

**European Association  
of Establishments for Veterinary Education**

**Association Européenne  
des Etablissements d'Enseignement Vétérinaire**



**REPORT ON THE REVISIT TO THE FVMADU, AYDIN**

**March, 22<sup>nd</sup> -24<sup>th</sup>, 2015**

**By the EXPERT GROUP**

Philip Duffus, Olivier J. Glardon, Patrick Talty

April 3<sup>rd</sup>, 2015

## **1. Introduction**

### **1.1 Documents available for the re-visit of the FVMADU, Aydin**

After the last full visitation, the ECOVE decided non-approval for nine (9) category 1 deficiencies. A 3 years progress report was sent by the FVMADU in 2014, to inform the ECOVE about the changes done and the new situation.

The ECOVE named Dr. Patrick Talty (ECOVE member), Prof. Philip Duffus and Dr. Olivier Glardon (respectively member and chairman of the expert team in 2011) to revisit the FVMADU.

During the visitation, the dean of the FVMADU provided the experts with numbers and figures about the changes done and the progress reached.

### **1.2 Agenda of the visit**

The FVMADU Aydin was revisited on March 22<sup>nd</sup> -24<sup>th</sup>, 2015. The experts met first with the direction of the school to receive an overview of what had been done so far to rectify the category 1 deficiencies. Afterwards, they had the opportunity to visit different departments and buildings, including a teaching farm, according to their needs of facts and information. On Monday afternoon and Tuesday morning they also had meetings with the students and the teachers, in order to complete the information contained in the report of the faculty.

## **2. Deficiencies listed in the EAEVE report.**

### **2.1 Deficiency 1. Inadequate necropsy facilities and insufficient pathology case load (Final Report 4.2.3).**

#### Facts (Faculty report)

(see also appendix 1: numbers of necropsies and anatomical dissections between 2013 - 2014, Appendix 2: same between 2011 - 2015)

All of the cases indicated in Table 1 were used as teaching materials for the students. The total number of necropsy was 289 between September 2013 and September 2014. In this period total number of dissections carried out in the Anatomy Department was 18.

The construction of the necropsy laboratory of FVMADU is partially completed and constructions are under-going. This is the main reason for relatively low R necropsy value obtained between September 2013 and September 2014.

Comments (OG):

In the opinion of the expert, the new facilities for necropsy are meeting the requirements and are sufficient for the pathology teaching. Taking the actual case load into consideration, there is an obvious improvement in the number of cases available for teaching. The drop in the case number between 2012 and 2014 is due to the ongoing constructions during this period of time. In the same building more room is available for further improvement of the facilities, which will be undergone in the next years.

**2.2 Deficiency 2. Insufficient clinical training, (insufficient case load of different species) excessive number of students per group and insufficient practical hands-on training (Final Report Chapter 4.4.2).**

**a) Increasing the number of animals applied to the clinics and to provide self-learning opportunities to the students.**

Facts (Faculty report)

(see also appendix 2: Table 2 number of animals applied to the clinic)

The total number of animals inspected and treated at the clinics between September 2013 and September 2014 was 2935 (Table 2). The number of inspections and treatments carried out within nearby farm visits and through the mobile clinic service were not considered within this context. The total number of operations carried out at the hospital was 359 within the same period. Meanwhile, 36 vaccinations for cats and dogs, 15 sperm motility investigations and 1 sperm investigation in bull sperm and 1 vaginal smear and artificial insemination with fresh sperm in dog were carried out at the hospital.

Apart from animals accepted to the clinics for inspection and treatment, 65 sheep (6 rams and 59 ewes) , 2 goats, 1 billy goat, 12 cows and 14 pigs (8 boars and 6 sows) were also made available for student practices in the faculty's animal inventory between September 2013 and September 2014.

Comments (OG, PD):

The process of increasing the number of patients seen in the clinics is improving. The broad spectrum of species seen in the small and large animal clinics is also important for the quality of teaching and the learning opportunities.

However, in regard to the number of students, the case load still remains low and should be increased. Care should also be given to a possible competition between interns (5<sup>th</sup> year students on rotation in the clinics) and master (postgraduate) students working in the clinics. Again, this can only be solved by increasing the number of patients and developing a more specialized type of clinical work (increasing referrals from private practitioners). In addition, it is important that the 5<sup>th</sup> year students on rotation in the clinics have exposure to cases for the entire day rather than just half a day.

The possibility of using animals from charity and/or humane societies as well as stray dogs for training the interns in routine procedures (castrations, blood tests, etc.) should be considered. In order to improve the clinical work with farm animals, it is important that the ambulatory clinic is fully functional.

**b) Increasing the number of exotic animals and horse.**

Facts (Faculty report)

It was determined that the number of inspected/treated exotic animals and horses in the Faculty Clinics in 2013-2014 were 69 and 72, respectively. R14- No. of students graduating annually:  
No. of equine cases =  $61/72 = 1/1.18$

Comments (PD, OG, PT):

The number of exotic animals has been increased in a satisfactory way. The facilities in Kanat Ger are a good opportunity for the training in exotic animal care.

The number of horses remains low, but in the opinion of the experts, this cannot be corrected in a short time due to the lack of such patients in the area of Aydin. As a suggestion, it might be possible to build up cooperation with another veterinary faculty having more equine patients, in order to send interested students for extramural study.

**2.3 Deficiency 3. Lack of theoretical and practical teaching in herd health management (Final Report Chapter 4.3.3) - Forming and placing the Herd Health Management lecture in the curriculum**

Facts (Faculty report)

A course entitled Farm Management (VFU 502) was added to the curriculum as 10 hours/week and 13 ECTS for 5<sup>th</sup> has been modified. In addition, 4 optional lecture package programs/modules have been added. These programs/modules are: A) Experimental and exotic animal veterinary medicine, B) Basic laboratory techniques, C) Veterinary public health and food safety, D) Herd health management. The program/module changes are awaiting the approval of faculty board.

Comments (PD, PT)

The experts met up with the members of the several departments that contribute to both the theoretical and practical aspects of herd health teaching. While there is no single department with the overall responsibility for teaching this subject, the experts were confident that with the introduction of the new modules, this area of teaching is now adequately covered.

In addition, the experts visited a local dairy farm that although privately owned is extensively utilised by veterinary students. This farm was a well run and modern facility with its own veterinarian, and in the absence of a farm owned by FVMADU operates as an excellent alternative. The experts met up with the farm management who greatly value their links with FVMADU. Students were able to perform many of the tasks associated with dairy farm work such as pregnancy diagnosis, castrations, foot trimming, vaccinations, blood sampling etc.

**2.4 Deficiency 4. Inefficient control of study progress of students. (Final Report Chapter 4.1.2)**

Facts (Faculty report)

Students who are unable to complete courses successfully for the first two years (courses on basic sciences such as biochemistry, physiology, histology etc.) are not allowed to take any courses from the department of clinical sciences. Furthermore, a requirement dictating that a student must complete all courses by the end of the 7th semester, and have to attend courses within the 8th semester to be involved in the intern program has been implemented.

In order to provide sufficient, completed and continuous knowledge transfer to the students, students are required to provide several prerequisites, equivalent courses and co-requisites for each lecture (Please find appendix 1 and 2).

Comments (PD, OG, PT):

In the opinion of the experts, this deficiency has been corrected in a satisfactory way.

**2.5 Deficiency 5. Lack of biohazard risk control measures (Final Report Chapter 4.2.3.)**

Facts (Faculty report)

Concerning biohazard risk control measures, education of staff members of the faculty has been emphasized. Constructions carried out in the chemistry and microscopy laboratories were completed and equipments for both laboratories were provided. As a consequence of these measures, students no longer take practical courses in department laboratories where the spread of infectious diseases is a great concern. This will also significantly reduce the risk for students from getting contaminated by infectious agents. Moreover, a course entitled ‘‘Control measures for infectious diseases’’ has been added to the curriculum for the 1<sup>st</sup> and 2<sup>nd</sup> years.

Comments (OG):

In the opinion of expert, the deficiency has been satisfactorily corrected. However, to be sure that the equipment is not only available, but would be properly used in case of biohazard, a general directive on the faculty level (available for all departments) could be useful.

**2.6 Deficiency 6. Lack of animal welfare and hygiene measures in the experimental animal unit (Final Report Chapter 6.1.2.)**

Facts (Faculty report)

As part of legal regulations concerning Experimental Animal Breeding and Research Units established in 2004 by the Ministry of Food, Agriculture and Livestock of the Republic of Turkey, the unit has gained new service areas, especially administrative offices. The licensing process of the unit for the production, usage and supplementation of the laboratory animals (mice, rats, gerbil, hamster, guinea pig, rabbit and some poultry species) is underway in cooperation with the Ministry of Food, Agriculture and Livestock of the Republic of Turkey. Although not sufficient, a fund for the construction of the unit has been provided and efforts are undergoing to obtain additional funds for the completion of the unit.

Comments (PT):

Since 2012 the veterinary faculty has shared an experimental animal unit with the faculty of Medicine at the main campus. This unit is under the direction of a veterinarian. Ethical approval is required for all procedures and the facility is regularly monitored by the Ministry of Food, Agriculture and Livestock. The existing experimental unit at the veterinary faculty has been upgraded by installation of a forced air ventilation system which changes the air 20 times per hour.

In the opinion of the expert, the deficiency has been satisfactorily corrected.

**2.7 Deficiency 7. Lack of organization, of isolation facility, of emergency service and of mobile clinic in the veterinary teaching hospital (Final Report Chapter 6.2.2.)**

Facts (Faculty report)

The licensing procedure for the veterinary training hospital was completed and the facility certified as a hospital by the Ministry of Food, Agriculture and Livestock (MFAL) in May 2013. Based on the requirements of MFAL, changes were carried out in the hospital. The emergency service was initiated as of 04.11.2013 (Please see appendix 2).

At the moment 1 associate professor acting as attending veterinarian and 1 veterinary surgeon, and 3 academicians from the clinical departments are in charge in the clinics within the veterinary teaching hospital. A total of 10 research assistants work in the clinics of the hospital. Beside this, a hospital manager has been assigned by the deanship. However, there is no improvement concerning the automation for both the hospital admission as well as the registration system. In addition, the mobile clinic service is not yet operational due to insufficient funds provided by the Rectorate. It should also be indicated that a number of the hospitalization facilities, namely upgraded operation, pre and post operation rooms and isolation units have not yet been completed. The licensing procedures for veterinary teaching hospital pharmacy has been completed and was certified as hospital pharmacy by MFAL in January 2014 (Please see the appendix 4). Adnan Menderes University Faculty of Veterinary Medicine Veterinary Diagnosis and Analysis Laboratories (Microbiology, Virology, Pathology, Parasitology, Pharmacology-toxicology, Biochemistry, Histology and Physiology) were also approved by MFAL in October 2014 (Please see appendix 3).

Comments (PD, OG, PT):

As regards the organization and the emergency service, the deficiencies have been satisfactorily corrected, especially after the creation of a hospital director position. However, further improvements are necessary with the surgical facilities. A centralized computerized system of medical records (coordinated with the digitalized X-Ray system and easily available to students) should be developed in all clinics.

As regard to the isolation facilities and especially the mobile clinic, due to the important financial and organizational improvements made to correct the other deficiencies, the planning is ongoing and the constructions will be finished by the end of 2016.

In the opinion of the experts, it would be adequate to accept the postponing of the correction of the deficiency up to the end of 2016, without a need for a revisit at that time.

**2.8 Deficiency 8. Insufficient teaching in pig medicine (Final Report Chapter 6.2.2.).**

Facts (Faculty report)

Subjects related to the diagnosis and treatment of pig diseases have been incorporated in the curriculum. The numbers of necropsy carried out by the Pathology department are given in the Appendix 1.

Comments (PT):

A new pig unit has been built on the campus since 2011. Pig medicine has been integrated into the curriculum under various headings.

In the opinion of the expert, the deficiency has been corrected satisfactorily.

**2.9 Deficiency 9. Insufficient numbers of support staff (Final Report Chapter 10.3.).**

Facts (Faculty report)

The numbers of academic and support staff since 2011 are given in Appendix 3. This number is fixed by the rector of the university, based on one side on the student number, on the other side on financial and budget limitations.

Comments (PD, OG, PT):

In the opinion of the experts, due to the financial conditions of the faculty and the rules / directives of the university, the deficiency has been satisfactorily corrected.

**3. Propositions of the expert**

In conclusion, after careful consideration of the documents provided by the FVMADU Aydin, based on the discussions with the students, the support staff, the teachers and the head of the faculty, and the findings collected during the revisit of the school, the experts mandated by the EAEVE recommend that the most important deficiencies have been or are in the process of being corrected. However, the experts felt that a letter from the Rectorate guaranteeing funds for the completion of the facilities in the hospital and mobile clinic should be made available before the next ECOVE meeting in May.

The experts feel that although some improvements in regard to the quality of the teaching and learning are still in a process of amelioration the corrections are sufficient to fulfil the requirements stated in the SOP and the indicators.

**The experts therefore recommend to the ECOVE the suppression of the category I deficiencies and the inclusion of the FVMADU Aydin in the positive list of the EAEVE / FVE.**

This topic should be placed on the agenda of the next possible ECOVE meeting (May 2015).

**Philip Duffus**

Member of the 2011 visiting team

**Olivier J. Glardon,**

Chairman of the 2011 visiting team

**Patrick Talty**

Member of the ECOVE

**Appendix 1:**

**The numbers of necropsy and anatomical dissections conducted between September 2013 and September 2014.**

Species	The numbers of necropsy, biopsy and organ inspection and anatomical dissections	
	Pathology Department	Anatomy Department
Cattle	31	1
Sheep	28	4
Goat	12	4
Dog	76	2
Cat	5	1
Pig	7	-
Horse	-	-
Donkey	-	1
Poultry	33	-
Rabbit	6	5
Duck	-	-
Fish	74	-
Hamster	-	-
Camel	6	-
Seal	1	-
Exotic animal	10	-
<b>Total</b>	<b>289</b>	<b>18</b>

R18- No. of students graduating annually : No. of necropsy food producing animals +equine =  $61/31+28+12+7+6= 61/ 84 = 1/1.38$

R19- No. of students graduating annually : No. of necropsy poultry and rabbits =  $61/39=1/0.64$

R20- No. of students graduating annually : No. of necropsy companion animals=  $61/76+5 = 61/81=1/1.33$

**Appendix 2**

**Table 2. The numbers of animals applied to the clinics.**

<b>Animal species</b>	<b>The number of inspected animals</b>
Dog	1690
Cat	480
Cattle-heifer-calve	463
Horse-colt	72
Camel	72
Sheep-lamb-goat-ram	226
Rabbit	9
Poultry	54
Exotic animals	69
<b>Total</b>	<b>2935</b>
Wild birds hosted at Kanat Ger (on site)	33
Faculty animals (on site)	23 cattle, 65 sheep, 12 goats, 10 pigs, 8 horses

R11- No. of students graduating annually : No. of food producing animals seen at the faculty=  
 $61 / 463+72+226=61/761=1/12.5$

R14- No. of students graduating annually : No. of equine cases =  $61/72=1/1.16$

R15- No. of students graduating annually : No. of poultry-rabbit cases (including the exotic birds) =  $61 / 63+69 = 61/132=1/2.16$

R16- No. of students graduating annually : No. of companion animals =  $61/1690+480 = 61/2170 = 1/35.5$

**Appendix 3:**

**Table 4. The numbers of academic and support staff**

	2010	2012	2013	2014	2015
<b>Academic staff</b>					
Teaching staff	64	69	73	74	74
Research staff	26	30	23	33	33
Total	90	99	96	107	107
<b>Support staff</b>					
Responsible for administration, general services, maintenance, etc.	27	36	30	35	36
Engaged in research work	7	5	9	5	5
Others (temporary support staff)	8	10	17	12	12
<i>Total</i>	42	51	56	52	53

R1- No. FTE in veterinary training : No. undergraduate veterinary student=  $107/499 = 1/4.66$

R2- No. of FTE total at the faculty : No. undergraduate students at the faculty =  $107+52/499 = 159/499 = 1/3.13$

R3- No. total VS FTE in veterinary training : No. undergraduate veterinary students =  $107/499 = 1/4.66$

No. total VS FTE in veterinary training : No. students graduating annually =  $107/61 = 1.75/1$

R4- No. total FTE academic staff in veterinary training : No. total FTE support staff in veterinary training =  $107/52 = 2.05/1$

**Annex 1      Decision of ECOVE**

On 20 May 2015, ECOVE decided at their meeting that the ‘Report on the Revisit to the FVMADU, Aydin’ submitted by the Visiting Experts on 18 April 2015, was not considered as sufficient evidence. Therefore, the decision was deferred to the following meeting of ECOVE on 19 November 2015 to further investigate the rectification of the Major Deficiencies.

Unfortunately, the report was not submitted in time for the members of ECOVE to give it an appropriate consideration but the Director of the ESEVT and ECOVE Chair reviewed the report outside the meeting and noted that the new facility would not have been completed and functional until spring of 2016. Based on this evidence, ECOVE asked the Faculty of Veterinary Medicine, Adnan Menderes University to provide an Interim Report for discussion at their meeting on 11 May 2016.

Eventually, the ‘Progress Report’ submitted on 11 April 2016 was considered sufficient evidence and the Committee concluded that the Major Deficiencies identified in 2011 had been rectified.

The ‘Faculty of Veterinary Medicine, Adnan Menderes University’ is classified after Re-visit as holding the status of: **APPROVAL**.