



**VISITATION REPORT**

**To the Veterinary Department of the University of Camerino, Matelica, Italy**

**On 24 – 28 May 2021**

**By the Visitation Team**

**Maria dos Anjos Pires**, Vila Real, Portugal: Visitor in Basic Sciences

**Juan Alberto Corbera (Chairperson)**, Las Palmas, Spain: Visitor in Clinical Sciences in Companion Animals

**Robert Smith**, Liverpool, UK: Visitor in Clinical Sciences in Food-Producing Animals

**Ivar Vågsholm**, Uppsala, Sweden: Visitor in Food Safety and Quality

**Eva Orban**, Budapest, Hungary: Visitor in Quality Assurance

**Christophe Buhot**, Castelnau de Medoc, France: Practitioner

**Anne Myller**, Helsinki, Finland: Student

**Pierre Lekeux**, Liège, Belgium: ESEVT Coordinator

## **Contents of the Visitation Report**

Introduction

1. Objectives, Organisation and QA Policy
2. Finances
3. Curriculum
4. Facilities and equipment
5. Animal resources and teaching material of animal origin
6. Learning resources
7. Student admission, progression and welfare
8. Student assessment
9. Academic and support staff
10. Research programmes, continuing and postgraduate education
11. ESEVT Indicators
12. ESEVT Rubrics

Executive Summary

Glossary

## **Introduction**

Veterinary teaching started in Camerino in 1824. After several changes of name, it became the Faculty of Veterinary Medicine of the University of Camerino (UNICAM) in 1933 and moved to Matelica in 1989.

In 2013, it merged with the School of Biosciences and Biotechnologies of the UNICAM to establish the School of Biosciences and Veterinary Medicine (called the Veterinary Education Establishment (VEE) in this report).

The VEE was visited by EAEVE in 2000 for the first time and was not approved. Another Visitation was held in 2011, after which it was fully approved.

The study programme of the VEE was accredited by the Italian National Agency for the Evaluation of the University and Research Systems (ANVUR) in 2014 and by the ISO 9001 in 2020.

Despite its small size, the VEE offers different undergraduate and postgraduate courses, as well as continuing education initiatives. The buildings are separated in four blocks located in the city of Matelica.

The suggestions for improvement given during the 2011 ESEVT Visitation have been addressed and most of them have been met at least partially, e.g. to reduce the total amount of teaching load for individual academic staff, to increase the number of support staff, to provide more continuing education to staff, to introduce a more transparent and uniform system to screen incoming students for adequate basic knowledge in the EU-listed basic subjects, to enable and encourage interdisciplinary teaching and transversal knowledge, to establish a more balanced examination structure, to decrease the time needed for students to graduate, to enrol graduates in clinical specialties, to emphasise the problem-based and research-based teaching, to increase caseload in all species, to introduce ophthalmology teaching, to put in place a self-evaluation procedure for

practical activities, to increase on-farm activities, to implement practical teaching in poultry and rabbit medicine and production, to promote undergraduate student involvement in research, to increase the number of up-to-date textbooks available for loan.

The main problems of the VEE are linked to the two severe earthquakes, which occurred in October 2016 and have seriously damaged the intra-mural and extra-mural facilities used for teaching. The reconstruction is still far from being completed.

The ESEVT SOP 2019 is valid for the Visitation, which was completed in agreement with the “Exceptional Rules for ESEVT Visitations linked to the COVID-19 outbreak”.

## **Standard 1: Objectives, Organisation and QA Policy**

**1.1 The VEE must have as its main objective the provision, in agreement with the EU Directives and ESG recommendations, of adequate, ethical, research-based, evidence-based veterinary training that enables the new graduate to perform as a veterinarian capable of entering all commonly recognised branches of the veterinary profession and to be aware of the importance of lifelong learning.**

**The VEE must develop and follow its mission statement which must embrace all the ESEVT standards.**

### **1.1.1. Findings**

The VEE offers a single-cycle five-year degree course in veterinary medicine, preparing students for all possible veterinary careers in the public and private sectors, developing students’ judgement autonomy and critical skills by means of which they can make socially and ethically responsible professional decisions. They also participate in graduate and continuing education. Their training is research-based. The VEE assumes an active role in the Marche Region by being a reference centre for diagnostic services and consultations, providing 24/7 clinical services, further training, and other services.

The mission of the School of Biosciences and Veterinary Medicine (SBVM) is “the organisation and coordination of teaching and research activities, in order to provide the students with a high-quality education, based on improving animal welfare and health, as well as human and environmental health”. Strategic and more specific objectives are based not only on the expectations formulated in national (ANVUR, MUR) and international (ESG, EAEVE) standards, guidelines and regulations, but also on a SWOT analysis, and an in-depth review of the needs and expectations of the partners of the VEE (Annex 1.6 of the Self-Evaluation Report (SER)).

Curriculum mapping was used to ensure that new graduates are able to enter the profession equipped with all necessary knowledge and competences. The VEE is quality oriented, and is an ISO 9001:2015 certified institution as part of the UNICAM, and was approved by EAEVE in 2011.

### **1.1.2. Comments**

The VEE provides veterinary training corresponding to the European directives and standards.

The VEE’s emphasis on the development of critical thinking and autonomous decision making in

students is an important part of its mission, which determines the directions of developing the educational process.

The thorough analysis of the needs and requirements of stakeholders and the mapping of Day One Competences to the curriculum offer solid foundations to the Degree Course (DC).

### **1.1.3. Suggestions for improvement**

None.

### **1.1.4. Decision**

The VEE is compliant with Substandard 1.1.

**1.2 The VEE must be part of a university or a higher education institution providing training recognised as being of an equivalent level and formally recognised as such in the respective country.**

**The person responsible for the veterinary curriculum and the person(s) responsible for the professional, ethical, and academic affairs of the Veterinary Teaching Hospital (VTH) must hold a veterinary degree.**

**The decision-making process of the VEE must allow implementation of its strategic plan and of a cohesive study programme, in compliance with the ESEVT standards.**

### **1.2.1. Findings**

UNICAM has seven schools. The VEE (School of Biosciences and Veterinary Medicine – branch of Veterinary Medicine – SBVM-bVM) is one of the two branches of a School. UNICAM is a public university supervised by the Ministry of University and Research (MUR). The VEE is – according to Italian law – entitled to issue the Degree in Veterinary Medicine, and post-gradually 2<sup>nd</sup> level master degrees and PhD degree. It has, as all Schools, scientific, teaching, and functional autonomy, and in part management autonomy limited by the “Regulations for Administration, Finance and Accounting”.

The School is led by the Director, elected by the School Council, who represents the SBVM, ensures its proper functioning, coordinates and supervises teaching, and research. The Director is assisted by the Vice-Director and the Study Programme Administration Officer, and the following bodies:

- the School Board, assisting the Director in instructing the School Council and executing deliberations,
- the School Council, the decision-making body for the direction and management of the School,
- the School Delegates, assisting the Director in student tutoring, student guidance, disability, internship and placement, and internationalisation issues, reporting to the School Council.
- Heads of Degree Courses, who supervise and coordinate teaching activities.

The Study Programme Administration Officer (SPA) and the Head of the Teaching Office of each branch support the Director of the school and the heads of the Degree Courses.

The School has the following bodies:

- Teacher/Student Joint Committee, to control the teaching activities in the degree courses with

## **FINAL REPORT AS ISSUED BY ECOVE ON 29 SEPTEMBER 2021**

advisory functions; consisting of student representatives in the School Council, and an equal number of professors/researchers appointed by the School Council.

- Course Year Coordination Committee (CYCC) for each year of the Degree Course (there are thus 5), to analyse each semester's teaching, and propose corrections and improvements; consisting of all teachers of the course, and at least one student.
- Degree Course in Veterinary Medicine (DCVM) Council preparing proposals for the SBVM Council on the basis of the CYCCs' analyses; consisting of the Head of DCVM, the five coordinators of CYCCs, and two students.
- Steering Working Group, consisting of representatives of the profession, of public health and industries in the region, functioning as advisory body regarding the role of DCVM in the territory, conveying needs for training, cooperation in research, etc.
- Internal EAEVE Committee monitoring the quality of DCVM consisting of the coordinator, 11 members of the teaching staff, 1 member of the support staff, 1 research fellow, 1 PhD student, 4 undergraduate students.
- DCVM Review Reporting Committee drafting the annual report of DCVM sent to ANVUR for evaluation and accreditation; preparing cyclic reports, calculating indicators; consisting of the Head of DCVM and 4 teachers.
- Research Committee proposing scientific policies and research strategies to the School, and verifies the development.
- Ethics Committee for Animal Welfare, approving research projects making use of living animals.
- Student Career Committee, examining all student practices, careers and transfers.

The VEE has a Head who is on the one hand organising and managing the activities of the branch, and on the other participating in the work of the School Board and School Council coordinating teaching, research and services. A representative assists the Head. Both the Head of SBVM-bVM, also responsible for the academic activities of the VEE, and the Medical Director of the VTH hold a veterinary degree.

The VEE is not divided into departments. The VTH is its only subunit working under special regulations issued by the Rector. The VTH has a division for small, and one for large animals, both of which are subdivided into operating units for internal medicine, surgery and anaesthesiology, and obstetrics and gynaecology. There are three cross-operating units (for diagnostic imaging, clinical pathology laboratory and blood transfusion, regenerative medicine). The Assembly of the VTH is an advisory board, but also appoints the Medical Director and the Heads of Divisions and Units. The VTH Management Committee collaborates in the functioning and management of the VTH.

### **1.2.2. Comments**

The Schools of UNICAM have a high degree of autonomy except for administrative and financial matters, which are managed at the university level. The decision-making body of the VEE is the School Board. There are different committees with the participation of a considerable number of staff members. Students are involved in most of the committees thus actively contribute to the management of education.

Since a great part of the staff is involved somehow in the management of the DCVM, the culture of quality is widespread in the VEE.

### **1.2.3. Suggestions for improvement**

The Heads of Degree Courses could have a greater say in making decisions.

### **1.2.4. Decision**

The VEE is compliant with Substandard 1.2.

## **1.3 The VEE must have a strategic plan, which includes a SWOT analysis of its current activities, a list of objectives, and an operating plan with a timeframe and indicators for its implementation.**

### **1.3.1. Findings**

The SBVM has a strategic plan for 2020–2023, which fits into the strategic plans of UNICAM, and contains specific passages regarding the Degree Course in Veterinary Medicine. The strategic plan of the VEE is based on a thorough SWOT analysis, and is focusing on the following strategic macro-objectives: teaching and training, including related structures and services; research; staff; student welfare; third mission, which are broken down into actions. A broad time frame, responsible persons, and indicators are given in the operating plan.

### **1.3.2. Comments**

The VEE has a broad strategy broken down into operational objectives and actions.

### **1.3.3. Suggestions for improvement**

An even more specific operational plan could orient the step-by-step realisation of the strategy even better.

### **1.3.4. Decision**

The VEE is compliant with Substandard 1.3.

## **1.4 The VEE must have a policy and associated written procedures for the assurance of the quality and standards of its programmes and awards. It must also commit itself explicitly to the development of a culture which recognises the importance of quality, and quality assurance, within their VEE. To achieve this, the VEE must develop and implement a strategy for the continuous enhancement of quality. The development and implementation of the VEE's strategy must include a role for students and other stakeholders, both internal and external, and the strategy must have a formal status and be publicly available.**

### **1.4.1. Findings**

UNICAM has an operational Quality Assurance System for the evaluation and verification of all its activities, and in particular to guarantee adequate training to the students, and allocation of resources, as well as monitoring and improving its subsystems. The Quality Manual, compiled by the Division for Programming, Evaluation and Quality Systems of UNICAM covers all the elements and aspects of the QA system: the quality policy, the organisation of the QMS, the needs and expectations of partners, processes and documentation of the QMS, planning, communication, staff management, the procedures related to degree courses and the management of resources, the monitoring and survey of customer satisfaction, and the management of improvements.

## **FINAL REPORT AS ISSUED BY ECOVE ON 29 SEPTEMBER 2021**

UNICAM has set up a Quality Supervision Board of the University (QSB-U), which coordinates QA procedures, identifies common tools, and provides training for their application. It also supports School Directors, their representatives and Collaborators in joint activities. The Division for Programming, Evaluation and Quality Systems (DPEQS) provides technical and operational support, such as internal audit, assisting external evaluation groups, etc., and coordination. It also manages data useful for the analysis and evaluation, carries out surveys, etc. It provides information for the review of educational objectives.

The Quality Supervision Board of the School (QSB-S) is a complex coordination body composed of Coordinators/Heads, and members of different bodies, and carries out its tasks through meetings and activities of these bodies.

The Degree Course Review Reporting Committee (DCRRC), the Teacher/Student Joint Committee (TSJC), the study programme administration officer, and the head of the DVCAM are all involved in the management of quality at school level.

UNICAM and the DCVM undergoes internal audits, as well as external ones. Both have had ISO 9001:2008 certification, and in November 2020 they achieved ISO 9001:2015 certification. UNICAM, including the VEE, was found “fully satisfactory” by the national AVA system, focusing on the quality of higher education, managed by MUR in 2017.

The UNICAM quality service (USIQUAL) constantly monitors the study load and improvement of the student support services. (See SER Substandard 7.5)

### **1.4.2. Comments**

The needs and expectations of interested parties are summarized in the Quality Manual together with the tools of monitoring them and their satisfaction.

### **1.4.3. Suggestions for improvement**

None.

### **1.4.4. Decision**

The VEE is compliant with Substandard 1.4.

**1.5 The VEE must provide evidence that it interacts with its stakeholders and the wider society. Such public information must be clear, objective and readily accessible; the information must include up-to-date information about the study programme, views and employment destinations of past students as well as the profile of the current student population.**

**The VEE’s website must mention the ESEVT VEE’s status and its last Self Evaluation Report and Visitation Report must be easily available for the public.**

### **1.5.1. Findings**

There are several bodies which provide a framework for the interaction between the University and the stakeholders.

- UNICAM Supporters Committee ensures collaboration with institutional, cultural, educational, social, and economic stakeholders and partners enhancing educational, scientific and knowledge transfer through logistical and financial support initiatives; providing a link with the socio-economic context and the labour market; providing opinions and proposals for enhancing the presence of UNICAM in the region; contributing with working groups to curriculum development.
- the Steering Working Group with representatives of the different fields of the veterinary profession is an advisory board which helps the DCVM to find the best ways of preparing students for the requirements of the labour market.
- the Standing Committee for Territorial Development is coordinated by the Pro-Rector for territorial relationships, and includes Mayors, and local unions' presidents.
- AlmaLaurea is an interuniversity consortium representing 90% of Italian graduates, and surveys the profile and employment status of graduates.

There is clear and valid information about the DCVM, the conditions of admission, the curriculum, and the chances of graduates on the labour market. The ESEVT-status and the SER and Final Report of the last EAEVE Visitation are available on the website of the SBVM-bVM.

### **1.5.2. Comments**

UNICAM and SBVM-bVM in particular have close relations with professional bodies, and most importantly with local/regional stakeholders and partners, and lay weight on gathering their opinion in relation to the curriculum, the visibility and influence of UNICAM and the SBVM-bVM on the Marche Region. Their contribution is valued and has an impact on the educational process (e.g. tailoring the curriculum to their expressed needs, hands-on training provided, etc.).

### **1.5.3. Suggestions for improvement**

A more formal framework for some elements of cooperation and interaction with external partners could increase their contribution to the development of the curriculum and the educational programme.

### **1.5.4. Decision**

The VEE is compliant with Substandard 1.5.

**1.6 The VEE must monitor and periodically review its activities, both quantitative and qualitative, to ensure that they achieve the objectives set for them and respond to the needs of students and society. The VEE must make public how this analysis of information has been utilised in the further development of its activities and provide evidence as to the involvement of both students and staff in the provision, analysis and implementation of such data.**

**Any action planned or taken as a result of this data analysis must be communicated to all those concerned.**

### **1.6.1. Findings**

There is a set of outcome assessments included in the strategic plan by which UNICAM monitors the satisfaction of its partners with its educational and research activities and services. These surveys are carried out at the university level, but schools and branches also benefit from the results.

## **FINAL REPORT AS ISSUED BY ECOVE ON 29 SEPTEMBER 2021**

The main tool for monitoring teaching, school premises, organisation, and services is a questionnaire filled out by students at the end of each semester anonymously. The results are evaluated by the University Evaluation Unit (UEU), and used by the SBVM Council. Aggregated results are also made available online at the end of the academic year.

Group tutoring meetings at the end of semesters are chaired by the Rector's Proxy for Tutoring, and involve – among others – the Head of the DCVM and student representatives, and all enrolled students, and serve as opportunities for raising problems, and finding corrective actions.

Besides the university/school level QA tools, the SBVM-bVM has set up additional bodies – the CYCCs for each year, and the DCVM Council which monitor the educational process at the end of each semester.

It is the DCVM Review Reporting Committee, which analyses all the data about the DCVM and prepares Review Reports (annual, cyclic) for ANVUR (MUR). These reports include performance measures, an analysis of the achievement of objectives, and among others the percentage of students who found work after graduation. There is an analysis of learning outcomes as well in the reports. The main objectives to be achieved are also identified. These reports go through the Teacher/Student Joint Committee, the UEU, the SBVM Council, and incorporate remarks on behalf of the Steering Working Group (SWG). Proposed corrective actions are reinforced and returned to the DCVM Council to be implemented.

### **1.6.2. Comments**

The VEE has a system in place for gathering data to monitor its functioning, and can base corrective actions and improvements on this evidence.

### **1.6.3. Suggestions for improvement**

None.

### **1.6.4. Decision**

The VEE is compliant with Substandard 1.6.

**1.7 The VEE must undergo external review through the ESEVT on a cyclical basis. Evidence must be provided of such external evaluation with the assurance that the progress made since the last ESEVT evaluation was linked to a continuous quality assurance process.**

### **1.7.1. Findings**

The VEE last underwent an ESEVT evaluation in 2011 with one Minor Deficiency and several recommendations which were analysed and addressed in the following years, and corrections or improvements were made if possible. The changes were managed by the Internal EAEVE Committee and the bodies of the VEE concerned with QA. The commitment of UNICAM and SBVM-bVM to continuous improvement is also underlined by their other successful external assessments (ISO 9001, AVA).

All Italian universities are monitored annually for their study success rates through the CENSIS system. UNICAM has been the first among small (less than 10 000 students) universities in Italy

regarding services and teaching quality. UNICAM is also ranking 47<sup>th</sup> in the StuDocu World University Ranking (see SER Substandard 7.5).

**1.7.2. Comments**

The VEE undergoes regular external assessment the preparations for, and the consequences of which enhance their efforts for continuous development.

**1.7.3. Suggestions for improvement**

None.

**1.7.4. Decision**

The VEE is compliant with Substandard 1.7.

**Standard 2. Finances**

**2.1 Finances must be demonstrably adequate to sustain the requirements for the VEE to meet its mission and to achieve its objectives for education, research and services. The description must include both expenditures (separated into personnel costs, operating costs, maintenance costs and equipment) and revenues (separated into public funding, tuition fees, services, research grants and other sources).**

**2.1.1. Findings**

The national budget funding and Region Marche cover salaries and general costs for the staff and utility expenditures. Around 75% of the revenues are from the national budget and Region Marche. The financial autonomy of the School is limited to the income obtained from the clinical and diagnostic services and from research grants projects amounting to a little more than 20% of the revenue, of which most 18% were derived from research projects. Most of the revenues coming from commercial activities are reinvested in clinical teaching activities, equipment and research.

In recent years, revenues have been strongly affected by both the economic crisis and the earthquakes. After the earthquake, the University tuition fees were suspended in order to limit any negative repercussions on new enrolments. The revenues are foreseen to drop in the future.

**2.1.2. Comments**

The strategy that the School will try to compensate for the reduction in funds for operating costs will be to increase research projects as has been done in recent years and to increase clinical services. However, this could not fully compensate for less funding for education. More research funds will protect the staff against redundancies, but also require the workload to be shifted towards research.

**2.1.3. Suggestions for improvement**

This expected reduction in funds needs to be compensated to ensure that available resources will meet the requirements.

**2.1.4. Decision**

The VEE is compliant with Substandard 2.1.

**2.2 Clinical and field services must function as instructional resources. Instructional integrity of these resources must take priority over financial self-sufficiency of clinical services operations. The VEE must have sufficient autonomy in order to use the resources to implement its strategic plan and to meet the ESEVT Standards.**

**2.2.1. Findings**

Currently the clinical and diagnostic services comprise around 4% of the total revenue. The VEE's operating units manage these funds themselves.

**2.2.2. Comments**

The resources available for the clinical and field services are sufficient.

**2.2.3. Suggestions for improvement**

More clinical services could generate more resources for clinical work and tuition.

**2.2.4. Decision**

The VEE is compliant with Substandard 2.2.

**2.3 Resources allocation must be regularly reviewed to ensure that available resources meet the requirements.**

**2.3.1. Findings**

There are procedures in place for reviewing the resources available and their allocation.

The Internal EAEVE Committee is a standing committee that monitors the quality of the DCVM, making sure that it is aligned with the ESEVT Day One Competences and standards. It identifies the areas and activities that require greater financial support both in terms of personnel and equipment and informs the Head of the DCVM and the Director of the SBVM.

It is the competence of the Board of Directors to decide how the resource allocation is to be made, following consultation with the relevant School Director and Academic Senate.

**2.3.2. Comments**

The resources are regularly reviewed.

**2.3.3. Suggestions for improvement**

None.

**2.3.4. Decision**

The VEE is compliant with Substandard 2.3.

## **Standard 3. Curriculum**

**3.1 The curriculum must be designed, resourced and managed to ensure all graduates have achieved the graduate attributes expected to be fully compliant with the EU Directive 2005/36/EC (as amended by directive 2013/55/EU) and its Annex V.4.1. The curriculum must include the subjects (input) and must allow the acquisition of the Day One Competences (output) listed in Annex 2. This concerns Basic Sciences, Clinical Sciences in companion animals (including equine and exotic pets), Clinical Sciences in food-producing animals (including Animal Production and Herd Health Management), Food Safety and Quality, and Professional Knowledge.**

### **3.1.1. General findings**

#### **3.1.1.1. Findings**

The Veterinary Degree Course of the School of Biosciences and Veterinary Medicine (SBVM) at the University of Camerino (UNICAM) is 5 years long with a total of 3320 hours attended by each student. The total number of ECTS is 300, with an average of 60 per year, 30 per semester. The curriculum is in accordance with Italian law (Ministerial Decrees No. 509/1999, No. 270/2004, and Decree of 16 March 2007), and with the EU Directive 2005/36/EC (as amended by Directive 2013/55/EU). It is divided into Basic subjects (with 175 hours corresponding 5.3% of the total), Basic Sciences of Specific Veterinary Subjects (850 hours corresponding to a 25.6% of the total) and Clinical Sciences (1425 hours, 42.3% of total hours of the course).

The curricula were updated completely in the academic year of 2012/2013, and small changes were made in 2017/2018 and completed in 2018/2019.

The Italian law limits the number of exams to 30 in the total programme, with 28 compulsory, and one final graduation exam. 8 ECTS are corresponding to elective subjects chosen by the student, or also obtained by attending other courses, seminars, and conferences, which must be approved by the Student Career Committee.

During the course, the students have three compulsory internships, called Tirocinio, the first at the end of the 2<sup>nd</sup> year, in Animal Production; the second after the 4<sup>th</sup> year in Food inspection, the last in the second semester of the 5<sup>th</sup> year, composed of two different internships, one in Internal medicine, prophylaxis and avian pathology and the other in Clinical surgery and obstetrics.

The student must complete a minimum number of ECTS to enrol into the next year: 40 ECTS credits for enrolment into the 2<sup>nd</sup> year, 70 ECTS credits for enrolment into the 3<sup>rd</sup> year, 100 ECTS credits for enrolment into the 4<sup>th</sup> year, and 170 ECTS credits for enrolment into the 5<sup>th</sup> year.

The final examination, called “graduation thesis”, is a written report on a specific topic within one of the several subjects addressed during the curricular training, which could be a small (or a part of a wider) experimental research project, or a state-of-the-art review on a specific topic, supported by at least one teacher of the DCVM. This thesis is presented and discussed with a Committee, which consists of a President and 10 teachers from the School. The individual work to prepare the graduation thesis corresponds to 200 hours (8 ECTS credits) of activity.

A personal logbook (one for preclinical, and one for clinical activities), must be completed before the last exam.

It is compulsory to attend at least 70% of teaching hours of each theoretical and practical course. Students without the certification of attendance for a specific course may not take the related exam, and have to take the course again.

The DCVM has one Coordinator and one Course Year Coordinator for each academic year who

chair the Course Year Coordination Committees. These conjoin with the Teacher/Student Joint Committee, the DCVM Review Reporting Committee and the Internal EAEVE Committee, which are all involved in the curriculum design and management, and in the QA procedures.

In Italy, the curriculum of the DCVM is outlined at national level, but some parameters can be adapted to each Establishment, including the number of hours that each ECTS credit corresponds to spent by autonomous/individual study, theoretical training, and practical activities (within the 25 hours determined by Ministerial Decrees). It is also determined that the Students must achieve ECTS credits by passing examinations (and each Establishment may autonomously set the number of examinations needed to graduate in VM up to a maximum of 30).

Ministerial Decrees establish the minimum number of credits for the so-called “indispensable” or “qualifying” subjects i.e., basic subjects (58 credits) and 12 subjects (130 credits), and ECTS credits for “similar” or “integrative” subjects, “eligible” subjects, subject(s) devoted to the acquisition of foreign language, *Tirocinio*, and final (graduation) exam, to reach the total number of 300 credits.

This VEE has established several levels for identification and correction of curricular overlaps, redundancies, omissions and lack of consistency, transversality and/or integration of the curriculum, using both bottom-up and top-down approaches. This are mainly identified by students questionnaires that are used for evaluation of teaching activities, completed at the end of each semester, for each course, and the student may not take an examination without completing it.

#### **3.1.1.2. Comments**

The VEE decided to have different corresponding ECTS credit for theoretical and practical training (including self-learning and independent study) between the basic and clinical subjects justified by their distinct specificities.

The total ECTS number of DCVM is 300, with an average of 60 per year, 30 per semester, but with variable amount between 26 and 34. The reason for this is the limitation on the number of exams, established by the MUR to a maximum of 30, thereby some subjects run during the year annually, but the majority are semestral.

#### **3.1.1.3. Suggestions for improvement**

None.

#### **3.1.1.4. Decision**

The VEE is compliant with Substandard 3.1.1.

### **3.1.2. Basic Sciences**

#### **3.1.2.1. Findings**

The Basic Sciences are divided in Basic Subjects (with 175 hours corresponding 5.3% of the total) and Basic Sciences of Specific Veterinary Subjects (850 hours corresponding to a 25.6% of the total). The total hours corresponding to all Basic Sciences are 30.9% of the overall course.

The distribution of the Basic Subjects in the curriculum per year is shown in the Annexes to Standard 3, and the curricular hours employed by each student for each subject are shown in Table 3.1.2 in the SER.

Immunology is included in Microbiology and Epidemiology with 8 lecture hours and 3 practical hours. Genetics is part of General Zootechnics, with 20 hours of lectures and 6 hours of lab. There are no specific practical classes for these two subjects.

The General Physiology of Domestic Animals and Ethology and Special Physiology and Endocrinology of Domestic Animals, are taught in the second year and have no practical laboratory classes.

Veterinary Pharmacology and Toxicology, in the 1<sup>st</sup> semester of the 3<sup>rd</sup> year, have some practical classes using animals in the VTH.

Chemistry and Biochemical Propaedeutics and Veterinary Biochemistry is an annual discipline having a range of laboratory practicals.

### **3.1.2.2. Comments**

The objectives of practicals in physiology and pharmacology are not clearly described in the learning outcome and they are limited to few manipulations done in farms or the VTH.

### **3.1.2.3. Suggestions for improvement**

Even if the number of subjects cannot be increased, to avoid exceeding the maximum recommended by the ministry, it is recommended to improve the contents of immunology, independently of microbiology, including specific practical laboratory classes. The same is recommended for genetics.

Practical classes of Chemistry and Biochemical Propaedeutics and Veterinary Biochemistry covered most of the fundamental laboratory techniques for the DCVM. It is suggested to divide the teaching of these techniques into other subjects throughout the course (e.g. physiology, genetics, immunology), increasing their relationship with the different subjects covered, with more subject-specific approaches, increasing the students' learning potential in these different themes.

### **3.1.2.4. Decision**

The VEE is partially compliant with Substandard 3.1.2 because of suboptimal practical training, e.g. in physiology.

## **3.1.3. Clinical Sciences in companion animals (including equine and exotic pets)**

### **3.1.3.1. Findings**

The curriculum includes a total of 810 hours of clinical animal work (Table 3.1.1), representing 24% of the total curriculum (3320 hours). Clinical work with animals takes place mainly in the fifth year (760/810 hours; 94%) and clinical practical learning during the earlier years of the curriculum is limited, in detail students receive only 5 hours (2<sup>nd</sup> year), 29 hours (3<sup>rd</sup> year) and 70 hours (4<sup>th</sup> year). The clinical practical training is completed by a professional training which is called in Italy *Tirocinio*. This training includes both intramural and extramural activity. It should therefore be noted that the *Tirocinio* includes the EPT.

The total dedication to each of the subjects included in the Directive 2005/36/EC as amended by 2013/55 EU is included in Table 3.1.2. In this regard it should be noted that all subjects related to Clinical Sciences and established in the Directive are taught.

A total of 1013 clinical training is completed in three different clinical activities: *the teaching courses (151 hours), the clinical rotation (612 hours) and the intensive weeks (250 hours, 30% in EPT)*.

Students are provided with a personal logbook of clinical training activities documenting and certifying the acquisition of Day One Competences, including *Tirocinio*.

### **3.1.3.2. Comments**

Clinical work with animals is practically carried out in the final year (94%). There is a significant limitation of clinical practical training in the clinical subjects included in the 3<sup>rd</sup> (3.5%) and 4<sup>th</sup> year (8.6%).

### **3.1.3.3. Suggestions for improvement**

The inclusion of more clinical training, in the years prior to their immersion in clinical activity in the fifth year, would allow the students to better understand and learn the clinical competences linked to the theoretical training carried out in these previous years. Furthermore, learning the basics of clinical knowledge and basic clinical competences before starting clinical activity would improve the student's teaching-learning process. In this way, the student focuses on applying the knowledge acquired in previous years and the acquisition of clinical competencies to be applied in the clinical activity in the final year is encouraged. On the other hand, clinical training with animals could motivate the students and enhance their learning experience during all years of the degree. These activities could also help to improve the student success rates mentioned in another chapter of the SER.

### **3.1.3.4. Decision**

The VEE is compliant with Substandard 3.1.3.

## **3.1.4. Clinical Sciences in food-producing animals (including Animal Production and Herd Health Management)**

### **3.1.4.1. Findings**

Animal production, including breeding and economics is taught via lectures and non-clinical animal work mainly in year 2. Obstetrics and reproduction are also taught across species. Preventive medicine is taught over 26 hours of mainly lectures, and Herd Health Management has five further lectures. Production animal practical experience is mainly gained via preclinical EPT in the 2<sup>nd</sup> year (90 hours) and clinical training provided by external contracted practitioners in the 5<sup>th</sup> year (52 hours). In normal years this is 7 weeks stated as extramural (70%) and EPT (30%). Four external practitioners on 0.7 FTE teach extramural and EPT in farm species in ambulatory clinics. Intramural clinics state they provide farm animal teaching but the caseload is extremely low. No specific assessed task on herd health was identified within the assessment strategy.

### **3.1.4.2. Comments**

The curriculum is based on disciplines rather than species and the species coverage of medicine, surgery and preventative medicine and propaedeutics is not clear from the SER.

Calculations suggest this is 5 hours per working day for students but it is stated that clinics are open 9 a.m. – 6 p.m. Maximising the use of clinical resources for teaching should be a goal of the VEE.

### **3.1.4.3. Suggestions for improvement**

A specific assessment of herd health should be introduced in the logbook and final examination, such as a report produced on a farm and/or interpretation of herd health data, should be introduced. This should be under the supervision of an academic member of staff with suitable production animal specialist qualifications, experience and focus.

### **3.1.4.4. Decision**

The VEE is partially compliant with Substandard 3.1.4 because of suboptimal clinical training in food-producing animals and integration of herd health management teaching.

## **3.1.5. Food Safety and Quality**

### **3.1.5.1. Findings**

Apart from some practical activities (4 hours) in microbiological analyses of different types of food of animal origin (milk, meat, etc.) performed by students within the course of Microbiology during the 2<sup>nd</sup> year of the DCVM, practical activity in Food Inspection consists in the following:

- practical work during the Food Hygiene and Technology and of Food Control and Certification courses (63 hours);
- Tirocinio (internship/apprenticeship) in Food Inspection (200 hours).

During the practical activities in Food Hygiene and Technology, students are divided into small groups of maximum 7 students. Eighteen hours (in total) are spent drawing up the Hazard Analysis and Critical Control Points (HACCP) plans for the production of processed food of animal origin. Each group chooses a different food product, fills in a form on the product description and draws up a flow chart of the process. During 5 hours of extramural activity, students visit the relevant food establishments to check the flow chart and collect the information for drafting the HACCP plan. The HACCP plan is presented and discussed by means of a PowerPoint presentation in front of the teacher, the class, other teachers belonging to the Food Inspection area, and veterinary members of the National Health Service. Teachers of other disciplines potentially involved are also invited to attend the presentations in order to support the interdisciplinary character of activities. Three hours of practical activity are spent in the food chemistry laboratory, where students evaluate certain parameters influencing the shelf-life of food, such as pH, Aw, and NaCl percentage. Every student analyses one fresh or processed product of animal origin. The results are collectively discussed under the teacher's supervision.

Animal organs, fish, crustaceans and food of animal origin are taken from slaughterhouses and grocery stores, and are brought to the University laboratories/teaching rooms. For practical activities within the course of Food Control and Certification, the students are divided into groups of maximum 10 students, who are further divided into smaller subgroups (2 or 3 students each) at the time of the activities. Seven hours are spent analysing case studies on food labelling, 6 hours inspecting meat products collected from the market, 8 hours evaluating fish and crustacean freshness. These practical activities are all divided in three steps: production of a written report on the activity, presentation of the report in front of the teacher and the class, and a final discussion about the results presented by each group.

About 10 hours are spent inspecting organs with lesions relevant for food safety (e.g. zoonoses, etc.): students should be able to recognise the organ, perform the diagnosis or suggest diagnostic tests to confirm the suspicion, and make decisions on the basis of the food legislation. During this activity, students fill in a form provided by the teacher. About 4 hours are spent observing histological sections from organs with lesions relevant for food safety (e.g. zoonoses, illegally hormone-treated meat, etc.), recognising the origin of the samples, performing the diagnosis and applying the proper food legislation, by filling in a specific form provided by the teacher. Three hours of extramural activity consist in organ inspection at a slaughterhouse. Seven hours of extramural activities are spent in domestic ungulate and poultry slaughterhouses performing different activities, such as animal welfare evaluation, familiarisation with accompanying documents, and inspection of premises.

The *Tirocinio* activity in Food Inspection consists of 200 hours of practical activity, divided into sets of 50 hours each. Fifty hours are spent in slaughterhouses, 50 in a meat processing plant, 50 in a cheese factory, and 50 in a plant of the student's choice. For each set, the teacher arranges a specific programme called "*Progetto formativo*" (Training Project), where all the activities to be performed by students are listed. The 50 hours performed in a slaughterhouse of the student's choice, among those under agreement with UNICAM, are carried out according to the training project drafted by the teacher, and together with an Official Veterinarian. The activities that must be performed include the following: control of accompanying documents of animals, *ante-mortem* inspection methodology, evaluation of animal welfare during discharge and stunning, *post-mortem* inspection methodology, sampling for BSE test (where requested), official sampling procedures, preparation of an audit plan, performing of a post-mortem inspection. All these activities are aimed at improving and certifying the relevant Day One Competences.

The 200 hours of *Tirocinio* (Italian for internship, apprenticeship) are carried out outside the lecture schedules. The teaching slaughterhouse located in Matelica has been built and could be available for training purposes, but it was never put in operation because of the severe economic crisis, and because no company available to manage the plant was found. Furthermore, the slaughterhouse closest to the SBVM-bVM, located in Camerino, was seriously damaged during the earthquakes of 2016 and 2017. For this reason, students have to carry out their practical activities in slaughterhouses quite far from the VEE. However, the municipal slaughterhouse in Camerino should be operative again at the beginning of 2022.

The COVID-19 emergency of 2019/20 had limited impact on the teaching activities (including practical ones) of "Food hygiene and technology" and "Hygiene and health control and certification of food", because they were carried out during the first semester (October 2019-January 2020) of the 4<sup>th</sup> year before the pandemic. Instead, they did on *Tirocinio* (professional practical training), which is performed from the second semester (March-June 2020) of 4<sup>th</sup> year onwards, including part of the 1<sup>st</sup> and 2<sup>nd</sup> semester of the present academic year 2020/21, depending on periods chosen by students.

### **3.1.5.2. Comments**

Since the earthquakes 2016 and 2017 students have to carry out their practical activities in

slaughterhouses quite far from the VEE. However, the municipal slaughterhouse in Camerino should be operative again during 2022. COVID-19 has limited impact on the teaching of food safety and quality, which may be commended.

### **3.1.5.3. Suggestions for improvement**

None.

### **3.1.5.4. Decision**

The VEE is compliant with Substandard 3.1.5.

## **3.1.6. Professional Knowledge**

### **3.1.6.1. Findings**

Professional knowledge is not specifically described in the SER and the information is only available in some tables and in the annexes. The subjects are information literacy and data management (6 hours), professional ethics and communication (8 hours), animal health economics and practice management (2 hours), herd health management (17 hours + fieldwork). Veterinary legislation represents 109 hours.

Deontology is included in the “internal medicine, therapy and forensic medicine”.

Regarding practice management, it was planned to increase the number of hours but this has been delayed due to the COVID-19 crisis. However, more hours are taught during the course “economics and agricultural law”.

Concerning professional communication, students are trained to write reports or scientific papers, to demonstrate their ability to solve problems, but also to express themselves orally by making presentations or explaining the medical condition of the animal to the owner.

The input of the Steering Working Group (SWG) is important because it can help to detect the lack of certain competences in the alumni or make suggestions for improving the curriculum as a result of interactions with the alumni.

### **3.1.6.2. Comments**

2 hours of specific practice management is not enough to ensure that students are well-trained to run their future practice properly and confidently.

### **3.1.6.3. Suggestions for improvement**

It is suggested to increase the number of hours in practice management with the support of the SWG.

### **3.1.6.4. Decision**

The VEE is compliant with Substandard 3.1.6.

**3.2 Each study programme provided by the VEE must be competency-based and designed so that it meets the objectives set for it, including the intended learning outcomes. The qualification resulting from a programme must be clearly specified and communicated and must refer to the correct level of the national qualifications framework for higher education**

**and, consequently, to the Framework for Qualifications of the European Higher Education Area.**

**The VEE must provide proof of a QA system that promotes and monitors the presence of an academic environment highly conducive to learning including self-learning. Details of the type, provision and updating of appropriate learning opportunities for the students must be clearly described, as well as the involvement of students.**

**The VEE must also describe how it encourages and prepares students for self-learning and lifelong learning.**

### **3.2.1. Findings**

The objectives and the intended learning outcomes of the study programmes provided by the VEE are clearly given both for the overall programme (MUR website, DCVM Annual Factsheet), and for each subject on the homepage of the VEE (and UNICAM). The Qualification gained (Degree in Veterinary Medicine) fits into the European qualification framework. It is supplemented by a Professional Qualification Exam which is required by Italian law to enter the veterinary profession.

The curriculum is planned on the basis of the set of Day One Competences which are mapped to the subjects to ensure that they are covered, and fostered. Students' performances are monitored regularly through procedures of the Quality Assurance System (see Standard 1.4) by the Degree Course in Veterinary Medicine Review Reporting Committee (DCVMRRC) and the Teacher/Student Joint Committee (TSJC).

The learning environment is monitored and developments are proposed by the same bodies which are involved in curriculum monitoring and development. The results of the student questionnaires are also taken into consideration at the CYCC meetings, and used in planning the developments. The low number of students is favourable because on the one hand, there is a close contact between teachers and students, and on the other hand it is possible to form small groups for practical activities. There has been a shift in recent years towards problem-based learning, and an increase in practical training which provides a more facilitating environment for learning. There is time allocated for self-learning in many subjects, for which students may use a range of facilities from computers and library resources to slides and microscopes.

### **3.2.2. Comments**

The programme of the DC was matched against the set of Day One Competences by EAEVE and World Organisation for Animal Health (OIE). The shift towards problem-based education also makes students realise the importance of life-long learning and contributes to the development of skills which are necessary to it.

### **3.2.3. Suggestions for improvement**

More intensive training in the use of library/bibliographic resources could contribute to evidence-based practice and lifelong professional development.

### **3.2.4. Decision**

The VEE is compliant with Substandard 3.2.

### **3.3 Programme learning outcomes must:**

- **ensure the effective alignment of all content, teaching, learning and assessment activities of the degree programme to form a cohesive framework**
- **include a description of Day One Competences**
- **form the basis for explicit statements of the objectives and learning outcomes of individual units of study**
- **be communicated to staff and students**
- **be regularly reviewed, managed and updated to ensure they remain relevant, adequate and are effectively achieved.**

#### **3.3.1. Findings**

The cohesion of curriculum elements is provided for by curriculum mapping (see Substandard 3.2). The Internal EAEVE Committee pays attention to matching and merging former learning outcomes with these requirements, and the ESEVT Day One Competences. Not only course descriptions include the objectives and learning outcomes, but also the two logbooks (preclinical and clinical) which make the tracing of the development of competences of students possible. They also serve as guides for both the academic staff or veterinarians responsible for EPTs and the students. Logbooks have been updated several times as the list of Day One Competences had changed.

The Head of the DCVM, assisted by the five coordinators of the CYCCs and by DCVMRRC, and by the Internal EAEVE Committee as an advisory body outlines the learning outcomes of the programme which are finalized by DCVMRRC. The document is submitted to TSJC and UEU for revision, and is finally approved by the School Council. Students are represented in all of these bodies. The approved document is published on the UNICAM, and the University websites.

Teachers take these outcomes into account when formulating the learning outcomes of their courses. The DCVMRRC periodically reviews the learning outcomes of the DCVM, and so do teachers for the ones of their courses.

#### **3.3.2. Comments**

The programme learning outcomes are regularly monitored, updated and published.

#### **3.3.3. Suggestions for improvement**

None.

#### **3.3.4. Decision**

The VEE is compliant with Substandard 3.3.

**3.4 The VEE must have a formally constituted committee structure (which includes effective student representation), with clear and empowered reporting lines, to oversee and manage the curriculum and its delivery. The committee(s) must:**

- **determine the pedagogical basis, design, delivery methods and assessment methods of the curriculum**

- **oversee QA of the curriculum, particularly gathering, evaluating, making change and responding to feedback from stakeholders, peer reviewers and external assessors, and data from examination/assessment outcomes**
- **perform on going and periodic review of the curriculum at least every seven years by involving staff, students and stakeholders; these reviews must lead to continuous improvement. Any action taken or planned as a result of such a review must be communicated to all those concerned**
- **identify and meet training needs for all types of staff, maintaining and enhancing their competence for the ongoing curriculum development.**

#### **3.4.1. Findings**

The TSJC collects and evaluates suggestions submitted by CYCCs, the DCVM Council, and the DCVMRRC, and prepares proposals to be approved by the School Council. If a more thorough revision is required of the curriculum an *ad hoc* “New Curriculum Committee” is set up to elaborate the proposal for the change. This Committee usually consists of the Head of the DCVM, the Study Programme Administration Officer, one member of each Academic Discipline or Academic Recruitment Field, and a representative of basic subjects (if involved). It is this committee which elaborates the draft of the core curriculum taking into account relevant legislation and the suggestions of committees (DCVMRRC, Internal EAEVE Committee, CYCCs, DCVM Council, SWG). The draft is discussed by TSJC, and the opinion is returned to the New Curriculum Committee for consideration. The final draft is discussed by the SBVM Council. If approved, the draft curriculum is submitted to MUR through the Italian National University Council. If the Ministry has any requests, the procedure is repeated until full approval is obtained.

The curriculum is published on UNICAM and University websites and it is distributed in print throughout the Campus, presented to students at specific group tutoring meetings, and during lessons.

#### **3.4.2. Comments**

The curriculum is reviewed and updated regularly with the involvement of students, external stakeholders, and internal interested parties.

#### **3.4.3. Suggestions for improvement**

Regular meetings with external stakeholders and more formal recording of their suggestions/feedback would ensure more emphasis on their contribution.

#### **3.4.4. Decision**

The VEE is compliant with Substandard 3.4.

**3.5 External Practical Training (EPT) is compulsory training activities organised outside the VEE, the student being under the direct supervision of a non-academic person (e.g. a practitioner). EPT cannot replace the core intramural training nor the extramural training under the close supervision of academic staff (e.g. ambulatory clinics, herd health management, practical training in FSQ and VPH).**

**Since the veterinary degree is a professional qualification with Day One Competences, EPT must complement and strengthen the academic education inter alia by enhancing student's professional knowledge.**

### **3.5.1. Findings**

EPT is offered to all students, except Y1, in various fields of practice with the exception of companion animals. Upon graduation, the students will have completed 142 hours in production animals, 150 hours in food inspection and 72 hours in infectious diseases.

### **3.5.2. Comments**

There is no clear distinction between the academic clinical training and EPT.

### **3.5.3. Suggestions for improvement**

It is suggested to clarify for extra-mural clinical training what is completed under the supervision of academic staff or under the supervision of practitioners.

### **3.5.4. Decision**

The VEE is compliant with Substandard 3.5.

**3.6 The EPT providers must have an agreement with the VEE and the student (in order to state their respective rights and duties, including insurance matters), provide a standardised evaluation of the performance of the student during their EPT and be allowed to provide feedback to the VEE on the EPT programme.**

**There must be a member of the academic staff responsible for the overall supervision of the EPT, including liaison with EPT providers.**

### **3.6.1. Findings**

Practitioners supervise both EM activities and EPT and are paid by the VEE.

A contract is signed between the VEE and the practitioner but the model shown in the annex is signed between the University and the practitioner. The contract is not said to be signed by the student and the duties and rights of each party are not specified.

EPT providers in the clinical sector are qualified practitioners, who have to undergo specific training activities organised as an e-learning course. Each EPT provider manages 25-40 students in groups of 3-6 students.

The student must present a project called "training project" which must be signed by the teacher supervising the EPT and then sent to the UNICAM Internship Office. The student is then covered by an insurance.

EPT providers and students evaluate each other at the end of the activity.

One professor is responsible for the EPT activities in general, while several others supervise all practical activities carried out by students. All of them are in direct contact with the students, which allows them to detect problems or receive complaints.

### **3.6.2. Comments**

The student does not appear in the agreement established by the VEE and the VPT provider, and the respective rights and duties are not described in the contract. As the VPT provider is a practitioner paid by the VEE, the activity is not an EPT but an EM activity. There is a confusion

or/and a mix of EPT and extra-mural activities.

### **3.6.3. Suggestions for improvement**

It is suggested to formalise the agreements about EPT.

### **3.6.4. Decision**

The VEE is partially compliant with Substandard 3.6 because of suboptimal EPT organisation.

**3.7 Students must take responsibility for their own learning during EPT. This includes preparing properly before each placement, keeping a proper record of their experience during EPT by using a logbook provided by the VEE and evaluating the EPT. Students must be allowed to complain officially and/or anonymously about issues occurring during EPT. The VEE must have a system of QA to monitor the implementation, progress and then feedback within the EPT activities.**

#### **3.7.1. Findings**

Students are aware of the EPT activities thanks to the academic in charge of the EPT supervision but do not choose their EPT providers. The procedures carried out during the EPT activities could be better understood by the students. Students record their activities in their logbook. Specific forms are used to assess the EPT activity and to provide feedback.

#### **3.7.2. Comments**

Students do not really take control for their own learning and do not prepare their EPT activities. There is no specific logbook dedicated to EPT activities, nor is there clear evidence of a system monitoring students' progress during the EPT. EPT sessions are not EPT according to the ESEVT requirements and understanding.

#### **3.7.3. Suggestions for improvement**

It is suggested to involve students in the preparation of the EPT and include these activities in the logbook.

#### **3.7.4. Decision**

The VEE is partially compliant with Substandard 3.7 because of suboptimal EPT organisation.

## **Standard 4. Facilities and equipment**

**4.1 All aspects of the physical facilities must provide an environment conducive to learning, including internet access. The veterinary VEE must have a clear strategy and programme for maintaining and upgrading its buildings and equipment. Facilities must comply with all relevant legislation including health, safety, biosecurity, accessibility to people with reduced mobility, and EU animal welfare and care standards.**

#### **4.1.1. Findings**

The SBVM is divided into 4 blocks.

Block 1 includes "San Sollecito", the main building where the various offices and the Surgical Unit

## **FINAL REPORT AS ISSUED BY ECOVE ON 29 SEPTEMBER 2021**

connected to the Small Animal Clinical Division (SACD) are located. The morphology, chemistry, some of the diagnostic imaging facilities and clinical pathology laboratories are also located in San Sollecito. Most of the SACD facilities of the Veterinary Teaching Hospital are located in the "New Division" (SER Annex 4, building of San Sollecito).

In Block 2 there is the Large Animal Clinical Division (LACD) as part of the VTH located separately. The facilities include the hospitalisation of horses (6 boxes), pigs and small ruminants (8 animals) and large ruminants (4 bovines). An operating theatre for large animals is available. The LACD breeding section is attached to the same building. Attached to the reproduction exploration area there are two boxes for animals, a laboratory for artificial insemination and embryo transfer, as well as a room for teaching. There is a new area for fresh semen collection with a dummy for this purpose. This equipment has been installed recently near the fresh semen and artificial vagina labs. Also, a small coprology lab is attached to this building.

A new wild animal hospitalisation area is located in block 2 as well. This facility has three rooms, one for birds, one for ruminants and one for carnivores with completely new equipment (particularly suitable cages for each species) which is now being put into use.

Block 3 ("Teaching Block") consists of 4 buildings separated from the rest of the blocks. Most of the laboratory and lecture rooms are located in these buildings. Block A is under reconstruction.

Block 4 ("Teaching Slaughterhouse") is the slaughterhouse of the municipality and UNICAM. This building houses the Food Inspection Unit, the necropsy and dissection rooms. The slaughterhouse has never been used.

The different facilities are fully equipped (detailed information is given in SER Annex 4.5).

Concerning the strategy and programme for the maintenance and modernisation of buildings and equipment, the VEE complies with the relevant official legislation and regularly provides a list of maintenance companies in charge of these tasks.

UNICAM has a centralised service called Procurement and Assets Division, Office of Logistics, Assets and Security which is responsible for the implementation, management and control of the security of workers, students and premises in accordance with Italian legislation.

All facilities have access for people with reduced mobility.

Related to EU animal Welfare and animal care, the VEE provides the highest standards; however, the use of animals for teaching purposes is not recorded.

### **4.1.2. Comments**

The current microbiology lab (Block 3, Building B) is not properly designed for teaching purposes. There is insufficient space to conduct teaching that meets the best biosafety standards for large groups of students. The VEE is aware of this situation and, therefore, presents a new building called Building A, which will be built in the near future. This building will include several classrooms and the microbiology laboratories.

There is no formal registration of the use of the teaching animals and procedures.

The recently built facilities for Wild Life Animals (named “*Reparto Animali Selvatici*”) is noteworthy because it can be a pole of attraction for clinical cases in the future and a facility in which teaching and research activities can be developed.

#### **4.1.3. Suggestions for improvement**

The use of the animals for experimental and teaching purposes should be recorded, particularly if the animal is used for invasive examinations, such as repeated rectal palpation, but not exclusively.

#### **4.1.4. Decision**

The VEE is partially compliant with Substandard 4.1 because of no formal recording of the use of teaching animals.

**4.2 Lecture theatres, teaching laboratories, tutorial rooms, clinical facilities and other teaching spaces must be adequate in number, size and equipped for the instructional purposes and must be well maintained. The facilities must be adapted for the number of students enrolled. Students must have ready access to adequate and sufficient study, self-learning, recreation, locker, sanitary and food service facilities.**

**Offices, teaching preparation and research laboratories must be sufficient for the needs of the academic and support staff.**

#### **4.2.1. Findings**

For theoretical training activities, the VEE has sufficient rooms for the number of students admitted each year (an average of 46 students in the last academic years). Five classrooms are located in building D, three classrooms in building C. In addition, 1 classroom is available in the New division. Theoretical training is scheduled in the morning, so that in the afternoons the different classrooms can be used for group work, such as desk work.

There are two classrooms (Aula Magna in Block 3, Building 3 and Aula Azzurra in San Solecito) with 160 and 42 seats.

The VTH is fully equipped with premises suitable for clinical activity.

There are a total of 8 consultation rooms for small animals, and two for equines and farm animals. The diagnostic imaging service includes the most up-to-date equipment, such as CT scan and MR (0,2 Tesla).

Several laboratories for practical work are located in different buildings.

The library includes a large reading room and a study room. In the same building the students have several rooms for their use as student office/tutors room and a cafeteria (currently with vending machines because of COVID-19 restrictions).

A computer room for the use of the student is provided in Block 3, Building 3.

Students are allowed to use the lecture halls as study rooms if available (in the afternoons).

In the VTH, the students have lockers and changing rooms and a specific area for resting during the emergency shifts.

#### **4.2.2. Comments**

The VEE is provided with laboratories of higher standard for teaching and research purposes, for example in San Sollecito (Block 1, plan 1.c) chemistry and morphology labs. However, as previously mentioned, the size of some laboratories, such as the microbiology labs, is not appropriate for the teaching purposes.

#### **4.2.3. Suggestions for improvement**

A fully equipped skill lab would promote the learning of clinical competences, and would allow students to learn clinical skills before being able to implement them on patients.

#### **4.2.4. Decision**

The VEE is compliant with Substandard 4.2.

### **4.3 The livestock facilities, animal housing, core clinical teaching facilities and equipment used by the VEE for teaching purposes must:**

- **be sufficient in capacity and adapted for the number of students enrolled in order to allow safe hands-on training for all students**
- **be of a high standard, well maintained and fit for the purpose**
- **promote best husbandry, welfare and management practices**
- **ensure relevant biosecurity and bio-containment**
- **be designed to enhance learning.**

#### **4.3.1. Findings**

Healthy animals include 4 horses, 2 cows, 2 donkeys and 4 small ruminants, which are kept in stalls or in outdoor pastures in area 2 (LACD). The separate outdoor area accommodates 2 cows, while the horse area is organised in different enclosures to protect healthy and hospitalised animals.

SER Table 4.3.1 lists the places of hospitalisation and housing of animals in the VTH.

#### **4.3.2. Comments**

Measures for compensation are in place for the practical teaching of FSQ and VPH because the VEE does not own any farms and the on-site slaughterhouse is not operational yet.

The VEE is the only establishment equipped for the surgery of large animals in the Marche Region.

There is a limitation in the number of boxes for the accommodation of sick ruminants. The design of the large animals teaching hospital is suboptimal and does not promote properly intramural clinical practices for ruminants.

#### **4.3.3. Suggestions for improvement**

The new ambulance located at the VTH could be used to promote the learning of clinical skills on ruminants and other species in the farms if it were provided with the appropriate clinical equipment and consumables.

#### **4.3.4. Decision**

The VEE is compliant with Substandard 4.3.

**4.4 Core clinical teaching facilities must be provided in a veterinary teaching hospital (VTH) with 24/7 emergency services at least for companion animals and equines. Within the VTH, the VEE must unequivocally demonstrate that standard of education and clinical research are compliant with all ESEVT Standards, e.g. research-based and evidence-based clinical training supervised by academic staff trained to teach and to assess, availability for staff and students of facilities and patients for performing clinical research and relevant QA procedures.**

**For ruminants, on-call service must be available if emergency services do not exist for those species in a VTH.**

**The VEE must ensure state-of-the-art standards of teaching clinics which remain comparable with or exceeding the best available in the private sector.**

**The VTH and any hospitals, practices and facilities (including EPT) which are involved with the curriculum must meet the relevant national Practice Standards.**

#### **4.4.1. Findings**

The VTH provides clinical services 24/7. Normal opening hours are from 9:30 to 18:30, Monday to Friday. Intensive care and hospitalisation services are offered.

For the emergency service, academic staff, contracted veterinary staff and, if necessary, external doctors are involved to ensure 24/7 service. The list of external private practitioners can be found in SER Annex 4.6.

Students are actively involved in clinical practice and their participation and activities are listed in SER Annex 4.7. Hands-on and clinical training are carried out on companion animals, large animals and exotics. All activities are performed in accordance with the good veterinary practice standards set up by the Federation of Veterinarians of Europe (FVE) and the Italian Federation of Professional Veterinary Associations (FNOVI).

Regular hospitalisation is for animals that do not require intensive care and are placed in cages of appropriate size. There are separate areas equipped with tables and boxes for daily clinical assessment and treatment of these animals.

#### **4.4.2. Comments**

The appointment system is provided by Google calendar and does not permit the identification of the programmed visits. Thus, clinicians and students cannot study or consult the patients' clinical history in advance.

The LACD does not provide intramural clinical service for ruminants. Also there is no compensation because there is no on-call emergency service running. This finding is in accordance with the number of patients seen intramurally in the VTH and evidenced in SER Table 5.1.3.

#### **4.4.3. Suggestions for improvement**

The LACD's facilities and equipment should be adapted to promote the best standards for an intramural clinical training. The students should experience clinical training on individual ruminant patients under the supervision of academic staff as part of the core intramural training. Herd Health Management and/or clinical activity on individual animals and animal collectives (i.e. pregnancy diagnostics, vaccination, etc.) should also be performed under the direct supervision of a member of the academic staff. These core clinical activities developed by the academic staff should be

clearly differentiated from the EPT, which are completed by the student under the direct supervision of a non-academic person (e.g. a practitioner).

Improving the ventilation (negative pressure) of the large animal isolation is recommended, particularly to prevent the contamination of the closer paddock.

#### **4.4.4. Decision**

The VEE is not compliant with Substandard 4.4 because of absence of emergency services for ruminants in the VTH, which is not compensated by an alternative on-call service.

**4.5 The VEE must ensure that students have access to a broad range of diagnostic and therapeutic facilities, including but not limited to: diagnostic imaging, anaesthesia, clinical pathology, intensive/critical care, surgeries and treatment facilities, ambulatory services, pharmacy and necropsy facilities.**

#### **4.5.1. Findings**

At the VTH, the Cardiology Unit is equipped with electrocardiography and a holter. Diagnostic imaging equipment includes ultrasound, X-ray, CT and MRI.

There are several anaesthesia machines and multi-parametric monitors for small and large animals.

The small animal intensive care unit provides the higher standards for the treatment of emergency patients. Also this clinical unit is in charge of the isolation facility for small animals.

The ambulatory clinic for ruminants is provided by external practitioners.

#### **4.5.2. Comments**

The emergency consulting room with attached emergency lab and X-ray room is noteworthy for its equipment and procedures. Also, the oncology treatment room and the physiotherapy are good examples of high standard, demonstrating that the VTH provides research-based and evidence-based clinical training supervised by academic staff trained for teaching.

The pharmacy is running properly, however the tracing of the use of drugs depends on the clinician remembering to report on the medication consumption to the responsible person at the end of the day. A system should be implemented to ensure the traceability of the use of medications, especially those that Italian law requires to be kept under lock and key.

The design of the necropsy room does not facilitate the biocontainment and biosecurity best practices (i.e. the presence of freezers and some cabinets in the room prevent proper disinfection of the entire room).

#### **4.5.3. Suggestions for improvement**

A drug tracing system should be implemented to ensure that the use of drugs are properly registered. Also, a system should be put in place to control drug waste, including a record of its destruction.

A concise registration of the different diagnostic test should be recorded in the VTH (i.e. X-rays, CT, MRI, laboratory analysis, etc.) in order to easily calculate the caseload in next external evaluation.

Students should be provided with boots that have to be used exclusively in the necropsy room. Also, a complete personal protection equipment (as a disposable coverall) should be provided to the users of the necropsy room. There must be a shower in the facilities supporting the autopsy room. Biosecurity rules of the necropsy room should be improved and should promote the best standards for biocontainment and biosafety.

#### **4.5.4. Decision**

The VEE is compliant with Substandard 4.5.

**4.6 Appropriate isolation facilities must be provided to meet the need for the isolation and containment of animals with communicable diseases. Such isolation facilities must be properly constructed, ventilated, maintained and operated to provide for animal care and for prevention of spread of infectious agents. They must be adapted to all animal species commonly handled in the VTH.**

#### **4.6.1. Findings**

The small animal isolation unit is located in the New division (rear entrance) and is designed to prevent the spread of infectious diseases in the rest of the VTH.

The design of the facilities permit the containment and isolation of any animal suspicious or diagnosed with infectious diseases. A preliminary examination room with the needed equipment permit the triage of the patient previous to its inclusion in the quarantine area (one for dogs and one for cats) or in the isolation area (one for dogs and one for cats).

The number of cages allows the admission of animals of different sizes and is sufficient for the hospital's caseload and its needs.

The large animal isolation area is exclusively for equines. Although it has three boxes, it can only accommodate one animal since they are not properly isolated.

The protocol for access to the isolation areas is similar for large and small animals and is carried out in an adequate and protocolized manner.

#### **4.6.2. Comments**

The ventilation system in the large animal isolation area does not permit the correct renewal of the air within the facilities and the control of the temperature (during the visit the window was open). On the other hand, the air flows directly to the paddock located just in the opposite side of the external corridor.

A facility for the intramural clinical training on ruminants, with isolation facility for this species should be provided.

#### **4.6.3. Suggestions for improvement**

The ventilation system (negative pressure) in the large animal isolation area could be improved. It

should be ensured that there is no spread of infectious agents in the air near the isolation area, where there is a nearby stabling area.

Also, the proper isolation of the three boxes currently available within the isolation area will permit its use for more than one animal.

#### **4.6.4. Decision**

The VEE is compliant with Substandard 4.6.

### **4.7 The VEE must have an ambulatory clinic for production animals or equivalent facilities so that students can practise field veterinary medicine and Herd Health Management under academic supervision.**

#### **4.7.1. Findings**

The outpatient clinic is run by 4 contracted veterinarians (one for each species: bovine, poultry, small ruminants and swine). They attend the training courses given by UNICAM for the teaching staff.

#### **4.7.2. Comments**

Although there is a list of practitioners available to be called for emergency cases, there is not a real ruminant clinical service running. Most of the consulted clinical records are related to routine clinical activity on farms, such as pregnancy diagnosis or vaccinations. This finding is consistent with the information provided by the VEE in SER Table 5.1.3 (Number of patients seen intramurally).

There is a consistency in the findings of low caseload in ruminant seen intramurally, low clinical activity reported by the students, low number of hours dedicated to clinical practice in ruminants in the clinic, and low number of academic staff dedicated to ruminant clinical activity.

Although several aspect of the Collective Animal Health is taught throughout the curriculum, there is suboptimal practice in the Heard Heath Management concept.

#### **4.7.3. Suggestions for improvement**

A proper intramural and extramural ruminant clinical service should be provided.

#### **4.7.4. Decision**

The VEE is compliant with Substandard 4.7.

### **4.8 The transport of students, live animals, cadavers, materials from animal origin and other teaching materials must be done in agreement with national and EU standards, to ensure the safety of students and staff and to prevent the spread of infectious agents.**

#### **4.8.1. Findings**

The VEE does not have vehicles for the transport of students or live animals (large or small) to the clinics.

The VEE has a vehicle for the transport of carcasses (small animals) and materials of animal origin. The vehicle is equipped with a trailer and appropriate, hermetically sealed containers, all approved by the official Local Health Authority. Carcasses of large animals are transported by specialised companies. Cold rooms and freezers are available on site.

The waste is collected by a specialised company in agreement with the Italian legislation.

#### **4.8.2. Comments**

The VEE is compliant with the Substandard.

#### **4.8.3. Suggestions for improvement**

Ambulance could be used in the farms for the treatment of livestock on farms as well.

#### **4.8.4. Decision**

The VEE is compliant with Substandard 4.8.

**4.9 Operational policies and procedures (including e.g. biosecurity, good laboratory practice and good clinical practice) must be taught and posted for students, staff and visitors and a Biosafety manual must be available. The VEE must demonstrate a clear commitment for the delivery of biosafety and biosecurity, e.g. by a specific committee structure. The VEE must have a system of QA to monitor and assure clinical, laboratory and farm services, including a regular monitoring of the feedback from students, staff and clients.**

#### **4.9.1. Findings**

Since 2010, mandatory safety courses have been provided for all students and staff. First year students are required to participate. A new online course is in preparation. In addition, specific paper safety manuals are available for students in the laboratories. Italian and English versions of the "Laboratory Safety", "Biohazard" and "Special Hazardous Waste" guides are available on the website. The safety manager is an academic and must attend a specific course to fulfil this task. Before starting the actual work, all students receive the necessary information on the basic safety procedures from their teachers and laboratory technicians.

#### **4.9.2. Comments**

The first aid equipment in case of accident is not provided in all the operating rooms.

Related to biosafety, there is a system in place. Instructions and signs in all laboratories and facilities are present. The biosecurity rules are applied to the entire VEE and most of the labs are provided with the biosecurity equipment such as the safety storage cabinets, or eye washing equipment. However, the design and size of some facilities do not facilitate or allow for proper application of adequate biosafety standards. This is particularly a problem in the current microbiology laboratory.

On the other hand, although the minimum biosecurity requirements are met in the necropsy room, academic, support staff and students do not have boots for exclusive use in this facility. There are no showers in the changing room, and the design of the facility does not guarantee that the necropsy room can be isolated and that users can be adequately decontaminated in case of contamination with an infectious disease.

Video presentations showed students on farms not wearing appropriate personal protective equipment, particularly overalls or over trousers, on all occasions.

#### **4.9.3. Suggestions for improvement**

In all operating rooms, a first aid equipment in case of accidents such as small cuts and similar situations should be present.

The inclusion of comprehensive signalment for biosecurity rules would help in the implementation of the biosecurity system and its compliance.

Students should be provided with boots that have to be used exclusively in the necropsy room. Also, complete personal protection equipment should be provided to the users of the necropsy room.

Procedure for self-protection and biosecurity in the necropsy room should be improved.

#### **4.9.4. Decision**

The VEE is partially compliant with Substandard 4.9 because of suboptimal use of personal protective equipment for necropsy and some farm work.

## **Standard 5. Animal resources and teaching material of animal origin**

**5.1 The number and variety of healthy and diseased animals, cadavers, and material of animal origin must be adequate for providing the practical and safe hands-on training (in the areas of Basic Sciences, Clinical Sciences, Pathology, Animal Production, Food Safety and Quality) and adapted to the number of students enrolled.**

**Evidence must be provided that these data are regularly recorded and that procedures are in place for correcting any deficiencies.**

#### **5.1.1. Findings**

The VTH covers medical, surgical and obstetric care for small animals and horses, with very few production animal cases and provides 24-hour emergency care. The “Breeding Centre for Horses” is located in the large animal part of the VTH. Production animal, herd health and food safety teaching is provided via extra-mural providers under contract agreements. A slaughterhouse was built on site but no commercial company has been prepared to run it.

The carcasses of animals that die or are euthanised during clinical activities are used for autopsy and pathological and topographical anatomy teaching activities. Many cadavers are used several times to maximise benefit. Informed consents from patient owners are documented to ensure that animals, carcasses and animal material (blood, organs, bones, and muscles) may be provided for student training and research. Thirty percent of the material used for teaching comes from the VTH, whilst 70% comes from external sources (practitioners, private clinics, and laboratories), also including farms, slaughter plants, kennels and catteries.

#### **5.1.2. Comments**

Exposure to healthy animals for pre-clinical training has been drastically reduced in 2019-2020.

No extramural cases were seen in 2019-2020 and this represents virtually all production animal cases that would normally have been seen. The number of visits to herds and abattoirs seem low to produce the Indicator values. The VTH animal resources are not being effectively used for teaching for much of the year. Day-time student teaching in the VTH only occurs during semester 2 (spring).

### **5.1.3. Suggestions for improvement**

The caseload, particularly of necropsies in equines, is very low. A strategy should be formulated to increase these numbers.

If extramural caseload is going to be relied upon, a strategy needs to be in place to maintain learning in exceptional circumstances and if student numbers increase.

A register of the use of healthy teaching animals needs to be implemented to ensure that they are not overused.

Timetabling of other courses and lectures should be reviewed to allow use of cases in semester 1 (autumn) to be used for clinical teaching.

### **5.1.4. Decision**

The VEE is compliant with Substandard 5.1.

**5.2 In addition to the training provided in the VEE, experience can include practical training at external sites, provided this training is organised under direct academic supervision and following the same standards as those applied in the VEE.**

### **5.2.1. Findings**

Students perform 5 ECTS credits (125 hours) of Tirocinio in animal production during the 2<sup>nd</sup> year of the course on farms in the region. This is predominately under the direct supervision of academic staff, in collaboration with farm staff. These cover all species.

Production animal clinical training is largely provided by four external practitioners each on 0.7 FTE contracts. It is not stated what facilities or case recording systems these veterinarians have. They are required to attend an online teaching course. Although an academic member of staff oversees the production animal placement, he is an equine specialist and involved in teaching and clinical work in that species.

### **5.2.2. Comments**

2019-2020 has been a challenge for the VEE relying on external providers to meet Day One skills in certain species.

A list of slaughter plants and farms is provided.

### **5.2.3. Suggestions for improvement**

Contingency plans should be produced regarding how minimal case exposure can be maintained for all species if economic problems or disease prevent the use of agreed animal resources. If extra students are to be accepted, plans need to be in place regarding increasing the animal resources before students are accepted.

Production animal clinical training should be under the supervision of an academic member of staff with suitable production animal specialist qualifications, experience and focus.

#### **5.2.4. Decision**

The VEE is compliant with Substandard 5.2.

### **5.3 The VTH must provide nursing care skills and instruction in nursing procedures. Under all situations students must be active participants in the clinical workup of patients, including problem-oriented diagnostic approach together with diagnostic decision-making.**

#### **5.3.1. Findings**

Students acquire some animal handling and clinical skills in early years of the programme but nursing skills are mainly acquired during the 4<sup>th</sup> year (Medical Pathology and Semeiotics, first semester), Andrology (first semester), Obstetrics (second semester), and Surgical Pathology and Semeiotics (second semester), and clinical rotations at the VTH supervised by veterinary and support staff. Two students participate in the ICU/Emergency Unit or night service.

Critical thinking is encouraged via presentation of clinical cases students are responsible for and discussing their own reports with their peer group and supervisor. Day-time student teaching in the VTH only occurs during semester 2 (spring).

#### **5.3.2. Comments**

Veterinary staff are on duty but no qualified nursing support staff are available to support student learning of nursing care skills.

#### **5.3.3. Suggestions for improvement**

Alteration in timetabling should be considered to increase use of the cases, as case numbers where students are actively involved are low in semester 1 (autumn).

Support staff qualified in veterinary nursing should be appointed to support teaching of nursing skills.

#### **5.3.4. Decision**

The VEE is compliant with Substandard 5.3.

### **5.4 Medical records must be comprehensive and maintained in an effective retrieval system (preferably an electronic patient record system) to efficiently support the teaching, research, and service programmes of the VEE.**

#### **5.4.1. Findings**

From December 2020 patient records have been updated to use a web-based portal ARGO, which is planned to also be available to students from outside the VEE via the internet. The system allows PACS based image storage and data searches and retrieval for teaching and research purposes. Although it is stated that production animal case records are returned to the VEE and uploaded to ARGO, there were very few cases recorded.

#### **5.4.2. Comments**

The new records system seems to be well integrated with diagnostic services.

### **5.4.3. Suggestions for improvement**

Students should be exposed to the recording systems used by the external practitioners during the intensive weeks to ensure they are aware of recording systems used in production animal practice.

### **5.4.4. Decision**

The VEE is compliant with Substandard 5.4.

## **Standard 6. Learning resources**

**6.1 State-of-the-art learning resources must be adequate and available to support veterinary education, research, services and continuing education. When the study programme is provided in several tracks/languages, the learning resources must be available in all used languages. Timely access to learning resources, whether through print, electronic media or other means, must be available to students and staff and, when appropriate, to stakeholders. State-of-the-art procedures for bibliographical search and for access to databases and learning resources must be taught to undergraduate students.**

### **6.1.1. Findings**

The main available learning resource is the SBMV-bVM library which was established in 2010. It is used not only by students and staff but also by external users such as practitioners. UNICAM is in charge of the availability, the access, the update and the maintenance of the library.

The UNICAM Library System educates users on bibliographic resources.

Electronic tools are available for various library services. Lectures are organized on how to access databases and bibliographical resources.

The UNICAM Library System is chaired by a director nominated by the University and comprises several libraries, including the SBMV-bVM library. The latter is managed by a librarian and two staff members. The librarian is in charge of acquiring books and journals with sometimes the approval of the School Council depending on their costs. E-books, database accesses, etc. are purchased by the University through a consortium of several universities.

A fully equipped skill lab or a museum are not available.

There is no formal course on bibliographic search and database access. Students receive information about bibliographic search throughout their training, either from teachers or from library staff.

The library is evaluated twice a year through student questionnaires. Internal audits are not specifically planned, but the library is included in an integrated performance plan carried out by UNICAM. There are no external audits.

### **6.1.2. Comments**

The VEE is compliant with Substandard 6.1.

### **6.1.3. Suggestions for improvement**

It is suggested to keep the bookshelves open permanently for an easy access to books.

#### **6.1.4. Decision**

The VEE is compliant with Substandard 6.1.

**6.2 Staff and students must have full access on site to an academic library administered by a qualified librarian, an Information Technology (IT) unit managed by an IT expert, an e-learning platform, and all the relevant human and physical resources necessary for the development of instructional materials by the staff and their use by the students.**

**The relevant electronic information, database and other intranet resources must be easily available for students and staff both in the VEE's core facilities via wireless connection (Wi-Fi) and from outside the VEE through a hosted secured connection, e.g. Virtual Private Network (VPN).**

#### **6.2.1. Findings**

The SBMV-bVM library is run by a qualified librarian with the help of one person and some part-time students, for a total of 1.76 FTE.

The library is open every day from 8:00 am to 7:00 pm, and from 9:30 am to 1:00 pm and 3:00 to 6:00 pm during the weekend. Its budget is around 3,200 €.

The library is equipped with 3 PCs and has enough space to accommodate 60 students at the same time, but it does not give students the opportunity to work in small groups.

Students and staff have access to the library by Wi-Fi.

The library is part of an extensive network of libraries at national level.

There are no subsidiary libraries but there is also a computer room with 15 PCs and students can freely use lecture halls.

One IT expert is dedicated to the VEE which is also well equipped with CCTV.

The University has developed a centralised e-learning platform with teaching support, online tutors, and multimedia content. Staff members can also follow education courses and practitioners involved in extramural activities have a specific e-learning course.

All resources are available for students and staff in all the University campus whereas only library and bibliographic resources are available off-campus.

Students and staff have also access to subscribed platforms such as Wiley Online Library, Nature, etc., off-campus.

#### **6.2.2. Comments**

The proposed services are in agreement with the expectation of staff and students.

#### **6.2.3. Suggestions for improvement**

None.

#### **6.2.4. Decision**

The VEE is compliant with Substandard 6.2.

**6.3 The VEE must provide students with unimpeded access to learning resources, internet and internal study resources, and equipment for the development of procedural skills (e.g. models). The use of these resources must be aligned with the pedagogical environment and learning outcomes within the programme and have mechanisms in place to evaluate the**

**teaching value of changes in learning resources.**

### **6.3.1. Findings**

1855 veterinary books and 9 periodicals are fully available. An extensive number of e- periodicals (around 8,100) is also available in the UNICAM Library Service as well as several databanks in non-veterinary disciplines but of veterinary interest such as the Code of foodstuff.

Students also have access to support materials (courses, videos, etc.) put on the SBVM-bVm website by the teachers for self-study and preparation for exams.

The teaching value of learning resources can be discussed at Course Year Coordination Committee and/or DCVM Council and/or Teacher-Student Joint Committee. Furthermore, each teacher is free to decide which resource is most appropriate for his/her teaching subject.

A collection of histopathological slides and bones and skeletons can be freely used by students but there is no skill lab.

Case records of VTH patients can be consulted by students while respecting the rules of confidentiality.

### **6.3.2. Comments**

The VEE does not have an optimal skill lab to implement the EU 3R strategy and to respect the idea that students should not perform an act for the first time on live animals and should be able to repeat procedures as often as necessary. The use of cadavers is not the most appropriate and sustainable way for students' training.

### **6.3.3. Suggestions for improvement**

The VEE must be encouraged to gradually develop a fully equipped skill lab with the support of the teaching staff.

### **6.3.4. Decision**

The VEE is partially compliant with Substandard 6.3 because of a suboptimal skill lab.

## **Standard 7. Student admission, progression and welfare**

**7.1 The VEE must consistently apply pre-defined and published regulations covering all phases of the student "life cycle", e.g. student admission, progression and certification.**

**In relation to enrolment, the VEE must provide accurate and complete information regarding all aspects of the educational programme in all advertisings for prospective national and international students.**

**Formal cooperations with other VEEs must also be clearly advertised.**

### **7.1.1. Findings**

Information regarding enrolment is published on the MUR website.

UNICAM informs prospective students about its programmes through conventional and new channels (websites, brochures, social media). Besides, the UNICAM Orientation Service in cooperation with the Head of the SBVM-bVM offers a bunch of programmes enhancing choice and decision making such as orientation meetings, guided visits to SBVM-bVM, Journeys of

Knowledge seminars, internship at UNICAM, School-Work Alteration, Open doors in UNICAM, GAM Days, seminars and personalized guidance.

The general information about the DCVM on the SBVM-bVM website is updated every year for newly enrolled students and includes information about procedures, the educational programme, organisation details, calendars, sheets, timetables, departments and premises.

The websites contain pertinent, correct and up-to-date information covering all aspects of student life, the curriculum, and regulations. Possibilities for mobility can also be found there, together with the list of foreign partner institutions that may be asked for from the International Cooperation Office. Italian partner institutions are mentioned where relevant.

### **7.1.2. Comments**

The VEE and its parent institution as well as MUR provide accurate and up-to-date information regarding all phases of the student life cycle. UNICAM and the VEE offer a great variety of programmes, as well as modern channels of communication to enhance orientation and recruitment.

### **7.1.3. Suggestions for improvement**

None.

### **7.1.4. Decision**

The VEE is compliant with Substandard 7.1.

## **7.2 The number of students admitted must be consistent with the resources available at the VEE for staff, buildings, equipment, healthy and diseased animals, and materials of animal origin.**

### **7.2.1. Findings**

The number of students is determined by the MUR, however, there is an initial number suggested by UNICAM, and the MUR consults a working group including representatives of Italian VEEs, the Professional Veterinary Associations, the Regions and the Ministry of Health. The number of students for Italy is then decided and divided between the VEEs. If places planned for non-EU students residing abroad are not occupied, they can be used for admitting Italian students. Though there are fluctuations, the student numbers are quite even, and the VEE has developed the learning environment so that it would suit the given number of students. Upon the request of academic institutions, the MUR tries to keep the allocated student numbers even to enhance long term planning and operation of the institutions.

### **7.2.2. Comments**

The VEE has developed a learning environment basically proportionate to the number of students, and achieved that the MUR allocates a more even number of students to the VEE. There are planned developments which will provide more spacy laboratories for teaching. Possible shortage in facilities, teaching animals, etc. are mentioned in the appropriate chapters of this Report.

### **7.2.3. Suggestions for improvement**

None.

### **7.2.4. Decision**

The VEE is compliant with Substandard 7.2.

**7.3 The selection and progression criteria must be clearly defined, consistent, and defensible, be free of discrimination or bias, and take into account the fact that students are admitted with a view to their entry to the veterinary profession in due course.**

**The VEE must regularly review and reflect on the selection processes to ensure they are appropriate for students to complete the programme successfully. If the selection processes are decided by another authority, the latter must regularly receive feedback from the VEE. Adequate training (including periodic refresher training) must be provided for those involved in the selection process to ensure applicants are evaluated fairly and consistently.**

#### **7.3.1. Findings**

The admission procedure is published on the SBVM-bVM website, and is regulated at the national level by MUR, just like the number of students that can be admitted. The admission test is organised also by the Ministry and is the same at all Italian universities. It consists of 60 multiple choice questions. Students, receiving a minimum score of 20 points are included in the national ranking list, and assigned to a VEE on a first-come first-served basis taking into account the points achieved, the available places at the chosen VEE, and geographical preferences expressed.

The selection and admission procedure is made public also on different websites supervised by MUR. The Ministry also operates an online system (CINCEA) for the management of the selection process, where the national ranking can be seen with coded personal information. Students may view their own personal performance and sheet after proper authentication. Higher education institutions may also submit selection-related data to this electronic system.

The selection process is not controlled by the VEE, however, the MUR in charge of the process consults academic institutions (see Substandard 7.1). Besides, an Admission Committee is set up of professors and technical staff of SBVM-bVM by the SBVM Council, and appointed by Rector's Decree, who supervise the admission process after having read and commented the guidelines issued by MUR. This kind of preparation always precedes the entrance examination.

It is possible to appeal against MUR selection criteria and/or procedures to MUR and to the Regional Administrative Court.

UNICAM has a "Disabled and Specific Learning Disability (SLD) Student Support Service" and has specific regulations in force for such students. SBVM-bVM has a Proxy coordinating Tutors so as to guarantee the right to education programmes and equal access, integration and participation in university life for students with disabilities or specific learning disabilities. There is a special webpage for such students if they want to enrol, which explains the procedures activated for their

support.

### **7.3.2. Comments**

The admission procedure is regulated by MUR, however, UNICAM and the VEE provide feedback through the established channels, working groups, Conference of Directors. Special help is provided already at this stage to students with disabilities and SLD.

### **7.3.3. Suggestions for improvement**

None.

### **7.3.4. Decision**

The VEE is compliant with Substandard 7.3.

**7.4 There must be clear policies and procedures on how applicants with disabilities or illnesses are considered and, if appropriate, accommodated in the programme, taking into account the requirement that all students must be capable of meeting the ESEVT Day One Competences by the time they graduate.**

### **7.4.1. Findings**

UNICAM provides special services for disabled and SLD students to enhance the best inclusion, and their possibility to learn. The services include tutorship, accompanying service, specific software and teaching material. The SBVM-bVM Proxy is supported by a Tutor who is in charge of supporting students with disabilities and/or SLD with special forms of learning, participating in their evaluation, offering specific teaching aids, ensuring suitable forms and times for participation in teaching activities, stimulating and increasing awareness of the problems among students, teachers and the technical/administrative staff of UNICAM.

### **7.4.2. Comments**

The VEE provides all possible help for students with disabilities or SLD.

### **7.4.3. Suggestions for improvement**

None.

### **7.4.4. Decision**

The VEE is compliant with Substandard 7.4.

**7.5 The basis for decisions on progression (including academic progression and professional fitness to practise) must be explicit and readily available to the students. The VEE must provide evidence that it has mechanisms in place to identify and provide remediation and appropriate support (including termination) for students who are not performing adequately.**

**The VEE must have mechanisms in place to monitor attrition and progression and be able to respond and amend admission selection criteria (if permitted by national or university law) and student support if required.**

### **7.5.1. Findings**

The requirements of progression are included clearly in the study regulations (Regulations of the Single-Cycle Second Level Degree Course in Veterinary Medicine - Class LM-42). In order to step to the next year, students must acquire 40 ECTS for the 2<sup>nd</sup>, 70 ECTS for the 3<sup>rd</sup>, 100 ECTS for the 4<sup>th</sup>, and 170 ECTS for the 5<sup>th</sup> year. Students not complying with this requirement have to repeat the year. One ECTS corresponds to 25 hours of classroom/laboratory or individual work. (Some more details under 3.1.1.1.)

In order to obtain the ECTS for the course, the student has to pass the exam or other form of assessment. There are exam periods every month except for August and holidays, and students may select the date most convenient for them. Exams can be booked, and results recorded in the ESSE3 electronic system. The webpage of the SBVM-bVM gives all the necessary information, while the ESSE3 system makes it possible for the student to get current information about his/her progression.

Students who do not perform adequately are followed and aided from the 1<sup>st</sup> year. If a student's performance is lower than one third of the maximum achievable score in a section of the admission test, they must attend a compulsory remedial course (OFA) in chemistry and/or biology, and at the end of the course, they have to pass an exam. Enrolment in the teaching courses from the 2<sup>nd</sup> year on depends on the successful completion of the OFA. The OFA is considered successful even if the student does not sit the final test, but manages to pass the exams of the first year in Chemistry and Biochemical Propaedeutics, and Zoology and Botany. Since there are delays in enrolling in the DCVM for reasons not controlled by the student or the VEE, remedial courses are repeated for those who enrolled late. A Tutorship service is also available to prepare for the chemistry exam.

There were modifications in the study regulations and the curriculum in order to reduce the time required for graduation in 2016/17 and in 2018. The changes, reflecting requests from professors and the CYCCs and the JTSC included the following:

- reduction in the teaching load for the 3<sup>rd</sup> year,
- elimination of the propaedeutic course in "Infectious Diseases of Animals" for "Veterinary Pathological Anatomy and Cadaveric Diagnostics",
- automatic certification of attendance for students enrolling late, and reduction of ECTS required to enter the 2<sup>nd</sup> and 5<sup>th</sup> year,
- increasing the awareness of students by involving them in the QA procedures, and inviting more student representatives to the DCVMRRC and Internal EAEVE Committee.

A Tutorship service is available for students covering three important fields: reception, graduation course, and professional orientation. Each student has a teacher Tutor who stands by the student throughout the student's entire university career. There are group tutoring meetings upon request

of students. UNICAM and SBVM-bVM organise special days to welcome the freshmen, study tutoring course, seminars and workshops held by experts, and labour market orientation meetings.

The services available for students with disabilities and/or SLD are described under Substandard 7.4. The role of the VEE (UNICAM) in the admission procedure is described under Substandard 7.3.

The study success of universities is monitored nationwide by the CENSIS system, and UNICAM monitors the study load via its quality system (USIQUAL). UNICAM has a favourable position in the ranking of universities by students (StuDocu).

#### **7.5.2. Comments**

Student progression is closely monitored by the VEE, and remedial actions are taken. The tutorial system at individual and group level is an opportunity to closely monitor and aid the development of students, and provide feedback to the educational process.

#### **7.5.3. Suggestions for improvement**

None.

#### **7.5.4. Decision**

The VEE is compliant with Substandard 7.5.

**7.6 Mechanisms for the exclusion of students from the programme for any reason must be explicit. The VEE's policies for managing appeals against decisions, including admissions, academic and progression decisions and exclusion, must be transparent and publicly available.**

#### **7.6.1. Findings**

According to the Ethical Codex of UNICAM, violation of duties by students are considered by the Rector having heard the students' Ombudsman. There is also a Disciplinary Board at UNICAM responsible for investigating more severe violations of duties and the code of ethics, and making propositions for sanctions to the Board of Directors. Consequences must be fair and proportionate, the most severe being a suspension of studies for a maximum of 3 years. It is possible to appeal against decisions to the UNICAM Student Council, which forwards the appeal to the Ombudsman. The duties and authority of the Ombudsman are clearly regulated. Since there is no limit for the number of the repetition of exams, students cannot be excluded for study reasons.

The VEE shares its policy and procedures with UNICAM which publishes the University Statute, the Code of Ethics and Conduct, Study regulations and other relevant regulations on its homepage, and also sends changes in e-mail to students and staff.

#### **7.6.2. Comments**

Exclusion of students from studies may occur only for a maximum of 3 years, and happens exceptionally. The majority of the Statute as well as the ethical codex regards staff and not the

students.

### **7.6.3. Suggestions for improvement**

None.

### **7.6.4. Decision**

The VEE is compliant with Substandard 7.6.

**7.7 Provisions must be made by the VEE to support the physical, emotional and welfare needs of students. This includes, but is not limited to, learning support and counselling services, career advice, and fair and transparent mechanisms for dealing with student illness, impairment and disability during the programme. This shall include provision of reasonable adjustments for disabled students, consistent with all relevant equality and/or human rights legislation.**

**There must be effective mechanisms for resolution of student grievances (e.g. interpersonal conflict or harassment).**

### **7.7.1. Findings**

There are many services available to students:

- Student Administration Office
- Tutorship Service (see Substandard 7.5, also available via social networks and modern communication channels),
- Tutors Desk for students with disabilities and/or SLD: available by appointment or online,
- ERDIS Service: ensuring accommodation at reduced price,
- CUS Sport: recreation and sport facilities,
- Psychological Counselling Service for students of UNICAM,
- International Office for various forms of mobility,
- Language Office of UNICAM organising courses and tests in foreign languages,
- E-learning platform with free and paid courses, e.g. on workplace safety,
- Cafeteria (closed at present due to the pandemic),
- Insurance assistance for those attending activities under agreement with UNICAM,
- Ombudsman of students,
- Individual tutorship,
- Public transport agreement between UNICAM and the local bus company for free transport between Camerino and Matelica and other university locations,
- Alias examination booklet in respect of gender self-determination.

Student organisations:

- Student Council ensuring the opportunity to participate in the academic life,
- European Student Association and IVSA facilitating relationship with students from other VEEs,
- Cultural Associations for the promotion of cultural activities.

For the handling of student grievances, see Substandard 7.6.

### **7.7.2. Comments**

Following their student focused policy, UNICAM and the VEE are very supportive of students in all respects, and the small size of the VEE makes individualised attention and care possible, which is highly appreciated by students.

The many ways of evening out competencies of students' coming from different high schools, of supporting students with disabilities and SLD, the attention paid to socially deprived students and financial aid provided for them, as well as the alias examination booklet are good practices to be followed.

### **7.7.3. Suggestions for improvement**

None.

### **7.7.4. Decision**

The VEE is compliant with Substandard 7.7.

**7.8 Mechanisms must be in place by which students can convey their needs and wants to the VEE. The VEE must provide students with a mechanism, anonymously if they wish, to offer suggestions, comments and complaints regarding compliance of the VEE with national and international legislation and the ESEVT standards.**

### **7.8.1. Findings**

Students are represented in almost all of the committees, and their representation has increased in the recent years in order to facilitate active participation.

Four Tutors are available at given times to listen to comments and suggestions made by students of the DCVM. Student representatives may contact the teachers, the Rector's Proxy for Tutoring, the Head of the DCVM, the School Director, the Vice-Rectors, and the Rector to raise issues concerning education or work. This open-door policy is possible because of the small size of the institution, and is considered as an integral part of quality efforts.

Students may turn to the Student Council with their suggestions and grievances, and there is a form on the homepage of the SBVM-bVM which can be used anonymously or with a name for submitting proposals, remarks or complaints to different authorities within the school.

### **7.8.2. Comments**

The open-door policy of UNICAM and the tutorial system with its several levels is worthy of praise. Students have all opportunities to contact their teachers and the university/faculty management.

### **7.8.3. Suggestions for improvement**

Students should be encouraged to use the formal (and not only personal) channels for the formulation of their significant comments, requests, etc. to ensure that these are discussed and dealt with by the relevant committees or the direction of the VEE.

#### **7.8.4. Decision**

The VEE is compliant with Substandard 7.8.

### **Standard 8. Student assessment**

**8.1 The VEE must ensure that there is a clearly identified structure within the VEE showing lines of responsibility for the assessment strategy to ensure coherence of the overall assessment regime and to allow the demonstration of progressive development across the programme towards entry-level competence.**

#### **8.1.1. Findings**

The assessment tasks and grading of the SBVM follow the UNICAM University Policies for the verification of learning, approved by the University Senate, regarding the Standards and Guidelines for Quality Assurance in the European Higher Education Area (ESG 2015, Standard 1.3), the Guidelines for the professional development of teachers, and teaching evaluation strategies for universities (QUARC, ed. 2017) and the UNICAM Teaching Regulations, to “ensure that the programmes are delivered in a way that encourages students to take an active role in creating the learning process, and that the assessment of students reflects this approach”.

Even based on this, the assessment methods are managed by each School, and are decided by the Professor responsible for teaching and training activity that designs and plans the methods for learning assessment, and checks its alignment with the expected learning outcomes and teaching.

At the beginning of each course activity, the professor informs the students, in a clear and exhaustive way, how the exams will take place, and how the level of achievement of the course objectives will be assessed. The same information is described in predefined on-line forms, making them available to the public well in advance.

The University has an Evaluation Unit (UEU), which ensures that the evaluation in study programmes is compliant with the requirements established in the Curriculum Map, and the Quality Supervision Board of the University (QSB-U) promotes a careful monitoring of exam results, and the regularity of students' career.

At the beginning of each year, the professor responsible for each subject indicate to the Study Programme Administration Officer the composition of the Examination Committee for his/her course. This Committee consists of the President (the professor in charge of the course) and at least one colleague as member (plus two or three substitute members). The composition of the Examination Committee is published in the ESSE3 system. Also, the Study Programme Administration Officer draws up the calendar of lectures/activities, and a calendar of the exam sessions, and publishes them. Each student, has at least 8 examination sessions for each teaching course, and may sit the same exam as many times as they want, provided that fifteen days have passed between the failed exam and its repetition. From June on, the students enrolled in a given year may sit any exams of the courses held in the previous years.

Only the students with at least 70% of a teaching course attendance of the academic lectures/activities (theoretical and practical ones) may access the corresponding exam. In some subjects, they are required to pass the mandatory preliminary exams listed in SER Annex 8.3.

The maximum number of exams necessary for obtaining the degree cannot be higher than 30.

Most theoretical and practical exams are performed in oral form and a few of them are written, but with an oral component too, according to the “problem solving” principles.

### **8.1.2. Comments**

Each student has at least 8 examination sessions for each teaching course, and may sit the same exam as many times as they want, provided that fifteen days have passed between the failed exam and its repetition.

### **8.1.3. Suggestions for improvement**

It is suggested to reduce the number of examination sessions for each subject.

### **8.1.4. Decision**

The VEE is compliant with Substandard 8.1.

**8.2 The assessment tasks and grading criteria for each unit of study in the programme must be published, applied consistently, clearly identified and available to students in a timely manner well in advance of the assessment. Requirements to pass must be explicit.**

**The VEE must properly document the results of assessment and provide the students with timely feedback on their assessments.**

**Mechanisms for students to appeal against assessment outcomes must be explicit.**

### **8.2.1. Findings**

The professor responsible for a teaching course informs the students at the beginning of each course activity, in a clear and exhaustive way, how the exams will take place, how all/some activities (practical and/or theoretical) will be performed, how the level of achievement of the course objectives will be assessed and how evaluation will take place during the course. The same information is described in predefined online forms, making them available to the public well in advance.

The assessment is through competency-based exams, to determine the acquired knowledge and skills. Exams focus on specific learning outcomes, to which single questions and formats are assigned, following the principle of constructive alignment.

Grades are expressed in numbers, the highest is 30 “cum laude”, and the minimum passing grade is 18.

There are four different possibilities of results: *absent*, when the student does not sit the exam; *withdrawn*, when the student takes the exam but is not satisfied with the result; *insufficient*, when the student does not reach the grade of 18; *rated* with a grade of 18 or higher.

At the end of their exam, each student is immediately notified individually about the result and the grade. If the grade is accepted by the student, the President of the Examination Committee registers the result in the ESSE3 and the student can see their results online, and constantly monitor their career.

The UNICAM Governance recommends to the professors with repeatedly withdrawing students to discuss the situation with the student and see what issues are preventing the final approval. Also, in this situation the Tutor intervention is useful.

The professors are very attentive to the “repeating students”, and as soon as they are identified, contact them to understand their difficulties, and aid to solve them, in order for students to successfully complete their degree.

Issues with the class (i.e. inadequate information about the conduct of the exam; insufficient teaching material and textbook(s) for the preparation of the exam; the arguments of the exam not included in the programme described at the beginning of the teaching course and published online)

are reported to the different councils as the DCVM and CYCCs at end of the semester. The Coordinator of the DCVM notifies the professor in order to provide feedback and suggestions for an improvement of the training and assessment process. The notified teacher has to implement all requested adjustments in his/her course, in order to improve the students' opinion and their general and individual performances.

In general, there are no cases to the appeal process related to the incorrect assessment. When this occurs, the Examination Committee may be modified, replacing some of the professors with the substitute members that were described, and also the Coordinator of DCVM, the Director of the School or, in exceptional cases, the Pro-Rector for Teaching Activities of UNICAM, could also be a participant as an additional member.

The students are encouraged to play an active role in the process of assessment through critical evaluation of the training process by means of the questionnaires, and be a part of the different committees.

### **8.2.2. Comments**

The VEE has an excellent student-centered approach, aiming for their success. The different tutoring activities are useful for the welfare of the students and to promote their learning.

### **8.2.3. Suggestions for improvement**

None.

### **8.2.4. Decision**

The VEE is compliant with Substandard 8.2.

**8.3 The VEE must have a process in place to review assessment outcomes, to change assessment strategies and to ensure the accuracy of the procedures when required. Programme learning outcomes covering the full range of professional knowledge, skills, competences and attributes must form the basis for assessment design and underpin decisions on progression.**

### **8.3.1. Findings**

The Coordinator of the DCVM is responsible for guaranteeing a fair and rigorous student evaluation system. Annually, all programmes including the evaluation criteria and systems of all the subjects, are monitored and re-examined through the review process supported by the DCVM Council, the DCVMRRC and the TSJC. The Review Reporting Committee is responsible for the development of guidelines and for the evaluation of teaching methods and student results.

The DCVM Council also receives help and suggestions from the CYCCs and the TSJC (a committee that integrates students), and from UNICAM Educational Working Group, composed of Heads of the DCs, and represented by the Pro-Rector for Teaching Activities.

The programme learning outcomes are published on the SBVM-bVM website.

### **8.3.2. Comments**

There are some differences in the assessment process and efforts are made to progressively reach a more uniform method of evaluation, which is an ongoing process, with the active participation of the professors and the students that are very active in all these committees and really contribute to this.

**8.3.3. Suggestions for improvement**

None.

**8.3.4. Decision**

The VEE is compliant with Substandard 8.3.

**8.4 Assessment strategies must allow the VEE to certify student achievement of learning objectives at the level of the programme and individual units of study.**

**The VEE must ensure that the programmes are delivered in a way that encourages students to take an active role in creating the learning process, and that the assessment of students reflects this approach.**

**8.4.1. Findings**

The grades along the course contribute to about 90% of the final graduation grade, assigned after the final exam. The final evaluation of the student, certified by means of a degree certificate, is supported by the evaluation of the thesis, for a maximum of 10 points.

The professors of different subjects are responsible for the grades' registration and signature in the student's paper logbook and in the ESSE3 system.

Each student is provided with two different logbooks, one for preclinical and one for clinical activities, which are recorded and certified by the relevant professors after the student demonstrated the acquisition of the Day One Competences (D1C) during practical activities performed in different teaching courses and during the Tirocinio.

**8.4.2. Comments**

The students are motivated to be part of the evaluation process and really contribute to it with the questionnaires and they are active in several councils.

**8.4.3. Suggestions for improvement**

None.

**8.4.4. Decision**

The VEE is compliant with Substandard 8.4.

**8.5 Methods of formative and summative assessment must be valid and reliable and comprise a variety of approaches. Direct assessment of clinical skills and Day One Competences (some of which may be on simulated patients), must form a significant component of the overall process of assessment. It must also include the quality control of the student logbooks in order to ensure that all clinical procedures, practical and hands-on training planned in the study programme have been fully completed by each individual student.**

**8.5.1. Findings**

The students only have one point of evaluation, called the exam, including all content of each subject. Most theoretical and practical exams are performed in oral form and a few of them are written, but with an oral component too. Most oral examinations are generally performed according

to the “problem solving” principles, and are competency-based, with at least three questions, in a public session. The written exam is in the form of open and/or closed-answer questions, multiple-choice questions, problem-solving questions, and supervised work assessments.

The soft skills are evaluated by the presentations and discussion individually or in small groups of students, as supervised lectures given by the students, reading, and discussion of scientific papers, critical evaluation of scientific methods. This is also evaluated in the final thesis.

The Tirosinio activities are organized in order to perform intramural and extramural activities, ambulatory clinics, and EPT, in a small-group teaching, skills that can be observed individually, and the feedback given directly to the individual students, by completing the two logbooks certifying the acquisition of preclinical and clinical practical activities.

According to the level of training received, different examination formats are used, or partially combined, allowing the learning outcomes, theoretical and clinical skills, and D1Cs to be assessed. The clinical rotation makes up 40% of the final grade and has continuous assessment, where the D1Cs have to be demonstrated in formative and summative assessments.

### **8.5.2. Comments**

Although all professors and students agree that the single exam held at the end of the course is the best way for the general understanding of the subject, having occasions to evaluate the student throughout the classes (along the semester or year) with a real contribution to his/her final grade can be motivating for the real and interested participation in all teaching activities, and possibly reduce the exam repetitions.

### **8.5.3. Suggestions for improvement**

It could be useful to have other occasions of assessment throughout the classes (along the semester or year) with a real contribution to the final grade, reducing the weight of the final exam.

Increase in the variety of assessment methods to include “authentic” assessments aligned to Day One skills could be implemented – for example, production of a herd health report, written surgical case report, written evaluation of radiographs, production of a legally compliant label for pharmaceutical products. These could be included as assessment methods in the final grade.

### **8.5.4. Decision**

The VEE is compliant with Substandard 8.5.

## **Standard 9. Academic and support staff**

**9.1 The VEE must ensure that all staff are appropriately qualified and prepared for their roles, in agreement with national and EU regulations and must apply fair and transparent processes for the recruitment and development of staff.**

**A formal training (including good teaching and evaluation practices, learning and e-learning resources, biosecurity and QA procedures) must be in place for all staff involved with teaching.**

**Most academic staff (calculated as FTE) involved in veterinary training must be veterinarians. It is expected that more than 2/3 of the instruction that the students receive, as determined by student teaching hours, is delivered by qualified veterinarians.**

### **9.1.1. Findings**

Italian law stipulates the training required for each grade of staff. Italian National Scientific Qualification (Abilitazione Scientifica Nazionale – INSQ) and a PhD and/or national Specialisation Diploma in Medicine are usually mandatory for permanent posts. A list of suitably qualified potential applicants is held nationally by MUR and selection of candidates is open and public.

A staff training programme “UNICAMforma”, is mentioned under 9.2 in the SER. Details of a small number of courses are at the linked website.

78.47% of staff are qualified veterinarians and they deliver 68.33% and 73.89% of the teaching depending on the qualifications of the thesis supervisor.

Support staff reported that they had access to appropriate training, and management were open to requests for training to expand their capability into new roles.

### **9.1.2. Comments**

Staffing is a specific part of the VEE strategic plan but said to be cross-cutting and no specific detail given. The majority of staff teaching are members of the VEE staff and a small number work in other parts of the University or externally.

Much of the production animal training and EPT in farm species is undertaken by 4 external practitioners on 0.7 FTE under the supervision of an equine specialist member of academic staff.

### **9.1.3. Suggestions for improvement**

Contract for external providers should stipulate that they need to agree to undertake training in teaching methods if they do not hold such a teaching qualification already.

A list of training available to staff for each type of learning (lectures, e-learning, small groups programme design, etc.) could be provided to staff and an amount of annual mandatory training agreed.

### **9.1.4. Decision**

The VEE is compliant with Substandard 9.1.

**9.2 The total number, qualifications and skills of all staff involved with the programme, including teaching staff, ‘adjunct’ staff, technical, administrative and support staff, must be sufficient and appropriate to deliver the educational programme and fulfil the VEE’s mission.**

**A procedure must be in place to assess if the staff involved with teaching display competence and effective teaching skills in all relevant aspects of the curriculum that they teach, regardless of whether they are full or part time, residents, interns or other postgraduate students, adjuncts or off-campus contracted teachers.**

### **9.2.1. Findings**

The VEE has a small staff with 5 full professors, 11 associate professors and 12 University researchers on permanent contracts. Junior staff are on fixed term contracts. Internships have commenced in 2019-2020 but the post of Resident does not exist in the structure.

Support staff are managed separately from academic staff. There are 35 FTE with half being permanent roles and some part-time roles being undertaken by students.

Each subject and staff member are evaluated by student questionnaire.

Staff suitably qualified in production animal /herd health and nursing care were not identified.

### **9.2.2. Comments**

The VEE states its wishes to increase the number of European recognised specialist staff but without a strategy and resident posts it is not clear how they will achieve this aspiration.

### **9.2.3. Suggestions for improvement**

A clear plan of how staff can be supported to obtain European recognised specialist (EBVS) qualifications could be put into place. Staff undertaking alternative residency programmes affiliated to specialists in other Universities could improve this position in a 5-10 year timescale. Peer evaluation and mentoring of teaching quality should be put into place formally to aid teacher development.

Academic staff specifically qualified and experienced in production animals and Herd Health (ideally qualified to European specialisation level) should be appointed to supervise production animal and Herd Health teaching.

Support staff specifically qualified and experienced in nursing care should be appointed to oversee nursing care of inpatients and aid the learning of students.

### **9.2.4. Decision**

The VEE is partially compliant with Substandard 9.2 because of suboptimal academic staffing in food-producing animals teaching and support staffing in nursing care.

**9.3 Staff must be given opportunities to develop and extend their teaching and assessment knowledge and must be encouraged to improve their skills. Opportunities for didactic and pedagogic training and specialisation must be available. The VEE must clearly define any systems of reward for teaching excellence in operation.**

**Academic positions must offer the security and benefits necessary to maintain stability, continuity, and competence of the academic staff. They must have a balanced workload of teaching, research and service depending on their role. They must have reasonable opportunities and resources for participation in scholarly activities.**

### **9.3.1. Findings**

The SER contains no information regarding the training and recognition of teaching other than a staff training programme “UNICAMforma”, mentioned under 9.2 in the SER. Details of a small number of courses are at the linked website. No formal plan for staff to obtain European recognised specialist qualifications is presented.

A minimum amount of teaching for full time academic staff is stipulated in Italian law. The average actually delivered of 303.6 hours seems reasonable.

For a small number of staff, the amount of research publications seems good. However, large areas

of the clinical teaching in production animals is delivered by contracted staff with no clear opportunity for other scholarly activity.

### **9.3.2. Comments**

The SER focussed on legal minimum teaching requirements rather than the ideal to deliver a balanced curriculum.

### **9.3.3. Suggestions for improvement**

It would be necessary to produce a plan for how staff may obtain EBVS-recognised specialist qualifications. It is suggested that staff are supported to undertake alternative residency programmes in collaboration with other institutions who are already training establishments so that the VEE can become a training establishment for residents in the medium term.

### **9.3.4. Decision**

The VEE is compliant with Substandard 9.3.

**9.4 The VEE must provide evidence that it utilises a well-defined, comprehensive and publicised programme for the professional growth and development of academic and support staff, including formal appraisal and informal mentoring procedures.**

**Staff must have the opportunity to contribute to the VEE's direction and decision-making processes.**

**Promotion criteria for academic and support staff must be clear and explicit. Promotions for teaching staff must recognise excellence in, and (if permitted by the national or university law) place equal emphasis on all aspects of teaching (including clinical teaching), research, service and other scholarly activities.**

### **9.4.1. Findings**

Both academic and teaching staff are represented at all levels of governing bodies of UNICAM, according to the Statute: Board of Directors, University Senate, Assembly of Representatives, Single Committee for Guaranteeing the Promotion of Equal Opportunities and Welfare and Against Discriminations.

Academic staff promotion is merit-based. Every year, a total score is assigned on the basis of activities (teaching, research, fund acquisition, third mission, and institutional roles covered), performed in the previous three years. All staff members eligible for the two-year promotion can apply, and promotion is assigned by a Commission (composed of the Rector, the Director-General, and the Directors of the Schools) to those staff members who obtained a minimum score of 12 points. Promotion criteria for support staff are clear and individuals ranked. However, availability of budget determines who is promoted from the ranking.

### **9.4.2. Comments**

Support staff report that management are open to supporting the training that they suggest.

### **9.4.3. Suggestions for improvement**

None.

#### **9.4.4. Decision**

The VEE is compliant with Substandard 9.4.

**9.5 A system for assessment of teaching staff must be in operation and must include student participation. Results must be available to those undertaking external reviews and commented upon in reports.**

#### **9.5.1. Findings**

The SER focusses on the evaluation of the task rather than individual staff.

Monitoring of satisfaction is carried out through questionnaires (addressed to students and teachers) and checklists (for interviews with families and companies). Starting from the AY 2020/2021, a new questionnaire was introduced, taking into account some suggestions given by students and teachers. Scores lower than 3 out of 4 are reported by the Head of the Degree Course in the annual review document together with the relevant improvement actions. The Board of the Coordinators of CYCCs (composed of the Coordinators and student representatives of all CYCCs, and the Coordinator of the DCVM) meets to discuss all the issues arising during the semester and proposes the relevant solutions.

#### **9.5.2. Comments**

The VEE is compliant with the Substandard.

#### **9.5.3. Suggestions for improvement**

None.

#### **9.5.4. Decision**

The VEE is compliant with Substandard 9.5.

### **Standard 10. Research programmes, continuing and postgraduate education**

**10.1 The VEE must demonstrate significant and broad research activities of staff that integrate with and strengthen the veterinary degree programme through research-based teaching.**

#### **10.1.1. Findings**

Pathology, clinical sciences and infectious diseases including food safety are research fields that dominate amongst undergraduate theses. In the list of ongoing funded research the 16 grants from industry, national and EU (Horizon 2020 and InterReg) varies from 234 k€ to 5k€. The SBVM also focuses on innovation as evidenced by 5 active patents listed.

#### **10.1.2. Comments**

The VEE has limited external funding of around 20% of its budget as external research funding.

#### **10.1.3. Suggestions for improvement**

A formulated strategy for increased research and external funding will augment the research-based teaching of VEE.

#### **10.1.4. Decision**

The VEE is compliant with Substandard 10.1.

**10.2 All students must be trained in scientific method and research techniques relevant to evidence-based veterinary medicine and must have opportunities to participate in research programmes.**

#### **10.2.1. Findings**

The students pursued either ‘experimental’ or ‘critical-review’ theses and during the period 2017-2020, the distribution was 73.5% experimental and 26.5% critical review, respectively.

‘Experimental’ thesis work means that the students are actively involved in research activities within the research group which they have chosen to carry out the thesis: they carry out experiments, analyses, data collection and processing, bibliographic searches, and finally, they write their thesis in the format of a scientific publication (introduction, materials and methods, results, discussion, conclusions, references, acknowledgments).

In the case of a “critical-review” thesis, students must carry out a critical review of scientific literature regarding a chosen topic, and the thesis work is based on a deep bibliographic search and analysis.

In both cases, during this period of training, students experience group working and are encouraged to operate with defined degrees of autonomy, as well as to familiarise themselves with the scientific English language. The students may also carry out the thesis work abroad.

#### **10.2.2. Comments**

The students’ theses could be used to increase the research activity at the VEE.

#### **10.2.3. Suggestions for improvement**

The students in the experimental side should also acquire the skills of critical literature review and ranking of evidence.

#### **10.2.4. Decision**

The VEE is compliant with Substandard 10.2.

**10.3 The VEE must provide advanced postgraduate degree programmes, e.g. PhD, internships, residencies and continuing education programmes that complement and strengthen the veterinary degree programme and are relevant to the needs of the profession and society.**

#### **10.3.1. Findings**

There are 4 to 7 PhD degrees completed per year and there were 11 interns during 2019/2020. There are no EBVS residency programmes in place but there are national specialisation 3 year programmes of hygiene and control of fishery and aquaculture products and animal health, breeding and production.

The VEE has no specific plan to increase the number of residencies, even if it is a point considered in the strategic plan.

### **10.3.2. Comments**

The possibility for increased number of PhD students is through the region's call for innovative PhDs.

### **10.3.3. Suggestions for improvement**

There should be more PhD students and possibilities for pursuing residencies in veterinary specialisation either in national programmes or in EBVS-approved programmes for younger staff.

### **10.3.4. Decision**

The VEE is partially compliant with Substandard 10.3 because of suboptimal numbers of students involved in postgraduate programmes.

## **10.4 The VEE must have a system of QA to evaluate how research activities provide opportunities for student training and staff promotion, and how research approaches, methods and results are integrated into the veterinary teaching programmes.**

### **10.4.1. Findings**

Being small, the VEE facilitates a continuous contact between students and teachers who also are doing research. Moreover, the research departments do the practical teaching, which may require the student to write a report structured as a scientific publication. This should enable the students to better understand how a research activity is carried out. Moreover, the organisation of meetings throughout the training of students promotes research-based education. Teachers are also encouraged to design practical activities so that students start acquiring some research skills as well.

As for staff members at the VEE, there is one meeting (usually in April of each year) for the evaluation of postgraduate programmes (excluding Schools of National Specialisation) proposed for the following academic year; at that time, staff members can evaluate and then reject, modify or approve the proposed courses and some problems are discussed there. The courses listed in the VEE's SER are those proposed and positively evaluated by the staff.

The VEE is currently setting up a certification process for all postgraduate courses, which undergraduate might attend too.

### **10.4.2. Comments**

A positive element is osmosis – the flow of skills, competences, and experiences towards undergraduate students not only through practical activities but also through seminars, conferences, and lectures, to which undergraduate students are often invited.

**10.4.3. Suggestions for improvement**

As the VEE suggested, to let veterinary students take graduate classes in the fields of their interest to further the research-based training.

**10.4.4. Decision**

The VEE is compliant with Substandard 10.4.

**11. ESEVT Indicators**



ESEVT Indicators

Date of the form filling:		Establishment values	Median values <sup>1</sup>	Minimal values <sup>2</sup>	Balance <sup>3</sup>
<b>Calculated Indicators from raw data</b>					
<b>I1</b>	n° of FTE academic staff involved in veterinary training / n° of undergraduate students	0,184	0,15	0,13	0,058
<b>I2</b>	n° of FTE veterinarians involved in veterinary training / n° of students graduating annually	1,173	0,84	0,63	0,543
<b>I3</b>	n° of FTE support staff involved in veterinary training / n° of students graduating annually	0,670	0,88	0,54	0,130
<b>I4</b>	n° of hours of practical (non-clinical) training	698,000	953,50	700,59	-2,590
<b>I5</b>	n° of hours of clinical training	810,000	941,58	704,80	105,200
<b>I6</b>	n° of hours of FSQ & VPH training	513,000	293,50	191,80	321,200
<b>I7</b>	n° of hours of extra-mural practical training in FSQ & VPH	75,000	75,00	31,80	43,200
<b>I8</b>	n° of companion animal patients seen intra-murally / n° of students graduating annually	84,302	62,31	43,58	40,722
<b>I9</b>	n° of ruminant and pig patients seen intra-murally / n° of students graduating annually	0,434	2,49	0,89	-0,456
<b>I10</b>	n° of equine patients seen intra-murally / n° of students graduating annually	4,717	4,16	1,53	3,187
<b>I11</b>	n° of rabbit, rodent, bird and exotic seen intra-murally / n° of students graduating annually	0,830	3,11	1,16	-0,330
<b>I12</b>	n° of companion animal patients seen extra-murally / n° of students graduating annually	2,302	5,06	0,43	1,872
<b>I13</b>	n° of individual ruminants and pig patients seen extra-murally / n° of students graduating annually	50,566	16,26	8,85	41,716
<b>I14</b>	n° of equine patients seen extra-murally / n° of students graduating annually	2,472	1,80	0,62	1,852
<b>I15</b>	n° of visits to ruminant and pig herds / n° of students graduating annually	4,566	1,29	0,54	4,026
<b>I16</b>	n° of visits of poultry and farmed rabbit units / n° of students graduating annually	1,019	0,11	0,04	0,974
<b>I17</b>	n° of companion animal necropsies / n° of students graduating annually	2,340	2,11	1,40	0,940
<b>I18</b>	n° of ruminant and pig necropsies / n° of students graduating annually	2,453	1,36	0,90	1,553
<b>I19</b>	n° of equine necropsies / n° of students graduating annually	0,226	0,18	0,10	0,126
<b>I20</b>	n° of rabbit, rodent, bird and exotic pet necropsies / n° of students graduating annually	2,849	2,65	0,88	1,969
<b>I21*</b>	n° of FTE specialised veterinarians involved in veterinary training / n° of students graduating annually	0,348	0,27	0,06	0,288
<b>I22*</b>	n° of PhD graduating annually / n° of students graduating annually	0,094	0,15	0,07	0,024
<sup>1</sup>	Median values defined by data from Establishments with Accreditation/Approval status in May 2019				
<sup>2</sup>	Recommended minimal values calculated as the 20th percentile of data from Establishments with Accreditation/Approval status in May 2019				
<sup>3</sup>	A negative balance indicates that the Indicator is below the recommended minimal value				
*	Indicators used only for statistical purpose				

**12. ESEVT Rubrics** (summary of the decision on the compliance of the VEE for each ESEVT Substandard, i.e. (total or substantial) compliance (C), partial compliance (PC) (Minor Deficiency) or non-compliance (NC) (Major Deficiency))

<b>Standard 1: Objectives, Organisation and QA Policy</b>	<b>C</b>	<b>PC</b>	<b>NC</b>
1.1 The VEE must have as its main objective the provision, in agreement with the EU Directives and ESG recommendations, of adequate, ethical, research-based, evidence-based veterinary training that enables the new graduate to perform as a veterinarian capable of entering all commonly recognised branches of the veterinary profession and to be aware of the importance of lifelong learning. The VEE must develop and follow its mission statement which must embrace all the ESEVT standards.	X		
1.2 The VEE must be part of a university or a higher education institution providing training recognised as being of an equivalent level and formally recognised as such in the respective country. The person responsible for the veterinary curriculum and the person(s) responsible for the professional, ethical, and academic affairs of the Veterinary Teaching Hospital (VTH) must hold a veterinary degree. The decision-making process of the VEE must allow implementation of its strategic plan and of a cohesive study programme, in compliance with the ESEVT standards.	X		
1.3 The VEE must have a strategic plan, which includes a SWOT analysis of its current activities, a list of objectives, and an operating plan with a timeframe and indicators for its implementation.	X		
1.4 The VEE must have a policy and associated written procedures for the assurance of the quality and standards of its programmes and awards. It must also commit itself explicitly to the development of a culture which recognises the importance of quality, and quality assurance, within their VEE. To achieve this, the VEE must develop and implement a strategy for the continuous enhancement of quality. The development and implementation of the VEE's strategy must include a role for students and other stakeholders, both internal and external, and the strategy must have a formal status and be publicly available.	X		
1.5 The VEE must provide evidence that it interacts with its stakeholders and the wider society. Such public information must be clear, objective and readily accessible; the information must include up-to-date information about the study programme, views and employment destinations of past students as well as the profile of the current student population. The VEE's website must mention the ESEVT VEE's status and its last Self Evaluation Report and Visitation Report must be easily available for the public.	X		
1.6 The VEE must monitor and periodically review its activities, both quantitative and qualitative, to ensure that they achieve the objectives set for them and respond to the needs of students and society. The VEE must make public how this analysis of information has been utilised in the further development of its activities and provide evidence as to the involvement of both students and staff in the provision, analysis and implementation of such data. Any action planned or taken as a result of this data analysis must be communicated to all those concerned.	X		
1.7 The VEE must undergo external review through the ESEVT on a cyclical basis. Evidence must be provided of such external evaluation with the assurance that the progress made since the last ESEVT evaluation was linked to a continuous quality assurance process.	X		
<b>Standard 2: Finances</b>			
2.1 Finances must be demonstrably adequate to sustain the requirements for the VEE to meet its mission and to achieve its objectives for education, research and services. The description must include both expenditures (separated into personnel costs, operating costs, maintenance costs and equipment) and revenues (separated into public funding, tuition fees, services, research grants and other sources).	X		
2.2 Clinical and field services must function as instructional resources. Instructional integrity of these resources must take priority over financial self-sufficiency of clinical services operations. The VEE must have sufficient autonomy in order to use the resources to implement its strategic plan and to meet the ESEVT Standards.	X		
2.3 Resources allocation must be regularly reviewed to ensure that available resources meet the requirements.	X		
<b>Standard 3: Curriculum</b>			
3.1 The curriculum must be designed, resourced and managed to ensure all graduates have achieved the graduate attributes expected to be fully compliant with the EU Directive 2005/36/EC (as amended by directive 2013/55/EU) and its Annex V.4.1. The curriculum must include the subjects (input) and must allow the acquisition of the Day One Competences (output) listed in Annex 2. This concerns Basic Sciences, Clinical Sciences in companion animals (including equine and exotic pets), Clinical Sciences in food-producing animals (including Animal Production and Herd Health Management), Food Safety and Quality, and Professional Knowledge.	X		
3.1.1. General findings			
3.1.2. Basic sciences		X	
3.1.3. Clinical Sciences in companion animals (including equine and exotic pets)	X		
3.1.4. Clinical Sciences in food-producing animals (including Animal Production and Herd Health Management)		X	
3.1.5. Food Safety and Quality	X		

**FINAL REPORT AS ISSUED BY ECOVE ON 29 SEPTEMBER 2021**

3.1.6. Professional Knowledge	X		
3.2 Each study programme provided by the VEE must be competency-based and designed so that it meets the objectives set for it, including the intended learning outcomes. The qualification resulting from a programme must be clearly specified and communicated and must refer to the correct level of the national qualifications framework for higher education and, consequently, to the Framework for Qualifications of the European Higher Education Area. The VEE must provide proof of a QA system that promotes and monitors the presence of an academic environment highly conducive to learning including self-learning. Details of the type, provision and updating of appropriate learning opportunities for the students must be clearly described, as well as the involvement of students. The VEE must also describe how it encourages and prepares students for self-learning and lifelong learning.	X		
3.3 Programme learning outcomes must: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>ensure the effective alignment of all content, teaching, learning and assessment activities of the degree programme to form a cohesive framework</li> <li>include a description of Day One Competences</li> <li>form the basis for explicit statements of the objectives and learning outcomes of individual units of study</li> <li>be communicated to staff and students</li> <li>be regularly reviewed, managed and updated to ensure they remain relevant, adequate and are effectively achieved.</li> </ul>	X		
3.4 The VEE must have a formally constituted committee structure (which includes effective student representation), with clear and empowered reporting lines, to oversee and manage the curriculum and its delivery. The committee(s) must: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>determine the pedagogical basis, design, delivery methods and assessment methods of the curriculum</li> <li>oversee QA of the curriculum, particularly gathering, evaluating, making change and responding to feedback from stakeholders, peer reviewers and external assessors, and data from examination/assessment outcomes</li> <li>perform ongoing and periodic review of the curriculum at least every seven years by involving staff, students and stakeholders; these reviews must lead to continuous improvement. Any action taken or planned as a result of such a review must be communicated to all those concerned</li> <li>identify and meet training needs for all types of staff, maintaining and enhancing their competence for the ongoing curriculum development.</li> </ul>	X		
3.5 External Practical Training (EPT) is compulsory training activities organised outside the VEE, the student being under the direct supervision of a non-academic person (e.g. a practitioner). EPT cannot replace the core intramural training nor the extramural training under the close supervision of academic staff (e.g. ambulatory clinics, herd health management, practical training in FSQ and VPH). Since the veterinary degree is a professional qualification with Day One Competences, EPT must complement and strengthen the academic education inter alia by enhancing student's professional knowledge.	X		
3.6 The EPT providers must have an agreement with the VEE and the student (in order to state their respective rights and duties, including insurance matters), provide a standardised evaluation of the performance of the student during their EPT and be allowed to provide feedback to the VEE on the EPT programme. There must be a member of the academic staff responsible for the overall supervision of the EPT, including liaison with EPT providers.		X	
3.7 Students must take responsibility for their own learning during EPT. This includes preparing properly before each placement, keeping a proper record of their experience during EPT by using a logbook provided by the VEE and evaluating the EPT. Students must be allowed to complain officially and/or anonymously about issues occurring during EPT. The VEE must have a system of QA to monitor the implementation, progress and then feedback within the EPT activities.		X	
<b>Standard 4: Facilities and equipment</b>			
4.1 All aspects of the physical facilities must provide an environment conducive to learning, including internet access. The veterinary VEE must have a clear strategy and programme for maintaining and upgrading its buildings and equipment. Facilities must comply with all relevant legislation including health, safety, biosecurity, accessibility to people with reduced mobility, and EU animal welfare and care standards.		X	
4.2 Lecture theatres, teaching laboratories, tutorial rooms, clinical facilities and other teaching spaces must be adequate in number, size and equipped for the instructional purposes and must be well maintained. The facilities must be adapted for the number of students enrolled. Students must have ready access to adequate and sufficient study, self-learning, recreation, locker, sanitary and food service facilities. Offices, teaching preparation and research laboratories must be sufficient for the needs of the academic and support staff.	X		
4.3 The livestock facilities, animal housing, core clinical teaching facilities and equipment used by the VEE for teaching purposes must: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>be sufficient in capacity and adapted for the number of students enrolled in order to allow safe hands-on training for all students</li> <li>be of a high standard, well maintained and fit for the purpose</li> <li>promote best husbandry, welfare and management practices</li> <li>ensure relevant biosecurity and bio-containment</li> <li>be designed to enhance learning.</li> </ul>	X		

## FINAL REPORT AS ISSUED BY ECOVE ON 29 SEPTEMBER 2021

<p>4.4 Core clinical teaching facilities must be provided in a veterinary teaching hospital (VTH) with 24/7 emergency services at least for companion animals and equines. Within the VTH, the VEE must unequivocally demonstrate that standard of education and clinical research are compliant with all ESEVT Standards, e.g. research-based and evidence-based clinical training supervised by academic staff trained to teach and to assess, availability for staff and students of facilities and patients for performing clinical research and relevant QA procedures.</p> <p>For ruminants, on-call service must be available if emergency services do not exist for those species in a VTH. The VEE must ensure state-of-the-art standards of teaching clinics which remain comparable with or exceeding the best available in the private sector.</p> <p>The VTH and any hospitals, practices and facilities (including EPT) which are involved with the curriculum must meet the relevant national Practice Standards.</p>			X
4.5 The VEE must ensure that students have access to a broad range of diagnostic and therapeutic facilities, including but not limited to: diagnostic imaging, anaesthesia, clinical pathology, intensive/critical care, surgeries and treatment facilities, ambulatory services, pharmacy and necropsy facilities.	X		
4.6 Appropriate isolation facilities must be provided to meet the need for the isolation and containment of animals with communicable diseases. Such isolation facilities must be properly constructed, ventilated, maintained and operated to provide for animal care and for prevention of spread of infectious agents. They must be adapted to all animal species commonly handled in the VTH.	X		
4.7 The VEE must have an ambulatory clinic for production animals or equivalent facilities so that students can practise field veterinary medicine and Herd Health Management under academic supervision.	X		
4.8 The transport of students, live animals, cadavers, materials from animal origin and other teaching materials must be done in agreement with national and EU standards, to ensure the safety of students and staff and to prevent the spread of infectious agents.	X		
4.9 Operational policies and procedures (including e.g. biosecurity, good laboratory practice and good clinical practice) must be taught and posted for students, staff and visitors and a Biosafety manual must be available. The VEE must demonstrate a clear commitment for the delivery of biosafety and biosecurity, e.g. by a specific committee structure. The VEE must have a system of QA to monitor and assure clinical, laboratory and farm services, including a regular monitoring of the feedback from students, staff and clients.		X	
<b>Standard 5: Animal resources and teaching material of animal origin</b>			
5.1 The number and variety of healthy and diseased animals, cadavers, and material of animal origin must be adequate for providing the practical and safe hands-on training (in the areas of Basic Sciences, Clinical Sciences, Pathology, Animal Production, Food Safety and Quality) and adapted to the number of students enrolled.	X		
Evidence must be provided that these data are regularly recorded and that procedures are in place for correcting any deficiencies.			
5.2 In addition to the training provided in the VEE, experience can include practical training at external sites, provided this training is organised under direct academic supervision and following the same standards as those applied in the VEE.	X		
5.3 The VTH must provide nursing care skills and instruction in nursing procedures. Under all situations students must be active participants in the clinical workup of patients, including problem-oriented diagnostic approach together with diagnostic decision-making.	X		
5.4 Medical records must be comprehensive and maintained in an effective retrieval system (preferably an electronic patient record system) to efficiently support the teaching, research, and service programmes of the VEE.	X		
<b>Standard 6: Learning resources</b>			
6.1 State-of-the-art learning resources must be adequate and available to support veterinary education, research, services and continuing education. When the study programme is provided in several tracks/languages, the learning resources must be available in all used languages. Timely access to learning resources, whether through print, electronic media or other means, must be available to students and staff and, when appropriate, to stakeholders. State-of-the-art procedures for bibliographical search and for access to databases and learning resources must be taught to undergraduate students.	X		
6.2 Staff and students must have full access on site to an academic library administered by a qualified librarian, an Information Technology (IT) unit managed by an IT expert, an e-learning platform, and all the relevant human and physical resources necessary for the development of instructional materials by the staff and their use by the students.	X		
The relevant electronic information, database and other intranet resources must be easily available for students and staff both in the VEE's core facilities via wireless connection (Wi-Fi) and from outside the VEE through a hosted secured connection, e.g. Virtual Private Network (VPN).			
6.3 The VEE must provide students with unimpeded access to learning resources, internet and internal study resources, and equipment for the development of procedural skills (e.g. models). The use of these resources must be aligned with the pedagogical environment and learning outcomes within the programme and have mechanisms in place to evaluate the teaching value of changes in learning resources.		X	
<b>Standard 7: Student admission, progression and welfare</b>			
7.1 The VEE must consistently apply pre-defined and published regulations covering all phases of the student "life cycle", e.g. student admission, progression and certification.	X		
In relation to enrolment, the VEE must provide accurate and complete information regarding all aspects of the educational programme in all advertisements for prospective national and international students.			
Formal cooperations with other VEEs must also be clearly advertised.			
7.2 The number of students admitted must be consistent with the resources available at the VEE for staff, buildings, equipment, healthy and diseased animals, and materials of animal origin.	X		

## FINAL REPORT AS ISSUED BY ECOVE ON 29 SEPTEMBER 2021

7.3 The selection and progression criteria must be clearly defined, consistent, and defensible, be free of discrimination or bias, and take into account the fact that students are admitted with a view to their entry to the veterinary profession in due course. The VEE must regularly review and reflect on the selection processes to ensure they are appropriate for students to complete the programme successfully. If the selection processes are decided by another authority, the latter must regularly receive feedback from the VEE. Adequate training (including periodic refresher training) must be provided for those involved in the selection process to ensure applicants are evaluated fairly and consistently.	X		
7.4 There must be clear policies and procedures on how applicants with disabilities or illnesses are considered and, if appropriate, accommodated in the programme, taking into account the requirement that all students must be capable of meeting the ESEVT Day One Competences by the time they graduate.	X		
7.5 The basis for decisions on progression (including academic progression and professional fitness to practise) must be explicit and readily available to the students. The VEE must provide evidence that it has mechanisms in place to identify and provide remediation and appropriate support (including termination) for students who are not performing adequately. The VEE must have mechanisms in place to monitor attrition and progression and be able to respond and amend admission selection criteria (if permitted by national or university law) and student support if required.	X		
7.6 Mechanisms for the exclusion of students from the programme for any reason must be explicit. The VEE's policies for managing appeals against decisions, including admissions, academic and progression decisions and exclusion, must be transparent and publicly available.	X		
7.7 Provisions must be made by the VEE to support the physical, emotional and welfare needs of students. This includes, but is not limited to, learning support and counselling services, career advice, and fair and transparent mechanisms for dealing with student illness, impairment and disability during the programme. This shall include provision of reasonable adjustments for disabled students, consistent with all relevant equality and/or human rights legislation. There must be effective mechanisms for resolution of student grievances (e.g. interpersonal conflict or harassment).	X		
7.8 Mechanisms must be in place by which students can convey their needs and wants to the VEE. The VEE must provide students with a mechanism, anonymously if they wish, to offer suggestions, comments and complaints regarding compliance of the VEE with national and international legislation and the ESEVT standards.	X		
<b>Standard 8: Student assessment</b>			
8.1 The VEE must ensure that there is a clearly identified structure within the VEE showing lines of responsibility for the assessment strategy to ensure coherence of the overall assessment regime and to allow the demonstration of progressive development across the programme towards entry-level competence.	X		
8.2 The assessment tasks and grading criteria for each unit of study in the programme must be published, applied consistently, clearly identified and available to students in a timely manner well in advance of the assessment. Requirements to pass must be explicit. The VEE must properly document the results of assessment and provide the students with timely feedback on their assessments. Mechanisms for students to appeal against assessment outcomes must be explicit.	X		
8.3 The VEE must have a process in place to review assessment outcomes, to change assessment strategies and to ensure the accuracy of the procedures when required. Programme learning outcomes covering the full range of professional knowledge, skills, competences and attributes must form the basis for assessment design and underpin decisions on progression.	X		
8.4 Assessment strategies must allow the VEE to certify student achievement of learning objectives at the level of the programme and individual units of study. The VEE must ensure that the programmes are delivered in a way that encourages students to take an active role in creating the learning process, and that the assessment of students reflects this approach.	X		
8.5 Methods of formative and summative assessment must be valid and reliable and comprise a variety of approaches. Direct assessment of clinical skills and Day One Competences (some of which may be on simulated patients), must form a significant component of the overall process of assessment. It must also include the quality control of the student logbooks in order to ensure that all clinical procedures, practical and hands-on training planned in the study programme have been fully completed by each individual student.	X		
<b>Standard 9: Academic and support staff</b>			
9.1 The VEE must ensure that all staff are appropriately qualified and prepared for their roles, in agreement with national and EU regulations and must apply fair and transparent processes for the recruitment and development of staff. A formal training (including good teaching and evaluation practices, learning and e-learning resources, biosecurity and QA procedures) must be in place for all staff involved with teaching. Most academic staff (calculated as FTE) involved in veterinary training must be veterinarians. It is expected that more than 2/3 of the instruction that the students receive, as determined by student teaching hours, is delivered by qualified veterinarians.	X		
9.2 The total number, qualifications and skills of all staff involved with the programme, including teaching staff, 'adjunct' staff, technical, administrative and support staff, must be sufficient and appropriate to deliver the educational programme and fulfil the VEE's mission. A procedure must be in place to assess if they display competence and effective teaching skills in all relevant aspects of the curriculum that they teach, regardless of whether they are full or part time, residents, interns or other postgraduate students, adjuncts or off-campus contracted teachers.		X	

**FINAL REPORT AS ISSUED BY ECOVE ON 29 SEPTEMBER 2021**

<p><b>9.3 Staff must be given opportunities to develop and extend their teaching and assessment knowledge and must be encouraged to improve their skills. Opportunities for didactic and pedagogic training and specialisation must be available. The VEE must clearly define systems of reward for teaching excellence in operation. Academic positions must offer the security and benefits necessary to maintain stability, continuity, and competence of the academic staff. Academic staff must have a balanced workload of teaching, research and service depending on their role. They must have reasonable opportunities and resources for participation in scholarly activities.</b></p>	X		
<p><b>9.4 The VEE must provide evidence that it utilises a well-defined, comprehensive and publicised programme for the professional growth and development of academic and support staff, including formal appraisal and informal mentoring procedures. Staff must have the opportunity to contribute to the VEE's direction and decision-making processes. Promotion criteria for academic and support staff must be clear and explicit. Promotions for teaching staff must recognise excellence in, and (if permitted by the national or university law) place equal emphasis on all aspects of teaching (including clinical teaching), research, service and other scholarly activities.</b></p>	X		
<p><b>9.5 A system for assessment of teaching staff must be in operation and must include student participation. Results must be available to those undertaking external reviews and commented upon in reports.</b></p>	X		
<b>Standard 10: Research programmes, continuing and postgraduate education</b>			
<p><b>10.1 The VEE must demonstrate significant and broad research activities of staff that integrate with and strengthen the veterinary degree programme through research-based teaching.</b></p>	X		
<p><b>10.2 All students must be trained in scientific method and research techniques relevant to evidence-based veterinary medicine and must have opportunities to participate in research programmes.</b></p>	X		
<p><b>10.3 The VEE must provide advanced postgraduate degree programmes, e.g. PhD, internships, residencies and continuing education programmes that complement and strengthen the veterinary degree programme and are relevant to the needs of the profession and society.</b></p>		X	
<p><b>10.4 The VEE must have a system of QA to evaluate how research activities provide opportunities for student training and staff promotion, and how research approaches, methods and results are integrated into the veterinary teaching programmes.</b></p>	X		
<p><i>C: (total or substantial) compliance; PC: partial compliance (Minor Deficiency); NC: non-compliance (Major Deficiency)</i></p>			

## **Executive Summary**

Although veterinary teaching started in Camerino in 1824, the VEE became the Faculty of Veterinary Medicine of the University of Camerino (UNICAM) in 1933 and moved to Matelica in 1989. In 2013, it merged with the School of Biosciences and Biotechnologies of the UNICAM to establish the School of Biosciences and Veterinary Medicine (called the VEE in this report).

The VEE was visited by EAEVE in 2000 for the first time and was not approved. Another Visitation was held in 2011, after which it was fully approved.

The SER was provided on time and written in agreement with the SOP 2019. Replies to the pre-Visitation questions from the experts were provided before the start of the Visitation. In agreement with the “Exceptional Rules for ESEVT Visitations linked to the COVID-19 outbreak”, an SER Addendum was also provided on time for explaining how the COVID-19 outbreak has affected the VEE and what actions have been taken to alleviate the impact of the lockdown.

Because of the restrictions to travel linked to the COVID-19 outbreak, three experts had to complete a remote Visitation, as agreed by ECOVE. Webinars were organised permanently between the onsite and remote members, who were allowed to see the intramural facilities via an excellent video and audio system and to discuss in depth with the relevant local colleagues.

Despite this difficult context, the Visitation was well organised and was in agreement with the ‘Exceptional Rules for ESEVT Visitations linked to the COVID-19 outbreak’ and with the ‘Minimum requirements concerning health and safety measures to protect ESEVT Experts’ health and to prevent the spread of COVID-19’, as adopted by ExCom in June 2020. The Liaison Officer did a great job to adapt the schedule of the Visitation, to search for the requested information, to organise the relevant meetings and e-meetings, and to ensure the health and safety of the Visitors. A translator was present during the visits and meetings but it was considered as useless and even inappropriate.

### **Areas worthy of praise (i.e. Commendations), e.g.:**

- ) excellent student-centered approach;
- ) commitment of staff to teaching activities;
- ) multi-level tutorial support;
- ) efficient support for people with disabilities;
- ) effective collaboration with local stakeholders, e.g. Matelica city, Marche Region, farms, practitioners, veterinary public services;
- ) efficient adaptability to cases of force majeure (earthquake, pandemic);
- ) well-adapted group size;
- ) well-structured training in FSQ;
- ) well-developed training in agrifood economics and law;
- ) excellent physiotherapy unit;
- ) well-equipped and well-functioning chemistry laboratory in San Sollecito;
- ) extended facilities for wild animal clinical services.

Additional commendations are described in the Visitation Report.

**Areas of concern (i.e. Minor Deficiencies):**

- ) partial compliance with Substandard 3.1.2 because of suboptimal practical training in physiology and pharmacology;
- ) partial compliance with Substandard 3.1.4 because of suboptimal clinical training in food-producing animals and integration of herd health management teaching;
- ) partial compliance with Substandard 3.6 and 3.7 because of suboptimal EPT organisation;
- ) partial compliance with Substandard 4.1 because of no formal recording of the use of teaching animals;
- ) partial compliance with Substandard 4.9 because of suboptimal use of personal protective equipment for necropsy and some farm work;
- ) partial compliance with Substandard 6.3 because of suboptimal skill lab;
- ) partial compliance with Substandard 9.2 because of suboptimal academic staffing in food-producing animals teaching and support staffing in nursing care;
- ) partial compliance with Substandard 10.3 because of suboptimal numbers of students involved in postgraduate programmes.

**Items of non-compliance with the ESEVT Standards (i.e. Major Deficiencies):**

- ) non-compliance with Substandard 4.4 because of absence of emergency services for ruminants in the VTH, which is not compensated by an alternative on-call service.

Additional suggestions for improvement are described in the Visitation Report.

## **Glossary**

ANVUR: Italian National Agency for the Evaluation of the University and Research Systems

CYCC: Course Year Coordination Committee

DCVM: Degree Course in Veterinary Medicine

DCVMRRC: Degree Course in Veterinary Medicine Review Reporting Committee

D1C: Day One Competences

EAEVE: European Association of Establishments for Veterinary Education

EBVS: European Board of Veterinary Specialisation

ECOVE: European Committee on Veterinary Education

EPT: External Practical Training

ESEVT: European System of Evaluation of Veterinary Training

ESG: Standards and Guidelines for Quality Assurance in the European Higher Education Area

FSQ: Food Safety and Quality

FTE: Full-Time Equivalent

IT: Information Technology

MUR: Ministry of University and Research

PDCA: Plan Do Check Act

QA: Quality Assurance

SBVM: School of Biosciences and Veterinary Medicine

SER: Self Evaluation Report

SLD: Specific Learning Disability

SOP: Standard Operating Procedure

TSJC: Teacher/Student Joint Committee

UNICAM: University of Camerino

VEE: Veterinary Education Establishment

VPH: Veterinary Public Health

VTH: Veterinary Teaching Hospital

## **Decision of ECOVE**

The Committee concluded that the following Major Deficiency had been identified:

- Non-compliance with Substandard 4.4 because of absence of emergency services for ruminants in the VTH, which is not compensated by an alternative on-call service.

The Veterinary Education Establishment (VEE) of the University of Camerino is therefore classified as holding the status of: **CONDITIONAL ACCREDITATION**.