



VISITATION REPORT

To the Faculty of Veterinary Medicine, Adnan Menderes University, Aydin, Turkey

On 11 – 15 October 2021

By the Visitation Team:

László Fodor (Chairperson), Budapest, Hungary: Visitor in Basic Sciences

Niksa Lemo, Zagreb, Croatia: Visitor in Clinical Sciences - Companion Animals

Mark Crowe, Dublin, Ireland: Visitor in Clinical Sciences - Food-Producing Animals

Nicolas Korsak, Liège, Belgium: Visitor in Food Safety and Quality

Attilio Corradi, Parma, Italy: Visitor in Quality Assurance

Hervé Hiard, Dol de Bretagne, France: Practitioner

Maria-Mihaela Ifrose, Bucharest, Romania: Student member

Marina Spinu, Cluj-Napoca, Romania: ESEVT Coordinator

Introduction

Aydın Adnan Menderes University (ADÜ) Faculty of Veterinary Medicine (FVMADU) (referred to as Veterinary Education Establishment (VEE) in this Report) was established in 1987 as an affiliate of Dokuz Eylül University; in 1992 it moved to Adnan Menderes University, but the academic training was performed at the Ankara University between 1993 and 1995. The academic year of 1995-1996 represented the start for teaching activities at FVMADU, a teaching hospital being established in 1999 and all the units being moved to Aydın. Between 2009-2013 the VEE was the only Faculty of ADÜ to have TS EN ISO 9001 Quality Management System Certificate obtained from TSE.

FVMADU holds the accreditation by National Association for Evaluation and Accreditation of Veterinary Education Institutions and Programs (VEDEK) for seven years since December 2016. The last full Visitation FVMADU took place in October 2011 and the ECOVE decision granted the VEE with the "Approved" status in May 2016, with the end of the granted period in October 2021.

FVMADU is located in the Aegean region, where agriculture is well-developed mainly including vegetal farming a mix of fig especially, but also olive and citrus trees. Animal farming mainly includes cattle, sheep and goats. Further, poultry and fish production, along with honeybees are also well represented.

The undergraduate educational programme of Veterinary Medicine at the FVMADU is provided during a five-year training, while postgraduate education is carried out by the staff affiliated with the Institute of Health Sciences. The FVMADU covers a surface of 170.000 m² of open and 19.097 m² of closed areas, organised in 11 blocks, hosting 17 departments, over 1000 students, 106 academic staff and 49 administrative staff personnel.

Since the previous ESEVT Visitation, changes at FVMADU included the curriculum, organisation, infrastructure and management. The adjustments included the procedures and processes through the Strategic Plan (2021-2023), inclusion of Day One Competences (DOC) in the curriculum, diversifying the postgraduate programme, implementing the distance learning portal ADÜZEM and opening of a Clinical Skills Laboratory, which subsequently increased the range of services delivered to students and the society. The VEE is compliant with national regulations, confirmed by VEDEK accreditation in 2016. The infrastructure was improved by renovating the necropsy hall, partial renovation of the VTH and opening the Conference hall and a new cafeteria.

The VEE implemented measures to overcome the difficulties caused by the COVID-19 pandemic, described in detail in each Standard. During the COVID-19 pandemic period, distance learning course-exam activities and electronic resource sharing are carried out through the software supported by ADÜZEM.

The *2019 SOP as amended in December 2020* is valid for the visitation of FVMADU, Turkey.

Standard 1: Objectives, Organisation and QA Policy

1.1 The VEE must have as its main objective the provision, in agreement with the EU Directives and ESG recommendations, of adequate, ethical, research-based, evidence-based veterinary training that enables the new graduate to perform as a veterinarian capable of entering all commonly recognised branches of the veterinary profession and to be aware of the importance of lifelong learning.

The VEE must develop and follow its mission statement which must embrace all the ESEVT Standards.

1.1.1. Findings

FVMADU aims at being recognized for its high-quality academic activity at national and international levels, for the ability of its trainees to keep up with international developments within the field of veterinary medicine and affiliated research.

FVMADU made clear its mission and vision within the Strategic Plan, designed as requested by the Government for the period 2021-2023, in agreement with EU Directives 36/2005 and 55/2013. The mission of the VEE consists of educating its students based on ethical values, social and professional awareness to be rational, able to identify and solve veterinary problems, productive and creative, in an environment sensitive manner, aligned to worldwide progress in research and of providing high quality and reliable service to the society.

FVMADU is currently a member of the European Association of Establishments for Veterinary Education (EAEVE) and the previous full Visitation took place in May 2016. FVMADU met EAEVE quality criteria and was granted the status of 'Approval' by the European Committee on Veterinary Education (ECOVE) for five years in May 2016.

1.1.2. Comments

The VEE was the only Faculty of ADÜ to have TS EN ISO 9001 Quality Management System Certificate obtained from TSE between 2009-2013. FVMADU has also the accreditation approval by National Association for Evaluation and Accreditation of Veterinary Education Institutions and Programs (VEDEK) for seven years in December 2016, meeting the national requirements for the veterinary professionals' training.

1.1.3. Suggestions for improvement

The improved description of educational activities and detailed research and professional services would further heighten the educational progress of the VEE.

1.1.4. Decision

The VEE is compliant with Substandard 1.1.

1.2 The VEE must be part of a university or a higher education institution providing training recognised as being of an equivalent level and formally recognised as such in the respective country.

The person responsible for the veterinary curriculum and the person(s) responsible for the professional, ethical, and academic affairs of the Veterinary Teaching Hospital (VTH) must hold a veterinary degree.

The decision-making process of the VEE must allow implementation of its strategic plan and of a cohesive study programme, in compliance with the ESEVT Standards.

1.2.1. Findings

The VEE is a Faculty of ADÜ affiliated to the Higher Education Council (YÖK). The Dean, vice Deans, Heads of VEE Units and Departments, Hospital Director, the Director of the Unit of experimental animals, Heads of boards and Commissions of the VEE are doctors in veterinary medicine (DVM). The Dean is responsible for the rational use and development of the VEE's teaching capacity. He/she takes security measures when necessary; facilitates necessary social services to students; conducts education, scientific research and editing activities in a regular manner; supervises, audits, monitors and controls all activities as well as the output results, along with the various Boards or Committees. The Dean appoints at most two from among the Faculty members as vice Deans to assist her/him in her/his duty. The VEE has 20 governing bodies as follows: 5 Boards and 15 Commissions. The VEE is arranged in 5 Departments (Basic Sciences, Preclinical Sciences, Clinical Sciences, Animal Science and Animal Nutrition, Food Hygiene and Technology).

1.2.2. Comments

None.

1.2.3. Suggestions for improvement

The further inclusion of students' representatives as well as of stakeholders in the VEE's Commissions, would foster the education strategy related to professional activities.

1.2.4. Decision

The VEE is compliant with Substandard 1.2.

1.3 The VEE must have a strategic plan, which includes a SWOT analysis of its current activities, a list of objectives, and an operating plan with a timeframe and indicators for its implementation.

1.3.1. Findings

The VEE has a Strategic Plan covering the short period of 2021-2023, due to governmental request. Its preparation was completed at the end of 2020. The draft copy was then uploaded on the VEE's website and stakeholders were invited for its critical evaluation. The amended copy was refined and the final version was approved by the VEE's Administrative Board. Objectives, goals and performance indicators of the Strategic Plan 2021-2023 and SWOT analysis were clearly stated.

1.3.2. Comments

None.

1.3.3. Suggestions for improvement

None.

1.3.4. Decision

The VEE is compliant with Substandard 1.3.

1.4 The VEE must have a policy and associated written procedures for the assurance of the quality and standards of its programmes and awards. It must also commit itself explicitly to the development of a culture which recognises the importance of quality, and quality assurance, within their VEE. To achieve this, the VEE must develop and

implement a strategy for the continuous enhancement of quality. The development and implementation of the VEE's strategy must include a role for students and other stakeholders, both internal and external, and the strategy must have a formal status and be publicly available.

1.4.1. Findings

The VEE has been carrying out various studies prioritizing the quality assurance system since the beginning of the Bologna Process. For three years, between 2009 and 2013, the VEE was the only Faculty of the ADU, to have the TS EN ISO 9001 Quality Management System Certificate. The Quality Commission was re-established at FVMADU in 2018 and started its active work in 2019 due to the changes implemented in the VEE's management. The definition, inputs, resources, outputs, performance criteria, responsibilities, team, beginning, purpose, scope, targets of these processes were detailed in the process information. In order to carry out these processes, the functioning of the units working at the VEE organizational level has been documented with procedures, annual work plans, job descriptions, instructions, work flow charts and forms used.

1.4.2. Comments

A rather thorough description of all phases of the QA management process was beneficial to the educational development of the FVMADU and enhanced the identification of eventual critical points to be managed.

1.4.3. Suggestions for improvement

A more user-friendly access of the Quality Assurance Manual on the VEE's website would further increase the QA management at VEE level.

1.4.4. Decision

The VEE is compliant with Substandard 1.4.

1.5 The VEE must provide evidence that it interacts with its stakeholders and the wider society. Such public information must be clear, objective and readily accessible; the information must include up-to-date information about the study programme, views and employment destinations of past students as well as the profile of the current student population. The VEE's website must mention the ESEVT VEE's status and its last Self Evaluation Report and Visitation Report must be easily available for the public.

1.5.1. Findings

The VEE and its Veterinary Teaching Hospital (VTH) openly share information on the VEE's website about the institutional management and clinical activities. In addition, the VEE and the VTH communicate in social networking using social media accounts such as Facebook, YouTube, Instagram and Twitter. The list of the Stakeholders is available within the Strategic Plan 2021-2023. The nineteen Input and six Output indicators are clearly identified. A Postgraduates' "Alumni platform" has been provided. An Alumni Satisfaction Questionnaire and the Competency/First Day Qualifications Questionnaire are completed, and the evaluation process continued. Lifelong learning training events are organized.

1.5.2. Comments

The "Alumni platform" on the VEE's website is available only in the Turkish language.

1.5.3. Suggestions for improvement

The international visibility of the VEE could be increased by establishing the English version of the “Alumni platform” on its website.

1.5.4. Decision

The VEE is compliant with Substandard 1.5.

1.6 The VEE must monitor and periodically review its activities, both quantitative and qualitative, to ensure that they achieve the objectives set for them and respond to the needs of students and society. The VEE must make public how this analysis of information has been utilised in the further development of its activities and provide evidence as to the involvement of both students and staff in the provision, analysis and implementation of such data. Any action planned or taken as a result of this data analysis must be communicated to all those concerned.

1.6.1. Findings

The VEE’s facilities are monitored, and the related advertising is available on the VEE’s website. The achievement of the objectives of the Strategic Plan is periodically monitored by Quality Board meetings, based on Quality Assurance (QA) of specific performance indicators. At the end of each academic semester, students fill in the "Academic Staff and Course Evaluation" and "Course Learning Outcomes Evaluation" on OBIS (Student Information Portal), an anonymous questionnaire. In line with the recommendation of the Quality Commission, "Academic Staff and Course Evaluation Questionnaires" and "Course Learning Outcomes Evaluation Questionnaires" were evaluated by the VEE’s Department Commissions and presented to the Dean in a final report. Educational feedbacks are also evaluated by the VEE’s bodies or by its Commissions, and the results and improvement are shared with the students in the first course of the new semester. Reports are submitted to the units of the Rector’s Office regarding the activities of the VEE. The reports are evaluated yearly for: Internal evaluation, Rubric evaluation, Academic performance evaluation, Annual Activity Report.

1.6.2. Comments

The feedback evaluation – currently applied for Anatomy, Biochemistry, Pharmacology, Animal Science, Internal Medicine – must be considered as best practice.

1.6.3. Suggestions for improvement

The VEE could benefit from improving feedback evaluation – currently applied for Anatomy, Biochemistry, Pharmacology, Animal Science, Internal Medicine – to the maximum possible number of compulsory courses active in the degree course.

1.6.4. Decision

The VEE is compliant with Substandard 1.6.

1.7 The VEE must undergo external review through the ESEVT on a cyclical basis. Evidence must be provided of such external evaluation with the assurance that the progress made since the last ESEVT evaluation was linked to a continuous quality assurance process.

1.7.1. Findings

The VEE is a member of EAEVE, as well as of VEDEK, the Turkish national accreditation body. The VEE is cyclically visited on site by aforementioned national and international accreditation bodies. Currently the VEE is EAEVE “Approved” until the end of October 2021 and VEDEK accredited. The VEE has in place a fully operational QA system, which is efficient and continuously updated on the basis of the data collected by the VEE’s Commission appointed to monitor the educational processes.

1.7.2. Comments

None.

1.7.3. Suggestions for improvement

None.

1.7.4. Decision

The VEE is compliant with Substandard 1.7.

Standard 2: Finances

2.1 Finances must be demonstrably adequate to sustain the requirements for the VEE to meet its mission and to achieve its objectives for education, research and services. The description must include both expenditures (separated into personnel costs, operating costs, maintenance costs and equipment) and revenues (separated into public funding, tuition fees, services, research grants and other sources).

2.1.1. Findings

The SER of the VEE gives a representation of the figures for the last three years.

It is difficult to clearly state if there are 3 last and complete academic years, given that the VEE states the figures for the year 2021.

The personnel costs represent an important percentage of the total expenditure, comprised between 68 and 86% of the total amount of expenditures. The operating costs represent a percentage comprised between 8.7 and 24.9% of total expenditure. There is also a budget for the equipment. This expenditure arises at a percentage of 1.2 to 2.5%, depending on the academic year. There is no tuition fee for Turkish students, except when they exceed 5 academic years before graduation, and even then it is 44 Euro/exceeding year.

Following the SER, the VEE receives a certain amount of money from the Turkish Ministry of Treasury and Finance, after negotiation occurring in November of each academic year. The VEE does not pay taxes for its revenues; however, 1% of the revenue goes to the state budget, while 5% of the services’ revenue is transferred to the University for funding of future research projects. The VEE does not have to support all the costs inherent to utilities, salaries and social insurance, since these costs are covered by the rectorate of the University, which represents a significant advantage.

2.1.2. Comments

The budget of the VEE is allocated after the academic year has started. The information presented in the SER did not allow a clear interpretation of the starting and ending of the academic year. A more transparent evaluation of the budget and its use at VEE level would have been possible by focusing on the last three full academic years (2017-2018, 2018-2019 and 2019-2020), in accordance with the ESEVT SOP 2019 as amended in December 2020.

The institution does not have a budget designed previously, which does not allow it to have a long-term view for new investments and the purchase of equipment for teaching or research; similarly, it does not have complete control over the budget and personnel costs have seen a marked decrease in 2021.

The annual revenues conferred by public authorities have decreased significantly from year to year. The institution has no control over the number of students who will be enrolled, which could constitute a threat in the longer or shorter term. Data of 2021 in Tables 2.1.1 and 2.1.2 of the SER only covers the budget for the first half of the year, according to the VEE. The revenues and the expenditure decreased in Euro, the devaluation of the Turkish lira was 33.52% in the recent two years. The government takes various measures to cover the devaluation of the Turkish lira, the budget of the VEE in Turkish lira was increased but the real value of it was decreasing.

2.1.3. Suggestions for improvement

The availability of a budget over the following 5 years, rather negotiation of it each beginning of each academic year could enhance the planning of future activities and also investments by the VEE. A more appropriate distribution of the budget could be achieved by the VEE having more control over the number of students it receives.

2.1.4 Decision

The VEE is partially compliant with Substandard 2.1 because of sub-optimal financing of activities of the VEE.

2.2 Clinical and field services must function as instructional resources. Instructional integrity of these resources must take priority over financial self-sufficiency of clinical services operations.

The VEE must have sufficient autonomy in order to use the resources to implement its strategic plan and to meet the ESEVT Standards.

2.2.1. Findings

Within the University policy, as described in the SER, FVMADU has the autonomy over the use of the income generated by its own services and its own research activities. This makes it possible to have an investment policy in terms of equipment for the VEE.

The VEE considers that the hospital and the farm should be given priority in terms of financial support. Therefore, the income generated by services and research are re-invested at the level of these 2 structures.

2.2.2. Comments

The VTH and the FVMADU farm provide the educational environment to the students. The VEE is aware of their importance and the need for their continuous improvement. The importance of further development of these two objectives was stressed during the Visitation.

2.2.3. Suggestions for improvement

The FVMADU could further enhance the improvement of the VTH and its farm, by continuously relying on the financial balance sheets at the level of these two objectives in designing their future financial plans.

2.2.4 Decision

The VEE is compliant with Substandard 2.2.

2.3 Resources allocation must be regularly reviewed to ensure that available resources meet the requirements.

2.3.1. Findings

The management mentioned that it meets once a year to review expenses and investments to be made in future years. A series of useful investments have been made in the institution, notably with a “skills lab”, which is a very important structure for the training of students.

2.3.2. Comments

None.

2.3.3. Suggestions for improvement

It would be beneficial for the institution to have a more or less long-term vision of the investments and expenditures to be made. A 5-year perspective would be helpful in this regard.

2.3.4 Decision

The VEE is compliant with Substandard 2.3.

Standard 3. Curriculum

3.1 The curriculum must be designed, resourced and managed to ensure all graduates have achieved the graduate attributes expected to be fully compliant with the EU Directive 2005/36/EC (as amended by directive 2013/55/EU) and its Annex V.4.1. The curriculum must include the subjects (input) and must allow the acquisition of the Day One Competences (output) listed in Annex 2. This concerns Basic Sciences, Clinical Sciences in companion animals (including equine and exotic pets), Clinical Sciences in food-producing animals (including Animal Production and Herd Health Management), Food Safety and Quality, and Professional Knowledge.

3.1.1. General findings

3.1.1.1. Findings

The curriculum follows the principles laid down in Directives 2005/36/EC and 2013/55/EU and the List of subjects and Day One Competences approved by the European Coordination Committee on Veterinary Training (ECCVT). The veterinary training in Turkey is outlined by the “National Veterinary Core Education Program (VUCEP)”, approved by the Higher Education Council (YÖK). The curricula of the faculties have at least 70% similarity. The curriculum contains all subjects mentioned in the ESEVT SOP and it includes some additional subjects (e.g. Honeybee diseases and pests, Occupational health and safety, Diseases of fisheries, Foot disease and horseshoe technique). The training takes 10 semesters, each one is 15 weeks long, it is not divided into Bachelor and Master phase, however students after completing semesters 1st - 4th receive Associate Degree in Health Sciences and can work as veterinary technicians. There is no tracking system. There are no lectures in the final semester, it consists of only compulsory practicals (Clinical Practice, Food Hygiene and Technology, Emergency Clinical Training) and elective practicals (Farm Management, Clinical Laboratory Diagnosis, Basic Science Practice). Students must collect 300 ECTS credits during their study, 224 credits from compulsory, 62 credits from elective subjects, and non-professional subjects (Atatürk’s principles, history, languages) result in 14 credits. The departments of the VEE reviewed and adapted the courses in order to eliminate deficiencies in connection with Day One

Competences this year. Students are not required to write a graduation thesis. Tables 3.1.1 and 3.1.2 were provided shortly before the Visitation.

3.1.1.2. Comments

Inclusion of the subjects Honeybee diseases and pests, Occupational health and safety, Diseases of fisheries and Foot disease and horseshoe techniques among the compulsory subjects widens the horizon of the graduates.

3.1.1.3. Suggestions for improvement

None.

3.1.1.4. Decision

The VEE is compliant with Substandard 3.1.1.

3.1.2. Basic Sciences

3.1.2.1. Findings

All basic subjects and basic sciences mentioned in the ESEVT SOP are in the curriculum of the VEE. They are taught in lectures and practicals, their amount is sufficient and the proportion between the subjects is correct. The knowledge of the admitted students on basic subjects is high, no catch-up courses are necessary. Students have to learn 60 hours of English and 30 hours of Foreign Language for the Profession, but their English proficiency is limited.

3.1.2.2. Comments

None.

3.1.2.3. Suggestions for improvement

Students could be motivated to improve their English proficiency.

3.1.2.4. Decision

The VEE is compliant with Substandard 3.1.2.

3.1.3. Clinical Sciences in companion animals (including equine and exotic pets)

3.1.3.1. Findings

Clinical science education is part of the following subjects:

5th semester – core classes; Introduction to Internal Diseases, Anaesthesiology and Reanimation, Introduction to Surgery, Helminthology, General Pathology, Clinical training I
6th semester: General Therapy, Radiology, General surgery, Protozoology, Virology, Clinical training, Summer Term Clinical Training II - Conducted by Surgery and Internal Medicine Departments and 4 summer weeks (4x40=160 hours)

7th semester – Special Surgery I, General Obstetrics I, Special Pathology II, Clinical training III
8th semester; Special Surgery II, Eye Diseases, General Obstetrics II, Small animal internal diseases, Clinical training IV

9th semester – Equine Internal Medicine, Gynaecology, Clinical Training V, Emergency clinical training

10th semester – Clinical practice (20h practical per week), Emergency Clinical training II

In the third year (5th and 6th semesters) students finish the pre-clinical subjects. In the fourth year (semesters 7 and 8), after getting the basics of diagnosis and treatment, students start an intensive applied education in addition to theoretical training in clinical sciences. In the 9th semester students receive an intensive applied education together with the courses that require more expertise in clinical branches together with emergency clinical services.

In the last semester -10th, students are fully directed to applied education.

In total, hours in clinical science are divided as 630 h of lectures, 30 h of laboratory and desk-based work and 987 h of clinical animal work, per student.

There are no Theoretical and Practical Elective Courses for clinical science in companion animals.

3.1.3.2. Comments

In Clinical Sciences, all relevant subjects are presented and regularly distributed. The curriculum includes the subjects listed in Annex V of EU Directive 2005/36/EC.

3.1.3.3. Suggestions for improvement

It would be useful to avoid the overlap between Practical training (987 h) with the high number of hours for lectures (630 h) during 5th to 9th semester, which would allow the students improved opportunities to follow the cases during daily clinical work at the VTH (daily clinical working hours).

3.1.3.4 Decision

The VEE is compliant with Substandard 3.1.3.

3.1.4. Clinical Sciences in food-producing animals (including Animal Production and Herd Health Management)

3.1.4.1. Findings

Courses are listed in genetics (Vet 110), Animal Behaviours and Welfare (Vet 211), Feed knowledge and hygiene (Vet 213), Animal Housing and Hygiene (Vet 215), Animal Science I (Vet 210), Animal Nutrition and Nutritional diseases (Vet 214), Animal Science II (Vet 315), Animal Health and Economics Management (Vet 319), Clinical Training 1 (Vet 317), Clinical Training II (Vet 320), Summer Term Clinical training (Vet 330), Internal Diseases of Ruminants (Vet 403), General Obstetrics (Vet 405), Animal Breeding (Vet 413), Clinical Training III (Vet 517), General Obstetrics II (Vet 406), Dairy Science and Technology (Vet 410), Clinical Training IV (Vet 418), Reproduction and Reproductive Biotechnology (Vet 511), Gynecology (Vet 515), Clinical Training V (Vet 521), Clinical Practice (Vet 508), and Farm Management (Vet 502 elective). These are all relevant to the education in food producing animals.

Food animal cases presented in the SER and for the earlier years presented to the Team during the Visitation (see Indicators) suggest that there are sufficient numbers of ruminants seen intramurally. The numbers of these species seen extramurally are low. COVID-19 has affected the numbers of ruminant and pig cases and farm visits in the clinic and farm visits during 2020 and 2021.

3.1.4.2. Comments

Because most modules are taught on a discipline basis it is difficult to quantify specific hours assigned to farm animal species in the formal curriculum.

The individual components of Herd Health Management i.e., Animal breeding / genetics, Nutrition, Animal Husbandry, Fertility, Performance, milk quality / mastitis (for dairy herds),

animal welfare and health monitoring are taught with some integration in herd health management.

Ethology and animal welfare are very practical subjects, yet no practicals are included in these courses.

3.1.4.3. Suggestions for improvement

Further inclusion of the concepts of herd health management / the herd health cycle for all core students and then continuing to do more applied herd health management for the elective students would be beneficial in this important topic. This could include possibilities to conduct farm audits and writing of reports.

The VEE should consider the inclusion of practical aspects of ethology and animal welfare.

3.1.4.4. Decision

The VEE is compliant with Substandard 3.1.4.

3.1.5. Food Safety and Quality

3.1.5.1. Findings

In the field of food and quality sciences, the courses inherent in this subject represent 14 ECTS out of a total of 300 ECTS, i.e. a percentage of 4.66%.

The courses in this area are:

- Meat Hygiene and Meat Products Technology VET419, 3 ECTS given during the 7th semester
- Dairy Science and Technology VET410, 3 ECTS given during the 8th semester
- Food Hygiene and Control VET505, 3 ECTS given during the 9th semester
- Veterinary Public Health VET517, 2 ECTS given during the 9th semester
- Food Hygiene and Technology VET510, 3 ECTS given during the 10th semester

There is also an elective course entitled “Poultry meat technology” of 21 ECTS given during the 8th semester.

The courses have a good balance between theory and practical aspects, e.g. in course VET 419, there are 14 theoretical course units of 2 hours and 14 practical units of 2 hours each, too. An assessment takes place at the half-semester level and this assessment counts for 40% of the total course assessment. This is valid for all food safety and food quality teaching modules. The idea is very interesting to have a sequence followed by theoretical and practical modules.

The VEE has a good relationship with slaughterhouses that enables the students to practice *ante* and *postmortem* inspection. The students have a special place in order to have time and opportunity to inspect more cautiously organs and discuss with the assistants the reasons to declare organs unfit for human consumption. It was noted that there are many reference books at the level of each course in relation to food science, which is beneficial for students.

3.1.5.2. Comments

The courses are first approached from the point of view of the processes before approaching the knowledge of dangers and risks. This is a good outline in order to consolidate the learning outcomes of the students, each time illustrating the theoretical concepts with practical exercises. It is to be commended that "VET 517 Veterinary Public Health" is given to the students. This course aims to show the very important role veterinarians can play in public health. In course VET 505, notions relating to meat hygiene are taught, whereas this part should be approached in course VET 319 specifically, dedicated to meat and meat products. In this course, it also seems that there are theoretical elements related to the knowledge of risks, which represent a good reminder for the students.

Yet, there are some minor redundancies in the food science courses, but they could consolidate learning.

Above all, the institution seems to favour the knowledge of students in two main fields very important to food science: the meat sector and the milk and derived products sector. In every course, at the beginning the students learn about Biosecurity and Healthy Food. In the following years of studies, the students receive more information about the Quality of the food.

3.1.5.3. Suggestions for improvement

A more coherent approach in the courses in food science would avoid repetitions between the different courses. A higher extent of integration with the clinical sciences of production animals by joint visits could improve the understanding by the students of hazard control that could already take place at the stage of primary production.

The change in the order of the courses, first showing the risks and then explaining how they are controlled in the main production chains for food of animal origin could improve the understanding of the subject by the students.

3.1.5.4. Decision

The VEE is compliant with Substandard 3.1.5.

3.1.6. Professional Knowledge

3.1.6.1. Findings

The curriculum respects the EU Directive and has been reviewed and very recently accepted by Turkish Authorities to allow the students to have their Day One Competences.

During the COVID-19 pandemic, boards continued with their work, to achieve curriculum revision. All the departments were asked, this year, to strictly adapt their courses to this new curriculum.

3.1.6.2. Comments

The curriculum follows the ECTS programme, and the distribution of the 300 ECTS is given in a table format.

Internet access has been created to resume all the courses and is available for each stakeholder. All the aspects of the veterinary diploma are taught; therefore the students have a wide range of job opportunities when completing their studies.

3.1.6.3. Suggestions for improvement

None.

3.1.6.4 Decision

The VEE is compliant with Substandard 3.1.6.

3.2 Each study programme provided by the VEE must be competency-based and designed so that it meets the objectives set for it, including the intended learning outcomes. The qualification resulting from a programme must be clearly specified and communicated and must refer to the correct level of the national qualifications framework for higher education and, consequently, to the Framework for Qualifications of the European Higher Education Area.

The VEE must provide proof of a QA system that promotes and monitors the presence of an academic environment highly conducive to learning including self-learning. Details of the type, provision and updating of appropriate learning opportunities for the students must be clearly described, as well as the involvement of students.

The VEE must also describe how it encourages and prepares students for self-learning and lifelong learning.

3.2.1. Findings

The curriculum is designed in accordance with the EU Directive 2005/36/EC (as amended by the 2013/55/EU directive) and Annex V.4.1. The essential curriculum is designed in respect of the ESEVT SOP "Day One Competences". The adequacy of curriculum is guaranteed by the "National Competency Framework for Higher Education in Turkey" (TYYÇ). National and international competencies have been defined and all national curricula have been created within the framework of these rules. The structure and course distribution of the educational programme are based on 300 ECTS in accordance with the Bologna Process. The courses are classified under the titles of Compulsory, Elective, and Non-Departmental Elective and defined in percentage ratios. The curriculum is based on the acquisition of qualifications and skills before graduation in accordance to the ESEVT SOP "Day One Competences". The VEE receives suggestions for improving the curriculum through the Alumni platform. There is a module created within the scope of OBIS to receive anonymous online feedback from the students. Students evaluate the courses and lecturers over this module. The students' feedback is taken into consideration by the academic staff in the next semester, who make the necessary improvements themselves. The proficiency levels or achievements of students regarding learning outcomes are carried out by one or more of the open-ended, multiple-choice tests, duties, and practical activities. Students in the practice education programme record their activities in a "practice booklet" as well as EPTs in a "logbook". Practices such as narration, educational and remote demonstration were performed during the SARS-CoV-2 (COVID-19) pandemic emergency period. Students start clinical courses as of the 3rd educational grade and obtain a follow-up booklet for each clinical practice course. After each application, the student submits it to the responsible lecturer for the course for approval.

3.2.2. Comments

None.

3.2.3. Suggestions for improvement

None.

3.2.4. Decision

The VEE is compliant with Substandard 3.2.

3.3 Programme learning outcomes must:

- **ensure the effective alignment of all content, teaching, learning and assessment activities of the degree programme to form a cohesive framework**
- **include a description of Day One Competences**
- **form the basis for explicit statements of the objectives and learning outcomes of individual units of study**
- **be communicated to staff and students**
- **be regularly reviewed, managed and updated to ensure they remain relevant, adequate and are effectively achieved.**

3.3.1. Findings

The educational programme is designed to meet the minimum professional requirements for preparing a practitioner. These requirements are determined as Day One Competences by veterinary accreditation bodies such as EAEVE and VEDEK. The curriculum lasts five years and each one (year) is arranged in two semesters for a total of ten semesters. Qualifications and learning outcomes are achieved with a total of 300 ECTS. These 300 ECTS are given by 5 Departments (Basic sciences, Pre-clinical sciences, Clinical sciences, Animal Science and Animal Nutrition and Food hygiene and technology) within the VEE. All courses are semi-annual. One student takes 30 ECTS courses in each semester. 235 ECTS of these required courses are compulsory, 53 ECTS are departmental elective courses and 12 ECTS are non-departmental elective courses. Courses are included in the context of a cohesive didactic framework and are structured for step-by-step knowledge acquisition, for a progressive and calibrated improvement of competencies and skills. The curriculum starts from preparatory basic science for topics related to pre-clinical science and follows with topics explaining clinical science and non-clinical science (Animal Science and Animal Nutrition and Food hygiene and technology) defining the veterinary profession. The Day One Competences are included in the veterinary curriculum. The communication, evaluation and review of learning outcomes is undertaken jointly and consistently with other aspects of the curriculum: core curriculum, objectives, assessment criteria. The basic procedure is carried out by the Education Commission, the Quality Commission, and the Traineeship Commission (EPT) and finally by the VEE's board. Commissions meet at least twice a year, and the VEE board meets whenever necessary. The decisions taken are communicated to the relevant parties both as the presence of students in the Commissions and as an announcement.

3.3.2. Comments

None.

3.3.3. Suggestions for improvement

None.

3.3.4. Decision

The VEE is compliant with Substandard 3.3.

3.4 The VEE must have a formally constituted committee structure (which includes effective student representation), with clear and empowered reporting lines, to oversee and manage the curriculum and its delivery. The committee(s) must:

- **determine the pedagogical basis, design, delivery methods and assessment methods of the curriculum**
- **oversee QA of the curriculum, particularly gathering, evaluating, making change and responding to feedback from stakeholders, peer reviewers and external assessors, and data from examination/assessment outcomes**
- **perform on going and periodic review of the curriculum at least every seven years by involving staff, students and stakeholders; these reviews must lead to continuous improvement. Any action taken or planned as a result of such a review must be communicated to all those concerned**
- **identify and meet training needs for all types of staff, maintaining and enhancing their competence for the ongoing curriculum development.**

3.4.1. Findings

The FVMADU has an official Education Coordination Board (Education Commission) to supervise, develop and prepare the curriculum. The Education Commission is constituted of a minimum of 4 members, one of which is the vice Dean responsible for education, one student (VEE student representative) and at least 2 Faculty members. At the VEE level there are active specific Commissions for survey, alumni, quality, accreditation and EAEVE. These Commissions send their analysis about the curriculum and cooperate with the Education Commission. In particular, the Faculty accreditation commission collects data for accreditation and informs the Education Commission about the related requirements. Approval of VUÇEP standards by the national accreditation authority, and a large-scale curriculum review within the aims of VEDEK and EAEVE have started. In these review processes stakeholders were consulted and surveys were completed by alumni. Currently, the Education Commission is working on this issue through routine meetings. At the same time, every year, renewals in the educational courses' content are routinely performed. During SARS Cov-2 (COVID-19) pandemic emergency all the VEE's members were provided with measurement and evaluation training in distance education.

3.4.2. Comments

None.

3.4.3. Suggestions for improvement

None.

3.4.4. Decision

The VEE is compliant with Substandard 3.4.

3.5 External Practical Training (EPT) is compulsory training activities organised outside the VEE, the student being under the direct supervision of a non-academic person (e.g. a practitioner). EPT cannot replace the core intramural training nor the extramural training under the close supervision of academic staff (e.g. ambulatory clinics, herd health management, practical training in FSQ and VPH).

Since the veterinary degree is a professional qualification with Day One Competences, EPT must complement and strengthen the academic education inter alia by enhancing student's professional knowledge.

3.5.1. Findings

EPT is performed as the compulsory training outside the VEE and is called "summer training". It takes place at the end of the 4th year, it is 5 weeks long (200 hours), in a place chosen by the student, who has to deliver an acceptance letter from the place they want to go for this summer training, which is approved by the due commission.

3.5.2. Comments

All the information is available on a website, in Turkish, and an optional additional training is available. During the COVID-19 pandemic, the VEE had to supply additional training possibilities (during last summer period) by receiving 40 students on the campus, supervised by VTH veterinarians, without the participation of academic staff to allow the time allocated to be considered as EPT time.

3.5.3. Suggestions for improvement

None.

3.5.4. Decision

The VEE is compliant with Substandard 3.5.

3.6 The EPT providers must have an agreement with the VEE and the student (in order to state their respective rights and duties, including insurance matters), provide a standardised evaluation of the performance of the student during their EPT and be allowed to provide feedback to the VEE on the EPT programme. There must be a member of the academic staff responsible for the overall supervision of the EPT, including liaison with EPT providers.

3.6.1. Findings

The students are allowed to freely choose the place where they want to do the EPT, but the presence of a veterinary practitioner on site is compulsory. There is an agreement between the VEE and the student regarding the students' activities and fulfilment of their duties is strictly under the supervision of the veterinarian. Designated people from the staff are responsible for the supervision of the EPT at the FVMADU level, after its accomplishment by the students. The task development plan for future candidate students is discussed with the practicing veterinarian, so that their feed-back is considered.

3.6.2. Comments

A new project called "mobilization" has increased the possibility of training in public institutions, as it is explained on the website. During the pandemic, the VEE had to find a solution for the students who could not find placements themselves.

3.6.3. Suggestions for improvement

A "Plan B", to be implemented in case of need with supplementary pre-established EPT providers could be useful to cover a broader scale of options for the students.

3.6.4. Decision

The VEE is compliant with Substandard 3.6.

3.7 Students must take responsibility for their own learning during EPT. This includes preparing properly before each placement, keeping a proper record of their experience during EPT by using a logbook provided by the VEE and evaluating the EPT. Students must be allowed to complain officially and/or anonymously about issues occurring during EPT. The VEE must have a system of QA to monitor the implementation, progress and then feedback within the EPT activities.

3.7.1. Findings

The students are aware of their future placements for the EPT and they are instructed in biosafety measures in advance.

They record their daily work in logbooks which are signed by their supervising practitioner and are used by the Training committee to evaluate the quality of the training. At FVMADU, an optional traineeship is possible, which must be approved by the board of directors and is up to 75 working days. Similarly, the students can carry out an optional EPT under the supervision of the University.

3.7.2. Comments

The use of logbooks represents the heart of the EPT and allows a good evolution throughout the curriculum; this powerful principle is applied at the FVMADU. The creation of a food hygiene and public health EPT starting at the end of the 6th semester is currently being considered.

3.7.3. Suggestions for improvement

Students could benefit more during the earlier part of the curriculum, by the inclusion of additional EPT during each summer after the 4th semester (i.e. at the end of years 2, 3 and 4).

3.7.4. Decision

The VEE is compliant with Substandard 3.7.

Standard 4. Facilities and equipment

4.1 All aspects of the physical facilities must provide an environment conducive to learning, including internet access. The VEE must have a clear strategy and programme for maintaining and upgrading its buildings and equipment. Facilities must comply with all relevant legislation including health, safety, biosecurity, accessibility to people with reduced mobility, and EU animal welfare and care standards.

4.1.1. Findings

The VEE includes 11 blocks with a total of 170,000 m² open and 19,097 m² closed area in the West Campus located within the Işıklı neighbourhood of Efeler district, Aydın province. The VEE has a total of 10,484 square meters of education area, 335 square meters of social and cultural area, 158 square meters of student-staff dining hall, and 11 meeting rooms (580 square meters in total).

ADÜ budget comes from the Ministry of Treasury and Finance, Republic of Turkey. The budget transferred to the university is allocated to the faculties according to the requirements. The Dean is responsible for the allocation and admission of the budget reserved for the VEE. The demands from the Departments are followed in order, by giving the priority to the education by the Council of the Faculty in accordance with the direction of the Dean.

Internet access is provided through Eduroam and University Wi-Fi links and all students and staff have access to the internet.

Accessibility to people with reduced mobility is developing and handled individually.

Occupational safety, biosecurity, and environmental safety of the VEE are overseen by qualified personnel and the biosecurity guide is available and easy to access through the internet link. Lack of fire hose(s) or extinguishers in lecture rooms, inadequate number of fire extinguisher in the departments, lack of biosecurity signs in some laboratories, lack of posters indicating restricted area (access and disinfection barriers), and improper storage of some chemicals and technical gases, were noticed in the VEE.

4.1.2. Comments

The VEE has a large and nicely located campus with numerous buildings and rooms for teaching and research activities. Internet is available to all employees and students on the campus.

Despite the availability of written measures related to biosafety and biosecurity, inadequate handling of chemical and technical gases was noticed.

4.1.3. Suggestions for improvement

At least one fire extinguisher should be available in large lecture rooms with a capacity of 80 persons (lecture rooms); fire extinguishers must be present in the rooms where technical and medical gases are handled. Signs – on the door or the floor, must be present where there is division between clean and dirty areas of the clinics, as well as near the hospitalisation and isolation units.

4.1.4. Decision

The VEE is not compliant with Substandard 4.1 because the facilities do not comply with all relevant legislation including health, safety, biosecurity, and animal welfare and care standards.

4.2 Lecture theatres, teaching laboratories, tutorial rooms, clinical facilities and other teaching spaces must be adequate in number, size and equipped for the instructional purposes and must be well maintained. The facilities must be adapted for the number of students enrolled. Students must have ready access to adequate and sufficient study, self-learning, recreation, locker, sanitary and food service facilities. Offices, teaching preparation and research laboratories must be sufficient for the needs of the academic and support staff.

4.2.1. Findings

The VEE has five lecture theatres, three classrooms, a small classroom in the main building and two lecturing rooms at the VTH (one under construction). All rooms are equipped with air conditioning, multimedia devices, interactive whiteboard and computers. Additionally, there are rooms in different departments available for work with small groups of students. The faculty Library with a capacity of 38 people, includes an "Internet Hall" and a "Reading Hall", which are in the main building. There is also a 190-seat conference hall and a foyer area.

For teaching purposes there are two additional Microscope Laboratories ($100\text{ m}^2 \times 2 = 200\text{ m}^2$), two Chemistry Laboratories ($100\text{ m}^2 \times 2 = 200\text{ m}^2$) and one Anatomy Laboratory (280 m^2).

Similarly, the ADÜ Central Library (9 km away) is accessible for all staff and students from the VEE. A Wi-Fi network system is available in the entire library and campus.

Students and staff have the opportunity to use the dining hall (120 m^2 , 60 people capacity). Also, there are 2 more canteens (Canteen A; 240 m^2 , 100 people capacity, and Canteen B; 210 m^2 , 50 people capacity).

A total of 274 lockers are available for the students.

There is an accommodation facility for students on duty in the emergency clinic with 6 beds, situated in the VTH.

The staff offices and research laboratories of the departments were distributed to the departments. In total, there are 139 offices, and 49 research laboratories are at the service of academic and support staff for teaching and research activities.

4.2.2. Comments

Lecture theatres, teaching laboratories, tutorial rooms, clinical facilities and other teaching spaces are adequate in number and size. Teaching rooms- lecture hall and laboratories are well equipped and well maintained. The facilities are adapted for the number of students enrolled. The VEE has a great chance to apply the education programme and use all facilities in the best manner. Rooms are spacious and, as indicated in the Strategic plan, there is the possibility to enlarge some clinical departments and rebuild some important parts of the VTH.

4.2.3. Suggestions for improvement

None.

4.2.4. Decision

The VEE is compliant with Substandard 4.2.

4.3 The livestock facilities, animal housing, core clinical teaching facilities and equipment used by the VEE for teaching purposes must:

- **be sufficient in capacity and adapted for the number of students enrolled in order to allow safe hands-on training for all students**
- **be of a high standard, well maintained and fit for the purpose**
- **promote best husbandry, welfare and management practices**
- **ensure relevant biosecurity and bio-containment**
- **be designed to enhance learning.**

4.3.1. Findings

VTH's usage area is 5,200 m² and contains Patient Admission, Patient Lounges, Small and Large Animal Clinics, Diagnostic Imaging, Central Laboratory, Pharmacy, clinical examination and practice rooms, treatment rooms, operation halls, intensive care and rehabilitation units, dental unit, echo examination room, eye unit, endoscopy unit, isolation rooms, hospitalization units for each animal species.

Clinical Laboratory contains equipment for haematology, blood and urine chemistry, and serological analysis. Diagnostic imaging unit possesses one digital X-ray, one tomography and one doppler ultrasonography device.

The necropsy service is part of the Veterinary Pathology department and samples from clinics, private veterinary clinicians and animal breeders are used for educational purposes.

The Department of Food Hygiene and Technology has the necessary equipment for a small milk processing unit. Within the scope of intern/elective practices in the 10th semester, each student is taken to the slaughterhouses, as part of public health practices, several times under the supervision of an assistant. These slaughterhouses are distributed around Aydın as Uludağ Et in Umurlu, Ege Et in Çine, and Efeler Municipality Animal Market.

The VEE has a farm for bovine, sheep, goats, pigs, and experimental facility for poultry.

Cattle are held in a free-range deep litter system; however, it was not freshly bedded with straw and therefore presents a hygiene concern. The cows were in variable body condition with some in quite poor condition.

The pig barn is a free-range deep litter one, with at least 2 pigs in very poor body condition (emaciated).

The experimental poultry facility allows the students to be familiarized with the production processes on a chicken (broiler and layer) farm, including a small demonstration slaughter unit.

The "Experimental Animal Production and Research Centre" unit of the VEE (total usage area 324 m²), has been certified as a producer/user/supplier for rats, mice, gerbils, pigs, sheep and goats by the Ministry of Food, Agriculture and Livestock.

4.3.2. Comments

Facilities and equipment used by the VEE for teaching purposes are sufficient in capacity and adapted for the number of students enrolled to allow safe hands-on training for all students. Adequate standard of facilities is demonstrated except for housing for cattle and pigs, which do not promote best husbandry, welfare and management practices. Some clinical facilities are in mid stages of refurbishment.

4.3.3. Suggestions for improvement

The VEE is encouraged to implement adequate standards for its pig and cattle farm facilities, based on national and European regulations on appropriate animal shelters, animal health and welfare. Completion of refurbishment of clinical facilities is encouraged.

4.3.4. Decision

The VEE is partially compliant with Substandard 4.3 because the standards and the capacity of livestock facilities are suboptimal.

4.4 Core clinical teaching facilities must be provided in a veterinary teaching hospital (VTH) with 24/7 emergency services at least for companion animals and equines. Within the VTH, the VEE must unequivocally demonstrate that standard of education and clinical research are compliant with all ESEVT Standards, e.g. research-based and evidence-based clinical training supervised by academic staff trained to teach and to assess, availability for staff and students of facilities and patients for performing clinical research and relevant QA procedures.

For ruminants, on-call service must be available if emergency services do not exist for those species in a VTH.

The VEE must ensure state-of-the-art standards of teaching clinics which remain comparable with or exceeding the best available in the private sector.

The VTH and any hospitals, practices and facilities (including EPT) which are involved with the curriculum must meet the relevant national Practice Standards.

4.4.1. Findings

The hospitalization unit for cats and dogs cover an area of approximately 200 m². There are separate units for infectious diseases and isolation of animals.

In the hospitalization unit: there are 9 cages of 90x90x90 cm and one 110x90x70 cm cage for dogs. There are 6 cages of 100x90x60 cm and 3 cages of 110x60x60 cm for cats.

In the hospitalisation unit of the VTH for large animals, 6 cattle and a 1 horse capacity room are in use.

There is a 24/7 emergency services for companion animals, ruminants, and equines within the VTH. On the web page of the VEE, there is information for the public about emergency service and phone number for contact available 24 h.

Nine examination rooms and 3 surgery rooms are currently reserved for small animals. One common examination room is reserved for horses and bovines, one surgery room was also available for horses and bovine.

4.4.2. Comments

Veterinary teaching hospital (VTH) with 24/7 emergency services for companion animals, ruminants, and equines is the part of the VEE. Within the VTH, the standard of education and clinical research is adequate and is compliant with all ESEVT Standards. The VTH meets the relevant national Practice Standards.

4.4.3. Suggestions for improvement

None.

4.4.4. Decision

The VEE is compliant with Substandard 4.4.

4.5 The VEE must ensure that students have access to a broad range of diagnostic and therapeutic facilities, including but not limited to: diagnostic imaging, anaesthesia, clinical pathology, intensive/critical care, surgeries and treatment facilities, ambulatory services, pharmacy and necropsy facilities.

4.5.1. Findings

Students can access diagnosis and treatment opportunities under the supervision of academic staff or responsible veterinarians. Clinical records are in paper form mostly and there is no computer programme where student can easily follow or retrieve clinical cases.

VTH has the necessary equipment and infrastructure to a larger extent for hospital operation and clinical training. Diagnosis, treatment, and operations of both small and large animal diseases are carried out in the general and special units within the VTH.

The Clinical Laboratory is equipped with devices to perform haematology, blood and urine chemistry test, and also serological analysis.

Diagnostic imaging unit includes one digital X-ray, one tomography and one doppler ultrasonography device. Additionally, students have access to a clinical skills lab in the building of the VTH.

The necropsy service is part of the Veterinary Pathology department and samples from clinics, private veterinary clinicians and animal breeders are used for educational purposes.

4.5.2. Comments

The students have access to a broad range of diagnostic and therapeutic facilities; diagnostic imaging, anaesthesia, clinical pathology, intensive/critical care, surgical and treatment facilities, ambulatory services, pharmacy, and necropsy facilities which enhances the training and acquisition of Day One Competences.

4.5.3. Suggestions for improvement

The VEE could make a much better use of its available clinical data purchasing a dedicated software for clinical records (also see Substandard 5.4).

4.5.4. Decision

The VEE is compliant with Substandard 4.5.

4.6 Appropriate isolation facilities must be provided to meet the need for the isolation and containment of animals with communicable diseases. Such isolation facilities must be properly constructed, ventilated, maintained and operated to provide for animal care and for prevention of spread of infectious agents. They must be adapted to all animal species commonly handled in the VTH.

4.6.1. Findings

There are facilities for keeping animals in isolation at the VTH. There are 3 isolation cages (100x100x100 cm dimensions) for dogs and cats, the room having a single entrance door from outside. Three additional cages for infectious diseases patients are located in a separate room accessible through one single door from the outside. There are no fences/barriers between those two units. Disinfection barriers or double door access with a place for changing clothes and performing disinfection on site are missing in the isolation units for small animals.

There is a single common use isolation room for horse or cattle. This room is not prepared for accommodating an isolated large size animal. Some old tables and cabinets are present in the room as storage items. Flooring and walls are inadequate for an isolation unit, cracks are present

on both sides. There is no double entrance and no pre- room for changing and disinfection or storage for used materials. Access to this unit is directly from outside and there is no fence or barrier, with separate entrance for non-infectious large animal patients into the VTH.

4.6.2. Comments

Isolation facilities are not appropriate and do not meet the standards for the isolation and containment of animals with communicable diseases. Isolation facilities are not properly constructed, maintained, and operated to provide for animal care and for prevention of spread of infectious agents.

4.6.3. Suggestions for improvement

The VEE is encouraged to strengthen its efforts for finishing the new premises where adequate isolation facilities for both small and large animals are planned.

4.6.4. Decision

The VEE is not compliant with Substandard 4.6 because the isolation facilities do not meet the standards.

4.7 The VEE must have an ambulatory clinic for production animals or equivalent facilities so that students can practise field veterinary medicine and Herd Health Management under academic supervision.

4.7.1. Findings

The VEE has a mobile clinic vehicle for students (16 seats) to perform field clinical training under academic supervision. In addition, there is a transport truck for animals to be brought into the hospital. At times, the VEE had difficulties to hire a licensed driver, since in Turkey the teaching staff are not allowed to drive such a vehicle for transport of students.

4.7.2. Comments

The VEE has an ambulatory clinic for production animals where it can go to commercial farms and the farm of the Faculty of Agriculture within the same University. Students can practise field veterinary medicine and Herd Health Management under academic supervision on these farms. Due to the government regulation, special license is needed for students' public transportation.

4.7.3. Suggestions for improvement

Constant occupancy of the mobile clinic's driver position with authorised personnel is suggested.

4.7.4. Decision

The VEE is compliant with Substandard 4.7.

4.8 The transport of students, live animals, cadavers, materials from animal origin and other teaching materials must be done in agreement with national and EU standards, to ensure the safety of students and staff and to prevent the spread of infectious agents.

4.8.1. Findings

The ambulatory clinic uses a 16-seat vehicle. The vehicle is equipped with disposable clothing belonging to the students, and leggings for boots and gloves (also disposable gloves for examinations). It includes surgical material, podiatry material for large animals and ultrasound equipment.

Biological waste is delivered to Aydın Metropolitan Municipality with the "National Waste Transport Form" (Form-9A) issued by the Ministry of Environment and Urbanization. In accordance with the bilateral agreements made with the Aydın Metropolitan Municipality, wastes are collected by licensed vehicles. The contamination susceptible cadavers are reported to the Ministry of Agriculture and Forestry, and the susceptible cadavers are collected by the government's personals.

4.8.2. Comments

Transport of students, live animals, cadavers, materials from animal origin and other teaching materials are done in agreement with local, national and EU standards.

Clinical and pathological wastes (medical wastes) and animal cadavers are collected in separate special containers that are transported to dedicated sites by the local municipality.

4.8.3. Suggestions for improvement

None.

4.8.4. Decision

The VEE is compliant with Substandard 4.8.

4.9. Operational policies and procedures (including e.g. biosecurity, good laboratory practice and good clinical practice) must be taught and posted for students, staff and visitors and a Biosafety manual must be available. The VEE must demonstrate a clear commitment for the delivery of biosafety and biosecurity, e.g. by a specific committee structure. The VEE must have a system of QA to monitor and assure clinical, laboratory and farm services, including a regular monitoring of the feedback from students, staff and clients.

4.9.1. Findings

The Biosafety Commission was established on 10.09.2019. The VEE's "Biosafety Guide" has been prepared; in addition, a safer environment was created for internal and external stakeholders by hanging the biosafety and warning signs at some points determined under the supervision of the "Biosafety Commission" but signs are missing at some places.

Information on biosafety is delivered to the 1st year students at the beginning of the semester and to the 3rd, 4th and 5th years before starting their Clinical Applications. "Biosecurity Training" is given to all staff and students.

4.9.2. Comments

The biosafety guide is a detailed document and well written and it must be applied to all levels of teaching, laboratory, and clinical work. The VEE has a QA system to monitor and assure clinical, laboratory and farm services, including a regular monitoring of the feedback from students, staff and clients.

4.9.3. Suggestions for improvement

Correct application of the operational policies and procedures could improve the level of knowledge on biosafety and biosecurity; all those involved should follow the instructions described in the internal guide.

4.9.4. Decision

The VEE is partially compliant with Substandard 4.9 because operational policies and procedures are not fully posted for students, staff and visitors.

Standard 5. Animal resources and teaching material of animal origin

5.1 The number and variety of healthy and diseased animals, cadavers, and material of animal origin must be adequate for providing the practical and safe hands-on training (in the areas of Basic Sciences, Clinical Sciences, Pathology, Animal Production, Food Safety and Quality) and adapted to the number of students enrolled.

Evidence must be provided that these data are regularly recorded and that procedures are in place for correcting any deficiencies.

5.1.1. Findings

Animal number ratios per student graduating annually are below the minimum values (i.e. intramurally seen equine patients, rabbits, rodents, bird and exotics, companion animal cases seen extra-murally, ruminant and pig cases seen extramurally, equine cases seen extramurally, visits to ruminant and pig herds (related to herd health), visits to poultry and farmed rabbit units (herd health), companion animal necropsies and ruminant and pig necropsies).

Animals and animal materials are used in Anatomy, Animal Production, Pathology and clinical settings. In anatomy teaching extensive use is made of both bones, joints and skeletal models (actual and 3D printed models). Plastinated specimens are also used. Limited whole animal cadavers (n=9-10 per year) are used.

The total necropsy numbers per year is ~250.

Animal materials, parts and waste are stored and then disposed of by an authorised service provider.

The Jockey club in Izmir that was visited has an equine farm and a well-equipped clinic, and large numbers of horses that are potentially available to the VEE.

A clinical skills laboratory is available with limited models for training of students in clinical skills.

The VEE has small numbers of cattle (16 cows plus calves); sheep (80 ewes and lambs), pigs (10-15 of various ages and sizes), and broilers in buildings on the campus. There is also a student club that houses, treats, rehabilitates and releases wild birds. A student Jockey / riding club also maintains 4 horses on site that provides opportunities for equitation by those students who are interested. Some rectal palpation / reproductive tract examination is carried out on the mares in the club.

There is also a large 2,400 Ha farm operated by the Faculty of Agriculture that has 66 dairy cows, some beef cattle (males from dairy herd) and 250 breeding ewes. This is used by students from the VEE in Obstetrics and Gynaecology and Animal Science/Nutrition. Much of the farm is also devoted to arable use.

5.1.2. Comments

There are insufficient whole animal cadavers (10) to effectively teach anatomy (anatomical dissection) to the numbers of students in the programme.

During the COVID-19 pandemic there were very low numbers of necropsies: 77 in 2020 and 32 to date in 2021. Pre COVID-19, the figure averages ~250 per year. While this appears to be a good number of total necropsy cases, in actual fact a large number of these were aquatic animals (fish) rather than mammals (27%, 59% and 24% in 2017, 2018 and 2019). As a result, the numbers of mammalian necropsies are low.

5.1.3. Suggestions for improvement

Consideration should be given to the organisation of agreements with animal shelters in the city as a means to increase the numbers of cadavers and necropsies. An agreement could also be considered with the Jockey Club (Izmir) to attain euthanised horses as cadaver material.

While the Faculty of Agriculture farm in the University is used by veterinary students, the standard and quality of the buildings and facilities could be improved to enhance the learning experiences by the students.

5.1.4. Decision

The VEE is not compliant with Substandard 5.1 due to insufficient numbers of cadavers available in the VEE for anatomy and necropsy and equine patients.

5.2 In addition to the training provided in the VEE, experience can include practical training at external sites, provided this training is organised under direct academic supervision and following the same standards as those applied in the VEE.

5.2.1. Findings

External practical training is achieved during the summer between 4th and 5th years (after semester 8). It is an obligatory 5-week period and provides 200h EPT.

Practical training is provided by the VEE under the direct supervision of academics at the Faculty of Agriculture farm and at private farms (dairy cows and broilers).

5.2.2. Comments

There were comments about insurance complications at the Aydin VEE and if these could be overcome then EPT, could be extended further.

5.2.3. Suggestions for improvement

The VEE would benefit from further extension of the EPT after clarifying their insurance complications at the University and FVMADU levels.

5.2.4. Decision

The VEE is compliant with Substandard 5.2.

5.3 The VTH must provide nursing care skills and instruction in nursing procedures. Under all situations students must be active participants in the clinical workup of patients, including problem-oriented diagnostic approach together with diagnostic decision-making.

5.3.1. Findings

Nursing skills are taught by teaching staff during clinical rotations with the hospitalised animals, this was disrupted during the COVID-19 pandemic but has now resumed.

Animal examination and interventions are generally planned for during the morning hours. Students have the opportunity to participate in the clinical work-up of patients, practice patient care, drug treatments, monitoring, cleaning and feeding etc.

A logbook system is maintained by students to ensure they complete the necessary Day One Competences procedures.

5.3.2. Comments

None.

5.3.3. Suggestions for improvement

As the VEE recovers from the impact of disruption to services caused by COVID-19, they need to ensure that nursing care skills training is re-established.

5.3.4. Decision

The VEE is compliant with Substandard 5.3.

5.4 Medical records must be comprehensive and maintained in an effective retrieval system (preferably an electronic patient record system) to efficiently support the teaching, research, and service programmes of the VEE.

5.4.1. Findings

Patient records are kept in an electronic system (e-Vet software) managed by 2 staff members and also on paper written records.

5.4.2. Comments

The e-Vet system is purely a financial and invoicing system that does not allow effective retrieval of medical records and does not store linked medical and laboratory information to the cases. The key clinical medical records are kept in a combination of written case logbooks, written case histories / diagnoses, biochemistry printouts and electronic X-rays. These medical records would need to be chased up with the academic department / professor if they were required for later analyses / research purposes by students. The information that is kept and available in hard format is not readily searchable or retrievable.

5.4.3. Suggestions for improvement

An effective system to allow retrieval of clinical records needs to be developed by the VEE. Ideally this would be a computerised system that can be accessed and searched by students in the VEE.

5.4.4. Decision

The VEE is not compliant with Substandard 5.4 since there is no functional case records system to allow effective retrieval of comprehensive medical records to efficiently support the teaching, research and service programmes of the VEE.

Standard 6. Learning resources

6.1 State-of-the-art learning resources must be adequate and available to support veterinary education, research, services and continuing education. When the study programme is provided in several tracks/languages, the learning resources must be

available in all used languages. Timely access to learning resources, whether through print, electronic media or other means, must be available to students and staff and, when appropriate, to stakeholders. State-of-the-art procedures for bibliographical search and for access to databases and learning resources must be taught to undergraduate students.

6.1.1. Findings

The main library in the University campus is open 24/7, is easy to reach through an internet access, has a lot of hard books that can be rented for one month, three times maximum. It is far from the VEE (9 Km) but close to some of the dormitories.

Each hard book has three to four copies, and the books can be provided in the VEE library when asked by a student. The main library is far from the VEE campus but there is a good transportation network.

There is a second, smaller library, situated at the VEE campus and it also has easy internet access through Wi-Fi and local computers.

IT and e learning exist and are well developed at the University and Faculty levels. A VPN access is available. The students have access through their laptops and through the library computers to an adequate e-learning programme, where they can find the curriculum, the courses and all the e-books needed.

The support staff is not enough to fulfil all duties, but the internet access exists everywhere in the VEE buildings.

The VEE has planned to develop a video studio for the students to record and observe themselves during clinical training.

6.1.2. Comments

No dedicated staff member for the veterinary students is available at the main library. The main library is located too far from the FVMADU to be easily accessed by veterinary students, but the access is 24/7. Nevertheless, the electronic access is an appropriate and handy way to resolve these problems, even if it has to be improved all the time.

6.1.3. Suggestions for improvement

None.

6.1.4. Decision

The VEE is compliant with Substandard 6.1.

6.2 Staff and students must have full access on site to an academic library administered by a qualified librarian, an Information Technology (IT) unit managed by an IT expert, an e-learning platform, and all the relevant human and physical resources necessary for the development of instructional materials by the staff and their use by the students. The relevant electronic information, database and other intranet resources must be easily available for students and staff both in the VEE's core facilities via wireless connection (Wi-Fi) and from outside the VEE through a hosted secured connection, e.g. Virtual Private Network (VPN).

6.2.1. Findings

In the main library, support is provided by qualified librarians, while in the FVMADU library, there is one dedicated library staff for management and assisting veterinary students.

The IT and e-learning are well developed, and through a portal called AZUDEM easy to reach for the students and for the educational team who can add documents needed by students for their learning process.

6.2.2. Comments

None.

6.2.3. Suggestions for improvement

None.

6.2.4. Decision

The VEE is compliant with Substandard 6.2.

6.3 The VEE must provide students with unimpeded access to learning resources, internet and internal study resources, and equipment for the development of procedural skills (e.g. models). The use of these resources must be aligned with the pedagogical environment and learning outcomes within the programme and have mechanisms in place to evaluate the teaching value of changes in learning resources.

6.3.1. Findings

In several different courses the professors explained the student's potential professional tracks for their development after graduation by use of internet and internal learning resources. Every student has an advisor to guide on the use of study resources that best fit the student's purpose. The access to the portal AZUDEM is free and can be reached from everywhere. The students can find lectures, videos from each learning department through the CSL. A consultancy room with a camera is planned to allow the students to improve their surgical practice.

The skills lab provides model for obtainment of practical skill and Day One Competences.

The students are involved in different associations, local or outside the VEE. Vet Derm Association includes also students from this VEE, who have the opportunity to communicate with their professors and practitioners about best professional practices and rational use of teaching materials. The Equine Community is also an opportunity for students to create relationships with practitioners in the field, improving the teaching environment.

The students are aware about welfare problems with teaching animals, and they try to avoid too much stress to those, therefore they form small groups and share tasks as divided by their teachers: while some verify the heart rate, other complete the physical examination, others are preparing the treatments, etc.

6.3.2. Comments

The VEE could make use of large animals' models to help with some procedures on animals.

6.3.3. Suggestions for improvement

None.

6.3.4. Decision

The VEE is compliant with Substandard 6.3.

Standard 7. Student admission, progression and welfare

7.1 The VEE must consistently apply pre-defined and published regulations covering all phases of the student “life cycle”, e.g. student admission, progression and certification. In relation to enrolment, the VEE must provide accurate and complete information regarding all aspects of the educational programme in all advertisings for prospective national and international students. Formal co-operations with other VEEs must also be clearly advertised.

7.1.1. Findings

The VEE uses different ways to inform potential veterinary students on academic rules, curriculum, student life, mechanisms of student admission, curricular progression and diploma. Information is provided on-site (visits to public and private high schools), online (VEE’s website, YÖK website, alumni platform) and social media (Facebook, Twitter, Instagram, YouTube). The VEE's website sets out the details of aims, curriculum, academics, calendars and all other issues related to Veterinary studies. A Virtual Fair website of YÖK informs local or international students about studying in Turkish Universities. The VEE has an International Relations’ Office which offers support, guidance, and advice for incoming and outgoing students. This office manages the collaborative bilateral agreements held with other institutions for international mobility programmes in Europe (ERASMUS), as well as national programmes (MEVLANA, FARABI). The office is coordinated by the Vice-Rector and coordinators for International Relations.

7.1.2. Comments

None.

7.1.3. Suggestions for improvement

None

7.1.4. Decision

The VEE is compliant with Substandard 7.1.

7.2 The number of students admitted must be consistent with the resources available at the VEE for staff, buildings, equipment, healthy and diseased animals, and materials of animal origin.

7.2.1. Findings

The number of admissible students to the Veterinary degree at the VEE is fixed by YÖK, every year, as a result of state policy. The quota average for the VEE was 100 in 2020. Resources, facilities, academic staff, support staff and job market are not taken into account for fixing the yearly student quota. The VEE suggests that the admissible number of students assigned each year should be decreased to help achieve a higher quality of education. A meritocratic adjunctive student enrolment is expected: a) most successful students in High School (3 students for each year); b) students who bear the Status of Foreign Student; c) students who come from Vocational High Schools through the Vertical Transfer Exam and other VEE students through Horizontal Transfer are added.

7.2.2. Comments

The suggestion of the VEE concerning the admissible number of student/year is relevant. The meritocratic path for increasing the number of admissible students seems to be a very interesting solution for “best student” acquisition.

7.2.3. Suggestions for improvement

A decrease in student numbers would help improve the Indicators and the quality of the training of veterinary students at the FVMADU.

7.2.4. Decision

The VEE is compliant with Substandard 7.2.

7.3 The selection and progression criteria must be clearly defined, consistent, and defensible, be free of discrimination or bias, and take into account the fact that students are admitted with a view to their entry to the veterinary profession in due course.

The VEE must regularly review and reflect on the selection processes to ensure they are appropriate for students to complete the programme successfully. If the selection processes are decided by another authority, the latter must regularly receive feedback from the VEE.

Adequate training (including periodic refresher training) must be provided for those involved in the selection process to ensure applicants are evaluated fairly and consistently.

7.3.1. Findings

The admission procedures are the same for all students. Student admission criteria and procedures for the admission of students into public Universities are established by the Student Selection and Placement Centre (ÖSYM), which is an administrative body under YÖK control. Student selection criteria are clear, transparent and guarantee impartiality. University Entrance Exam results and student applications are considered in the standard university admission procedure which is fully announced and transparent. All related information is published online. Results of the admission procedure for all the public universities of Turkey are also published online at the same time and sent personally to all applicants.

7.3.2. Comments

The ÖSYM website is only in the Turkish language, therefore it is difficult to access by international students.

7.3.3. Suggestions for improvement

The VEE could benefit by having an English language version of its website for use during its recruitment process.

7.3.4. Decision

The VEE is compliant with Substandard 7.3.

7.4 There must be clear policies and procedures on how applicants with disabilities or illnesses are considered and, if appropriate, accommodated in the programme, taking into account the requirement that all students must be capable of meeting the ESEVT Day One Competences by the time they graduate.

7.4.1. Findings

The VEE has a specific “sanitary path” for applicant students affected by disabilities or illness. State Hospitals are involved in this health assessment process with recognition before enrolling the applicants to the VEE. The health assessment refers to whether the student can ultimately practice in the veterinary profession and if she/he has a prohibiting disability. The VEE implements training programs in accordance with the health assessment report.

7.4.2. Comments

None.

7.4.3. Suggestions for improvement

None.

7.4.4. Decision

The VEE is compliant with Substandard 7.4.

7.5 The basis for decisions on progression (including academic progression and professional fitness to practise) must be explicit and readily available to the students. The VEE must provide evidence that it has mechanisms in place to identify and provide remediation and appropriate support (including termination) for students who are not performing adequately.

The VEE must have mechanisms in place to monitor attrition and progression and be able to respond and amend admission selection criteria (if permitted by national or university law) and student support if required.

7.5.1. Findings

The criteria for curricular progression are set out in the VEE Academic Regulatory Framework for Undergraduates Degrees. Rules for regular student state and curricular progression are clearly and precisely fixed. The VEE safeguards student who failed an exam. Aids are offered by Academic staff to reinforce and support underachievers, also face-to-face, during the week. Students who do not pass a single exam can repeat it. All information governing the student's university career is available online on OBIS (Student Information Portal). In the last five years (2016-2021) the total dropout rate was 17.7%.

7.5.2. Comments

The VEE's QA analysis notes that it is difficult to identify the main reasons for student dropping out of veterinary school. Some students leave because the VEE does not meet their expectations or achieve good academic results, while others transfer to another VEE. There are also students who drop out of school for work or personal reasons.

7.5.3. Suggestions for improvement

None.

7.5.4. Decision

The VEE is compliant with Substandard 7.5.

7.6 Mechanisms for the exclusion of students from the programme for any reason must be explicit.

The VEE's policies for managing appeals against decisions, including admissions, academic and progression decisions and exclusion, must be transparent and publicly available.

7.6.1. Findings

Mechanisms for student exclusion, rules for student retention and policy regarding complaints about admissions and academic decisions are outlined in ADU academic regulations. All procedures and key indicators are available and transparent on the OBIS website.

7.6.2. Comments

None.

7.6.3. Suggestions for improvement

None.

7.6.4. Decision

The VEE is compliant with Substandard 7.6.

7.7 Provisions must be made by the VEE to support the physical, emotional and welfare needs of students. This includes, but is not limited to, learning support and counselling services, career advice, and fair and transparent mechanisms for dealing with student illness, impairment and disability during the programme. This shall include provision of reasonable adjustments for disabled students, consistent with all relevant equality and/or human rights legislation.

There must be effective mechanisms for resolution of student grievances (e.g. interpersonal conflict or harassment).

7.7.1. Findings

Students talk freely with their advisors if they have problems or mental health issues. The VEE has services considering mental health situations especially during the SARS CoV-2 (COVID-19) pandemic emergency period. In the main campus there is a special centre, a special community where students can go to discuss mental health issues or other health and learning problems.

One of the strongest points it is that students have a very good communication with their professors and with the academic staff. The students can approach them directly when they have some problems or questions to ask. The representatives of students communicate with the rest of the students. Students can access information consulting the listed information sources: a) Student Information Website; b) Medico Social Centre; c) Youth Problems Research and Application Centre (ADÜ-GENÇ); d) ADÜ-GENÇ Units; e) ADU Erasmus+ Exchange Program Office. Students with disabilities are equally protected.

7.7.2. Comments

Most of the websites are available only in the Turkish language, jeopardizing the understanding of the available information by foreign students.

7.7.3. Suggestions for improvement

Website translation to English would be an asset.

7.7.4. Decision

The VEE is compliant with Substandard 7.7.

7.8 Mechanisms must be in place by which students can convey their needs and wants to the VEE. The VEE must provide students with a mechanism, anonymously if they wish, to offer suggestions, comments and complaints regarding compliance of the VEE with national and international legislation and the ESEVT Standards.

7.8.1. Findings

Students have several opportunities to communicate complaints about academic performance as well as to address interpersonal conflicts, cases of harassment and others related to student welfare. Complaints, requests and suggestions can be conveyed through the complaint boxes in the VEE's buildings. All student communications are submitted to the Dean. Student's requests or suggestions are analysed by the Dean who takes a monocratic decision or decision in collaboration with the Vice Dean (Student and Academic Affairs) and with Quality Commission for problem-solving. The VEE Board Student Committee, lecturers, and student mentors can intervene as problem-solving promoters. Students can also submit complaints, requests and suggestions using the Rectorate Communication Centre (RIMER - ADU rectorate website). Both ways, the students can express comments, suggestions and complaints about the VEE in accordance with national and international legislation and ESEVT SOP. Students can also contact, in a short way, the Dean, vice Deans, Academic mentors or Academic staff.

7.8.2. Comments

The ADU Rectorate website is available only in the Turkish language, again posing difficulty for access to foreign students.

7.8.3. Suggestions for improvement

An English translation of the ADU Rectorate website could improve the communication of useful information within the foreign student community.

7.8.4. Decision

The VEE is compliant with Substandard 7.8.

Standard 8. Student assessment

8.1 The VEE must ensure that there is a clearly identified structure within the VEE showing lines of responsibility for the assessment strategy to ensure coherence of the overall assessment regime and to allow the demonstration of progressive development across the programme towards entry-level competence.

8.1.1. Findings

Student assessment at the VEE is regulated by the university and the regulations are available together with the academic calendar on the homepage of the VEE. Professional progression of the students is evaluated in midterms, exams and end-of-term exams. Examinations can be written (multiple choice or essay), oral or practical ones or their combination. Courses are closed with an exam at the end of each semester. The final grade is defined by the midterms (40%) and the final exam (60%), however practical skills are also taken into account in the case of some subjects. Clinical skills are evaluated using logbooks. Exam grades are recorded on an

online system OBIS. Students who fail at the exam can take a make-up one after a week. Students take the failed course again.

8.1.2. Comments

The student assessment is structured, the rules are public.

8.1.3. Suggestions for improvement

None.

8.1.4. Decision

The VEE is compliant with Substandard 8.1.

8.2 The assessment tasks and grading criteria for each unit of study in the programme must be published, applied consistently, clearly identified and available to students in a timely manner well in advance of the assessment. Requirements to pass must be explicit. The VEE must properly document the results of assessment and provide the students with timely feedback on their assessments. Mechanisms for students to appeal against assessment outcomes must be explicit.

8.2.1. Findings

Regulation of student assessment is available on the homepage of the VEE. Exam dates are negotiated with the students. The grading criteria and the components of the exams are public. The results of the exams are announced in the Student Information System (OBIS) within one week after the last one. The ADÚ Associate and Undergraduate Degree Education Regulations describe the appeal mechanism. Students can send a written appeal related to material errors regarding the exam results to the Dean's office within five working days.

8.2.2. Comments

None.

8.2.3. Suggestions for improvement

None.

8.2.4. Decision

The VEE is compliant with Substandard 8.2.

8.3 The VEE must have a process in place to review assessment outcomes, to change assessment strategies and to ensure the accuracy of the procedures when required. Programme learning outcomes covering the full range of professional knowledge, skills, competences and attributes must form the basis for assessment design and underpin decisions on progression.

8.3.1. Findings

Learning outcomes of the courses are made public using the online OBIS system. Students do the evaluation after each course, and they respond at a Q&A system. The feedback from the students is evaluated by the departments. Results of the exams are evaluated by the teachers, and they modify the assessment methods if it is necessary.

8.3.2. Comments

None.

8.3.3. Suggestions for improvement

None.

8.3.4. Decision

The VEE is compliant with Substandard 8.3.

8.4 Assessment strategies must allow the VEE to certify student achievement of learning objectives at the level of the programme and individual units of study.

The VEE must ensure that the programmes are delivered in a way that encourages students to take an active role in creating the learning process, and that the assessment of students reflects this approach.

8.4.1. Findings

The outputs of the learning programme are available in the ADÜ Information Package/Course Catalogue and the online OBIS site. Outcomes of each course are defined, and students' progress is evaluated at the course exam. The students have representatives who can participate in the meeting with professors and Dean to discuss and to establish the Learning plan. Subsequently, they can communicate with all their colleagues the issued decision. In the exam they have different questions about theoretical part and practical part. A part of questions is asked during the practice time. Students can build their own track from elective courses; however, it does not result in any kind of specialisation. Motivated students are encouraged to be involved in research projects; and they can also perform voluntary work at the clinics.

8.4.2. Comments

None.

8.4.3. Suggestions for improvement

None.

8.4.4. Decision

The VEE is compliant with Substandard 8.4.

8.5 Methods of formative and summative assessment must be valid and reliable and comprise a variety of approaches. Direct assessment of clinical skills and Day One Competences (some of which may be on simulated patients), must form a significant component of the overall process of assessment. It must also include the quality control of the student logbooks in order to ensure that all clinical procedures, practical and hands-on training planned in the study programme have been fully completed by each individual student.

8.5.1. Findings

The assessment methods are communicated to the students, and they are published on the homepage of the VEE. Gaining clinical skills is supported by work on cadavers and a new Clinical Skills Laboratory. The Day One Competences of the students are evaluated on the basis of their logbooks controlled by the supervising instructors and at the exam for the course.

8.5.2. Comments

None.

8.5.3. Suggestions for improvement

Integration of the clinical skills laboratory in preparing students to clinical work is recommended.

8.5.4. Decision

The VEE is compliant with Substandard 8.5.

Standard 9. Academic and support staff

9.1 The VEE must ensure that all staff are appropriately qualified and prepared for their roles, in agreement with national and EU regulations and must apply fair and transparent processes for the recruitment and development of staff.

A formal training (including good teaching and evaluation practices, learning and elearning resources, biosecurity and QA procedures) must be in place for all staff involved with teaching.

Most academic staff (calculated as FTE) involved in veterinary training must be veterinarians. It is expected that more than 2/3 of the instruction that the students receive, as determined by student teaching hours, is delivered by qualified veterinarians.

9.1.1. Findings

Approximately 97% of academic staff are veterinarians so this exceeds the 2/3 requirement. Staff are appropriately qualified.

Academic staff numbers seem adequate based on the ESEVT Indicators.

Support staff numbers are low on the ESVET Indicators – they are below minimum values in the calculated Indicators (0.503 per student graduating vs minimum values of 0.57).

Teaching norm is about 10 h per week for those that do not have substantial administrative roles.

9.1.2. Comments

The staff on site exhibited excellent commitment to their work, to veterinary education and to the students. They were well praised by the students and recent graduates from the VEE for engaging the students and for being available to help students to maximise their learning opportunities.

Training appears to be provided for support staff. Training is available for teaching staff in the areas of “good teaching and evaluation practices, learning and e-learning resources, biosecurity and QA procedures”. They also get trained on biosecurity rules for the school each year. During the COVID-19 pandemic this training was diverted predominantly into design and methods for online teaching resources and examination.

9.1.3. Suggestions for improvement

None.

9.1.4. Decision

The VEE is compliant with Substandard 9.1.

9.2 The total number, qualifications and skills of all staff involved with the programme, including teaching staff, ‘adjunct’ staff, technical, administrative and support staff, must be sufficient and appropriate to deliver the educational programme and fulfil the VEE’s mission.

A procedure must be in place to assess if the staff involved with teaching display competence and effective teaching skills in all relevant aspects of the curriculum that they teach, regardless of whether they are full or part time, residents, interns or other postgraduate students, adjuncts or off-campus contracted teachers.

9.2.1. Findings

There are 121 academic staff and 51 support staff available within the school.

Student evaluation of teaching is carried out.

There are criteria for recruitment of academic staff to ensure they are qualified for the role.

Support staff numbers are low on the ESVET Indicators – they are below minimum values in the calculated Indicators (0.503 per student graduating vs minimum values of 0.57).

Teaching staff are evaluated and student evaluations were made available during the Visitation.

9.2.2. Comments

There are sufficient teaching staff to ensure students receive a quality training. The student evaluations were very positive of the staff teaching quality in the VEE, demonstrating that the staff involved with teaching display competence and effective teaching skills in all relevant aspects of the curriculum that they teach.

Support staff numbers are marginal.

9.2.3. Suggestions for improvement

It would be of benefit to the VEE and facilitate easier operations within the VEE if more support staff could be provided.

9.2.4. Decision

The VEE is compliant with Substandard 9.2.

9.3 Staff must be given opportunities to develop and extend their teaching and assessment knowledge and must be encouraged to improve their skills. Opportunities for didactic and pedagogic training and specialisation must be available. The VEE must clearly define any systems of reward for teaching excellence in operation.

Academic positions must offer the security and benefits necessary to maintain stability, continuity, and competence of the academic staff. They must have a balanced workload of teaching, research and service depending on their role. They must have reasonable opportunities and resources for participation in scholarly activities.

9.3.1. Findings

Development opportunities for academic staff are available in the school. Research opportunities are available and staff may collaborate with other institutions. Academic performance is incentivised by payments.

There is a clear and documented promotion pathway with key milestones to be achieved to meet promotion criteria to the next academic grade at all levels. Staff are aware of what these are and can achieve them if they seek promotion.

9.3.2. Comments

Academic and support staff are satisfied with the promotion system and criteria for promotion within the VEE. These criteria are largely controlled by the Turkish Ministry of Education.

9.3.3. Suggestions for improvement

None.

9.3.4. Decision

The VEE is compliant with Substandard 9.3.

9.4 The VEE must provide evidence that it utilises a well-defined, comprehensive and publicised programme for the professional growth and development of academic and support staff, including formal appraisal and informal mentoring procedures.

Staff must have the opportunity to contribute to the VEE's direction and decision-making processes.

Promotion criteria for academic and support staff must be clear and explicit. Promotions for teaching staff must recognise excellence in, and (if permitted by the national or university law) place equal emphasis on all aspects of teaching (including clinical teaching), research, service and other scholarly activities.

9.4.1. Findings

There are both formal and informal mentoring systems in place for staff.

9.4.2. Comments

Staff are very happy with the supports available to them within the departments and the VEE.

9.4.3. Suggestions for improvement

None.

9.4.4. Decision

The VEE is compliant with Substandard 9.4.

9.5 A system for assessment of teaching staff must be in operation and must include student participation. Results must be available to those undertaking external reviews and commented upon in reports.

9.5.1. Findings

Students do carry out assessments of teaching staff and courses.

Results of student evaluations were made available to the visiting Team; these indicated that students are content with the competence, quality and efforts made by the teaching staff.

9.5.2. Comments

The student evaluations were very positive of the staff teaching quality in the VEE, demonstrating that the staff involved with teaching display competence and effective teaching skills in all relevant aspects of the curriculum that they teach.

9.5.3. Suggestions for improvement

None.

9.5.4. Decision

The VEE is compliant with Substandard 9.5.

Standard 10. Research programs, continuing and postgraduate education

10.1 The VEE must demonstrate significant and broad research activities of staff that integrate with and strengthen the veterinary degree program through research-based teaching.

10.1.1. Findings

Research activities are mainly funded by Turkish institutions, such as BAP, TÜBİTAK, TAGEM. These are the main organizations funding research. Nevertheless, the strategic plan indicates that the TAGEM organization contributes the most in terms of the budget allocated to research, since this organization contributes 65% of the total allocated budget (21,973,374 TL, i.e. ±2,300,876, 8 EUR). For the number of subsidized projects, 60 projects out of the 72 are granted by the DU-BAP organization, representing an amount of 3,969,184 TL (i.e. ±415,621.36 EUR). It is interesting to note that students can also submit projects in this framework. A set of 124 publications is listed in SER Appendix 10.1. This refers to publications since the year 2019. It is very interesting to see that the publications fall into different fields.

Also a positive point is the fact that most teachers have a PhD.

Postgraduate programmes are conducted in FVMADU's departments under the organization of Institute for Health Sciences, which is also under the Postgraduate School of the University. Announcements for these positions are made according to rules defined by YÖK and the University Senate.

10.1.2. Comments

Students submitting projects to the DU-BAP is excellent and a good point for the institution. Researchers at the FVMADU participate actively in scientific studies. There are 94 research projects (7 external, 87 internal with 7.741.560 TRY fund, approximately 950.000 Euro) initiated in the last 3 years. In the SER it is visible that this concerns only certain subjects such as neonatology and infectious disease.

10.1.3. Suggestions for improvement

A complete list of projects funded during the previous years with the indication of areas covered by these financed research projects could be stimulating.

The teaching staff holding a PhD obtained internationally could increase their efforts to further increase the number of financed projects with international contribution.

10.1.4. Decision

The VEE is compliant with Substandard 10.1.

10.2 All students must be trained in scientific method and research techniques relevant to evidence-based veterinary medicine and must have opportunities to participate in research programmes.

10.2.1. Findings

The involvement of students in research is continuous and connected to their teaching environment. Students are interested in research, especially through student clubs, allowing

non-graduate students' involvement in research. Even though the institution put forward evidence-based medicine (EBM) in its self-assessment report, it is not sure that students know exactly what this concept covers.

10.2.2. Comments

It is a positive point to see that the institution is thinking about putting the thesis back in place for the students. This must also be put in the context of the "Day One Competences" of the EAEVE.

10.2.3. Suggestions for improvement

The institution should consider the advisability of setting up a course specifically dedicated to the teaching of EBM. EBM is a highly codified method of reflection and teaching at this level could be of significant added value for the VEE.

10.2.4. Decision

The VEE is compliant with Substandard 10.1.

10.3 The VEE must provide advanced postgraduate degree programmes, e.g. PhD, internships, residencies and continuing education programmes that complement and strengthen the veterinary degree programme and are relevant to the needs of the profession and society.

10.3.1. Findings

Within the institution, there are 14 PhD programmes and 18 specialization master's programmes. Fifty students were enrolled in the PhD in 2020 and 42 students were enrolled in a specialization master's programme. The strategic plan reports 9 PhD graduate students and 21 graduate students from a specialization master's programme in 2020. It is very interesting to see that PhD and specialization master's students are divided into different scientific branches, which range from anatomy to nutrition and food hygiene. In 2021, fields such as microbiology and internal medicine attracted the most students at the PhD and specialized master's level.

10.3.2. Comments

The number of PhD and MsC students stand for the undergraduate and graduate students' focus on continuous learning. This shows that there is a great eclecticism at the level of research projects within the institution.

10.3.3. Suggestions for improvement

None.

10.3.4. Decision

The VEE is compliant with Substandard 10.3.

10.4 The VEE must have a system of QA to evaluate how research activities provide opportunities for student training and staff promotion, and how research approaches, methods and results are integrated into the veterinary teaching programmes.

10.4.1. Findings

Depending on the institution, researchers can be funded for their research activities, thanks to financial support from organizations such as BAP, TUBITAK and TAGEM, depending on whether they are national or international research projects. Specialization master's and PhD programmes must be validated by the Health Science Institute.

10.4.2. Comments

The continuous training process seems to involve stakeholders. Nevertheless, the question is who exactly these stakeholders are. Likewise, the SER mentions an annual report making possible to judge the performance in terms of research at the level of the institution.

10.4.3. Suggestions for improvement

None.

10.4.4. Decision

The VEE is compliant with Substandard 10.4

11. ESEVT Indicators

The VEE provided the raw data and Indicators calculated for the academic years 2018/2019, 2019/2020 and 2020/2021 (up to the Visitation).

Given the fact that the information on the raw data and the Indicators included one and a half year of COVID-19 development and restrictive measures (2020-2021 up to August, when the SER was provided), some of the values representing 0 for all years drawn, it was very difficult to evaluate the performance of the FVMADU in complying with those Indicators. Therefore, the Visitation Team asked for the raw data and figures for the last three complete years (2017, 2018, and 2019) which were provided by the VEE during the Visitation. Nevertheless, some raw data concerning especially the extramural activity of the students (I12, 13, 14) stayed negative due to VEE's values representing 0 cases.

While looking at I7, extramural practical training in FSQ and VPH training, the value was negative (-8.8) for the previous period, but the balance improved in 2019-2021 to 62.6, which stands for the VEE's adequate measures to control this indicator.

Animal number ratios per student graduating annually are below minimum values for the following Indicators I10: equine patients seen intramurally, I11: rabbits, rodents, bird and exotics, I12: Companion animal cases, I13: numbers of ruminant and pig cases seen extramurally, I14 equine cases seen extramurally, I15: visits to ruminant and pig herds (related to herd health), I16: visits to poultry and farmed rabbit units (herd health), I17: companion animal necropsies and I18 ruminant and pig necropsies, all the values being negative.

Numbers of ruminant and pig cases seen intramurally per number of students graduating annually are above Median values at 3.257 per student. The numbers of these species seen extramurally per student graduating at 0.58 per student are below minimum values (6.29 per student).

In the revised tables on Indicators for the years 2017, 2018 and 2019, there were median values of 8.548 ruminant and pig cases per student graduating well above median values; numbers of these species seen externally were 0, and the number of herd visits were 0.042 which is below

FINAL REPORT AS ISSUED BY ECOVE ON 14 DECEMBER 2021

minimum values. COVID-19 has affected the numbers of ruminant and pig cases and farm visits in the clinic and farm visits during 2020 and 2021.

This display of Indicators for the VEE is reflected in non-compliance status with Substandard 5.1 – i.e. *“The number and variety of healthy and diseased animals, cadavers, and material of animal origin must be adequate for providing the practical and safe hands-on training (in the areas of Basic Sciences, Clinical Sciences, Pathology, Animal Production, Food Safety and Quality) and adapted to the number of students enrolled.”*

Further, the mainly hard-copy recording system for the VTH cases, which does not enhance an accurate evidence of the cases and toughens their retrieval, and does not efficiently support the teaching, research and service programmes of the VEE is reflected in non-compliance with Substandard 5.4 – i.e. *“Medical records must be comprehensive and maintained in an effective retrieval system (preferably an electronic patient record system) to efficiently support the teaching, research, and service programmes of the VEE.”*

12. ESEVT Rubrics (summary of the decision on the compliance of the VEE for each ESEVT Substandard, i.e. (total or substantial) compliance (C), partial compliance (PC) (Minor Deficiency) or non-compliance (NC) (Major Deficiency))

Standard 1: Objectives, Organisation and QA Policy	C	PC	NC
1.1 The VEE must have as its main objective the provision, in agreement with the EU Directives and ESG recommendations, of adequate, ethical, research-based, evidence-based veterinary training that enables the new graduate to perform as a veterinarian capable of entering all commonly recognized branches of the veterinary profession and to be aware of the importance of lifelong learning. The VEE must develop and follow its mission statement which must embrace all the ESEVT standards.	X		
1.2 The VEE must be part of a university or a higher education institution providing training recognised as being of an equivalent level and formally recognised as such in the respective country. The person responsible for the veterinary curriculum and the person(s) responsible for the professional, ethical, and academic affairs of the Veterinary Teaching Hospital (VTH) must hold a veterinary degree. The decision-making process of the VEE must allow implementation of its strategic plan and of a cohesive study programme, in compliance with the ESEVT Standards.	X		
1.3 The VEE must have a strategic plan, which includes a SWOT analysis of its current activities, a list of objectives, and an operating plan with a timeframe and indicators for its implementation.	X		
1.4 The VEE must have a policy and associated written procedures for the assurance of the quality and standards of its programmes and awards. It must also commit itself explicitly to the development of a culture which recognises the importance of quality, and quality assurance, within their VEE. To achieve this, the VEE must develop and implement a strategy for the continuous enhancement of quality. The development and implementation of the VEE's strategy must include a role for students and other stakeholders, both internal and external, and the strategy must have a formal status and be publicly available.	X		
1.5 The VEE must provide evidence that it interacts with its stakeholders and the wider society. Such public information must be clear, objective and readily accessible; the information must include up-to-date information about the study programme, views and employment destinations of past students as well as the profile of the current student population. The VEE's website must mention the ESEVT VEE's status and its last Self Evaluation Report and Visitation Report must be easily available for the public.	X		
1.6 The VEE must monitor and periodically review its activities, both quantitative and qualitative, to ensure that they achieve the objectives set for them and respond to the needs of students and society. The VEE must make public how this analysis of information has been utilised in the further development of its activities and provide evidence as to the involvement of both students and staff in the provision, analysis and implementation of such data. Any action planned or taken as a result of this data analysis must be communicated to all those concerned.	X		
1.7 The VEE must undergo external review through the ESEVT on a cyclical basis. Evidence must be provided of such external evaluation with the assurance that the progress made since the last ESEVT evaluation was linked to a continuous quality assurance process.	X		
Standard 2: Finances			
2.1 Finances must be demonstrably adequate to sustain the requirements for the VEE to meet its mission and to achieve its objectives for education, research and services. The description must include both expenditures (separated into personnel costs, operating costs, maintenance costs and equipment) and revenues (separated into public funding, tuition fees, services, research grants and other sources).		X	
2.2 Clinical and field services must function as instructional resources. Instructional integrity of these resources must take priority over financial self-sufficiency of clinical services operations. The VEE must have sufficient autonomy in order to use the resources to implement its strategic plan and to meet the ESEVT Standards.	X		
2.3 Resources allocation must be regularly reviewed to ensure that available resources meet the requirements.	X		
Standard 3: Curriculum			
3.1 The curriculum must be designed, resourced and managed to ensure all graduates have achieved the graduate attributes expected to be fully compliant with the EU Directive 2005/36/EC (as amended by directive 2013/55/EU) and its Annex V.4.1. The curriculum must include the subjects (input) and must allow the acquisition of the Day One Competences (output) listed in Annex 2. This concerns Basic Sciences, Clinical Sciences in companion animals (including equine and exotic pets), Clinical Sciences in food-producing animals (including Animal Production and Herd Health Management), Food Safety and Quality, and Professional Knowledge.			
3.1.1. General findings	X		
3.1.2. Basic sciences	X		
3.1.3. Clinical Sciences in companion animals (including equine and exotic pets)	X		
3.1.4. Clinical Sciences in food-producing animals (including Animal Production and Herd Health Management)	X		
3.1.5. Food Safety and Quality	X		
3.1.6. Professional Knowledge	X		
3.2 Each study programme provided by the VEE must be competency-based and designed so that it meets the objectives set for it, including the intended learning outcomes. The qualification resulting from a programme must be clearly specified and communicated and must refer to the correct level of the national qualifications framework for higher education and, consequently, to the Framework for Qualifications of the European Higher Education Area. The VEE must provide proof of a QA system that promotes and monitors the presence of an academic environment highly conducive to learning including self-learning. Details of the type, provision and updating	X		

FINAL REPORT AS ISSUED BY ECOVE ON 14 DECEMBER 2021

<p>of appropriate learning opportunities for the students must be clearly described, as well as the involvement of students. The VEE must also describe how it encourages and prepares students for self-learning and lifelong learning.</p>			
<p>3.3 Programme learning outcomes must:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • ensure the effective alignment of all content, teaching, learning and assessment activities of the degree programme to form a cohesive framework • include a description of Day One Competences • form the basis for explicit statements of the objectives and learning outcomes of individual units of study • be communicated to staff and students • be regularly reviewed, managed and updated to ensure they remain relevant, adequate and are effectively achieved. 	X		
<p>3.4 The VEE must have a formally constituted committee structure (which includes effective student representation), with clear and empowered reporting lines, to oversee and manage the curriculum and its delivery. The committee(s) must:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • determine the pedagogical basis, design, delivery methods and assessment methods of the curriculum • oversee QA of the curriculum, particularly gathering, evaluating, making change and responding to feedback from stakeholders, peer reviewers and external assessors, and data from examination/assessment outcomes • perform ongoing and periodic review of the curriculum at least every seven years by involving staff, students and stakeholders; these reviews must lead to continuous improvement. Any action taken or planned as a result of such a review must be communicated to all those concerned • identify and meet training needs for all types of staff, maintaining and enhancing their competence for the ongoing curriculum development. 	X		
<p>3.5 External Practical Training (EPT) is compulsory training activities organised outside the VEE, the student being under the direct supervision of a non-academic person (e.g. a practitioner). EPT cannot replace the core intramural training nor the extramural training under the close supervision of academic staff (e.g. ambulatory clinics, herd health management, practical training in FSQ and VPH). Since the veterinary degree is a professional qualification with Day One Competences, EPT must complement and strengthen the academic education inter alia by enhancing student's professional knowledge.</p>	X		
<p>3.6 The EPT providers must have an agreement with the VEE and the student (in order to state their respective rights and duties, including insurance matters), provide a standardised evaluation of the performance of the student during their EPT and be allowed to provide feedback to the VEE on the EPT programme. There must be a member of the academic staff responsible for the overall supervision of the EPT, including liaison with EPT providers.</p>	X		
<p>3.7 Students must take responsibility for their own learning during EPT. This includes preparing properly before each placement, keeping a proper record of their experience during EPT by using a logbook provided by the VEE and evaluating the EPT. Students must be allowed to complain officially and/or anonymously about issues occurring during EPT. The VEE must have a system of QA to monitor the implementation, progress and then feedback within the EPT activities.</p>	X		
Standard 4: Facilities and equipment			
<p>4.1 All aspects of the physical facilities must provide an environment conducive to learning, including internet access. The veterinary VEE must have a clear strategy and programme for maintaining and upgrading its buildings and equipment. Facilities must comply with all relevant legislation including health, safety, biosecurity, accessibility to people with reduced mobility, and EU animal welfare and care standards.</p>			X
<p>4.2 Lecture theatres, teaching laboratories, tutorial rooms, clinical facilities and other teaching spaces must be adequate in number, size and equipped for the instructional purposes and must be well maintained. The facilities must be adapted for the number of students enrolled. Students must have ready access to adequate and sufficient study, self-learning, recreation, locker, sanitary and food service facilities. Offices, teaching preparation and research laboratories must be sufficient for the needs of the academic and support staff.</p>	X		
<p>4.3 The livestock facilities, animal housing, core clinical teaching facilities and equipment used by the VEE for teaching purposes must:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • be sufficient in capacity and adapted for the number of students enrolled in order to allow safe hands-on training for all students • be of a high standard, well maintained and fit for the purpose • promote best husbandry, welfare and management practices • ensure relevant biosecurity and bio-containment • be designed to enhance learning. 		X	
<p>4.4 Core clinical teaching facilities must be provided in a veterinary teaching hospital (VTH) with 24/7 emergency services at least for companion animals and equines. Within the VTH, the VEE must unequivocally demonstrate that standard of education and clinical research are compliant with all ESEVT Standards, e.g. research-based and evidence-based clinical training supervised by academic staff trained to teach and to assess, availability for staff and students of facilities and patients for performing clinical research and relevant QA procedures. For ruminants, on-call service must be available if emergency services do not exist for those species in a VTH. The VEE must ensure state-of-the-art standards of teaching clinics which remain comparable with or exceeding the best available in the private sector. The VTH and any hospitals, practices and facilities (including EPT) which are involved with the curriculum must meet the relevant national Practice Standards.</p>	X		
<p>4.5 The VEE must ensure that students have access to a broad range of diagnostic and therapeutic facilities, including but not limited to: diagnostic imaging, anaesthesia, clinical pathology, intensive/critical care, surgeries and treatment facilities, ambulatory services, pharmacy and necropsy facilities.</p>	X		

FINAL REPORT AS ISSUED BY ECOVE ON 14 DECEMBER 2021

4.6 Appropriate isolation facilities must be provided to meet the need for the isolation and containment of animals with communicable diseases. Such isolation facilities must be properly constructed, ventilated, maintained and operated to provide for animal care and for prevention of spread of infectious agents. They must be adapted to all animal species commonly handled in the VTH.			X
4.7 The VEE must have an ambulatory clinic for production animals or equivalent facilities so that students can practise field veterinary medicine and Herd Health Management under academic supervision.	X		
4.8 The transport of students, live animals, cadavers, materials from animal origin and other teaching materials must be done in agreement with national and EU standards, to ensure the safety of students and staff and to prevent the spread of infectious agents.	X		
4.9 Operational policies and procedures (including e.g. biosecurity, good laboratory practice and good clinical practice) must be taught and posted for students, staff and visitors and a Biosafety manual must be available. The VEE must demonstrate a clear commitment for the delivery of biosafety and biosecurity, e.g. by a specific committee structure. The VEE must have a system of QA to monitor and assure clinical, laboratory and farm services, including a regular monitoring of the feedback from students, staff and clients.		X	
Standard 5: Animal resources and teaching material of animal origin			
5.1 The number and variety of healthy and diseased animals, cadavers, and material of animal origin must be adequate for providing the practical and safe hands-on training (in the areas of Basic Sciences, Clinical Sciences, Pathology, Animal Production, Food Safety and Quality) and adapted to the number of students enrolled. Evidence must be provided that these data are regularly recorded and that procedures are in place for correcting any deficiencies.			X
5.2 In addition to the training provided in the VEE, experience can include practical training at external sites, provided this training is organised under direct academic supervision and following the same standards as those applied in the VEE.	X		
5.3 The VTH must provide nursing care skills and instruction in nursing procedures. Under all situations students must be active participants in the clinical workup of patients, including problem-oriented diagnostic approach together with diagnostic decision-making.	X		
5.4 Medical records must be comprehensive and maintained in an effective retrieval system (preferably an electronic patient record system) to efficiently support the teaching, research, and service programmes of the VEE.			X
Standard 6: Learning resources			
6.1 State-of-the-art learning resources must be adequate and available to support veterinary education, research, services and continuing education. When the study program is provided in several tracks/languages, the learning resources must be available in all used languages. Timely access to learning resources, whether through print, electronic media or other means, must be available to students and staff and, when appropriate, to stakeholders. State-of-the-art procedures for bibliographical search and for access to databases and learning resources must be taught to undergraduate students.	X		
6.2 Staff and students must have full access on site to an academic library administered by a qualified librarian, an Information Technology (IT) unit managed by an IT expert, an e-learning platform, and all the relevant human and physical resources necessary for the development of instructional materials by the staff and their use by the students. The relevant electronic information, database and other intranet resources must be easily available for students and staff both in the VEE's core facilities via wireless connection (Wi-Fi) and from outside the VEE through a hosted secured connection, e.g. Virtual Private Network (VPN).	X		
6.3 The VEE must provide students with unimpeded access to learning resources, internet and internal study resources, and equipment for the development of procedural skills (e.g. models). The use of these resources must be aligned with the pedagogical environment and learning outcomes within the program and have mechanisms in place to evaluate the teaching value of changes in learning resources.	X		
Standard 7: Student admission, progression and welfare			
7.1 The VEE must consistently apply pre-defined and published regulations covering all phases of the student "life cycle", e.g. student admission, progression and certification. In relation to enrolment, the VEE must provide accurate and complete information regarding all aspects of the educational programme in all advertisements for prospective national and international students. Formal co-operations with other VEE must also be clearly advertised.	X		
7.2 The number of students admitted must be consistent with the resources available at the VEE for staff, buildings, equipment, healthy and diseased animals, and materials of animal origin.	X		
7.3 The selection and progression criteria must be clearly defined, consistent, and defensible, be free of discrimination or bias, and take into account the fact that students are admitted with a view to their entry to the veterinary profession in due course. The VEE must regularly review and reflect on the selection processes to ensure they are appropriate for students to complete the programme successfully. If the selection processes are decided by another authority, the latter must regularly receive feedback from the VEE. Adequate training (including periodic refresher training) must be provided for those involved in the selection process to ensure applicants are evaluated fairly and consistently.	X		
7.4 There must be clear policies and procedures on how applicants with disabilities or illnesses are considered and, if appropriate, accommodated in the programme, taking into account the requirement that all students must be capable of meeting the ESEVT Day One Competences by the time they graduate.	X		
7.5 The basis for decisions on progression (including academic progression and professional fitness to practise) must be explicit and readily available to the students. The VEE must provide evidence that it has mechanisms in place to identify and provide remediation and appropriate support (including termination) for students who are not performing adequately. The VEE must have mechanisms in place to monitor attrition and progression and be able to respond and amend admission selection criteria (if permitted by national or university law) and student support if required.	X		
7.6 Mechanisms for the exclusion of students from the programme for any reason must be explicit.			

FINAL REPORT AS ISSUED BY ECOVE ON 14 DECEMBER 2021

The VEE's policies for managing appeals against decisions, including admissions, academic and progression decisions and exclusion, must be transparent and publicly available.	X		
7.7 Provisions must be made by the VEE to support the physical, emotional and welfare needs of students. This includes, but is not limited to, learning support and counselling services, career advice, and fair and transparent mechanisms for dealing with student illness, impairment and disability during the programme. This shall include provision of reasonable adjustments for disabled students, consistent with all relevant equality and/or human rights legislation. There must be effective mechanisms for resolution of student grievances (e.g. interpersonal conflict or harassment).	X		
7.8 Mechanisms must be in place by which students can convey their needs and wants to the VEE. The VEE must provide students with a mechanism, anonymously if they wish, to offer suggestions, comments and complaints regarding compliance of the VEE with national and international legislation and the ESEVT standards.	X		
Standard 8: Student assessment			
8.1 The VEE must ensure that there is a clearly identified structure within the VEE showing lines of responsibility for the assessment strategy to ensure coherence of the overall assessment regime and to allow the demonstration of progressive development across the programme towards entry-level competence.	X		
8.2 The assessment tasks and grading criteria for each unit of study in the programme must be published, applied consistently, clearly identified and available to students in a timely manner well in advance of the assessment. Requirements to pass must be explicit. The VEE must properly document the results of assessment and provide the students with timely feedback on their assessments. Mechanisms for students to appeal against assessment outcomes must be explicit.	X		
8.3 The VEE must have a process in place to review assessment outcomes, to change assessment strategies and to ensure the accuracy of the procedures when required. Programme learning outcomes covering the full range of professional knowledge, skills, competences and attributes must form the basis for assessment design and underpin decisions on progression.	X		
8.4 Assessment strategies must allow the VEE to certify student achievement of learning objectives at the level of the programme and individual units of study. The VEE must ensure that the programmes are delivered in a way that encourages students to take an active role in creating the learning process, and that the assessment of students reflects this approach.	X		
8.5 Methods of formative and summative assessment must be valid and reliable and comprise a variety of approaches. Direct assessment of clinical skills and Day One Competences (some of which may be on simulated patients), must form a significant component of the overall process of assessment. It must also include the quality control of the student logbooks in order to ensure that all clinical procedures, practical and hands-on training planned in the study programme have been fully completed by each individual student.	X		
Standard 9: Academic and support staff			
9.1 The VEE must ensure that all staff are appropriately qualified and prepared for their roles, in agreement with national and EU regulations and must apply fair and transparent processes for the recruitment and development of staff. A formal training (including good teaching and evaluation practices, learning and e-learning resources, biosecurity and QA procedures) must be in place for all staff involved with teaching. Most academic staff (calculated as FTE) involved in veterinary training must be veterinarians. It is expected that more than 2/3 of the instruction that the students receive, as determined by student teaching hours, is delivered by qualified veterinarians.	X		
9.2 The total number, qualifications and skills of all staff involved with the programme, including teaching staff, 'adjunct' staff, technical, administrative and support staff, must be sufficient and appropriate to deliver the educational programme and fulfil the VEE's mission. A procedure must be in place to assess if they display competence and effective teaching skills in all relevant aspects of the curriculum that they teach, regardless of whether they are full or part time, residents, interns or other postgraduate students, adjuncts or off-campus contracted teachers.	X		
9.3 Staff must be given opportunities to develop and extend their teaching and assessment knowledge and must be encouraged to improve their skills. Opportunities for didactic and pedagogic training and specialisation must be available. The VEE must clearly define systems of reward for teaching excellence in operation. Academic positions must offer the security and benefits necessary to maintain stability, continuity, and competence of the academic staff. Academic staff must have a balanced workload of teaching, research and service depending on their role. They must have reasonable opportunities and resources for participation in scholarly activities.	X		
9.4 The VEE must provide evidence that it utilises a well-defined, comprehensive and publicised programme for the professional growth and development of academic and support staff, including formal appraisal and informal mentoring procedures. Staff must have the opportunity to contribute to the VEE's direction and decision-making processes. Promotion criteria for academic and support staff must be clear and explicit. Promotions for teaching staff must recognise excellence in, and (if permitted by the national or university law) place equal emphasis on all aspects of teaching (including clinical teaching), research, service and other scholarly activities.	X		
9.5 A system for assessment of teaching staff must be in operation and must include student participation. Results must be available to those undertaking external reviews and commented upon in reports.	X		
Standard 10: Research programmes, continuing and postgraduate education			
10.1 The VEE must demonstrate significant and broad research activities of staff that integrate with and strengthen the veterinary degree programme through research-based teaching.	X		
10.2 All students must be trained in scientific method and research techniques relevant to evidence-based veterinary medicine and must have opportunities to participate in research programmes.	X		

FINAL REPORT AS ISSUED BY ECOVE ON 14 DECEMBER 2021

10.3 The VEE must provide advanced postgraduate degree programmes, e.g. PhD, internships, residencies and continuing education programmes that complement and strengthen the veterinary degree programme and are relevant to the needs of the profession and society.	X		
10.4 The VEE must have a system of QA to evaluate how research activities provide opportunities for student training and staff promotion, and how research approaches, methods and results are integrated into the veterinary teaching programmes.	X		
<i>C: (total or substantial) compliance; PC: partial compliance (Minor Deficiency); NC: non-compliance (Major Deficiency)</i>			

Executive Summary

Aydın Adnan Menderes University (ADÜ) Faculty of Veterinary Medicine (FVMADU) was established in 1987, in 1992 it moved to Adnan Menderes University, but the academic training was performed at the Ankara University between 1993 and 1995. The academic year of 1995-1996 represented the start for teaching activities at FVMADU in Aydın. FVMADU holds the accreditation by National Association for Evaluation and Accreditation of Veterinary Education Institutions and Programs (VEDEK) for seven years since December 2016. Between 2009-2013 the VEE was the only Faculty of ADÜ to have TS EN ISO 9001 Quality Management System Certificate obtained from TSE.

FVMADU is located in the Aegean region, where agriculture is well-developed mainly including vegetal farming a mix of fig especially, but also olive and citrus trees. Animal farming mainly includes cattle, sheep and goats. Further, poultry and fish production, along with honeybees are also well represented.

The previous full Visitation FVMADU took place in October 2011 and the ECOVE granted the VEE with the "Approved" status in May 2016, with the end of the granted period in October 2021.

The VEE implemented measures to overcome the difficulties caused by the COVID-19 pandemic, described in detail in each Standard. During the COVID-19 pandemic period, distance learning course-exam activities and electronic resource sharing are carried out through the software supported by ADÜZEM.

The SER was well written, complete and provided on time to the Visitation Team along with the Appendices. The questions asked by experts before the Visitation as well as all the documents asked for during the Visitation were willingly provided.

The visiting Team would like to thank everybody who made this Visitation possible, also the staff and students for their welcome and support during the visit. The Visitation was very well prepared, well organised and carried out in a cordial and professional atmosphere. The Liaison Officer was very efficient, diligent and always helpful. The programme of the Visitation was designed ahead the Visitation, some minor changes being made on the site and easily implemented upon request of the Visitation Team. The Visitors were greeted with enthusiasm and given all courtesy and assistance needed, had full access to all the information, facilities and individuals they asked for, in a very transparent manner.

Areas worthy of praise (i.e. Commendations), e.g.:

- The commitment and enthusiasm of staff and students
- Transparency and openness
- Student-focused education
- Well-equipped laboratories of basic sciences
- Positive interaction between students and staff, in a learning inductive atmosphere
- Enthusiastic students
- Willingness to further develop teaching and research
- Effective implementation of a QA system
- Strong PhD and MSc training

Areas of concern (i.e. Minor Deficiencies):

- Partial compliance with Substandard 2.1 because of sub-optimal financing of activities of the VEE;
- Partial compliance with Substandard 4.3 because the standards and the capacity of livestock facilities are suboptimal;
- Partial compliance with Substandard 4.9 because operational policies and procedures are not fully posted for students, staff and visitors.

Items of non-compliance with the ESEVT Standards (i.e. Major Deficiencies):

- Non-compliance with Substandard 4.1 because the facilities do not comply with all relevant legislation including health, safety, biosecurity, and animal welfare and care standards;
- Non-compliance with Substandard 4.6 because the isolation facilities did not meet the standards;
- Non-compliance with Substandard 5.1 because the number and variety of healthy and diseased animals, cadavers, and material of animal origin is not adequate for providing the practical and safe hands-on training to students.
- Non-compliance with Substandard 5.4 because there is no functional case records system to allow effective retrieval of comprehensive medical records to efficiently support the teaching, research and service programmes of the VEE.

Additional suggestions for improvement are described in the Visitation Report.

Glossary

ADÜ: Aydin Adnan Menderes University
ADÜZEM: Aydin Adnan Menderes University Distance Learning Portal
BAP: Aydin Adnan Menderes University Scientific Research Projects Coordination Unit
CSL: Clinical Skills Laboratory
DOC: Day One Competences
DVM: Doctor of Veterinary Medicine
EBM: Evidence-Based Medicine
EAEVE: European Association of Establishments for Veterinary Education
EBVS: European Board of Veterinary Specialisation
ECOVE: European Committee on Veterinary Education
EPT: External Practical Training
ESEVT: European System of Evaluation of Veterinary Training
ESG: Standards and Guidelines for Quality Assurance in the European Higher Education Area
FSQ: Food Safety and Quality
FTE: Full-Time Equivalent
IT: Information Technology
OBIS: Student Information Portal
ÖSYM: Student Selection and Placement Centre
PDCA: Plan-Do-Check-Act
QA: Quality Assurance
SER: Self Evaluation Report
SOP: Standard Operating Procedure
TAGEM: General Directorate of Agricultural Research and Policies
TÜBİTAK: The Scientific and Technological Research Council of Turkey
TYYÇ: National Competency Framework for Higher Education in Turkey
VEDEK: Association for Evaluation and Accreditation of Educational Institutions and Programs of Veterinary Medicine
VPH: Veterinary Public Health
VTH: Veterinary Teaching Hospital
VUCEP: National Veterinary Core Education Program
YÖK: The Council of Higher Education

Decision of ECOVE

The Committee concluded that the following Major Deficiencies had been identified:

1. Non-compliance with Substandard 4.1 because the facilities do not comply with all relevant legislation including health, safety, biosecurity, and animal welfare and care standards;
2. Non-compliance with Substandard 4.6 because the isolation facilities did not meet the standards;
3. Non-compliance with Substandard 5.1 because the number and variety of healthy and diseased animals, cadavers, and material of animal origin is not adequate for providing the practical and safe hands-on training to students;
4. Non-compliance with Substandard 5.4 because there is no functional case records system to allow effective retrieval of comprehensive medical records to efficiently support the teaching, research and service programmes of the VEE.

The Veterinary Education Establishment (VEE) of the Adnan Menderes University is therefore classified as holding the status of: **NON-ACCREDITATION**.