the Re-visitation Team:

Göran Dalin, Uppsala, Sweden: Chairperson

Pierre Lekeux, Liège, Belgium: ESEVT Coordinator

Contents of the Re-visitation Report

Introduction

- 1. Correction of the Major Deficiencies**
- 2. Correction of the Minor Deficiencies**
- 3. ESEVT Indicators**
- 4. Conclusions**
- 5. Glossary**

Introduction

The Faculty of Veterinary Medicine of the Firat University (called the Veterinary Education Establishment (VEE) in this Report) was evaluated by ESEVT on 19-23 March 2018 under SOP 2016.

During the Visitation, the ESEVT Visitation Team identified a number of deficiencies. Based on these observations, ECOVE concluded in June 2018 that seven deficiencies were considered to be Major Deficiency, leading to a Non-Accreditation status for the VEE. The Major Deficiencies identified from the Evaluation were:

1. The VEE is not compliant with Standard 3 because of insufficient acquisition of some of the core Day-One Competences in all major species.
2. The VEE is not compliant with Standard 4.6. because facilities must comply with all relevant legislation including health, safety, biosecurity and EU animal welfare and care standards. The overall provisions for safety, biosecurity and animal welfare standards were not met.
3. The VEE is not compliant with Standard 4.11. because the VEE must ensure students have access to a broad range of diagnostic and therapeutic facilities, including but not limited to: pharmacy, diagnostic imaging, anesthesia, clinical pathology, intensive/critical care, surgeries and treatment facilities, ambulatory services and necropsy facilities. The pharmacy, the clinics and the teaching laboratories had cabinets with no locks, a variety of drugs or toxic agents (atropine, adrenaline, powerful pain killers) on display, no records of the circulation of those drugs, except an electronic inventory of the available amounts, unsigned prescriptions. Unused drugs were found in all clinics, on the tables, under no restrictions.
4. The VEE is not compliant with Standard 4.12. because operational policies and procedures (including biosecurity, good laboratory practice and good clinical practice) must be taught and posted for students, staff and visitors. Biosecurity measures were very scarcely applied, procedures were explained in an online book, but not displayed for the students and staff. Good laboratory practices were not in place, chemicals being accessible to outsiders.
5. The VEE is not compliant with Standard 4.13. because appropriate isolation facilities must be provided to meet the need for the isolation and containment of animals with communicable diseases. Such isolation facilities must be properly constructed, ventilated, maintained and operated to provide for animal care in accordance with updated methods for prevention of spread of infectious agents. They must be adapted to all animal types commonly handled in the VTH. The isolation facilities, although present, were inappropriately used, disinfected, had no proper ventilation methods for preventing diseases or they were not adequately applied. The waste was packet in medical bags and kept in an outside container till the municipality would collect it.

FINAL REPORT AS ISSUED BY ECOVE ON 29 SEPTEMBER 2021

6. The VEE is not compliant with Standard 4.15. because the transport of students, live animals, cadavers, materials from animal origin and other teaching materials must be done in agreement with national and EU standards, to ensure the safety of students and staff and to prevent the spread of infectious agents.
7. The VEE is not compliant with Standard 5.1. because the number and variety of healthy and diseased animals, cadavers, and material of animal origin must be adequate for providing the practical training (in the area of Basic Sciences, Clinical Sciences, Pathology, Animal Production, Food Safety and Quality) and adapted to the number of students enrolled”, due to the low number of equine and small animal and absence of swine cadavers in necropsy, low caseload in small animals, equine and exotic pets and low amount of material of animal origin for FSQ.

Several partial compliances with the ESEVT Standards were considered as Minor Deficiencies:

1. Partial compliance with Substandard 2.5.
2. Partial compliance with Substandards 3.7, 3.8 and 3.10.
3. Partial compliance with Substandards 4.7 and 4.8.
4. Partial compliance with Substandard 5.2.
5. Partial compliance with Substandard 7.9.
6. Partial compliance with Substandard 9.2.
7. Partial compliance with Substandard 11.6.

The VEE started rectification of the deficiencies immediately after receiving the decision of ECOVE and applied for a Re-visitation (RV) in the end of 2019. The Re-visitation SER (RSER) was sent in mid-January 2021 to the Re-visitation team. The R-SER was well written and informative.

Follow-up questions and requests for clarification were sent to the VEE two weeks before the Re-visitation. Responses were received immediately, including photo documentation that facilitated the work of the Chairperson, who could not be present in Elazig.

The Re-visitation was carried out in a hybrid form. The Chairperson could not travel to the VEE due to the travel restrictions because of the COVID-19 pandemic but the Re-visitation could be completed using online connection. The Coordinator visited the VEE in person following strict prevention rules. Information, documents and photos were shared and a webinar was held between the Chairperson and the Coordinator before the Exit Presentation.

The Re-visitation was well organised and completed in an excellent atmosphere. Preventive measures linked to the COVID-19 outbreak were well implemented for staff, students and visitors.

1. Correction of the Major Deficiencies

1.1. The VEE is not compliant with Standard 3 because of insufficient acquisition of some of the core Day-One Competences in all major species.

1.1.1. Findings

This Major Deficiency was primarily related to insufficient acquisition of the DayOne Competences (D1C) with regard to swine and swine diseases. As pig farming is almost non-existent in Turkey, the basic practical and clinical aspects of the production, slaughter and

FINAL REPORT AS ISSUED BY ECOVE ON 29 SEPTEMBER 2021

inspection/control of products intended for human consumption were not covered in enough detail. To enable international mobility, certain DOCs must be achieved. Another reason was the monitoring of infectious diseases (n.b. African Swine Fever /ASF/) in the relatively large wild boar population. In order to correct this Major Deficiency, the VEE has taken a number of steps.

1.1.1.1. A swine unit has been established at the teaching farm. There are 3 animals now and additional 14 animals will be present for the autumn semester 2021. The animals are used for teaching at the time of the farm visits as well as at the VTH. In the latter case, the animals are brought to the clinics and held there until core clinical training has been covered. In addition, the clinical departments have added new videos on swine diseases.

1.1.1.2. The infectious diseases of swine listed in the OIE Terrestrial Animal Health Code, Volume 2 are covered. The aim is that students shall recognise signs of possible notifiable, reportable and zoonotic diseases of swine and take appropriate actions. The infectious diseases covered are listed in the RSER.

1.1.1.3. With regard to meat inspection of swine, there is no swine slaughtering in the region. However, videos are used to cover the post-mortem and antemortem inspections and procedures in compliance with the national legislation.

1.1.1.4. An elective course on Swine Husbandry was given in the fall semesters of 2018 and 2019. The aim was to provide more detailed information about swine husbandry practices and the swine industry.

1.1.2. Comments

Upon request, the Re-visitation Team received supplementary material, including photos showing the VTF pig unit and the animals kept there.

The VEE has successfully established basic teaching about pig husbandry, biology, pathology, diseases (esp. infectious diseases), and food safety and quality. A small number of pigs are kept at the VTF so that the students can see live pigs.

1.1.3. Suggestions

None.

1.1.4. Decision

Major Deficiency 1 has been fully corrected.

1.2. The VEE is not compliant with Standard 4.6. because facilities must comply with all relevant legislation including health, safety, biosecurity and EU animal welfare and care standards. The overall provisions for safety, biosecurity and animal welfare standards were not met.

1.2.1. Findings

During the full Visitation, the VEE was found to be non-compliant with Standard 4.6. due to inadequacy of biosecurity measures taught and applied and non-compliance with EU animal welfare and care standards at the VTH. In order to correct this Major Deficiency, the VEE has taken a number of steps.

FINAL REPORT AS ISSUED BY ECOVE ON 29 SEPTEMBER 2021

Biosecurity principles are now covered in the content of most courses. However, the VEE admits that more training is needed. More than seminars, short videos showing the practices of biosecurity principles will be prepared.

There is a proposal for building a new state-of-the-art VTH in the current strategic plan of FU. If approved, it will be finished within three years. Biosecurity will be a most important issue in the design and construction of a new VTH.

1.2.1.1. Biosecurity Measures

- A triage point has been established at the entrance of the VTH area.
- A separate animal unloading ramp was built for the large animal isolation unit. The unloading ramp for large animals with non-contagious disease was renovated. Both ramps are disinfectable and easy for handling animals.
- The isolation units for large and small animals have been renewed, including ventilation with biosecurity filters.
- A separate sewage system has been installed at the large animal isolation unit. Solid biological wastes are discarded according to Biological Waste Discard procedures, including frozen storage. Records are kept of all discards.
- Biosecurity warning signs and good laboratory/clinical practice instructions are now posted in the clinics and laboratories.
- Disinfectant sprays, detergent sprays, biological waste containers, sharp object disposable containers, masks, gloves, etc. are now available in all laboratories and VTH clinics. Cleaning and disinfection procedures of room and stable surfaces have been updated and staff have been instructed.
- A training seminar about biosecurity principles was given to all students and staff in 2018.
- The Biosecurity Guideline provided by EAEVE has been translated into Turkish and used during an elective Biosecurity course given in 2020. Although it was elective, all students were encouraged to take it.
- Two training seminars on Biosecurity principles and rules have been given to the VTH staff and research assistants.
- A satellite necropsy facility was built in the VTH for large animals and small ruminants cases. This facility has its own separate sewage system with a 1.0-ton capacity tank.
- The VTH is regularly inspected by the internal Biosecurity Commission, which reports findings to the faculty administration. PDCA cycle is applied for improvement.
- A Biosafety testing program has been initiated at the VTH. Swab samples taken at twelve different points are analysed for the presence of indicator pathogens, i.e. *Salmonella* spp.

1.2.1.2. Animal Welfare

- Ventilation of the Small Animal Clinic hospitalization unit has been renewed.
- The cages at the Hospitalization Unit have been replaced by new cat and dog cages.
- An Animal Welfare Commission has been established with the duty to ensure that the VTH and VTF fulfil the EAEVE Standards.
- All VTH staff have been introduced to the general principles of animal welfare, and physiological and behavioural signs that indicate welfare problems.
- Placards on the Core Principles of Animal Welfare have been posted in the VTH.
- Improvements of the hospitalization units have been made to reduce fear or stress in the animals.
- The Veterinarian's Oath prepared by the Turkish Veterinary Association has been posted in the VTH to keep students alert about professional values including animal welfare principles.

FINAL REPORT AS ISSUED BY ECOVE ON 29 SEPTEMBER 2021

1.2.1.3. Personal Safety and Protection

- Six emergency showers have been installed at appropriate places in the laboratories area.
- Two eye showers have been installed at the VTH.
- Appropriate safety signs are now posted in the laboratories.

1.2.2. Comments

Upon request, the Re-visitation Team received additional material, including photos showing emergency showers, and biosecurity warning signs and equipment in the student and research laboratories, and in the VTH. Photos were also presented showing the new dog and cat cages in the VTH.

1.2.3. Suggestions

To ensure that students have acquired knowledge and skills regarding biosafety and personal safety and protection, this should be included in the theoretical and practical examinations. In the clinic rotation Logbook, "clinical biosafety" should be a first mandatory step.

1.2.4. Decision

Major Deficiency 2 has been fully corrected.

1.3. The VEE is not compliant with Standard 4.11. because the VEE must ensure students have access to a broad range of diagnostic and therapeutic facilities, including but not limited to: pharmacy, diagnostic imaging, anesthesia, clinical pathology, intensive/critical care, surgeries and treatment facilities, ambulatory services and necropsy facilities. The pharmacy, the clinics and the teaching laboratories had cabinets with no locks, a variety of drugs or toxic agents (atropine, adrenaline, powerful pain killers) on display, no records of the circulation of those drugs, except an electronic inventory of the available amounts, unsigned prescriptions. Unused drugs were found in all clinics, on the tables, under no restrictions.

1.3.1. Findings

During the full Visitation, the VEE was found to be non-compliant with Standard 4.11. due to inappropriate pharmacy facilities, inadequate medication tracking records, unsigned prescriptions, unsafe cabinets, absence of Venena and Separanda cabinetry, and also inappropriate ambulatory facilities.

1.3.1.1. The Pharmacy, handling of drugs and toxic agents

- The Pharmacy has been moved to a new location with access for pharmacy staff only.
- Seven High safety cabinets (Venena cabinetry) for storage of critical drugs and toxic agents are now available in the Pharmacy, the VTH and in relevant academic departments. A list of contents is posted on or near the cabinets.
- Ten ventilated and locked safe cabinets (Separanda cabinetry) for storage of hazardous chemicals are now in place in the academic departments.
- A new Electronic VTH management system has been installed which includes patient records and drug inventory control.
- Prescriptions are recorded by the Turkish E-prescription System and the Ministry of Agriculture Drug Tracking System. In addition, there are internal tracking records for multiple dose drugs, which is subject to audits by the Ministry of Agriculture.
- Outsiders have no access to hazardous chemicals and drugs.

FINAL REPORT AS ISSUED BY ECOVE ON 29 SEPTEMBER 2021

- All the records regarding the medications are held precisely and in compliance with the relevant National Legislation.

1.3.1.2. Access to a broad range of diagnostic and therapeutic facilities

With regard to “ensuring students have access to a broad range of diagnostic and therapeutic facilities” part of Standard 4.11, the following new equipment was accounted for:

- A Biochemistry Autoanalyzer, Calf intensive care units, Examination tables for companion animals, Surgery tables, Hand washing units for surgery, Service carts for medical materials, Surgical electrocautery, Patient monitoring devices, Infusion pumps, a Dental Unit, a Video-otoscope, an Anaesthesia Machine, and an Autoclave.
- The following equipment for the VTH diagnostic laboratory and Internal Medicine Clinic had been delivered after the RSER was submitted: a Haematology analyser, an ECG machine, an Ultra-pure water purification system and a Centrifuge.

1.3.2. Comments

Upon request, the Re-visitation Team was given access to supplementary material, including photos related to VTH pharmacy, the storage of drugs and toxic agents, and the renewed clinical facilities and equipment.

The VEE has altered the handling of drugs and chemicals in several ways. The new pharmacy has a safer storage of drugs and is managed by a newly hired pharmacist. Only medicines for immediate use are stored in the clinics. On-duty veterinarians have access to locked "buffer storages". Also in the academic departments, chemicals are now stored and handled in a safer way.

The clinics have invested in updated and modernized equipment.

1.3.3. Suggestions

Ensure that the new procedures for handling drugs and chemicals are followed when operations resume following the COVID-19 restrictions.

1.3.4. Decision

Major Deficiency 3 has been fully corrected.

1.4. The VEE is not compliant with Standard 4.12. because operational policies and procedures (including biosecurity, good laboratory practice and good clinical practice) must be taught and posted for students, staff and visitors. Biosecurity measures were very scarcely applied, procedures were explained in an online book, but not displayed for the students and staff. Good laboratory practices were not in place, chemicals being accessible to outsiders.

1.4.1. Findings

During the full Visitation, the VEE was found to be non-compliant with Standard 4.12. due to the inadequacy of biosecurity taught and information posted wherever appropriate, the absence of good laboratory practices (i.e. free access to dangerous chemicals, unlocked cabinetry in numerous laboratories working with those, no responsible or records for tracking the chemicals).

1.4.1.1. Veterinary Teaching Hospital

- VTH operates according to Animal Hospital Operation Instructions displayed on the VTH webpage (<http://hh.firat.edu.tr/tr/node/149>)

FINAL REPORT AS ISSUED BY ECOVE ON 29 SEPTEMBER 2021

1.4.1.2. Biosecurity Measures

- See above Section 1.2.1.1.

1.4.1.3. Control of Drugs and Hazardous Chemicals

- See above Section 1.3.1.1.

1.4.2. Comments

Major Deficiency 4 is closely related to the 2nd and 3rd Major Deficiencies that are under Standards 4.6 and 4.11, respectively. These are discussed above (1.2. and 1.3.). Most of the steps taken to correct these Deficiencies are also valid for Major Deficiency 4.

1.4.3. Suggestions

None.

1.4.4. Decision

Major Deficiency 4 has been fully corrected.

1.5. The VEE is not compliant with Standard 4.13. because appropriate isolation facilities must be provided to meet the need for the isolation and containment of animals with communicable diseases. Such isolation facilities must be properly constructed, ventilated, maintained and operated to provide for animal care in accordance with updated methods for prevention of spread of infectious agents. They must be adapted to all animal types commonly handled in the VTH. The isolation facilities, although present, were inappropriately used, disinfected, had no proper ventilation methods for preventing diseases or they were not adequately applied. The waste was packet in medical bags and kept in an outside container till the municipality would collect it.

1.5.1. Findings

During the full Visitation, the VEE was found to be non-compliant with Standard 4.13. due to inappropriate isolation facilities allowing free access, with inappropriate ventilation, absence of sewage disposal, inappropriate cadaver and waste disposal from the isolation unit. The VTH isolation units are now better equipped and organized. The actions taken to rectify the deficiencies are listed below.

- Currently there are four isolation rooms, two in the small animal unit (one for dogs, one for cats), and two for large animals (one for horses, one for ruminants).
- A Hepa (high efficiency particulate arresting) filtered ventilation system has been installed in all units.
- Each unit has two entrances, one for animals and one for staff and students.
- At the staff/student entrance, there is a transitory room where Protective Equipment, disinfectant and cleansing agents, waste containers, etc. are available.
- An unloading ramp for the large animal isolation unit has been built.
- Liquid waste/sewage from the large animal unit is collected in a tank, disinfected, and discarded.
- Chemical wastes, biological wastes, and sharp objects are dealt with in separate containers, collected by authorized staff, and stored until picked up by a contractor firm. There are two places for frozen storage of biological solid wastes. All the records of discards are kept.
- After use, table surfaces, floors, walls, equipment and other surfaces are cleaned and disinfected by trained staff.

FINAL REPORT AS ISSUED BY ECOVE ON 29 SEPTEMBER 2021

- Signs regarding biosecurity and good laboratory/clinical practices are posted at relevant places.
- The isolation units are part of the Biosecurity (Salmonella) testing program (See above Section 1.2.1.1.).

1.5.2. Comments

Upon request, the Re-visitation Team received additional material which showed the layout and facilities of the isolation units for horses, ruminants, dogs and cats.

The isolation facilities for dogs, cats, horses and ruminants are fully operational and meet the minimum requirements.

The routines for handling different kinds of wastes are now remark-free.

1.5.3. Suggestions

None.

1.5.4. Decision

Major Deficiency 5 has been fully corrected.

1.6. The VEE is not compliant with Standard 4.15. because the transport of students, live animals, cadavers, materials from animal origin and other teaching materials must be done in agreement with national and EU standards, to ensure the safety of students and staff and to prevent the spread of infectious agents.

1.6.1. Findings

During the full Visitation, the VEE was found to be non-compliant with Standard 4.15 due to inappropriate transport of live animals, cadavers and materials of animal origin to and from the VEE to ensure the safety of students and staff and to prevent the spread of infectious agents. Actions taken to correct the Standard 4.15. deficiencies included the following:

- A cadaver transport trailer was purchased, that is also used to pick up cadavers from farms.
- A satellite necropsy room was built in the VTH area to reduce the risk of contamination and to ensure the safety of students and staff.
- As for the transport of the live (large) animals, the VTH has a live animal transportation trailer.
- Special thermostatic and easy to clean and disinfect containers for transporting teaching material from slaughterhouses.
- Locker rooms were renovated and the number of student lockers has been increased.

1.6.2. Comments

Upon request, the Re-visitation Team was given access to supplementary material, including photos, which showed live animal and cadaver transportation trailers, and high-quality transport containers for slaughterhouse material and other kinds of teaching material of animal origin.

The transports of live animals, cadavers, and materials from animal origin are now carried out in an appropriate way where, among other things, biosafety is ensured.

During the site visit, it was noted that routines were lacking for changing shoes when entering and leaving the large animal necropsy room. This shortcoming would be remedied immediately, which has now been done. The mechanical boot cleaning device in the large animal clinic did not work, but this has now been fixed.

1.6.3. Suggestions

None.

1.6.4. Decision

Major Deficiency 6 has been fully corrected.

1.7. The VEE is not compliant with Standard 5.1. because the number and variety of healthy and diseased animals, cadavers, and material of animal origin must be adequate for providing the practical training (in the area of Basic Sciences, Clinical Sciences, Pathology, Animal Production, Food Safety and Quality) and adapted to the number of students enrolled”, due to the low number of equine and small animal and absence of swine cadavers in necropsy, low caseload in small animals, equine and exotic pets and low amount of material of animal origin for FSQ.

1.7.1. Findings

During the full Visitation, the VEE was found to be non-compliant with Standard 5.1. due to the low number of equine and small animal and absence of swine cadavers in necropsy, low caseload in small animals, equine and exotic pets and low amount of material of animal origin for FSQ.

When comparing Raw data and Indicators from the full Visitation (2015-2017) with those for the academic years 2017-2018 and 2018-2019 the following observations were made:

- The mean number of companion animal necropsies has increased from 45.0 to 82.0.
- The mean number of equine necropsies has improved from 2.3 to 11.5.
- A few pig necropsies now do occur, including wild boar necropsies.
- The average number of companion animal patients seen intra-murally is more than doubled, from 2071.0 to. 5242.5. The corresponding number of patients seen extra-murally is 88.0 vs. 770.0.
- The number of equine patients seen intra-murally shows a remarkable development, from 61.0 to 306.5. The corresponding number of patients seen extra-murally is 70.0 vs. 212.5.
- The number of exotic pets seen intra-murally has increased from 61.0 to 509.0.

With regard to the availability of materials of animal origin for the teaching in FSQ, details of what is used in the practical-laboratory teaching is reported. At the same time, the extent of the hands-on training at slaughterhouses and which is registered in the students' logbooks is emphasized.

1.7.2. Comments

The number of companion animal and equine necropsies is still low, but shows an important increase. A future (post corona) addition of companion animals from the municipal shelter is likely to improve the situation. Furthermore, the number of patients in relation to the number of graduated students exceeds the minimum levels of the Indicators, both intra- and extra-murally.

1.7.3. Suggestions

Evaluate the progress made during the revision of the Interim Report (IR).

1.7.4. Decision

Major Deficiency 7 has been fully corrected.

2. Correction of the Minor Deficiencies

2.1. Partial compliance with substandard 2.5.

2.1.1. Findings

During the full Visitation, the VEE was found to be partially compliant with Standard 2 because of its insufficient autonomy to use funds, due to the partial compliance with rubric 2.5.

It was suggested in the full Visitation report that the VEE should identify sources to improve the revenues from its own activities (lifelong learning, other types of courses) and services. The service fees at the VTH and other services have been increased twice since the full Visitation. Approximately 25% of the costs to correct the Major Deficiencies have been funded by the VEE's own revenues. The remaining portion was funded by the FU budget.

The VEE states that, despite the low income, the number of continuous training courses should be increased. Service fees should be kept comparable to private clinics and other VEEs. More importantly, the VTF should again be part of the VEE. The income from VTF would be used for development of the VEE.

2.1.2. Comments

The allocation of grants is governed by rules that are decided at government level. Special efforts can, however, be made if necessary. Decisions are then made by the Rector. This took place in connection with the measures to rectify the Deficiencies that were pointed out during the full Visitation.

2.1.3. Suggestions

None.

2.2. Partial compliance with substandards 3.7, 3.8 and 3.10.

2.2.1. Findings

At the full Visitation, the VEE was considered to be partially compliant with standard 3.6, Professional knowledge, due to absence of formal agreements with EPT providers, absence of EPT logbooks and also due to incomplete covering of species while acquiring DOC, which stand for partial compliance with rubrics 3.7, 3.8 and 3.10.

Until the “pandemic brake”, the following measures were taken:

- Formal agreements were signed with eight private veterinary clinics as EPT providers in 2019.
- The Elazig Chamber of Veterinary Medicine assisted in the selection of EPT providers.
- There is now a logbook where students record events and cases during their EPT. The logbooks are checked by the student affairs office.
- The EPT provider and students evaluate each other using evaluation forms.

Plans for the future EPT include:

- Numbers of EPT providers to be increased.
- The time allocated for EPT to be increased.
- Random spot checks of EPT providers to be performed.
- Principles of QA will be applied to EPT more efficiently.

2.2.2. Comments

EPT has temporarily come to a halt because of the pandemic.

FINAL REPORT AS ISSUED BY ECOVE ON 29 SEPTEMBER 2021

2.2.3. Suggestions

Continue the EPT development as planned when the COVID-19 restrictions are lifted.

2.3. Partial compliance with substandards 4.7 and 4.8.

2.3.1. Findings

At the full Visitation, the VEE was considered to be partially compliant with Standard 4 due to partial compliance with rubrics 4.7 and 4.8 since the VEE did not ensure best husbandry and animal welfare practices, and relevant biosecurity and bio-containment measures, and also education and clinical research are compliant with all ESEVT Standards.

Until the COVID-19 restrictions were instigated, the Emergency services were available 24/7/365.

2.3.2. Comments

The Major Deficiencies 2, 3, 4, 5, and 6 (Sub-standards 4.6, 4.11, 4.12, 4.13, 4.15, respectively) are closely related to these Minor Deficiencies. Thus, most of this Minor Deficiency has been rectified.

VTH Operation Instructions needs revision to cover the application of QA principles more effectively.

Numbers of qualified support staff need to be increased.

2.3.3. Suggestions

For DOC it is essential that 24/7 services reopen once the pandemic restrictions are lifted.

2.4. Partial compliance with substandard 5.2.

2.4.1. Findings

At the full Visitation, the VEE was considered to be partially compliant with rubric “5.2. It is essential that a diverse and sufficient number of surgical and medical cases in all common domestic animals and exotic pets be available for the students’ clinical educational experience and hands-on training.”

2.4.2. Comments

See Section 1.7. Major Deficiency 7, and Section 3 Indicators.

2.4.3. Suggestions

Evaluate the progress made during the revision of the Interim Report (IR) to make sure that the improvements are maintained.

2.5. Partial compliance with substandard 7.9.

2.5.1. Findings

At the full Visitation, the VEE was considered to be partially compliant with Standard 7 since no system to monitor attrition is in place.

In the RSER, the VEE states that:

- It is not possible to increase the time to prepare for failed exams because they are scheduled based on the Academic Calendar of FU.
- More students were have been involved in research projects after the Visitation, but still too few.

FINAL REPORT AS ISSUED BY ECOVE ON 29 SEPTEMBER 2021

- Election of Official students' representatives were going to be organized centrally by the FU administration in 2019, but was postponed due to bureaucratic reasons.
- The Self Evaluation Report and Visitation Reports are now published on the VEE webpage.

2.5.2. Comments

It is important that students are represented in decision-making bodies.

2.5.3. Suggestions

None.

2.6. Partial compliance with substandard 9.2.

2.6.1. Findings

At the full Visitation, the VEE was considered to be partially compliant with Standard 9, rubric 9.2. due to the very low numbers in support staff, especially technicians.

There has been an improvement in the numbers of support staff. In 2020, one radiology and one anaesthesiology technician were appointed. Two students work part time at the diagnostic laboratory of the VTH. Four PhD students work part time at the clinics. Still, numbers of support staff need to be increased to lessen the workload at the VTH clinics.

As for the academic staff, twelve retirements in 2018-2022 necessitate the recruitment of replacement positions.

2.6.2. Comments

In the near future, the VEE will have to make new appointments of academic staff due to retirements. In order to attract qualified applicants, it is important that salaries and employment conditions are competitive.

2.6.3. Suggestions

None.

2.7. Partial compliance with substandard 11.6.

2.7.1. Findings

At the full Visitation, the VEE was considered to be partially compliant with Standard 11 since rubric 11.6. was not fulfilled due to absence of autonomy of the VEE to use their funds for learning and teaching.

The VEE now underlines that FU, as a state university, is subject to national rules for how state grants may be used. A situation that is shared with state universities in many other countries and which can sometimes be perceived as a lack of autonomy.

2.7.2. Comments

See Section 2.1.

2.7.3. Suggestions

None.

3. ESEVT Indicators

3.1. Findings

Most Indicators are above the minimum level. See also Section 1.7. Major Deficiency 7.

FINAL REPORT AS ISSUED BY ECOVE ON 29 SEPTEMBER 2021

The Indicators which are still below the recommended minimal values are:

I1 – n° of FTE academic staff involved in veterinary training/n° of undergraduate students.

- The ratio is low due to a rather high number of “inactive” students among undergraduates.

I5 – n° of hours of clinical training.

- The hours of clinical training is just below (20 h) the recommended level. At the same time, the hours of practical (non-clinical) training is very high. It is recommended that a transfer of training time is made between these activities.

I17 – n° of companion animal necropsies/n° of students graduating annually.

- The mean number of companion animal necropsies has increased significantly, from 45.0 at the full Visitation to 82.0 at the Re-visitation. The VEE expects a further rise when the Covid19 restrictions are lifted and the cooperation with the municipal dog shelter can be resumed.

I19 – n° of equine necropsies/n° of students graduating annually.

- The mean number of equine necropsies has increased significantly, from 2.3 at the full Visitation to 11.5 at the Re-visitation. The I19 is now just at the limit of recommended value.

3.2. Comments

The VEE has enhanced the values of several Indicators, which are now above or close to the minimum values.

3.3. Suggestions

It is suggested to continue the efforts for reaching the recommended values for all Indicators.

4. Conclusions

The seven Major Deficiencies identified in 2018 have been fully corrected. Furthermore, most Minor Deficiencies identified in 2018 have been fully corrected and an ongoing process is in place to correct the remaining ones.

5. Glossary

DIC: Day One Competences

AAEVE: European Association of Establishments for Veterinary Education

EBVS: European Board of Veterinary Specialisation

ECOVE: European Committee of Veterinary Education

EPT: External Practical Training

ESEVT: European System of Evaluation of Veterinary Training

FTE: Full-Time Equivalent

FU: Firat University

OIE: World Organisation for Animal Health

QA: Quality Assurance

R-SER: Re-visitation SER

RV: Re-visitation

SOP: Standard Operating Procedure

VEE: Faculty of Veterinary Medicine of the Firat University

VTF: Veterinary Training Farm

VTH: Veterinary Teaching Hospital

FINAL REPORT AS ISSUED BY ECOVE ON 29 SEPTEMBER 2021

Decision of ECOVE

The Committee concluded that the Major Deficiencies identified after the full Visitation on 19 – 23 March 2018 had been corrected.

The Veterinary Education Establishment (VEE) of the Firat University in Elazig is therefore classified as holding the status of: **ACCREDITATION**.